# STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF OHIO MINUTES

October 2018 Ohio Department of Education 25 South Front Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

#### MEMBERS OF THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Tess Elshoff Joe Farmer Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Charles Froehlich Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan Nick Owens Eric Poklar James Sheppard

Lisa Woods

EX OFFICIO MEMBERS

Senator Peggy Lehner Representative Andrew Brenner

SECRETARY

Paolo DeMaria

Superintendent of Public Instruction

Mr. Farmer was absent from the meeting.

The State Board convened on Monday, October 15, at the Ohio Department of Education in Columbus.

The Board's Educators & Student Options Committee met beginning at 8:30 a.m.

### EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

President Elshoff welcomed the Executive Committee at 10:55 a.m.

President Elshoff asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Laura Kohler Nancy Hollister

Kara Morgan

Tess Elshoff

President Elshoff stated the Executive Committee had one item to cover today:

- Board member travel approval
- 1) Mrs. Dodd and Mrs. Haycock requested approval for registration to the Excellence in Education National Summit in December. Ms. Johnson requested approval for registration to the Network for Public Education National Conference in December. President Elshoff asked Committee members if there were any objections. No objections noted, requests approved.

Ms. Bruns Moved to adjourn the meeting. Mrs. Kohler Seconded the motion.

The President requested a voice vote.

Motion carried.

President Elshoff adjourned the meeting of the Executive Committee at 11:00 a.m.

#### STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Elshoff convened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, October 15, at 11:03 a.m.

President Elshoff asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

## YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Charles Froehlich Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Mervl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Kara Morgan James Sheppard Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

President Elshoff called on Vice President Hollister, who Moved that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion or compensation of a public employee or official; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the investigation of charges or complaints against a public employee, official, licensee, or regulated individual; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(3) for the purpose of conferring with legal counsel about matters that are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

Mrs. Kohler Seconded the motion.	
The President called for a roll call vote.	
YES VOTES Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Charles Froehlich Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff	Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Lisa Woods
Motion carried.	
The Board went into Executive Session at 11:03 a.m.	
The Board recessed from Executive Session at 11:30 a.m.	
The State Board recessed for lunch.	
RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING	
President Elshoff reconvened the Business October 15, at 1:10 p.m.	s meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday,
Martha Manchester welcomed Board mem Allegiance.	ubers and guests, and led the Board in the Pledge of
EDUCATION SPOTLIGHT	

The State Board of Education's Education Spotlight program challenges board members to identify outstanding districts, schools, teachers and students in their state board districts and showcase them at monthly board meetings.

#### **Bellefontaine Intermediate School**

Students at Bellefontaine Intermediate School are on a leadership quest that is having dramatic results. The school adopted the Leader in Me program with grant funding after a team of teachers sought a program that could help them balance academic development with character and leadership

development. The Leader in Me provided a foundation that makes this work intentional and building-wide. Prior to accepting the board's Education Spotlight Award at the October 2018 meeting, a student team from Bellefontaine Intermediate school shared how the Leader in Me program is impacting them, their school community and the community at large. Madi Zedeker started by sharing information about her school. She then introduced the rest of her team to share their work.

Leader in Me is an evidence-based character and leadership development program built on seven habits. The first three habits are private habits that build prosocial behaviors and help students visualize goals and build pathways to achieve them. The second three habits are public habits that build conflict resolution and communication skills. The final habit, sharpen the saw, helps students create healthy and balanced lifestyles.

The students provided eloquent testimonials about how the program has empowered them and positively impacted their lives. Sloan Stolly shared how she uses the "put first things first" strategy to help her get her homework done. Jack Wilson shared how "thinking win-win" and "seeking first to understand" has helped him resolve conflicts in and out of class. Students are balancing their time, setting goals and achieving more, as evidenced by the school's rising report card grades.

Next, the team shared how the program is impacting school culture. Leader in Me at Bellefontaine Intermediate School is led by fifth-grader Ellie Lang and includes a 22-member Student Lighthouse Team. Each Monday, Ellie creates an agenda, runs the meeting and facilitates decision-making. The group set six goals and uses a Gantt chart to track action steps and progress. To date, the team has met both its quarterly goals: to increase membership and improve school climate. To achieve the first goal, the team put all the Leader in Me principles to work and created a protocol that includes a written application, interview and collaborative activity for students who wish to demonstrate their leadership capacity and join the team.

Hayden Maus shared how the team approached its second goal to improve school climate. The team created the following mission statement: As leaders, the Student Lighthouse Team will make a difference in our school by making kids feel safe, happy and involved. To achieve this mission, the leaders started a new club, the Nice Society Savers and began the "Start with Hello" campaign, which encourages students to introduce themselves to each other and to prevent anyone from feeling left out. Students are asked to sign a pledge stating, "I pledge to include and respect people who are different from me. I will not leave them out on purpose." T-shirts and posters are in development as well.

A former student attended the meeting to share the long-term impact of the Leader in Me program and how he applied it to make a difference in his community. After watching his brother with special needs struggle to use playground equipment at the community park, Jack Varner took action and "began with the end in mind." He put together a proposal to build a Dare to be Aware playground, where all children can play together, regardless of disability. He researched grants, partnered with the parks and recreation department and held fundraisers, including a comedy night. He formed a committee and has raised around \$40,000 to date. Jack walked through each step of his process and how he applied the seven habits to make this dream come true.

Bellefontaine's implementation of the Leader in Me program demonstrates that a commitment to both leadership and high academic achievement can have exponential impact on students, their schools and their communities

- (7) State Board District Teachers of the Year:
  - District 1: Robert Sloan, Van Wert Local Schools
  - District 3: Jason Whited, Centerville City Schools
  - District 5: Chef Olszweski, Polaris Career Center
  - District 6: Jennifer LaPlace, Columbus City Schools
  - District 8: Michele Monigold, Jackson Local Schools
  - District 9: Lisa Wolfe, Indian Valley Local Schools
  - District 10: Nancy Reeves, East Clinton Local Schools
- (3) State Finalists
  - District 7: David Kaser, Barberton City Schools
  - District 4: Bre Sambuchino, Loveland City Schools
  - District 11: Catherine Duplisea, Cleveland Metro Schools
- 2019 Ohio Teacher of the Year
  - District 2: Mona Al-Hayani, Toledo Public Schools
  - State Superintendent, Paolo DeMaria, announced Ms. Al-Hayani as Ohio's 2019 Teacher
    of the Year on September 26th at Toledo Early College High School in front of staff,
    students, community and family members.
  - Ms. Al-Hayani was first selected as the 2019 State Board District 2 Teacher of the Year
    and moved forward as a finalist for this state title, supported by Board member, Mr.
    Chuck Froehlich. As Ohio's 2019 Teacher of the Year, she will represent Ohio in the 2019
    National Teacher of the Year selection process.

Presenter: Angela Dicke, State Coordinator of Teacher Recognition Programs.

Since 1964, Ohio has recognized educators with the distinguished Ohio Teacher of the Year award.

The mission of this program is to honor, promote and celebrate excellence in teaching and the teaching profession. Additionally, the goal is to incorporate this network of exemplary teachers as leaders in school improvement initiatives and in the recruitment, preparation and retention of quality teachers. They advocate and elevate the profession!

Nominations for the award come from traditional and community public school superintendents, principals, students and community members throughout Ohio.

A regional selection process is organized and facilitated by (11) Territory Leads in each State Board District represented by an elected

Board member with the goal of naming one teacher in their region as the State Board District Teacher of the Year.

All State Board District Teachers of the Year move forward as candidates in the Ohio Teacher of the Year selection process where up to 5 finalists are chosen to be interviewed and provide professional presentations. A rigorous deliberation process ensues until one Ohio Teacher of the Year is selected. Every year, the awardee represents Ohio in the National Teacher of the Year selection process.

#### REVIEW OF WRITTEN REPORTS AND ITEMS FOR VOTE

Item 13: Territory Transfer – Franklin City to Springboro City. Mrs. Haycock requested a clarifying map of the proposed transfer that more clearly showed school district boundaries.

#### REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

Budget Discussion

Department Budget Request Discussion: FY2020-2021 Biennium:

#### **Budget Work Continues:**

- 1. OBM Budget Guidance
- 2. 90% Scenario Specifications
- 3. 100% Scenario Specifications
- 4. Board Priorities above 100%
- 5. ODE Operational Priorities above 100%

#### **OBM Guidance:**

- GRF requests for FY20/FY21 limited to 100 percent of FY19 appropriations.
- Agencies also required to submit 90 percent scenario.
- Non-GRF requests based on estimated revenue.
- Budget submission due following board approval.

#### Exempt from Consideration:

- What is exempt from ODE's budget prep?
  - Foundation Formula
  - Transportation Funding
  - Special Education Enhancements

## 90% Scenario Approach:

- Eliminate all earmarks.
- Identify underspending.
- Identify funding needed to match federal funding.
- Limit reductions for student centered programs.
- Restore reduction in accountability funding.
- Apply across the board reductions to remaining operational and program line items.
- Programs tied to federal funding (no reduction)
  - Career-Technical Education Enhancements
  - School Lunch Match
- Programs with 5% reduction
  - Early Childhood Education

## 90% Scenario Specifications:

- Programs with 10% reduction
  - Non-Public Funding
  - EdChoice Expansion
- Accountability funding increased to backfill one-time non-GRF funds used in FY18 and FY19.
- Remaining Program and All Operating Lines reduced by 13.1%

# 100% Scenario Challenges:

- No significant underspending
- Fewer legislative earmarks

Need to backfill accountability shortfall related to use of one-time revenue.

#### 100% Scenario Specifications:

- Start with baseline at 100% of FY19 appropriations.
- Capture underspending and eliminate earmarks.
- Restore funding to Accountability Line.

Board Priorities for Consideration Beyond 100% GRF Limit (Appendix A):

## Early Childhood Education (Strategy 8):

- Funding for ECE has tripled over the last six years.
- Serve more students in quality early childhood education programs.

#### School Improvement:

• Supplement state's modest current investment in school improvement through ESCs, SSTs to help support district/school efforts.

# Meeting the Needs of the Whole Child (Strategy 7):

- Support for students physically, mentally and emotionally.
- Support schools and districts with assistance in forming partnership and integrating community and health services into schools.

Teacher and School-Level Professional Development and Supports (Strategy 1 & 3):

- Support effective and quality principal and teacher professional development.
- Support Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports (PBIS).

# Literacy (Strategy 9):

- Extend the work of the federal Striving Readers grant.
- Broaden the reach of Ohio's Plan to Raise Literacy Achievement.

#### Department Operational Needs:

- Maintain existing staffing and IT levels at the Department.
- Ensure sufficient resources for Department responsibilities and programs.

President Elshoff recessed the Board meeting at 5:00 p.m.

#### IMPACT TEAM MEETING

Following the Board meeting, the Board's Alternative Assessments Impact Team met.

President Elshoff reconvened the meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, October 16, at 8:30 a.m.

The Board's Achievement & Graduation Requirements Committee met beginning at 8:30 a.m.

The State Board recessed for lunch.

#### RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Elshoff reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, October 16, at 1:00 p.m.

President Elshoff asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

#### MEMBERS PRESENT

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Tess Elshoff Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Charles Froehlich Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Meryl Johnson Charlotte McGuire Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan Nick Owens Eric Poklar James Sheppard Lisa Woods

### APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF THE SEPTEMBER 2018 MEETING

President Elshoff called for the approval of the Minutes of the September 2018 meeting. She asked if there were any corrections to the Minutes.

There were no corrections.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Mrs. Flory that the Minutes be approved as presented. The President called for a voice vote.

Motion carried unanimously.

# BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Chair: Tess Elshoff, Vice Chair: Nancy Hollister

Mrs. Hollister gave a report from the Executive Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Committee members approved travel for Board members Dodd and Haycock to the Excellence in Education National Summit in December.

Committee Members also approved out of state travel for Board member Johnson for the Network for Public Education National Conference in October

# BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE EDUCATORS & STUDENT OPTIONS COMMITTEE

Chair: Joe Farmer, Vice Chair: Sarah Fowler

Ms. Fowler gave a report from the Educators & Student Options Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Colleen Grady, Executive Director, Unit for School Options, provided members with a presentation outlining E-Schools and the application process for new E-Schools. Ms. Grady's presentation was to help frame the proposed revisions to OAC 3301-102-09 Approving Applications for New Internet- or Computer-Based Community Schools. The rule is being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review process. Following discussion with Department staff, members agreed by consensus to move a possible vote on the revised rule to the November 2018 committee meeting. Following the meeting, Committee members were provided with supporting information requested during discussion.

Stephen Puchta, Director of Field Services & Pupil Transportation, summarized proposed revisions and public comment for several rules in OAC 3301-83 Pupil Transportation. The rules are being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review process and were presented this month for Committee discussion only. Following discussion, members were encouraged to forward additional questions to Department staff prior to an anticipated vote for recommendation at the November 2018 Committee Meeting.

# BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ACHIEVEMENT & GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS COMMITTEE

Chair: Laura Kohler, Vice Chair: Stephanie Dodd

Mrs. Kohler gave a report from the Achievement & Graduation Requirements Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

## Graduation Requirements:

Staff presented the final recommendation of the Superintendent's Advisory Committee for High School Graduation Requirements. Three members of the advisory committee participated in the discussion. Staff presented an update on the legislative discussions occurring related to graduation requirements. Additionally, staff presented an overview of the available data for the classes of 2018 and 2019. The committee discussed the data and proposed graduation requirements for future cohorts. The committee approved the resolution to adopt the Advisory Committee's recommendations. Full board vote is expected in November. The committee also discussed Vice Chair Dodd's proposed resolution on adjusting the current cumulative points requirements for end-of-course tests and WorkKeys tests as well as removing the content area score points. This resolution will be considered for approval in November.

## Computer Science Standards and Model Curriculum:

Staff introduced and discussed the Computer Science standards and model curriculum. State law requires the standards and model curriculum for computer science be adopted by the state board of education no later than Dec. 31, 2018. It is anticipated the committee will consider approval of the standards and model curriculum in November.

State Testing Update: Staff provided a brief update on state testing.

#### PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON ACTION ITEMS

There was no Public Participation on Action Items.

# VOTING ON THE REPORT & RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

President Elshoff called on Superintendent DeMaria for his report and recommendations.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendations (Items 1-9) on the Consent Agenda:

1. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF STEVEN J. AHLRICHS AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Steven J. Ahlrichs has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 24, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Steven J. Ahlrichs that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Ahlrichs' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Steven J. Ahlrichs is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Steven J. Ahlrichs has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Steven J. Ahlrichs' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or

certificate based upon Mr. Ahlrichs' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Steven J. Ahlrichs be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Ahlrichs of this action.

2. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER
TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD
LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MICHAEL J.
ARLINGHAUS AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING
APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Michael J. Arlinghaus has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on September 12, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Michael J. Arlinghaus that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Arlinghaus' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Michael J. Arlinghaus is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Michael J. Arlinghaus has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Michael J. Arlinghaus' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Arlinghaus' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Michael J. Arlinghaus be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Arlinghaus of this action.

3. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MATTHEW R. COYLE AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Matthew R. Coyle has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 24, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Matthew R. Coyle that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Coyle's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Matthew R. Coyle is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Matthew R. Coyle has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Matthew R. Coyle's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Coyle's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Matthew R. Coyle be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Coyle of this action.

4. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER
TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD
LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF JASON M. EITNER AND

# TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jason M. Eitner has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on September 14, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Jason M. Eitner that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Eitner's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Jason M. Eitner is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Jason M. Eitner has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Jason M. Eitner's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Eitner's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Jason M. Eitner be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Eitner of this action.

5. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER
TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD
LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF LISA C. EUBANKS AND
TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR
A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Lisa C. Eubanks has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on December 5, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Lisa C. Eubanks of its intent to deny or permanently deny her applications for a five-year professional adolescence to young adult teaching license and one-year substitute general education teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Eubanks engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about January 2016 through March 2016, Ms. Eubanks exchanged inappropriate, non-educationally related communications with a student, including but not limited to, 5,510 text messages exchanged between January 13, 2016 and February 25, 2016; and on or about January 2016, Ms. Eubanks and the student had dinner at Applebee's, paid for by the student, and then spent time alone in the student's automobile, which was parked on school grounds after school hours; and

WHEREAS on August 6, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Lisa C. Eubanks that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Eubanks' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Lisa C. Eubanks is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Lisa C. Eubanks has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Lisa C. Eubanks' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Eubanks' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Lisa C. Eubanks be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Eubanks of this action.

6. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF ANDREW C. RANDALL AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Andrew C. Randall has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 27, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Andrew C. Randall that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Randall's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Andrew C. Randall is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Andrew C. Randall has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Andrew C. Randall's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Randall's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Andrew C. Randall be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Randall of this action.

7. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF RHODORA VIDAL AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Rhodora Vidal has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 21, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Rhodora Vidal that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently

revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Vidal's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Rhodora Vidal is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Rhodora Vidal has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Rhodora Vidal's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Vidal's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Rhodora Vidal be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Vidal of this action.

8. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MARK J. WARNER AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Mark J. Warner has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on September 13, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Mark J. Warner that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Warner's decision to no longer engage in the teaching profession; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Mark J. Warner is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Mark J. Warner has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Mark J. Warner's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Warner's decision to no longer engage in the teaching profession. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Mark J. Warner be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Warner of this action.

9. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF LAURA A. WELFLEY AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Laura A. Welfley has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 29, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Laura A. Welfley that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Welfley's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Laura A. Welfley is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Laura A. Welfley has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Laura A. Welfley's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Welfley's decision not to participate in any further

proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Laura A. Welfley be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Welfley of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the Consent Agenda (Items 1-9) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda James Sheppard Tess Elshoff Cathye Flory Charles Froehlich Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan Lisa Woods

#### ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Sarah Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 10):

# 10. RESOLUTION TO RECIND OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-57-01 / ADMINISTERING THE IN-SERVICE TRAINING PROGRAM

The State Board of Education hereby ADOPTS the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code Section 3319.073 requires the board of education of each city and exempted school district and the governing board of each educational service center to adopt a curriculum for a program of in-service training in the prevention of child abuse, violence, and substance abuse and the promotion of positive youth development;

Ohio Administrative Code ("OAC") Section 3301-57-01 describes a program grant for the in-service training program;

OAC 3301-57-01 is being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review process; and

The Educators and Student Options Committee recommended in its September 17, 2018 meeting that the Board rescind OAC Section 3301-57-01.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board approves the rescission of OAC 3301-57-01;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and he hereby is, directed to file the rule with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rule; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rule; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rule relates.

It was Moved by Cathye Flory that the above recommendation (Item 10) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens
Lisa Woods

Cathye Flory Charles Froehlich Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Sarah Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 11):

# 11. RESOLUTION TO RECIND OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-102-01 / PURPOSE

The State Board of Education ADOPTS the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Administrative Code ("OAC") Section 3301-102-01 sets forth a statement of purpose;

OAC Section 3301-102-01 is being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review process; and

The Educators and Student Options Committee recommended in its September 17, 2018 meeting that the Board rescind OAC Section 3301-102-01.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Board approves the rescission of OAC 3301-102-01;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and he hereby is, directed to file the rule with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rule; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rule; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rule relates.

It was Moved by Sarah Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 11) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Lisa Woods Cathye Flory Charles Froehlich Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 12):

12. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND TO APPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE ANNA LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, SHELBY COUNTY, TO THE NEW BREMEN LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, AUGLAIZE COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following preambles and resolutions:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code ("ORC") Section 3311.24, residents Kelly and Tyler Poeppelman ("Petitioners") who reside within the Anna Local School District (Anna LSD) have petitioned for the transfer of school district territory from the Anna LSD, Shelby County, to the New Bremen Local School District (New Bremen LSD), Auglaize County;

Petitioners requested a hearing, and the hearing was held on August 6, 2018, before a duly appointed hearing officer;

The hearing officer, Karl Schedler, in his report of September 5, 2018, recommends that the State Board of Education approve the proposed transfer of territory from the Anna LSD, Shelby County, to the New Bremen LSD, Auglaize County, pursuant to ORC 3311.24; and

In the report, hearing officer Schedler concludes that the transfer would be for the ultimate good of the Petitioners given their proximity to and family relationships within New Bremen LSD.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that upon consideration of the hearing officer's report, including documents provided by Petitioners, Anna LSD, and New Bremen LSD as part of the hearing process, the State Board of Education hereby adopts the recommendation of the hearing officer and approves the request for the transfer of territory from the Anna LSD, Shelby County, to the New Bremen LSD, Auglaize County for the reasons outlined in the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to serve a true copy of this resolution on the Petitioners, the Anna LSD, Shelby County, the New Bremen LSD, Auglaize County, and counsel of record, if applicable.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister and Seconded by Mr. Froehlich that the above recommendation (Item 12) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
James Sheppard

Sarah Fowler
Nancy Hollister
Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens
Lisa Woods

#### NO VOTES

Pat Bruns Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester

## ABSTAIN

Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 13):

13. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE FRANKLIN CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT, WARREN COUNTY, TO THE SPRINGBORO CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT, WARREN COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following preamble and resolution:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code ("ORC") Section 3311.24, a resident ("petitioner") who resides within the Franklin City School District (Franklin CSD) has petitioned for the transfer of school district territory from the Franklin CSD, Warren County, to the Springboro City School District (Springboro CSD), Warren County; and

Petitioner has obtained more than 75% of signatures from the qualified electors located within the property proposed for transfer, and the receiving school district, Springboro CSD, is financially capable of accepting the territory and providing the same educational opportunities and programming it offers its current students.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that upon consideration of the petition, all submitted documents, and the relevant law, the State Board of Education hereby approves the request for the transfer of territory from the Franklin CSD, Warren County, to the Springboro CSD, Warren County; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to serve a true copy of this resolution on the petitioner, the Franklin CSD, Warren County, the Springboro CSD, Warren County, and counsel of record, if applicable.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister and Seconded by Mr. Owens that the above recommendation (Item 13) be approved.

Ms. Fowler stated she did not support the approval of the resolution as it was opposed by both school districts and no hearing had been held to further investigate the matter, therefore she believed there wasn't sufficient information presented to approve the resolution in good conscience.

Mrs. Haycock stated she believed there wasn't sufficient information presented, and the fact no hearing was held, she would not support the resolution.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cathye Flory
Charlotte McGuire
Eric Poklar
Nancy Hollister
Nick Owens
James Sheppard

NO VOTES

Pat Bruns Sarah Fowler Charles Froehlich Linda Haycock

Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Kara Morgan Tess Elshoff Laura Kohler Antoinette Miranda Lisa Woods

Motion denied.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 14):

# 14. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO SUSPEND THE PERMANENT NON-TAX TEACHING CERTIFICATE OF SHAMSA B. ALI

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Shamsa B. Ali holds a permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2000; and

WHEREAS on April 10, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Shamsa B. Ali of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2000 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Ali engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when on or about February 16, 2016, while she was principal of Sunrise Academy, she submitted a principal entry plan to the Sunrise Academy school board that she claimed she had created and was her intellectual capital and not property of Sunrise Academy. Upon investigating, Sunrise Academy determined that the principal entry plan was plagiarized from a report created by William E. Burkhead for Normandin Middle School in New Bedford, Massachusetts and that Ms. Ali did not have permission from Mr. Burkhead to use his report in this manner and she failed to attribute the work to Mr. Burkhead; and

WHEREAS Ms. Ali requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on April 27, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Ali was present at the hearing, and she was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Ali's teaching certificate be suspended for a period of three years, that she be prohibited from applying for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the Ohio Department of Education until she has completed eighty hours of community service and eight hours of ethics training, and that Ms. Ali be required to submit to two years of administrative reporting upon the reinstatement of her teaching credential. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Ali engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession and committing academic fraud when she submitted a principal entry plan to Sunrise Academy as her own intellectual

capital when the plan was really a copy of plan created for a Massachusetts school by a Massachusetts educator who had not given his permission for Ms. Ali to use his report in this manner; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby SUSPENDS Shamsa B. Ali's permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2000 for three years with the suspension beginning on October 15, 2018 and the suspension ending and her certificate being reinstated on October 15, 2021. The State Board also orders that Ms. Ali be required to submit to two years of quarterly administrative reporting upon the reinstatement of her teaching credential with the quarterly reports being submitted to the Ohio Department of Education. The suspension is based upon Ms. Ali engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when on or about February 16, 2016, while she was principal of Sunrise Academy, she submitted a principal entry plan to the Sunrise Academy school board that she claimed she had created and was her intellectual capital and not property of Sunrise Academy. Upon investigating, Sunrise Academy determined that the principal entry plan was plagiarized from a report created by William E. Burkhead for Normandin Middle School in New Bedford, Massachusetts and that Ms. Ali did not have permission from Mr. Burkhead to use his report in this manner and she failed to attribute the work to Mr. Burkhead. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(1)(e), orders that Shamsa B. Ali be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until she has completed, at her own expense, eighty hours of community service and eight hours of ethics training with the community service and ethics training to be pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education, on its behalf, to implement the aforementioned terms and conditions regarding Ms. Ali's certificate. Further, if said terms and conditions have not been fulfilled completely upon Ms. Ali applying for a new license, permit, or certificate, the State Board directs the Ohio Department of Education to evaluate any new applications in accordance with its orders and ensure all outstanding terms and conditions are addressed; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Ali of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Kohler and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 14) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Sarah Fowler
Nancy Hollister
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Cathye Flory Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 15):

15. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO SUSPEND THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL MULTI-AGE TEACHING LICENSE OF ANNE MARIE ANELLI

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Anne Marie Anelli holds a five-year professional multi-age teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on December 22, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Anne Marie Anelli of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year professional multi-age teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Anelli engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession during September 2016 when she failed to maintain appropriate student-teacher boundaries with a student whom she had briefly taught approximately eight months earlier while working in the Westlake City School District: on or about September 10, 2016, Ms. Anelli called the student's home between approximately 1:30 and 2:00 a.m. to inquire about the student's wellbeing and was advised by the student's mother that the student was fine; at approximately 10:40 p.m. the following evening, Ms. Anelli arrived at the student's home and rang the doorbell but left before speaking with anyone; after these events, Ms. Anelli spoke with police and admitted to her actions on September 10-11, 2016, and was advised by the police to cease any contact with the student and the student's family; and during a subsequent weekend, Ms. Anelli was found on the grounds of Westlake High School, where the student attended classes, and was escorted by police officers to a school building where she was provided a letter that restricted her access to school grounds; and

WHEREAS Ms. Anelli requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on June 19, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Anelli was present at the hearing, but she was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Anelli's license be suspended through its expiration on June 30, 2020 with the suspension stayed after June 30, 2019 if she meets the following conditions: she must refrain from either using her license after the suspension period ends or from reapplying for a new license, certificate, or permit until she completes a fitness to teach evaluation and follows all recommendations, completes sixteen hours of training in classroom management and eight hours of training on boundaries, and signs a release for records relating to her health provider records. The hearing officer further recommends that once the suspension is lifted and Ms. Anelli resumes working, she must submit to administrative reporting for a period of two years. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Anelli's unbecoming conduct being mitigated by her relatively young age, lack of any criminal conviction or other misconduct, and the apparent impact her diagnosed but untreated illness may have had on her perceptions and the actions she chose to take; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation, which Ms. Anelli timely filed; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby SUSPENDS Anne Marie Anelli's five-year professional multi-age teaching license issued in 2015 beginning on October 15, 2018 and ending on June 30, 2020, with the suspension to be stayed after June 30, 2019 if Ms. Anelli meets the following conditions: she must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist, who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education and who determines that Ms. Anelli is fit to serve in the school community as an educator, and that she has completed any recommendations; she must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, sixteen hours of training in classroom management and eight hours of training regarding professional boundaries with students with all training to be approved in advance by the Department of Education; and she must sign a release for records for all of her health providers. Further, the State Board of Education orders, that upon the suspension being stayed and Ms. Anelli resuming teaching, she must complete quarterly administrative reporting with the Ohio Department of Education, Office of Professional Conduct for a period of two years. The suspension is based upon Ms. Anelli engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession during September 2016 when she failed to maintain appropriate student-teacher boundaries with a student whom she had briefly taught approximately eight months earlier while working in the Westlake City School District: on or about September 10, 2016, Ms. Anelli called the student's home between approximately 1:30 and 2:00 a.m. to inquire about the student's well-being and was advised by the student's mother that the student

was fine; at approximately 10:40 p.m. the following evening, Ms. Anelli arrived at the student's home and rang the doorbell but left before speaking with anyone; after these events, Ms. Anelli spoke with police and admitted to her actions on September 10-11, 2016, and was advised by the police to cease any contact with the student and the student's family; and during a subsequent weekend, Ms. Anelli was found on the grounds of Westlake High School, where the student attended classes, and was escorted by police officers to a school building where she was provided a letter that restricted her access to school grounds. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Rule 3301-73-22(A)(1)(e), orders that Anne Marie Anelli be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until the suspension of her license is stayed or June 30, 2020, as long as she has completed the required fitness to teach evaluation and any recommendations, completed the required training, and signed the applicable releases for records, whichever occurs first; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education, on its behalf, to implement the aforementioned terms and conditions regarding Ms. Anelli's license. Further, if said terms and conditions have not been fulfilled completely upon Ms. Anelli applying for a new license, permit, or certificate, the State Board directs the Ohio Department of Education to evaluate any new applications in accordance with its orders and ensure all outstanding terms and conditions are addressed; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Anelli of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Manchester that the above recommendation (Item 15) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar

Charles Froehlich Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Cathve Florv

ABSTAIN Nick Owens

Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 16):

# 16. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF LISA M. APPLEGATE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Lisa M. Applegate held a one-year educational aide permit issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS on June 22, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Lisa M. Applegate of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year educational aide permit issued in 2016 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(a), and (B)(2)(d). The notice was based upon Ms. Applegate's 2017 conviction in the Scioto County Court of Common Pleas for one felony count of possession of heroin, 2014 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2005 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of persistent disorderly conduct, 2002 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of theft, 2001 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2001 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of theft, 2001 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of theft, and failure to disclose her convictions on the applications she submitted to the Ohio Department of Education in 2016; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Applegate that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year educational aide permit issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS Lisa M. Applegate did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Scioto County Court of Common Pleas and Portsmouth Municipal Court, and certified prosecutorial records from the Scioto County Prosecuting Attorney's Office; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for

the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(a), and (B)(2)(d), hereby **REVOKES** Lisa M. Applegate's oneyear educational aide permit issued in 2016 based upon Ms. Applegate's 2017 conviction in the Scioto County Court of Common Pleas for one felony count of possession of heroin, 2014 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2005 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of persistent disorderly conduct, 2002 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of theft, 2001 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2001 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of theft, 2001 conviction in the Portsmouth Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of theft, and failure to disclose her convictions on the applications she submitted to the Ohio Department of Education in 2016. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Lisa M. Applegate be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Applegate of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Mrs. Manchester that the above recommendation (Item 16) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens James Sheppard Tess Elshoff Cathye Flory Charles Froehlich Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan Eric Poklar Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 17):

# 17. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE PERMANENT NON-TAX TEACHING CERTIFICATE OF DUSTIN M. BUCKNER (AKA DUSTIN H. MARQUEL)

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Dustin M. Buckner (aka Dustin H. Marquel) holds a permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2012; and

WHEREAS on July 16, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Dustin M. Buckner of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2012 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing revoking all of Mr. Buckner's California educator credentials and denying any pending applications on or about July 23, 2017; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Buckner that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2012; and

WHEREAS Dustin M. Buckner did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, and certified disciplinary records from the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Dustin M. Buckner's permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2012 based upon the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing revoking all of Mr. Buckner's California educator credentials and denying any pending applications on or about July 23, 2017. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Dustin M. Buckner be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Buckner of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister and Seconded by Mr. Owens that the above recommendation (Item 17) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 18):

18. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY THE ONE-YEAR ADULT EDUCATION TEACHING PERMIT APPLICATION OF ARMANDINA S. CASTLE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Armandina S. Castle has applied for a one-year adult education teaching permit; and

WHEREAS on December 6, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Armandina S. Castle of its intent to deny or permanently deny her application for a one-year adult education teaching permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.15 and 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Castle engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about September 1, 2015, when she terminated her teaching contract with the Lima City School District after the tenth day of July 2015 and/or during the school year, prior to the termination of the annual session, and without the consent of the Lima City School District Board of Education; and

WHEREAS Ms. Castle requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on May 16, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Castle was present at the hearing and was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Castle's pending application be denied and that she be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education for a period of one year. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Castle engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession when she improperly terminated her teaching contract in violation of Ohio Revised Code 3319.15 during the 2015-2016 school year; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.15 and 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Armandina S. Castle's application for a one-year adult education teaching permit based upon Ms. Castle engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about September 1, 2015, when she terminated her teaching contract with the Lima City School District after the tenth day of July 2015 and/or during the school year, prior to the termination of the annual session, and without the consent of the Lima City School District Board of Education. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that Armandina S. Castle be ineligible to reapply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after October 15, 2019; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Castle of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 18) be approved.

Mrs. Haycock Moved to amend the resolution by striking out "October 15, 2019" and inserting "May 16, 2019". Dr. Morgan Seconded the motion. Mrs. Haycock stated the date May 16, 2019 was one year from the date of the hearing and would allow Ms. Castle to seek employment in May rather than October, which would in effect, be a two-year suspension.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Charles Froehlich Meryl Johnson Charlotte McGuire Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda

Kara Morgan Nick Owens James Sheppard Lisa Woods

Tess Elshoff

NO VOTES

Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler

Eric Poklar

Motion carried.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Charles Froehlich Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Mervl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan Nick Owens Eric Poklar James Sheppard Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 19):

# 19. RESOLUTION TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT APPLICATION OF STEPHEN G. COLLIER

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Stephen G. Collier has applied for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS on July 3, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Stephen G. Collier of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(a), (B)(2)(c), and (F) and Rule 3301-20-01(E) of the Ohio Administrative Code. The notice was based upon Mr. Collier's 1994 conviction in the Superior Court of Cobb County, Georgia for one felony count of financial transaction card fraud and 1993 conviction in the Superior Court of Cobb County, Georgia for two felony counts of criminal attempt/burglary and one felony count of possession of tools for the commission of a crime; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Collier that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the

State Board of Education will proceed to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS Stephen G. Collier did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, and certified court records from the Superior Court of Cobb County, Georgia; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS Mr. Collier is not eligible for licensure by the State Board of Education since he cannot meet the rehabilitation criteria established by Rule 3301-20-01 of the Ohio Administrative Code because he has two convictions for felony offenses; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(a), (B)(2)(c), and (F) and Rule 3301-20-01(E) of the Ohio Administrative Code, hereby **DENIES** Stephen G. Collier's application for a three-year pupil activity permit based upon Mr. Collier's 1994 conviction in the Superior Court of Cobb County, Georgia for one felony count of financial transaction card fraud and 1993 conviction in the Superior Court of Cobb County, Georgia for two felony counts of criminal attempt/burglary and one felony count of possession of tools for the commission of a crime. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Stephen G. Collier be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Collier of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Ms. Bruns that the above recommendation (Item 19) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd

Cathye Flory Charles Froehlich Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan Eric Poklar Lisa Woods Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 20):

20. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE PERMANENT COMPREHENSIVE HIGH SCHOOL TEACHING CERTIFICATE OF JOSEPH W. EVANS

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Joseph W. Evans holds a permanent comprehensive high school teaching certificate issued in 2003; and

WHEREAS on August 23, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Joseph W. Evans of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his permanent comprehensive high school teaching certificate issued in 2003 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Evans engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about November 22, 2014, Mr. Evans was discovered in a motor vehicle at the East Fork State Park by a park ranger, who observed an odor of an alcoholic beverage coming from the person of Mr. Evans and from an open container of alcohol in the motor vehicle, while Mr. Evans was in the process of searching for a campsite where he knew students were gathering and had previously told a parent that he would be present at this student gathering; as a result of his actions at the East Fork State Park, Mr. Evans was charged in the Clermont County Municipal Court with intoxicating beverages prohibited and subsequently settled the case with a bond forfeiture; on or about March 2015 to October 2015, Mr. Evans sent unprofessional and abrasive emails to the director of Human Resources and the superintendent of the West Clermont Local School District; on or about February 4, 2016 through February 5, 2016, Mr. Evans sent numerous inappropriate text messages to the secretary and principal of the Summit Academy Secondary School in Middletown and continued to message the secretary and principal after they requested that he stop messaging them; on or about February 5, 2016 to March 8, 2016, Mr. Evans sent unprofessional, inappropriate, and abrasive emails and a voicemail to the director of Human Resources, interim chief executive officer, and regional director of Therapeutic Martial Arts of Summit Academy Schools and principal of Summit Academy Secondary School in Middletown; and on or about November 14, 2016, Mr.

Evans was convicted in the Clermont County Municipal Court of one misdemeanor count of operating a motor vehicle while under the influence (OVI). Further, the notice was based upon Mr. Evans engaging in the following pattern of unbecoming conduct involving a student during the 2015-2016 school year: on or about October 19, 2015, while two educators were addressing the student's behavior, Mr. Evans berated the student and when the student responded to his statements, Mr. Evans slammed the door, got into the student's face, pointed at the student, and continued to yell at the student; on or about February 4, 2016, Mr. Evans got into the face of the student, yelled at the student, and had to be physically separated from the student and while being escorted from the room, made a statement to the effect of, "I will take [the student] down the street and kick [the student's] ass"; on or about February 10, 2016, Mr. Evans contacted the student by phone and discussed the February 4, 2016 incident and told the student that he was losing his job, had no insurance, and asked the student if the student had said that Mr. Evans threatened the student; and on or about February 18, 2016, Mr. Evans called the student six times. Further, the notice included the following aggravating factors: on or about August 22, 2013, Mr. Evans was disciplined by the State Board of Education when he accepted a letter of admonishment based on his attempt to make light of a situation by making a statement that provoked an altercation between students; on or about September 21, 2012, Mr. Evans received an oral warning from the West Clermont Local School District for the same incident that resulted in his letter of admonishment; and on or about February 18, 2010, Mr. Evans received a written reprimand from the West Clermont Local School District for failing to follow the proper protocol when dealing with an unruly student; and

WHEREAS Mr. Evans requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on June 15, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Evans was present at the hearing, but he was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Evans' license be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Mr. Evans be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon the serious and ongoing nature of Mr. Evans' misconduct including misusing alcohol in a state park while participating in a camping visit for students, sending unprofessional, inappropriate, and abrasive emails and/or text messages to various school officials, and engaging in numerous altercations with a student, in addition to his prior discipline from his school district and the State Board of Education; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Joseph W. Evans' permanent comprehensive high school teaching certificate issued in 2003 based upon Mr. Evans engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about

November 22, 2014, Mr. Evans was discovered in a motor vehicle at the East Fork State Park by a park ranger, who observed an odor of an alcoholic beverage coming from the person of Mr. Evans and from an open container of alcohol in the motor vehicle, while Mr. Evans was in the process of searching for a campsite where he knew students were gathering and had previously told a parent that he would be present at this student gathering; as a result of his actions at the East Fork State Park, Mr. Evans was charged in the Clermont County Municipal Court with intoxicating beverages prohibited and subsequently settled the case with a bond forfeiture; on or about March 2015 to October 2015, Mr. Evans sent unprofessional and abrasive emails to the director of Human Resources and the superintendent of the West Clermont Local School District; on or about February 4, 2016 through February 5, 2016, Mr. Evans sent numerous inappropriate text messages to the secretary and principal of the Summit Academy Secondary School in Middletown and continued to message the secretary and principal after they requested that he stop messaging them; on or about February 5, 2016 to March 8, 2016, Mr. Evans sent unprofessional, inappropriate, and abrasive emails and a voicemail to the director of Human Resources, interim chief executive officer, and regional director of Therapeutic Martial Arts of Summit Academy Schools and principal of Summit Academy Secondary School in Middletown; and on or about November 14, 2016, Mr. Evans was convicted in the Clermont County Municipal Court of one misdemeanor count of operating a motor vehicle while under the influence (OVI). Further, the revocation is based upon Mr. Evans engaging in the following pattern of unbecoming conduct involving a student during the 2015-2016 school year: on or about October 19, 2015, while two educators were addressing the student's behavior, Mr. Evans berated the student and when the student responded to his statements, Mr. Evans slammed the door, got into the student's face, pointed at the student, and continued to yell at the student; on or about February 4, 2016, Mr. Evans got into the face of the student, yelled at the student, and had to be physically separated from the student and while being escorted from the room, made a statement to the effect of, "I will take [the student] down the street and kick [the student's] ass"; on or about February 10, 2016, Mr. Evans contacted the student by phone and discussed the February 4, 2016 incident and told the student that he was losing his job, had no insurance, and asked the student if the student had said that Mr. Evans threatened the student; and on or about February 18, 2016, Mr. Evans called the student six times. Pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-21(B), the State Board of Education further considered the following aggravating factors: on or about August 22, 2013, Mr. Evans was disciplined by the State Board of Education when he accepted a letter of admonishment based on his attempt to make light of a situation by making a statement that provoked an altercation between students; on or about September 21, 2012, Mr. Evans received an oral warning from the West Clermont Local School District for the same incident that resulted in his letter of admonishment; and on or about February 18, 2010, Mr. Evans received a written reprimand from the West Clermont Local School District for failing to follow the proper protocol when dealing with an unruly student. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Joseph W. Evans be

permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Evans of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Flory that the above recommendation (Item 20) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda

Nick Owens James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 21):

# 21. RESOLUTION TO SUSPEND THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF KHIRY Z. HUFF

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Khiry Z. Huff holds a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS on June 17, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Khiry Z. Huff of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(c). The notice was based upon Mr. Huff's 2018 conviction in the Hamilton County Court of Common Pleas for one misdemeanor count of theft; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Huff that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Khiry Z. Huff did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Hamilton County Court of Common Pleas, and certified police records from the Colerain Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(c), hereby **SUSPENDS** Khiry Z. Huff's three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 from October 15, 2018 through June 30, 2020, its expiration date, based upon Mr. Huff's 2018 conviction in the Hamilton County Court of Common Pleas for one misdemeanor count of theft. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(1)(e), orders that Khiry Z. Huff be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after July 1, 2023; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Huff of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Kohler and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 21) be approved.

Mrs. Haycock Moved to amend the resolution by adding two conditions that must be met prior to reapplication. She proposed that prior to reapplication Mr. Huff completes, at his own expense, a theft prevention class and 80 hours of community service, with the class and community service to be pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education. Ms. Bruns Seconded the motion. Mrs. Haycock stated she brought this forward to maintain consistency with prior theft cases.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan Eric Poklar

James Sheppard Tess Elshoff Lisa Woods

**ABSTAIN** 

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Lisa Woods

**ABSTAIN** 

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 22):

# 22. RESOLUTION TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE GENERAL EDUCATION TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION OF EVETTE J. LANGSTON

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Evette J. Langston has applied for a one-year substitute general education teaching license; and

WHEREAS on May 25, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Evette J. Langston of its intent to deny or permanently deny her application for a one-year substitute general education teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (F). The notice was based upon Ms. Langston's 2014 conviction in the Franklin County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of criminal mischief after initially being charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence, one misdemeanor count of assault, and one misdemeanor count of endangering children for striking a minor near the minor's left eye, causing bruising and/or swelling; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Langston that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to deny or permanently deny her application for a one-year substitute general education teaching license; and

WHEREAS Evette J. Langston did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Franklin County Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Columbus Division of Police; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (F), hereby **DENIES** Evette J. Langston's application for a one-year substitute general education teaching license based upon Ms. Langston's 2014 conviction in the Franklin County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of criminal mischief after initially being charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence, one misdemeanor count of assault, and one misdemeanor count of endangering children for striking a minor near the minor's left eye, causing bruising and/or swelling. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Evette J. Langston be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Langston of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Mr. Froehlich that the above recommendation (Item 22) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister Meryl Johnson

Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 23):

# 23. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE THE FOUR-YEAR RESIDENT EDUCATOR ADOLESCENCE TO YOUNG ADULT TEACHING LICENSE OF MARKEATA A. LEE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Markeata A. Lee holds a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on June 28, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Markeata A. Lee of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Lee's 2017 conviction in the Montgomery County Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after initially being charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence stemming from an incident in which Ms. Lee struck the victim in the head with a rock while his back was turned; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Lee that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS Markeata A. Lee did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Montgomery County Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Huber Heights Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or

license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Markeata A. Lee's four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2015 based upon Ms. Lee's 2017 conviction in the Montgomery County Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after initially being charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence stemming from an incident in which Ms. Lee struck the victim in the head with a rock while his back was turned. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a), orders that Markeata A. Lee may not reapply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after October 15, 2023, provided she submits written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, an anger management class preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Lee of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 23) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Charles Froehlich Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 24):

24. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE GENERAL EDUCATION TEACHING LICENSE OF TIMOTHY D. MILEY

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Timothy D. Miley held a one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS on November 21, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Timothy D. Miley of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2016 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Miley engaging in a pattern of conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about January 2016 through September 2016 when he sent persistent, hostile, and threatening emails to school district and educational service center personnel, including but not limited to the following emails: on January 26, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the principal of Brunswick High School that stated in part, "Your first reason is total BS...I was pissed at you, for not helping me get a lunch... Don't tell me you had no cash to help me...I am fed up with how substitutes are treated in Ohio and you had no right to shock me last night, before talking to me."; on January 27, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the principal of Brunswick High School that stated in part, "Grow up and understand my intellect is far superior to yours. I have more education than you and you are wrong in this matter and I am right. I will give you a chance to make things right, before I go through with this case, that you will lose. Put me back on Aesop, ASAP and stay out of my way in the building??????"; on August 3, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the director of human resources and pupil services at the Education Service Center of Cuyahoga County that stated in part, "By the way, the child principal at Brunswick did frame me and he is a piece of shit."; on August 29, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the principal of Cloverleaf High School that stated in part, "Are you asking your staff to lie??? I have 48 children and one Bitch who know the true story. I told you, you are playing games with the wrong person. I will not take further action against you and your school, in an investigation, if you let me sub in my favorite school and my favorite students."; on September 11, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the director of personnel/substitute services at the Education Service Center of Medina County that stated in part, "You state I was fired for threatening people and using foul language. The worst word I used was Bitch to the principal of Cloverleaf, in reference to the teacher who confronted me last year. The teacher was wrong in what she did and the best word to describe her is Bitch. As far as threatening personnel in the county, all of you gave me no choice and my living situation, with low wages is desperate."; on September 14, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the director of human resources and pupil services at the Educational Service Center of Cuyahoga County that stated in part, "I do not give a damn about you, your staff or the professional people in the schools, because most of them have the attitude of being better than others and to me, that is very toxic...He is getting away with framing me and either you take it out of my folder or I will fight to

have it and anything else removed. Please write back to me, phone me, text me, or I will know you are afraid to confront me like a man."; and

WHEREAS Mr. Miley did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on May 31, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Miley was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Miley's license be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Mr. Miley be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Miley's unbecoming conduct and the negative impact his continued licensure would have on the health, safety, and welfare of the school community; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Timothy D. Miley's one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2016 based upon Mr. Miley engaging in a pattern of conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about January 2016 through September 2016 when he sent persistent, hostile, and threatening emails to school district and educational service center personnel, including but not limited to the following emails: on January 26, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the principal of Brunswick High School that stated in part, "Your first reason is total BS...I was pissed at you, for not helping me get a lunch... Don't tell me you had no cash to help me...I am fed up with how substitutes are treated in Ohio and you had no right to shock me last night, before talking to me."; on January 27, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the principal of Brunswick High School that stated in part, "Grow up and understand my intellect is far superior to yours. I have more education than you and you are wrong in this matter and I am right. I will give you a chance to make things right, before I go through with this case, that you will lose. Put me back on Aesop, ASAP and stay out of my way in the building??????"; on August 3, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the director of human resources and pupil services at the Education Service Center of Cuyahoga County that stated in part, "By the way, the child principal at Brunswick did frame me and he is a piece of shit."; on August 29, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the principal of Cloverleaf High School that stated in part, "Are you asking your staff to lie??? I have 48 children and one Bitch who know the true story. I told you, you are playing games with the wrong person. I will not take further action against you and your school, in an investigation, if you let me sub in my favorite school and my favorite students."; on September 11, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the director of personnel/substitute services at the Education Service Center of Medina County that stated in part, "You state I was fired for threatening people and using foul language. The worst word I used was Bitch to the principal of Cloverleaf, in reference to the teacher who confronted me last year. The teacher was wrong in what she did and the best word to describe

her is Bitch. As far as threatening personnel in the county, all of you gave me no choice and my living situation, with low wages is desperate."; on September 14, 2016, Mr. Miley sent an email to the director of human resources and pupil services at the Educational Service Center of Cuyahoga County that stated in part, "I do not give a damn about you, your staff or the professional people in the schools, because most of them have the attitude of being better than others and to me, that is very toxic...He is getting away with framing me and either you take it out of my folder or I will fight to have it and anything else removed. Please write back to me, phone me, text me, or I will know you are afraid to confront me like a man." Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Timothy D. Miley be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Miley of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Manchester and Seconded by Mrs. Flory that the above recommendation (Item 24) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Charles Froehlich Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Mervl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Kara Morgan Eric Poklar James Sheppard Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 25):

25. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL SUPERVISOR LICENSE AND FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL HIGH SCHOOL TEACHING LICENSE OF WILLIAM D. RHINAMAN

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS William D. Rhinaman held a five-year professional supervisor license issued in 2011 and a five-year professional high school teaching license issued in 2011; and

WHEREAS on December 22, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified William D. Rhinaman of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year professional supervisor license issued in 2011 and his five-year professional high school teaching license issued in 2011 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Rhinaman engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when on or about February 27, 2015, Mr. Rhinaman pled

guilty in the Jefferson County Court of Common Pleas to one misdemeanor count of obstructing official business after he was indicted on or about October 7, 2013 by a Special Grand Jury in Jefferson County, Ohio on one felony count of tampering with evidence, one felony count of obstructing justice, one misdemeanor count of obstructing official business, and one felony count of perjury; and

WHEREAS Mr. Rhinaman requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on July 11, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Rhinaman was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Rhinaman's licenses be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Mr. Rhinaman be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Rhinaman's unbecoming conduct in removing or deleting documents on a school computer network pertinent to the investigation of the rape of a minor child which resulted in a criminal conviction and the negative impact his continued licensure would have on the health, safety, and welfare of the school community and the statewide education community; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** William D. Rhinaman's five-year professional supervisor license issued in 2011 and five-year professional high school teaching license issued in 2011 based upon Mr. Rhinaman engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when on or about February 27, 2015, Mr. Rhinaman pled guilty in the Jefferson County Court of Common Pleas to one misdemeanor count of obstructing official business after he was indicted on or about October 7, 2013 by a Special Grand Jury in Jefferson County, Ohio on one felony count of tampering with evidence, one felony count of obstructing justice, one misdemeanor count of obstructing official business, and one felony count of

perjury. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders William D. Rhinaman be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Rhinaman of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Flory and Seconded by Ms. Woods that the above recommendation (Item 25) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda

Nick Owens James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 26):

# 26. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FOUR-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF GUS RICE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Gus Rice held a four-year educational aide permit issued in 2010; and

WHEREAS on February 21, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Gus Rice of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his four-year educational aide permit issued in 2010 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Rice engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about March 3, 2014, when he failed to supervise the students in his care which allowed two students to leave unaccompanied by an aide or teacher, whereupon the students were unsupervised for a period of forty-five to sixty minutes and during that time one of the students engaged in sexual activity with another student in an unsupervised classroom; and

WHEREAS Mr. Rice did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on July 9, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Rice was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Rice's permit be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Mr. Rice be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Rice engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession and neglect to the highest degree when he failed to notice that students left his class and roamed the school unsupervised for forty-five to sixty minutes, enabling the students to engage in sexual activity in an unsupervised classroom; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Gus Rice's four-year educational aide permit issued in 2010 based upon Mr. Rice engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about March 3, 2014, when he failed to supervise the students in his care which allowed two students to leave unaccompanied by an aide or teacher, whereupon the students were unsupervised for a period of forty-five to sixty minutes and during that time one of the students engaged in sexual activity with another student in an unsupervised classroom. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Gus Rice be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Rice of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Mrs. Manchester that the above recommendation (Item 26) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda

Kara Morgan Eric Poklar Lisa Woods Nick Owens James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 27):

# 27. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF MACKENZIE M. STRITE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Mackenzie M. Strite holds a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS on August 8, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Mackenzie M. Strite of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(c). The notice was based upon Ms. Strite's 2017 conviction in the Bowling Green Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of receiving stolen property; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Strite that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS Mackenzie M. Strite did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Bowling Green Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Bowling Green Division of Police; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(c), hereby **REVOKES** Mackenzie M. Strite's three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016 based upon Ms. Strite's 2017 conviction in the Bowling Green Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of receiving stolen property. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a), orders Mackenzie M. Strite be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after October 16, 2023 provided that prior to reapplication she completes, at her own expense, a theft prevention class that is pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Strite of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 27) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar

Lisa Woods

### ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 28):

28. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL INTERVENTION SPECIALIST TEACHING LICENSE OF PAULA J. WALTER

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Paula J. Walter holds a five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on April 3, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Paula J. Walter of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license issued in 2014 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Walter engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about May 1, 2014, Ms. Walter gave over-the-counter medication to a student without authorization to do so in violation of school policy; and on or about May 7, 2014, in an incident that occurred at school during school hours, Ms. Walter shouted and swore at the special education department chair regarding an email that was sent to administrators; and

WHEREAS Ms. Walter did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on July 24, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Walter was not present at the hearing, nor was she represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Walter's license be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Ms. Walter be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Walter's unbecoming conduct and the negative impact her continued licensure would have on the health, safety and welfare of the school community; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Paula J. Walter's five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license issued in 2014 based upon Ms. Walter engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about May 1, 2014, Ms. Walter gave over-the-counter medication to a student without authorization to do so in violation of school policy; and on or about May 7, 2014, in an incident that occurred at school during school hours, Ms. Walter shouted and swore at the special education department chair regarding an email that was sent to administrators. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Paula J. Walter be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Walter of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 28) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda

Nick Owens James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 29):

# 29. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION'S 2020-2021 BIENNIAL BUDGET REQUEST TO THE GOVERNOR AND MEMBERS OF THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY

Ohio Revised Code Section 3301.07(G) requires the State Board of Education to "[p]repare and submit to the director of budget and management the biennial budgetary requests of the state board of education, for its agencies and for the public schools of the state;"

In July, September, and October 2018, the Superintendent of Public Instruction presented a budget overview for the State Board of Education, along with potential areas of focus;

The Office of Budget and Management ("OBM") is requiring all state agencies to submit two budget scenarios - one that assumes GRF funding is flat to FY 2019 GRF budget levels and one scenario that assumes GRF funding is 90% of FY 2019 GRF budget levels (hereinafter referred to as "OBM scenarios");

The State Board of Education acknowledges that the GRF funding recommendations in the Budget Book Scenario may not sufficiently meet the needs of Ohio's public schools, and as such, the State Board of Education has established key priorities aligned to Ohio's Strategic Plan for Education – Each Child, Our Future; and

The State Board of Education discussed the impacts that the OBM scenarios would have if such funding changes were applied to all FY 2019 GRF non-Foundation program areas within the Department of Education and discussed priorities for funding the Department of Education if these OBM scenarios were implemented.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education approves the budget recommendations, which are attached hereto and incorporated herein by this reference, and directs the Department of Education to submit this scenario to OBM and members of the General Assembly;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education directs the Department of Education to submit the OBM Scenarios in a format and manner required by OBM, and describe within the submission the State Board of Education's priorities and budgetary impacts of funding at these budgetary levels; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education authorizes and directs the Superintendent of Public Instruction to continue to advocate for additional funding as is deemed appropriate for schools, families, teachers, and students of Ohio, the Department of Education, and the State Board of Education.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister and Seconded by Mr. Froehlich that the above recommendation (Item 29) be approved.

Superintendent DeMaria circulated Appendix A, with included a slight revision to the last paragraph. This revision included an additional comment to continue to pay attention to reducing the number of assessments and streamlining the report card process. President Elshoff asked if there were any objections to the addition to Appendix A. There were no objections.

Mrs. Dodd stated she would not be able to support the resolution as she is still unclear who directed the Department to move funds for the report card from one account to another and what areas it is proposed to reduce spending to make up for this.

Ms. Fowler thanked Superintendent DeMaria and his staff for providing the budget information. She stated she was concerned with the appendix because of certain requests for priorities of the Board that she disagrees with. She further stated she would not support the resolution.

Ms. Johnson stated she would not support the resolution due to no inclusion of poverty or inadequate funding. Superintendent DeMaria asked if language was inserted into the document to address those concerns, would she support the resolution. Ms. Johnson stated that she would be open to support based on what is included. Superintendent DeMaria proposed adding "Throughout Ohio students are challenged by poverty, toxic environments, and other adverse experiences. State funding is not being effectively used to address the needs created by these challenges. Ohio's opioid epidemic has also had a particular impact on the challenges that students face each day." President Elshoff asked if their were any objections to the addition. There were no objections.

Mrs. Kohler stated she believed it was the Board's job to direct the administration of those priority items believed to be in the best interests of students, administrators, etc. She was not comfortable with trying to adjust different line items.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Charles Froehlich Meryl Johnson Cathye Flory Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler

Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan
Nick Owens James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

NO VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

### PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NONACTION ITEMS

- 1) Mrs. Kim Davis, Director of Teaching and Learning, Mahoning County ESC. Mrs. Davis spoke to the Board regarding Graduation Requirements.
- 2) Ms. Audrey Elszasz, Chardon. Ms. Elszasz spoke to the Board regarding outdoor education programming for children.
- 3) Dr. Myrna Loy Corley, Superintendent, East Cleveland City School District. Dr. Loy Corley was accompanied by Mr. Tom Domzalski, Director of Research and Assessment, and Dr. Mary Rice, East Cleveland Board member. Dr. Loy Corley spoke to the Board regarding the Academic Distress Commission (ADC) facing the school district.

# Non-Resolutions Old Business

Mrs. Kohler gave a report out from the Achievement and Graduation Requirements Committee.

#### New Business

Ms. Fowler requested that resolutions which refer to accompanying documents include those with the resolution.

Mrs. Dodd requested the plan for conducting January's meeting of the Board. Superintendent DeMaria responded the Department would provide an update at upcoming meetings.

Ms. Woods stated she was putting the Board on notice she would bring back the resolution she had previously introduced at the November meeting of the Board regarding changes to improve understanding and usability of the state report card.

### **Once Around**

Board members were encouraged to share with the rest of the Board, something positive occurring in their districts.

Ms. Johnson Moved to adjourn the meeting. Mrs. Manchester Seconded the motion.

The President requested a voice vote.

Motion carried.

President Elshoff adjourned the meeting at 4:00 p.m. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Education is November 14-15, 2018.

ATTEST:

Tess Elshoff President

State Board of Education

Tess Elshoy

Paolo DeMaria

Superintendent of Public Instruction

**Please note:** Copies of the attachments referenced in the Minutes may be obtained by contacting the Office of Board Relations at the Ohio Department of Education at (614) 728-2754.