STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF OHIO MINUTES

April 2019 Ohio Department of Education 25 South Front Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

MEMBERS OF THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Cindy Collins Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler John Hagan Linda Havcock Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson Jenny Kilgore Laura Kohler Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Eric Poklar James Sheppard Mike Toal Lisa Woods

EX OFFICIO MEMBERS

Senator Peggy Lehner Representative Andrew Brenner

SECRETARY

Paolo DeMaria

Superintendent of Public Instruction

NOTE: Mr. Sheppard was absent on Monday. Mrs. Collins was absent on Tuesday.

The State Board convened on Monday, April 8, at the Ohio Department of Education in Columbus.

Chapter 119 Hearing

April 8, 2019 8:50 a.m.

Hearing Regarding the Amending, Rescinding and Adoption of Rules

President Kohler stated the Board would proceed with the public hearing on the following rule actions:

The amendment of 3301-11-10 Payment of scholarship amounts.

President Kohler called on Amy Golian, from the Office of the Attorney General, Chief, Education section. Ms. Golian called on Diane Lease, Chief Legal Counsel for the Ohio Department of Education.

Ms. Lease presented the following Board Exhibits:

- Board Exhibit 1 is the public notice that appears in the Register of Ohio and references the proposed rule action subject to this hearing:
- Board Exhibit 2 would be a true and accurate copy of the resolution adopted by the State Board of Education regarding this rule,
- Board Exhibit 3 would be a true and accurate copy of the rule as filed with the Joint Committee on Agency Rule Review (JCARR), Legislative Service Commission (LSC) and the Secretary of State.

Ms. Lease explained the rules had been made available to all persons affected by the rules.

President Kohler stated that testimony would be received, either orally or in writing, for or against, the amendment of the rules that are under consideration. Anyone who wished to testify must complete the registration sheet. All testimony would be limited to no more than five minutes. If additional time is needed, consideration would be given to a reasonable extension. Any written testimony would be marked as Group Exhibit 4.

President Kohler announced that the Board would now receive testimony on the proposed actions before the Board.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON THE PROPOSED RULE ACTIONS

There were no requests.

President Kohler called on Ms. Golian, who submitted into evidence State Board Exhibits 1 through 3.

President Kohler stated that the exhibits were so received. As there was no more testimony, she declared the public hearing closed at 8:53 a.m.

STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Kohler convened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, April 8, at 8:54 a.m.

President Kohler asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
John Hagan
Linda Haycock
Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson
Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler
Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire

Minutes of the April 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Lisa Woods Nick Owens Mike Toal

Motion carried.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

President Kohler called on Vice President McGuire, who Moved that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion or compensation of a public employee or official; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the investigation of charges or complaints against a public employee, official, licensee, or regulated individual; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(3) for the purpose of conferring with legal counsel about matters that are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

Ms. Johnson Seconded the motion.

The President called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler John Hagan Linda Haycock Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson Jenny Kilgore Laura Kohler Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Eric Poklar Mike Toal Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

The Board went into Executive Session at 8:54 a.m.

The Board recessed from Executive Session at 10:10 a.m.

Following Executive Session, The Board's Teaching, Leading and Learning and Continuous Improvement Committees met beginning at 10:15 a.m.

The State Board recessed for lunch.

RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Kohler reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, April 8, at 1:00 p.m.

President Kohler welcomed Board members and guests, and led the Board in the Pledge of Allegiance.

REVIEW OF WRITTEN REPORTS AND ITEMS FOR VOTE

Mrs. Haycock stated she would be offering a substitute resolution for item 17.

Ms. Fowler submitted questions relating to item 5.

REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

- EMIS overview
- Perkins Discussion
- Graduation Requirements Update

EDUCATION MANAGEMENT INFORMATION SYSTEM (EMIS) OVERVIEW:

Presenters: David Ehle, Director, EMIS. Marianne Mottley, EMIS Advisory Council Vice-Chair.

Ohio:

- 100.00 Teachers
- 1.7 million Students
- 3,500 Public Education Facilities

Data Sets in EMIS:

- Student Records Demographics, Test Scores, Discipline Data, Program Data, Gifted or IEP Data, Graduation Records, etc.
- Staff Records Demographics, Degrees, Employment Data, etc.
- Course Records Courses Offered, Credits Earned, etc.
- District and Building Data Calendar, Hours Per Day, etc.
- Financial Data Assets, Revenues, Expenditures, etc.
- Five-Year Forecast Future Revenues/Expenditures, etc.

How is EMIS used:

- State and Federal Funding
- Report Cards
- Coordinate enrollment between schools
- Agency priorities cannot be accomplished without EMIS

How does EMIS work:

Single System, Many Parts:

- 1 Statewide System
- 4 major types of reporting entities
- 10+ local data entry systems
- 25 Data Collectors/Information Tech Centers
- +/- 1,100 reporting entities
- 5,000+ local staff entering data

Goals vs. Reality:

- For many initiatives of the Department, EMIS is intersection between policy and what actually happens in a district. Many districts have "one off" exceptions that must be addressed
- A good educational law may cover all but 1 in 1,000 cases
- Guidance from ODE may cover all but 1 in 10,000 cases
- EMIS has a goal of fewer than 1 in 100,000 exceptions

Typical Reporting Window:

- Data elements are assigned collection windows
- Windows typically are open two to four months to give districts time to submit and check data for accuracy and completeness
- Many elements are collected multiple times during the year to allow for updates and corrections
- Data windows are organized to make it easier for districts to review their submissions
- Districts can submit data daily and data are processed nightly to ensure timely feedback
- Several reports exist to help districts check the completeness, accuracy and impact of their data
- Once the reporting window closes, districts may appeal their data to correct any errors from their final submission

Law changes mean changes to EMIS:

- Change in state or federal regulation.
- Legislation reviewed. Develop data requirements.
- EMIS reporting guidelines updated and shared.
- Technology systems updated to collect new data.
- Districts enter and submit data to the department.

House Bill 410 Example:

- · Tracking of attendance and truancy
- EMIS change added reporting 4 dates:
 - Parent notified of excessive absences
 - Absence intervention plan implemented
 - Student becomes habitually truant
 - Habitually truant student violates court order
- · Reporting date easy- what date to report is hard
- Reporting these dates accurately generated hundreds of questions, such as:
 - How precisely do we have to track absences
 - Which absences count
 - o What if we can't reach parents
 - o Does a plan carry forward across years
 - o Does a plan transfer between districts

"Can we add this to EMIS"

- Adding data to EMIS is more than a technical task
 - Time impact on districts
 - o Costs for software, training, and opportunity
 - Ability to provide policy and technical guidance for accurate, meaningful data
- Ultimate goal is to maximize information for policy development, implementation and evaluation while minimizing district impact

EMIS Advisory Council:

3301.0713 ORC

• Authorizes the EMIS Advisory Council to make recommendations to improve EMIS and to provide a forum for communication and collaboration between the Department of Education and parties in the field involved in collecting, reporting, and using EMIS data.

EMIS Advisory Council - Workgroups:

- EMIS Manual and Data Requirements
- District Software and EMIS Data Collector
- Department Data Processing/Ohio District Data Exchange (ODDEX)
- Reports and Impact

Recommendations for Improvement:

- Looking for both short-term and long-term recommendations
- Input from the work groups will guide the recommendations made by the EMIS Advisory Council to the state superintendent
- Meetings will be ongoing as needed and will continue through next year

PERKINS V OVERVIEW:

Carl D. Perkins Career Technical Education Act – Federal Law:

Guidance, support and accountability to states and their career tech programs.

Perkins Overview:

- Connections to federal Every Student Succeeds Act and Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act
- Supports the development of career-technical programs at secondary and postsecondary levels, as well as career readiness work

Timeline:

- 1. November 2018-May 2019 Transition Plan development
- 2. May 2019 Transition Plan submitted
- 3. Spring 2019 State 4-yr plan development begins
- 4. Winter 2020 State 4-yr plan posted for public comment
- 5. April 2020 Submit state 4-yr plan

Updates in Perkins V:

- Changes in some definitions
 - o added definitions where none existed in the law before (concentrator)
 - o added new special populations definitions (tied to ESSA definitions)
- Changes in the relationship between states and the US Dept. of Education
 - o States set own targets for accountability measures under Perkins V, rather than negotiating them with the feds
- Updates to key processes, such as how state targets are set

- Changes to accountability measures
 - o retains graduation rate and placement measures
 - updates to nontraditional measure
 - o new indicators of program quality (states can choose between credentials, work based learning, and college credit earned. Pros and cons to each. Decision to be made during the plan development process)
- Needs Assessments: New requirements for local career-technical education providers
- Equity: Expanded requirements
- Stakeholder Engagement: Expanded requirements

Stakeholder Engagement for Transition Plan:

- 10 regional meetings
- Bi-weekly conference calls
- Focused workgroup on equity
- Expanding engagement strategy for 4-year state plan

Transition Year Activities:

- No significant changes to program delivery for local providers
- Broad engagement with stakeholders on plan development
- Development of supports for local needs assessment
 - o Develop template
 - o Regional equity labs

GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS UPDATE:

- Long-term graduation requirements policy
- Review of Capstone Guidance (Class of 2020)
- Review of Work or Community Service Experience Guidance (Class of 2020)

Long-Term Graduation Requirements:

- State Board of Education reaffirmed the long-term graduation proposal at the March meeting
- House Education Committee Testimony
- Senate Education Committee Testimony

Guidance Overview (Class of 2020):

- Capstone Guidance
 - o Components of a successful capstone project
 - Process for evaluation of students' work
- Work or Community Experience Guidance
 - Approval of experience & verification of work
 - Connecting students to quality opportunities

Capstone Guidance – Legislative Directive:

- For the class of 2020, Section 3 of House Bill 491 (132nd General Assembly) directs the Ohio Department of Education to develop guidance for districts and schools that outlines the components of a successful capstone project and a process for evaluation.
- The guidance shall ensure that each capstone project is designed as a "culmination of the student's high school experience"

Four Components of a Successful Capstone Project:

- Proposal
- Anchor Experience

- Culminating Portfolio of Work
- Presentation

Capstone Proposal:

- Objective
- Timeline and Resources
- Identify Capstone Advisor and Community or Career Mentor
- Clearly Defined Expectations for Evaluation
- Signed Pledge

Anchor Experience:

- Student-directed, authentic learning experience
- Merges passions, creativity and future career interests with the knowledge and skills gained in high school or elsewhere
- Examples:
 - o Semester-long public service project
 - o Internship with business aligned to career interest
 - o In-depth research project
 - o Development of an art exhibit

Culminating Portfolio of Work:

- Collection of documents and major deliverables
 - o Capstone Proposal and supporting documents
 - o Documentation of Progress
 - o Evidence of anchor experience completion
 - Reflection
 - o Evaluations from student, advisor, and mentor
 - o Some combination of original student work
- Bridge between anchor experience and culmination of knowledge and skills

Presentation:

- Student presents summary of project to a panel of individuals selected by district
 - o May use technology-based tools and resources
- Student should be able to respond to questions

Process for Evaluation:

- 1. Planning and Approval
- 2. Anchor Experience Evaluation
- 3. Culminating Portfolio of Work
- 4. Presentation Evaluation

Work or Community Experience Guidance - Legislative Directive:

• For the class of 2020, Section 3 of HB 491 (132nd General Assembly) directs the Ohio Department of Education to work with the Governor's Office for Workforce Transformation to develop guidance outlining requirements for district or school approval of students' work or community service experiences, as well as requirements for verification of the work.

Approval of the Experience:

- Description of proposed work or community service experience
- List of duties, responsibilities, and learning outcomes
- Timeline or plan for completion
- Work or community service experience agreement

Verification of Work:

- Documented hours
 - Time log and supporting documentation
- Student reflection
 - o May include self-evaluation, progress toward learning outcomes, etc.
 - o Student and supervisor verification and evaluation
- May use Department or locally-designed template

Connecting students to Quality Opportunities:

- 1. OhioMeansJobs.com
- 2. Business Advisory Council
- 3. Chamber of Commerce
- 4. Ohio's Partnership with Adecco
- 5. Career-Technical Planning District
- 6. Communicate with all K-12 parents

VOTING ON THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

President Kohler called on Superintendent DeMaria for his report and recommendation.

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 1.A.):

1.A. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE DECISION OF THE HEARING OFFICER IN KIDS COUNT OF DAYTON, INC.'S APPEAL PURSUANT TO OHIO REVISED CODE 3314.016

The State Board of Education hereby **ADOPTS** the following preambles and resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code 3314.016(B) sets forth a process for the Department to annually rate and assign an overall rating to entities that sponsor community schools;

ORC 3314.016(B)(7)(b)(ii) provides that community school sponsors rated ineffective on their three most recent ratings shall have their sponsorship authority revoked as a matter of law, subject to a right to appeal;

On November 15, 2018, the Department issued a notice to Kids Count of Dayton, Inc. advising the sponsor of its "ineffective" rating for their three most recent ratings and that their sponsorship authority was to be revoked pursuant to Ohio law, but subject to a right to appeal;

Kids Count of Dayton, Inc. timely appealed the determination;

The matter was referred to a hearing officer and the Chapter 119 hearing occurred on January 30, 2019 - February 1, 2019;

The hearing officer heard testimony and received exhibits introduced during the three-day hearing;

Minutes of the April 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

The hearing officer issued his decision on March 15, 2019 based on the testimony and exhibits introduced at the hearing;

Kids Count of Dayton, Inc. timely submitted objections to the hearing officer's decision, on March 25, 2019 and the Department responded to such objections;

The State Board of Education has reviewed the hearing officer's decision and the objections submitted by Kids Count of Dayton, Inc. and the response to objections filed by the Department.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the State Board of Education, based on its review of the hearing officer's decision and Kids Count of Dayton, Inc.'s objections, hereby accepts the hearing officer's determination that supports the Department's determination and finds that Kids Count of Dayton, Inc.'s authority to sponsor community schools shall be revoked as a matter of law pursuant to ORC 3314.016(B)(7)(b)(ii); and

FURTHER RESOLVED that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Kids Count of Dayton, Inc. of this resolution.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Dr. Kilgore that the above recommendation (Item 1.A.) be approved.

Ms. Fowler stated she did not feel comfortable supporting the resolution when she has been given less than four days to review the matter thoroughly.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Linda Haycock
Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester
Nick Owens
Mike Toal

Stephanie Dodd
Kirsten Hill
Jenny Kilgore
Mark Lamoncha
Antoinette Miranda
Eric Poklar

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler John Hagan Charlotte McGuire

ABSTAIN

Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

President Kohler recessed the Board meeting at 3:12 p.m.

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

President Kohler welcomed the Executive Committee at 3:27 p.m.

President Kohler asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Sarah Fowler John Hagan Antoinette Miranda

President Kohler stated the Executive Committee had four item(s) to cover today:

- Superintendent for the Ohio State School for the Blind (Possible Vote)
- Board and Commission Compensation Discussion
- Discussion of Guidance
- Discussion on recording committee meetings
- 1) Superintendent for the Ohio State School for the Blind (Possible Vote)

Superintendent DeMaria reviewed with Board members the following resolution:

RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND APPOINTING DR. LOUJEANIA MAYNUS SUPERINTENDENT OF THE OHIO STATE SCHOOL FOR THE BLIND

The Executive Committee RECOMMENDS adopting the following Preambles and Resolution regarding appointing Dr. Loujeania Maynus Superintendent of the Ohio State School for the Blind:

The position of Superintendent of the Ohio State School for the Blind has been vacant and Dr. Loujeania Maynus has been serving as interim Superintendent for the Ohio State School for the Blind, where she has effectively managed the Ohio State School for the Blind;

Dr. Loujeania Maynus was appointed as Superintendent of the Ohio School for the Deaf effective July 2, 2018 and has also served as the Interim Superintendent of the Ohio State School for the Blind;

The responsibilities of the Superintendent of the Ohio State School for the Blind include advocating for the appropriate services for the blind students in Ohio through the development of collaborative relationships with staff. parents, stakeholders and community agencies;

Ohio Revised Code 3325.01 stipulates the State Board of Education, upon the recommendation of the Superintendent of Public Instruction, shall appoint a Superintendent for the Ohio School for the Deaf and a Superintendent of the State School for the Blind;

The State Superintendent of Public Instruction has recommended that this Board also appoint Dr. Loujeania Maynus, Superintendent of the Ohio State School for the Blind;

Dr. Loujeania Maynus is an experienced administrator and possesses the necessary experience, knowledge, and expertise to also serve as Superintendent of the Ohio State School for the Blind; and

In light of Dr. Loujeania Maynus' effectiveness in managing both the Ohio School for the Deaf and the Ohio State School for the Blind, the State Superintendent recommends that she also be named the Superintendent of the Ohio State School for the Blind and continue to serve as the Superintendent of the Ohio School for the Deaf.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Executive Committee hereby recommends that the Board approve Loujeania Maynus be hired as Superintendent of the Ohio State School for the Blind, effective May 26, 2019 and receive an annual salary of One Hundred Thirty Thousand Dollars (\$130,000) to serve as Superintendent of the Ohio State School for the Blind and Superintendent of the Ohio School for the Deaf.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation be approved.

President Kohler requested a voice vote. Motion carried.

2) Board and Commission Compensation Discussion

President Kohler asked if there was a consensus among the Committee members that additional time should be counted for Board members official duties.

Mr. Hagan recommended the following additional hours that Board members could include for preparation time and constituent services per year for compensation:

- Rank and File Board members 144 hours
- State Board President 280 hours
- State Board Vice President 252 hours
- Committee/Task Force Chair 216 hours
- Committee/Task Force Vice Chair 180 hours

Mr. Hagan stated that if all Board members used all allotted hours in a year, the total would be approximately 125,000 dollars. It would be the option for Board members to submit these hours for reimbursement. This would be a new category added to the Board's Policy & Procedures Manual.

Ms. Fowler Moved to accept the recommendations proposed by Mr. Hagan regarding Board compensation and to recommend to the full Board the adoption of the recommendations in the form of a resolution which will be presented at the May meeting. Dr. Miranda Seconded the motion.

President Kohler requested a voice vote. Motion carried.

3) Discussion of Guidance

Superintendent DeMaria reviewed with Committee members the section of his weekly report regarding guidance:

Department of Education Guidance:

On several occasions Board discussion has focused on issues of whether Department guidance is or is not consistent with state statutes or department rules. I am sensitive to the Board's interest in this issue, and want to make it clear that it is not our intention to ever be at odds with state law as reflected in statutes and rules. I also recognize that in the complex interplay of various laws and rules, not to mention specific and unique circumstances that often arise and confront us, there are times when the application of the law can be subject to interpretation. Many parts of our legal system are occupied with adjudicating different interpretations of law. Our commitment is to provide practical and meaningful information to our clients and customers that support compliance and effective implementation, while adhering to the states statutes and rules.

Interestingly the General Assembly has similar interests as reflected by the recent enactment (S.B. 221 of the 132nd GA) of section 121.03 of the Revised Code. This new law, effective in August 2019, directs all state agencies to undertake to "identify principles of law or policy that have not been stated in a rule and that the agency is relying upon in conducting adjudications or other determinations of rights and liabilities or in issuing writings and other materials, such as instructions, directives, policy statements, guidelines, handbooks, manuals, advisories, notices, circulars, advertisements, forms, letters, and opinions" – in other words, agencies are required to become more deliberate in identifying when the agency is relying on a legal principle that is not stated in a rule.

We are working on identifying a process or mechanism whereby we can be responsive to the Board's concerns, as well as the requirements of ORC 121.03 while still ensuring that the Department can be agile and responsive to stakeholder needs for assistance and support.

Ms. Fowler asked if there was a preferred outcome to this discussion or could there be a paragraph regarding guidance be added to the Board's Policy & Procedures manual. Superintendent DeMaria responded the Department would work on the language to be added to the manual.

4) Discussion on recording committee meetings

President Kohler reviewed with Committee members the request that committee meetings be recorded as well as the Board's Business meeting.

Mr. Hagan suggested receiving bids on the cost of the equipment.

Ms. Fowler encouraged consistency in recording of committees each month.

President Kohler stated Department staff would research various alternatives in recording the committee meetings.

President Kohler adjourned the meeting of the Executive Committee at 4:30 p.m.

President Kohler reconvened the meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, April 9, at 8:30 a.m.

RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Kohler reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, April 9, at 8:30 a.m.

President Kohler asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler
John Hagan Linda Haycock
Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson
Jenny Kilgore Laura Kohler
Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens Mike Toal

T. THE I

Lisa Woods

NOTE: Ms. Woods entered the room after roll call.

FULL BOARD ETHICS TRAINING

Presenter: Susan Willeke, Education & Communications Manager, Ohio Ethics Commission.

The State Board of Education received required biennial ethics training from the Ohio Ethics Commission.

The Board's Integrated Student Supports and Assessment & Accountability Committees met beginning at 10:00 a.m.

The State Board recessed for lunch.

RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Kohler called for the approval of the Minutes of the March 2019 meeting. She asked if there were any corrections to the Minutes.

There were no corrections.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hill and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the Minutes be approved as presented. The President called for a voice vote.

Motion carried unanimously.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON VOTING AGENDA ITEMS

There was no Public Participation on Voting Agenda Items.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-VOTING AGENDA ITEMS

1) Mr. Dominic Ravanelli, Medina. Mr. Ravanelli spoke to the Board regarding the Pearson Company and their involvement in the Assessment Process for educators. Mr. Ravanelli provided supporting documentation.

2) Dr. Linda Locke, Urbana. Dr. Locke spoke to the Board regarding Appropriate Developmental Practices.

LEGISLATIVE REPORT

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

- FY20-21 Executive Budget Recommendations
- SB 34 Regards school employment, educator licensure, and conduct
- SB 89 Career-Technical Ed and JVSD in enterprise zones
- SB 110 Modify operation of school academic distress commissions
- HB 123 Regards school security and youth suicide awareness/training
- HB 127 Prohibit new academic distress commissions
- HB 154 Dissolve and replace academic distress commissions
- HB 166 Creates FY 2020-2021 Operating Budget

FY20-21 Executive Budget Recommendations:

Timeline:

- October 2018: State Board approves budget recommendations and submits to OBM.
- March 2019: Governor submits FY20-FY21 budget proposal to legislature
- March June 2019: Budget moves through the legislative process
- July 1, 2019: FY20-FY21 biennium begins

Education: The Big Picture

- Primary & Secondary 43.2%
- Higher Ed 10.4%
- Human Services 26.7%
- Corrections 8%
- Gen. Gov't/Transp. Other 11.7%

GRF Appropriations (FY19-FY21)

Primary and Secondary Education grows by 3.9% in the first year of the biennium and 0.1% in the second.

• Overall growth in the GRF portion of the budget is 3.6% in the first year, and 4.8% in the second. The growth in the second year is primarily attributable to Medicaid.

FY20 ODE All Funds Budget: 13.03 billion

- General Revenue Fund 64.7%
- Federal 16%
- Revenue Distribution Fund 10.2%
- State Lottery Fund 8.7%
- Other State Sources <.5%

ODE Program Areas:

- General State Support
- Academic Improvement
- Adult Education
- Career-Technical Education
- Curricula, Assessment and Accountability
- Early Childhood Education
- Educator Quality
- School Choice
- School Operation Support
- Special Education
- State Administration and Infrastructure Support
- Students at Risk

FY20 Appropriations by Program Area: 13.03 billion

- Academic Improvement .67%
- Career-Technical Education .61%
- Curricula, Assessment & Accountability .69%
- Early Childhood Education 1.48%
- Educator Quality .85%
- General State Support 75.03%
- School Choice 1.1%
- School Operation Support 9.86%
- Special Education 4.16%
- State Administration and Infrastructure Support .39%
- Students at Risk 5.1%

Student Wellness and Success Funding:

- Provided on a per-pupil basis between \$20-\$250 in FY20 and \$25-\$300 in FY21
- Scaled based on census poverty levels.
- All traditional districts, joint vocational school districts, and community schools receive at least \$25,000 in FY20 and \$30,000 in FY21.
- Funding paid directly to educating entity.
- Schools must develop plans for use.
- Funds are restricted to 10 areas of support.
- Schools must coordinate the use of funds with community partners.
- Schools are required to report on how funds were used to support students.

Safe and Supportive Schools:

- Prevention Education Professional Development \$1 million annually
- School Climate Grants \$2 million annually

Supporting Teachers:

- Computer Science Teacher Credential \$1.5 million in FY20
- College Credit Plus Teacher Credential \$3.0 million in FY20

Quality School Choice:

- EdChoice Expansion
 - o \$57.2 million in FY20
 - o \$71.0 million in FY21
- Quality Community School Support
 - o \$30 million annually

Other Budget Items:

- Accountability System
- Teacher Evaluation System
- Innovative Shared Services
- Department of Education Operations
- BRIGHT New Leaders & Teach for America

Other Agency Budget Items:

- Job & Family Services: \$198m for quality improvement of child care; \$5m Books from Birth
- Mental Health/Addiction Services: \$18m for prevention curriculum
- Health: \$30m additional for home visitation
- Public Safety: Tipline funding

Academic Distress Commission:

- Budget language consistent with Superintendent's recommendations on ADCs.
- Allows greater flexibility (no "one-size")
- Creates "Substantial and Intensive Support" status and "Expectation and Support Agreement"
- Authorizes various intervention and support options
- Revises ADC and CEO authority

Other Language Items:

- Community School Mergers
- Community School Teachers
- Prevention Initiative Reporting

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Chair: Laura Kohler, Vice Chair: Charlotte McGuire

President Kohler gave a report from the Executive Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Members Present: Kohler (Chair), McGuire, Hagan, Fowler, Miranda

Board Compensation:

President Kohler discussed Superintendent's DeMaria memo he distributed to the Board prior to the March meeting regarding Board compensation. President Kohler asked if there was a consensus among the Executive Committee members that additional time should be counted for Board members official duties. Board Member Hagan put together recommendations for additional compensation hours.

Board Member Hagan's proposal would include hours for meeting prep and constituent services set at a limited number of hours a year based on the following criteria:

Generally, members could include up to 144 hours for preparation time and constituent services time per year. He also noted that members can choose if they want to count those hours. For members who hold the following positions, they could be compensated as outlined:

Committee/Task Force Vice Chair - 180 hours

Committee/Task Force Chair - 216 hours

State Board Vice-President - 252 hours

State Board President - 280 hours

He noted that if all Board members used all their allotted hours in a year it would increase the costs by \$125,000.

President Kohler noted the Department would request an opinion regarding this topic from the Attorney General's office and would have the opinion prior to the May meeting of the Board.

This resolution passed with a voice vote and will go to full Board in May.

Superintendent for the Ohio State School for the Blind:

Superintendent DeMaria gave a brief introduction to the resolution and commented on the tremendous job that Lou Maynus has done and recommended that her title change from interim to permanent.

This resolution passed with a voice vote and will go to the full Board in May.

Discussion on Guidance:

The committee discussed Superintendent's Demaria weekly report where he referenced guidance. Superintendent DeMaria also discussed recent legislation that requires departments to identify guidance that is not stated in a rule. Superintendent DeMaria discussed how the department is developing a mechanism to address the Board's concerns and the recent legislation.

Ms. Fowler recommended that we put a paragraph on guidance in our policy and procedures manual that summarizes this information. Department staff will put together language for the paragraph and bring it to the May Executive Committee for review.

Discussion on recording Board meetings:

The Executive Committee wants to take a deeper dive into the costs involved in recording Board meetings and equipment that can be used to record. Department staff will look into cheaper alternatives for recording committee meetings and present them at the May Executive Committee.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE TEACHING, LEADING AND LEARNING COMMITTEE

Chair: Sarah Fowler, Vice Chair: James Sheppard

Ms. Fowler gave a report from the Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Members Present: Fowler (Chair), Haycock, Hill, Johnson, Manchester, Owens

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-24-28 Interim License (Strategies 1 & 2)

- Introduced at its March meeting, Members continued their review and discussion of the new rule proposed to assist educators transition to new 'proper certification' requirements set forth in SB 216.
- Department staff summarized and provided Committee Members with public comments received during the rule's 30 day posting.
- Following Member discussion and review of public comments, the Committee voted unanimously to recommend adoption to the State Board. The State Board will be asked to adopt the new rule at its May 2019 meeting.

Model Curricula for Science, Social Studies and Financial Literacy (Strategy 4)

- Introduced following its February meeting, Members continued discussion of the proposed Model Curricula for Science, Social Studies and Financial Literacy to meet requirements set forth in House Bill 170 of the 132nd General Assembly.
- Committee Members provided Department staff with feedback and will provide suggested revisions to the Social Studies and Financial Literacy Model Curricula. Chair Fowler requested that Committee Members send written comments to her and Committee staff by the end of the week (Friday, April 12). Additionally, Members requested the Department provide any data available regarding use of current Model Curricula by Ohio school districts.
- Following discussion, Members agreed by consensus to delay voting on the Social Studies and Financial Literacy Model Curricula. Members did vote unanimously to recommend adoption of the Science Model Curriculum to the State Board. The State Board will be asked to adopt the revised Science Model Curriculum at its May 2019 meeting.

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-24-05 Licensure (Strategies 1 & 2)

- Members reviewed and discussed proposed revisions to OAC 3301-24-05 Licensure as part of the five-year rule review process and to align with requirements set forth in 132-SB 216.
- Members were presented with a summary of revisions and discussed these with Department staff. Members requested additional information regarding removal of certain license endorsements prior to an anticipated Committee vote in May.
- The rule is presented for discussion only this month with a possible vote to recommend adoption to the State Board at its May 2019 meeting.

Third Grade Reading Guarantee: Background & History (Strategies 1-3, 5, 7-9)

- Members were provided a deeper dive into setting the promotion score and examined recent statistics regarding promotion rate. Members also discussed the recommended promotion score and the practical implications of the recommended scores.
- Members requested additional data regarding promotion rates and how TGRG exempt students impact the promotion rates. No action is required this month.
- In May, Members will be asked to consider recommending the 2019-2020 promotion score to the State Board for adoption at their June 2019 meeting.

Report: 2019 Ohio Literacy Academy (Strategies 1-3, 5, 7-9)

• Dr. Melissa Weber-Mayrer, Director, Office of Approaches to Teaching and Professional Learning, provided Committee Members with an overview of the lessons shared and learned at the 2019 Ohio Literacy Academy held in Columbus on March 18 and 19, 2019. The academy assists districts, schools, and early childhood providers working toward raising literacy achievement in Ohio by providing professional learning to support the use of evidence based language and literacy practices.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE

Chair: Antoinette Miranda, Vice Chair: Mike Toal

Dr. Miranda gave a report from the Continuous Improvement Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Members Present: Antoinette Miranda (Chair), Mike Toal (Vice Chair), Stephanie Dodd, John Hagan, Mark Lamoncha, Eric Poklar.

Purpose(s) and/or Goal(s) of Meeting:

- Discuss and review proposed changes to OAC 3301-83-07, 08, 11, 13, and 20.
- Discuss and review the amendment process for OAC 3301-35 Operating Standards for Kindergarten through Twelfth Grade.
- Discuss and review the District Review Process.
- Discuss and review the Continuous Improvement Plan.

OAC 3301-83 Ohio Pupil Transportation Rules:

- Department staff provided an overview and amendments to OAC 3301-83-07, 08, 11, 13, and 20 Pupil Transportation rules which are being amended pursuant to the five-year rule review.
- Members reviewed feedback received by the Department during the public comment period.
- The rules were presented for discussion only this month with a possible vote to recommend adoption to the State Board at its June 2019 meeting.

Overview of Operationg Standards – OAC 3301-35 Standards For Kindergarten Through Twelfth Grade:

- Department staff provided a high-level overview of the OAC 3301-35 Standards for Kindergarten through Twelfth Grade.
- The Operating Standards are being amended pursuant to the five-year rule review.
- Members reviewed and discussed the timeline for the review process.
- Department staff answered member questions related to how the Operating Standards is expected to be implemented at the district and the Department's role in ensuring districts comply with the Operating Standards. During May's meeting, Department staff will provide additional information regarding the Department's role in the implementation of the Operating Standards.
- The rules were presented for discussion only this month and additional information on each rule will be presented to the Committee over the upcoming months, with a possible Committee vote in November 2019.

District Review Process:

- Department staff provided an in-depth description of the district review process conducted by the Office of Intensive Supports.
- Members discussed how, when and why district reviews are conducted.
- To provide an example, Department staff briefly walked through, and highlighted areas reviewed in the 2016 East Cleveland District Review.

Essential Tools And Primary Strategies For Improvement – Comprehensive Continuous Improvement Plan And Decision Framework:

- Department staff continued the discussion on the Center Continuous Improvement Plan. Specifically, Department staff discussed the essential tools and primary strategies for improvement, as outlined in the plan.
- Department staff provided a description of the four essential tools outlined in the plan (Comprehensive Continuous Improvement Plan, Decision Framework, Ohio Improvement

Process, and Ohio Leadership Advisory Council) and how each tool is used to promote continuous improvement at the district and building level.

Items Voted on and Outcome of Vote:

There were no items voted on during this meeting.

Will there be a Vote or Information in Front of the Full Board at Next or Upcoming Meeting?

The full board is expected to vote on OAC 3301-83-07, 08, 11, 13, and 20 during the June 2019 State Board meeting.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE INTEGRATED STUDENT SUPPORTS COMMITTEE

Chair: Charlotte McGuire, Vice Chair: Martha Manchester

Mrs. McGuire gave a report from the Integrated Student Supports Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Members Present: Charlotte McGuire, Committee Chair, Martha Manchester, Committee Vice Chair, Kirsten Hill, Meryl Johnson, Mark Lamoncha, Antoinette Miranda. Other members present: Sarah Fowler, Nick Owens, Laura Kohler and Stephanie Dodd.

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-51-11 Preschool Children Eligible for Special Education (Strategy 8)

- Members reviewed and discussed the proposed rule revisions that resulted from a five-year rule review and changes to align with legislation as a result of HB49.
- Members were asked to vote to recommend board adoption this month. Members discussed feedback from stakeholders and the proposed changes to the rule based on that feedback. The committee recommended additional revisions to the rule.
- The resolution recommending board adoption of the rule as amended was approved. The rule will come to the full board in May for consideration.

Social and Emotional Learning Standards (Strategies 4 and 7)

- Members reviewed and discussed the draft K-12 Social and Emotional Learning Standards.
- Members discussed feedback received by the department during the public comment period.
- The Social and Emotional Learning Standards were presented for discussion only this month with a possible committee vote to recommend adoption to the State Board at its May meeting.

Board Member Johnson's Proposed Resolution

- Members discussed Board Member Johnson's proposed resolution related to the use of Native American Mascots
- Members discussed how local districts have addressed at the local level.
- The committee did not adopt a resolution recommending the board adopt Board Member Johnson's resolution.

Updates on Strategic Plan Strategies (Strategies 7 and 8)

• Due to time constraints, discussion on Strategic Plan strategies was delayed to the May committee meeting.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ASSESSMENTS & ACCOUNTABILITY COMMITTEE

Chair: John Hagan, Vice Chair: Lisa Woods

Mr. Hagan gave a report from the Assessments & Accountability Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Members Present: John Hagan (Chair), Lisa Woods (Vice Chair), Linda Haycock, Jenny Kilgore, Mike Toal

Career Technical Planning District Report Card – Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component:

- Staff provided additional detail on the proposed redesign of the Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component.
- This is a continued discussion on the new framework and availability of data. Supplemental
 materials were included in the committee and full board packet for detail on the proposed
 redesign.
- Members requested additional simulations for the Career Technical Planning District report card to further discuss and vote out of committee at the May meeting. The committee members discussed the goal of moving a resolution through committee in May, to then move forward to the full board in June.

Report Card Rules Review - 3301-28-01,03, 04:

- Members continued to discuss and review the following report card rules (Definitions, Performance Index, Performance Indicators and Prepared for Success).
- After lengthy discussion of the rules, committee members agreed to table further discussions on the report card rules until the June meeting.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS TASK FORCE REPORT

Chair: Martha Manchester

Date of Meeting: March 25, 2019

Members Present:

Task Force Members: Manchester (chair), Johnson, LaMoncha, Miranda, Kohler, McGuire Vaughn, Jones, Gray, Fabiano

Draft Guidance for the Capstone Project and Work or Community Service Experience for the Class of 2020 (Strategy 10)

- Members were provided an overview of the class of 2020 capstone and work or community service experience guidance documents that address the requirements set forth in House Bill 491.
- Members provided feedback on the requirements outlined in the guidance document.
- Recommendations for revisions were made and the draft guidance documents were shared with the Board during the Superintendent's report at the April meeting.

The next meeting will be held on April 29th at 4:30 p.m.

VOTING ON THE REPORT & RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

President Kohler called on Superintendent DeMaria for his report and recommendations.

President Kohler presented the following recommendations (Items 1-4) on the Consent Agenda:

1. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY CHRISTEN J. KOVACS AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Christen J. Kovacs has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on February 25, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Christen J. Kovacs that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Kovac's decision not to participate in any further proceedings; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Christen J. Kovacs is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Christen J. Kovacs has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Christen J. Kovacs' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Kovacs' decision not to participate in any further proceedings. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Christen J. Kovacs be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Kovacs of this action.

2. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY MARY E.
MANLEY AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL
OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS,
AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER
PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR
CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Mary E. Manley has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on March 11, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Mary E. Manley that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Manley's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Mary E. Manley is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Mary E. Manley has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Mary E. Manley's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Manley's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Mary E. Manley be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Manley of this action.

3. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY JOSHUA L. MEGGITT AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Joshua L. Meggitt has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on March 4, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Joshua L. Meggitt that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Meggitt's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Joshua L. Meggitt is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Joshua L. Meggitt has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Joshua L. Meggitt's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Meggitt's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Joshua L. Meggitt be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Meggitt of this action.

4. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY SUSANNE N. RECKER (AKA SUSANNE N. FANGER) AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Susanne N. Recker (aka Susanne N. Fanger) has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on March 12, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Susanne N. Recker that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Recker's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Susanne N. Recker is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Susanne N. Recker has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Susanne N. Recker's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Recker's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Susanne N. Recker be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Recker of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the Consent Agenda (Items 1-4) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd John Hagan Kirsten Hill Jenny Kilgore Mark Lamoncha Charlotte McGuire Eric Poklar Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
James Sheppard
Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Mike Toal

Motion carried.

Dr. Miranda presented the following recommendation (Item 5):

5. RESOLUTION TO RESCIND OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-17-01/PURPOSE, 3301-17-02/APPLICABILITY, 3301-17-04/NOTIFICATION, 3301-17-08/AUDIT, AND 3301-17-09/REIMBURSEMENT; AND TO ADOPT CHANGES TO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-17-03/DEFINITIONS, 3301-17-05/CORRECTIVE ACTION PLAN, 3301-17-06/FINANCIAL AND OTHER PENALTIES, AND 3301-17-07/REPORTING

The State Board of Education hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code 3301.0714(L)(10) mandates the State Board of Education to adopt rules to implement the sanctions prescribed in that section;

The State Board of Education adopted Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) Chapter 3301-17 and the rules in that Chapter are being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review;

Staff recommended to the Continuous Improvement Committee that OAC 3301-17-01, 3301-17-04, 3301-17-08, and 3301-17-09 be rescinded since these rules are redundant and include language already set forth in ORC 3301.0714(L);

Staff recommended to the Continuous Improvement Committee that OAC 3301-17-03, 3301-17-05, 3301-17-06, and 3301-17-07 be amended to remove redundancy and to provide clarity;

Staff recommended to the Continuous Improvement Committee that no changes be made to OAC 3301-17-02;

The Continuous Improvement Committee recommended in its March 11, 2019 meeting that the State Board of Education adopt the rules in the form presented to the Committee; and

After further review, Staff recommends rescinding OAC 3301-17-02 because the language is redundant and included in OAC 3301-17-03.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education hereby approves rescinding 3301-17-01, 3301-17-02, 3301-17-04, 3301-17-08, and 3301-17-09; and approves amending OAC 3301-17-03, 3301-17-05, 3301-17-06, and 3301-17-07;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relates.

It was Moved by Dr. Miranda that the above recommendation (Item 5) be approved.

Ms. Fowler Moved to amend the resolution by substitution. She stated the proposed amendment would consolidate rule -02 with rule -03. A line would also be added to rule -06 (C) at the end; "at least thirty (30) days before the department withholds any additional funding as a result of the higher degree of sanction along with the basis for such withholding." Mr. Hagan Seconded the motion.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler John Hagan Linda Haycock Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson Jenny Kilgore Laura Kohler Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Eric Poklar James Sheppard Mike Toal

Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler John Hagan Linda Haycock Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson Jenny Kilgore Laura Kohler Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Eric Poklar James Sheppard Mike Toal

Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 6):

6. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-24-22 / ALTERNATIVE RESIDENT EDUCATOR LICENSE FOR CAREER TECHNICAL WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT

The State Board of Education ("Board") hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.07 allows the Board to adopt rules necessary for carrying out any function imposed on it by law;

ORC 3319.22 allows the Board to adopt, amend, or rescind rules for educator licenses;

ORC 3319.229, as adopted in House Bill 98 of the 132nd General Assembly, requires the Board to adopt rules establishing standards and requirements for obtaining a two-year initial career-technical workforce development educator license and a five-year advanced career technical workforce development educator license;

The Teaching, Leading, and Learning Committee recommended at its March 2019 meeting that the Board adopt Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-24-22 / Alternative Resident Educator License for Career Technical Workforce Development in the form attached hereto;

In accordance with the Legislative Service Commission Rule Drafting Manual Section 4.3.1, since more than 50 percent of the rule is being amended, the existing rule is being rescinded and a new rule, bearing the same number, is being adopted.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Board approves rescinding the existing OAC 3301-24-22 and adopting a new rule, bearing the same number, in the form attached hereto;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relates.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 6) be approved.

Ms. Woods asked that in section B, would it be possible to add a High-School Equivalency because many individuals in the construction trades earn a GED. Ms. Lease responded that the High-School diploma requirement was in statute, therefore, we would not have the ability to accept a GED. Superintendent DeMaria stated the Department could recommend this as a legislative recommendation.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES Stephanie Dodd John Hagan

Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Minutes of the April 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Jenny Kilgore
Mark Lamoncha
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
James Sheppard

Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Mike Toal

NO VOTES Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson

Motion carried.

Dr. Miranda presented the following recommendation (Item 7):

7. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-34-01 AND 3301-34-03; TO RESCIND OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-34-02; AND TO ADOPT NO CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-34-04 THROUGH 06 / EXCUSES FROM COMPULSORY ATTENDANCE FOR HOME EDUCATION

The State Board of Education ADOPTS the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code 3321.04 permits the State Board of Education to prescribe conditions by rule governing the issuance of excuses from compulsory attendance;

The State Board of Education adopted Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) Chapter 3301-34 and the rules in that Chapter are being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review;

Staff recommended to the Continuous Improvement Committee that OAC 3301-34-01 and 3301-34-03 be amended to update the definition of "Superintendent" and to clarify the notice requirements;

Staff recommended to the Continuous Improvement Committee that OAC 3301-34-02 be rescinded as the purpose of the rules in the Chapter is already set forth in law;

Staff recommended to the Continuous Improvement Committee that no changes be made to OAC 3301-34-04, 3301-34-05, and 3301-34-06; and

The Continuous Improvement Committee recommended in its March 11, 2019 meeting that the State Board of Education adopt the rules in the form presented to the State Board of Education.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education hereby approves amending 3301-34-01 and 3301-34-03; approve rescinding OAC 3301-34-02; and approve no changes to OAC 3301-34-04, 3301-34-05, and 3301-34-06:

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relates.

It was Moved by Dr. Miranda that the above recommendation (Item 7) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd John Hagan Kirsten Hill Jenny Kilgore Mark Lamoncha Charlotte McGuire Nick Owens James Sheppard Lisa Woods Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Eric Poklar

Mike Toal

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 8):

8. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE THE FIVE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE MIDDLE CHILDHOOD TEACHING LICENSE OF ELIZABETH M. CALLEN

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Elizabeth M. Callen holds a five-year substitute middle childhood teaching license issued in 2017 with an effective year of 2018; and

WHEREAS on January 25, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Elizabeth M. Callen of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year substitute middle childhood teaching license issued in 2017 with an effective date of 2018 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(c). The notice was based upon Ms. Callen's 2018 conviction in the Delaware Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of theft, 2018 conviction in the Upper Arlington Mayor's Court for one misdemeanor count of criminal damaging or

endangering, and 2018 conviction in the Westerville Mayor's Court for one misdemeanor count of reckless operation of a motor vehicle; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Callen that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year substitute middle childhood teaching license issued in 2017 with an effective year of 2018; and

WHEREAS Elizabeth M. Callen did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Delaware Municipal Court, Upper Arlington Mayor's Court, and Westerville Mayor's Court, and certified police records from the Delaware County Sheriff's Office, Upper Arlington Police Division, and Westerville Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(c), hereby **REVOKES** Elizabeth M. Callen's five-year substitute middle childhood teaching license issued in 2017 with an effective year of 2018 based upon Ms. Callen's 2018 conviction in the Delaware Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of theft, 2018 conviction in the Upper Arlington Mayor's Court for one misdemeanor count of criminal damaging or endangering, and 2018 conviction in the Westerville Mayor's Court for one misdemeanor count of reckless operation of a motor vehicle. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a), orders that Elizabeth M. Callen be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after April 9, 2022, and that upon reapplication, she must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, a drug/alcohol assessment by a licensed counselor who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education, a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education, and any additional counseling and/or treatment recommended by the licensed counselor or the licensed psychologist or psychiatrist; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Callen of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Woods and Seconded by Mrs. Manchester that the above recommendation (Item 8) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd John Hagan Kirsten Hill Jenny Kilgore Mark Lamoncha Charlotte McGuire Nick Owens James Sheppard Lisa Woods Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda

Eric Poklar Mike Toal

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 9):

Original Resolution:

9. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY THE ONE-YEAR EXTENSION OF A FOUR-YEAR RESIDENT EDUCATOR ADOLESCENCE TO YOUNG ADULT TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION AND TO REVOKE THE FOUR-YEAR RESIDENT EDUCATOR ADOLESCENCE TO YOUNG ADULT TEACHING LICENSE OF DAVID M. CHRISTIAN

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS David M. Christian has applied for a one-year extension of a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license and held a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on April 18, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified David M. Christian of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a one-year extension of a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license and to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Christian's 2017 conviction in the Stow Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after having been charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence and one misdemeanor count of endangering children; and

WHEREAS Mr. Christian requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on November 16, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Christian was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Christian's pending application be denied and his four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 be revoked. Further it is recommended that Mr. Christian be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education for a period of two years and that prior to reapplication, Mr. Christian must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed a parenting class, an anger management class, and a gun safety class. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Christian's conviction, which involved reckless behavior and resulted in physical injury to a minor, being mitigated by the significant testimony that he has excelled as a leader, teacher, and role model; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation which Mr. Christian timely filed; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** David M. Christian's application for a one-year extension of a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license and REVOKES David M. Christian's four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 based upon Mr. Christian's 2017 conviction in the Stow Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after having been charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence and one misdemeanor count of endangering children. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that David M. Christian be ineligible to reapply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after April 9, 2021, and that prior to reapplication, Mr. Christian must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed, at his own expense, classes in parenting, anger management, and gun safety with the classes to be preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Christian of this action.

It was Moved by Dr. Kilgore and Seconded by Mrs. Hill that the original recommendation (Item 9) be approved.

President Kohler announced the Board would first vote on the original resolution presented to the Board and the resolution presented by Mrs. McGuire. The original resolution has the highest level of penalty and Mrs. McGuire's resolution has the second highest level of penalty.

Mrs. McGuire Moved to amend the resolution by substitution. Mrs. Hill Seconded the motion. She proposed the following substitute resolution. Mrs. McGuire felt this situation occurred as a parent and not as an educator.

McGuire Resolution:

9. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT, TO MODIFY THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, TO DENY THE ONE-YEAR EXTENSION OF A FOUR-YEAR RESIDENT EDUCATOR ADOLESCENCE TO YOUNG ADULT TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION, AND TO REVOKE THE FOUR-YEAR RESIDENT EDUCATOR ADOLESCENCE TO YOUNG ADULT TEACHING LICENSE OF DAVID M. CHRISTIAN

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS David M. Christian has applied for a one-year extension of a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license and held a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on April 18, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified David M. Christian of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a one-year extension of a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license and to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Christian's 2017 conviction in the Stow Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after having been charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence and one misdemeanor count of endangering children; and

WHEREAS Mr. Christian requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on November 16, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Christian was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Christian's pending application be denied and his four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 be revoked. Further it is recommended that Mr. Christian be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education for a period of two years and that prior to reapplication, Mr. Christian must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed a parenting class, an anger management class, and a gun safety class. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Christian's conviction, which involved reckless behavior and

resulted in physical injury to a minor, being mitigated by the significant testimony that he has excelled as a leader, teacher, and role model; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation which Mr. Christian timely filed; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's Report and Recommendation: reject in its entirety the Recommendation Section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in their entirety the last two sentences of the first full paragraph on page 32 of the Report and Recommend that begin, "However, the Hearing Officer also recommends..."; and reject in its entirety the second full paragraph on page 42 of the Report and Recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board may determine that a penalty outside the range of the disciplinary guidelines listed in the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators* is more appropriate in an individual case based upon the aggravating and mitigating factors as outlined in Section 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and any other factors the State Board considers relevant; and

WHEREAS the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following mitigating factors: Mr. Christian's conduct was not intentional but was an unfortunate accident; the incident did not involve a student and did not occur on school grounds or during a school activity but instead occurred during a family gathering at Mr. Christian's home; the injury to the minor child was very minor, and Mr. Christian has taken responsibility for his actions that resulted in the small welt on the child's lower back; the administrative record was replete with testimony about Mr. Christian's excellent reputation as a devoted father and person who has excelled as a leader, teacher, and role model with significant positive long-term influence over others; and many of the witnesses at the hearing testified to the rancor between Mr. Christian and the minor child's mother with some witnesses indicating that this family custody dispute contributed to the filing of the criminal charges in this matter; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when he did not give the preceding facts and mitigating factors the weight they deserved when he made his recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that it has been almost two years since Mr. Christian's criminal conviction and allowing him to reapply on July 13, 2019 would coincide with the end of his two-year period of probation in his disorderly conduct case. The State Board further concludes that allowing Mr. Christion to reapply in July 2019 would not demean the nature and seriousness of his conduct based on the significant mitigating factors in this case: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's Report and Recommendation: reject in its entirety the Recommendation Section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in their entirety the last two sentences of the first full paragraph on page 32 of the Report and Recommend that begin, "However, the Hearing Officer also recommends..."; and reject in its entirety the second full paragraph on page 42 of the Report and Recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board may determine that a penalty outside the range of the disciplinary guidelines listed in the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators* is more appropriate in an individual case based upon the aggravating and mitigating factors as outlined in Section 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and any other factors the State Board considers relevant; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following mitigating factors: Mr. Christian's conduct was not intentional but was an unfortunate accident; the incident did not involve a student and did not occur on school grounds or during a school activity but instead occurred during a family gathering at Mr. Christian's home; the injury to the minor child was very minor, and Mr. Christian has taken responsibility for his actions that resulted in the small welt on the child's lower back; the administrative record was replete with testimony about Mr. Christian's excellent reputation as a devoted father and person who has excelled as a leader, teacher, and role model with significant positive long-term influence over others; and many of the witnesses at the hearing testified to the rancor between Mr. Christian and the minor child's mother with some witnesses indicating that this family custody dispute contributed to the filing of the criminal charges in this matter; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when he did not give the preceding facts and mitigating factors the weight they deserved when he made his recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that it has been almost two years since Mr. Christian's criminal conviction and allowing him to reapply on July 13, 2019 would coincide with the end of his two-year period of probation in his disorderly conduct case. The State Board further concludes that allowing Mr. Christion to reapply in July 2019 would not demean the nature and seriousness of his conduct based on the significant mitigating factors in this case; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** David M. Christian's application for a one-year extension of a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license and **REVOKES** David M. Christian's four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 based upon Mr. Christian's 2017 conviction in the Stow Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after having been charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence and one misdemeanor count of endangering children. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative

Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a) and (A)(3)(a), orders that David M. Christian be ineligible to reapply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after July 13, 2019; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Christian of this action.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote for Board members to either vote for the Hearing Officer recommendation or Mrs. McGuire's substitute resolution.

CHARLOTTE MCGUIRE SUBSTITUTE RESOLUTION:

Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Jenny Kilgore
Mark Lamoncha
Charlotte McGuire
Eric Poklar
Mike Toal

Lisa Woods

HEARING OFFICER RECOMMENDATION

Stephanie Dodd

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

The Motion carried for Mrs. McGuire's substitute resolution.

Ms. Fowler Moved to Amend by substitution. She proposed the following substitute resolution. Mr. Sheppard Seconded the motion. Ms. Fowler stated the elapsed time and the record reflecting the intense family custody dispute that was occurring were additional factors in the case as well as perceived bias by the Hearing Officer.

Fowler Resolution:

9. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY THE ONE-YEAR EXTENSION OF A FOUR-YEAR RESIDENT EDUCATOR ADOLESCENCE TO YOUNG ADULT TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION AND TO REVOKE THE FOUR-YEAR RESIDENT EDUCATOR ADOLESCENCE TO YOUNG ADULT TEACHING LICENSE OF DAVID M. CHRISTIAN

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS David M. Christian has applied for a one-year extension of a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license and held a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on April 18, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified David M. Christian of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a one-year extension of a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license and to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Christian's 2017 conviction in the Stow Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after having been charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence and one misdemeanor count of endangering children; and

WHEREAS Mr. Christian requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on November 16, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Christian was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Christian's pending application be denied and his four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 be revoked. Further it is recommended that Mr. Christian be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education for a period of two years and that prior to reapplication, Mr. Christian must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed a parenting class, an anger management class, and a gun safety class. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Christian's conviction, which involved reckless behavior and resulted in physical injury to a minor, being mitigated by the significant testimony that he has excelled as a leader, teacher, and role model; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation which Mr. Christian timely filed; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** David M. Christian's application for a one-year extension of a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license and **REVOKES** David M. Christian's four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 based upon Mr. Christian's 2017 conviction in the Stow Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after having been charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence and one misdemeanor count of endangering children. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that David M. Christian be ineligible to reapply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after April 9, 2021, and that prior to reapplication, Mr. Christian must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed, at his own expense, classes in parenting, anger

management, and gun safety with the classes to be preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Christian of this action.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote for Board members to either vote for Ms. Fowler's substitute resolution or Mrs. McGuire's substitute resolution.

SARAH FOWLER SUBSTITUTE RESOLUTION

Sarah Fowler John Hagan
Linda Haycock Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson Jenny Kilgore
Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda James Sheppard

Lisa Woods

CHARLOTTE MCGUIRE SUBSTITUTE RESOLUTIOIN

Stephanie Dodd Charlotte McGuire

Eric Poklar Mike Toal

Laura Kohler

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

The Motion carried for Ms. Fowler's substitute resolution.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended (Ms. Fowler's substitute resolution).

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler
John Hagan Linda Haycock
Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson
Jenny Kilgore Laura Kohler
Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester

Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar James Sheppard Mike Toal

Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Charlotte McGuire

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 10):

10. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL HIGH SCHOOL TEACHING LICENSE, FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL PRINCIPAL LICENSE, AND THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT APPLICATIONS OF WILLIAM E. DAWSON

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS William E. Dawson has applied for a five-year professional high school teaching license, five-year professional principal license, and three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS on May 7, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified William E. Dawson of its intent to deny or permanently deny his applications for a five-year professional high school teaching license, five-year professional principal license, and three-year pupil activity permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Dawson, on or about the summer of 2013, the 2013/2014 school year, and the 2014/2015 school year, failing to adhere to appropriate student/teacher boundaries when he engaged in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: he loaned a student \$2,700.00 to purchase a car and charged the student an additional \$300.00 in interest; he paid the phone bill of a student and had that student complete yardwork at his home as repayment; he gave numerous students rides in his personal vehicle; he had numerous students over to his home where he provided them food and allowed them to use his hot tub; and he had poker parties at his home for former students and he allowed a current student to participate on one occasion; and

WHEREAS Mr. Dawson requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on November 30, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Dawson was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Dawson's pending applications be denied. Further it is recommended that Mr. Dawson be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until Mr. Dawson provides written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has successfully completed a fitness to teach evaluation with a psychologist who has experience with grooming and who finds that Mr. Dawson is fit to continue teaching and coaching students and Mr. Dawson must also provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed, at his own expense, twenty-four hours of training on boundaries. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Dawson engaging in a pattern of conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession by loaning a student money to purchase a car and charging the student interest, by paying the phone bill of a student and having that student complete yardwork at his home as repayment, by giving numerous students rides in his car, by having numerous students over to his home and providing them food and allowing them to use his

hot tub, and by having poker parties at his home for former students and, on one occasion, allowing a current student to participate; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation which Mr. Dawson timely filed; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** William E. Dawson's applications for a five-year professional high school teaching license, five-year professional principal license, and three-year pupil activity permit based upon Mr. Dawson, on or about the summer of 2013, the 2013/2014 school year, and the 2014/2015 school year, failing to adhere to appropriate student/teacher boundaries when he engaged in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: he loaned a student \$2,700.00 to purchase a car and charged the student an additional \$300.00 in interest; he paid the phone bill of a student and had that student complete yardwork at his home as repayment; he gave numerous students rides in his personal vehicle; he had numerous students over to his home where he provided them food and allowed them to use his hot tub; and he had poker parties at his home for former students and he allowed a current student to participate on one occasion. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that William E. Dawson be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until he provides written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed, at his own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who has experience with grooming, who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education, and who determines that Mr. Dawson is fit to serve in the school community as an educator and/or coach and that he has completed any recommendations from the evaluation, and Mr. Dawson must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed, at his own expense, twenty-four hours of training regarding professional boundaries with students with the training to be preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Dawson of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Ms. Woods that the above recommendation (Item 10) be approved.

Mrs. Haycock Moved to amend the resolution by substitution. She proposed the following resolution. Mr. Owens Seconded the motion.

Ms. Fowler stated she agreed to the proposal that the individual would be required to receive additional hours in boundary training but was concerned with separating the coaching license from the teaching licenses. She felt the pattern of behavior could happen in either setting.

Ms. Johnson spoke in favor of the proposed resolution.

10. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT, TO MODIFY THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, TO DENY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL HIGH SCHOOL TEACHING LICENSE AND FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL PRINCIPAL LICENSE APPLICATIONS, AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT APPLICATIONS OF WILLIAM E. DAWSON

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS William E. Dawson has applied for a five-year professional high school teaching license, five-year professional principal license, and three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS on May 7, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified William E. Dawson of its intent to deny or permanently deny his applications for a five-year professional high school teaching license, five-year professional principal license, and three-year pupil activity permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Dawson, on or about the summer of 2013, the 2013/2014 school year, and the 2014/2015 school year, failing to adhere to appropriate student/teacher boundaries when he engaged in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: he loaned a student \$2,700.00 to purchase a car and charged the student an additional \$300.00 in interest; he paid the phone bill of a student and had that student complete yardwork at his home as repayment; he gave numerous students rides in his personal vehicle; he had numerous students over to his home where he provided them food and allowed them to use his hot tub; and he had poker parties at his home for former students and he allowed a current student to participate on one occasion; and

WHEREAS Mr. Dawson requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on November 30, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Dawson was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Dawson's pending applications be denied. Further it is recommended that Mr. Dawson be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until Mr. Dawson provides written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has successfully completed a fitness to teach evaluation with a psychologist who has experience with grooming and who finds that Mr. Dawson is fit to continue teaching and coaching students and Mr. Dawson must also provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed, at his own expense, twenty-four hours of training on boundaries. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Dawson engaging in a

pattern of conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession by loaning a student money to purchase a car and charging the student interest, by paying the phone bill of a student and having that student complete yardwork at his home as repayment, by giving numerous students rides in his car, by having numerous students over to his home and providing them food and allowing them to use his hot tub, and by having poker parties at his home for former students and, on one occasion, allowing a current student to participate; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation which Mr. Dawson timely filed; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's Report and Recommendation: reject the portion of the hearing officer's recommendation in the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet that would allow Mr. Dawson to reapply for a pupil activity permit but accept the portion that would allow him to reapply for other licenses when he completes a fitness to teach evaluation and twenty-four hours of boundary training; reject the portion of the hearing officer's recommendation in the last sentence of the third full paragraph on page 30 of the Report and Recommendation that would allow Mr. Dawson to reapply for a pupil activity permit but accept the portion that would allow him to reapply for other licenses when he completes a fitness to teach evaluation and twenty-four hours of boundary training; and reject the portion of the hearing officer's recommendation in the first paragraph of the Recommendation section on page 40 of the Report and Recommendation that would allow Mr. Dawson to reapply for a pupil activity permit but accept the portion that would allow him to reapply for other licenses when he completes a fitness to teach evaluation and twenty-four hours of boundary training; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board may determine that a penalty outside the range of the disciplinary guidelines listed in the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators* is more appropriate in an individual case based upon the aggravating and mitigating factors as outlined in Section 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and any other factors the State Board considers relevant; and

WHEREAS the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following aggravating factors: the nature and seriousness of Mr. Dawson's conduct includes multiple violations of student-teacher boundaries that occurred over the course of at least two school years including, but not limited to, him loaning a student a substantial amount of money with interest and arranging the repayment terms at the football field, adding a student-athlete to his personal cell phone plan, providing apparel to student-athletes, transporting multiple student-athletes in his personal car on numerous occasions, frequently having student-athletes over to his home for team meals and to watch game films and on at least

one occasion allowing student-athletes to use the hot tub at his house, and hosting money-stakes poker parties at his home for former students and on one occasion allowing a current student to participate; Mr. Dawson was a teacher/coach with twenty years of experience and despite his testimony that he had misgivings about loaning a student money, adding a student to his cell phone plan, and allowing a student to attend a poker game at his house, Mr. Dawson went forward with these actions and violated appropriate student-teacher boundaries; Mr. Dawson's conduct negatively impacted the education community which caused a combined police and school investigation with several interviewed people expressing concern over the special bond that he had formed with some student-athletes; and Xenia Community Schools imposed disciplinary action and removed him from his coaching duties because the administration did not want him coaching again; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when he did not give the preceding facts and aggravating factors the weight they deserved when he made his recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that the culture and climate of a school, including possible student-teacher boundary violations by other educators, does not negate Mr. Dawson's conduct nor release him from professional standards to maintain appropriate student-teacher boundaries; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that based on Mr. Dawson's repeated boundary violations with student-athletes, coaching settings being less structured and less monitored than classroom settings, and the other aggravating factors in this case a more appropriate sanction would be to deny Mr. Dawson's pupil activity permit permanently and deny his teaching and administrative licenses but allow him to reapply for teaching and administrative licenses when he has completed a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who has experience with grooming and twenty-four hours of training regarding professional boundaries with students: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's Report and Recommendation: reject the portion of the hearing officer's recommendation in the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet that would allow Mr. Dawson to reapply for a pupil activity permit but accept the portion that would allow him to reapply for other licenses when he completes a fitness to teach evaluation and twenty-four hours of boundary training; reject the portion of the hearing officer's recommendation in the last sentence of the third full paragraph on page 30 of the Report and Recommendation that would allow Mr. Dawson to reapply for a pupil activity permit but accept the portion that would allow him to reapply for other licenses when he completes a fitness to teach evaluation and twenty-four hours of boundary training; and reject the portion of the hearing officer's recommendation in the first paragraph of the Recommendation section on page 40 of the Report and Recommendation that would allow Mr. Dawson to reapply for a pupil activity permit but accept the portion that would allow him to reapply for other licenses when he completes a fitness to teach evaluation and twenty-four hours of boundary training; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and, Be It Further RESOLVED, That the State Board may determine that a penalty outside the range of the disciplinary guidelines listed in the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators* is more appropriate in an individual case based upon the aggravating and mitigating factors as outlined in Section 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and any other factors the State Board considers relevant; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following aggravating factors: the nature and seriousness of Mr. Dawson's conduct includes multiple violations of student-teacher boundaries that occurred over the course of at least two school years including, but not limited to, him loaning a student a substantial amount of money with interest and arranging the repayment terms at the football field, adding a student-athlete to his personal cell phone plan, providing apparel to student-athletes, transporting multiple studentathletes in his personal car on numerous occasions, frequently having studentathletes over to his home for team meals and to watch game films and on at least one occasion allowing student-athletes to use the hot tub at his house, and hosting money-stakes poker parties at his home for former students and on one occasion allowing a current student to participate; Mr. Dawson was a teacher/coach with twenty years of experience and despite his testimony that he had misgivings about loaning a student money, adding a student to his cell phone plan, and allowing a student to attend a poker game at his house, Mr. Dawson went forward with these actions and violated appropriate student-teacher boundaries; Mr. Dawson's conduct negatively impacted the education community which caused a combined police and school investigation with several interviewed people expressing concern over the special bond that he had formed with some studentathletes; and Xenia Community Schools imposed disciplinary action and removed him from his coaching duties because the administration did not want him coaching again; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when he did not give the preceding facts and aggravating factors the weight they deserved when he made his recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that the culture and climate of a school, including possible student-teacher boundary violations by other educators, does not negate Mr. Dawson's conduct nor release him from professional standards to maintain appropriate student-teacher boundaries; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that based on Mr. Dawson's repeated boundary violations with student-athletes, coaching settings being less structured and less monitored than classroom settings, and the other aggravating factors in this case a more appropriate sanction would be to deny Mr. Dawson's pupil activity permit permanently and deny his teaching and administrative licenses but allow him to reapply for teaching and administrative licenses when he has completed a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who has experience with grooming and twenty-four hours of training regarding professional boundaries with students; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** William E. Dawson's applications for a five-year professional high school teaching license, five-year professional principal license, and three-year pupil activity permit based upon Mr. Dawson, on or about the

summer of 2013, the 2013/2014 school year, and the 2014/2015 school year, failing to adhere to appropriate student/teacher boundaries when he engaged in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: he loaned a student \$2,700.00 to purchase a car and charged the student an additional \$300.00 in interest; he paid the phone bill of a student and had that student complete yardwork at his home as repayment; he gave numerous students rides in his personal vehicle; he had numerous students over to his home where he provided them food and allowed them to use his hot tub; and he had poker parties at his home for former students and he allowed a current student to participate on one occasion. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders that Williams E. Dawson be permanently ineligible to apply for any pupil activity permit or any other credential required for a position coaching students and, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that William E. Dawson be ineligible to apply for any teaching or administrative license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until he provides written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed, at his own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who has experience with grooming, who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education, and who determines that Mr. Dawson is fit to serve in the school community as an educator and that he has completed any recommendations from the evaluation, and Mr. Dawson must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed, at his own expense, twenty-four hours of training regarding professional boundaries with students with the training to be preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Dawson of this action.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd John Hagan
Linda Haycock Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler
Mark Lamoncha Antoinette Miranda

I'-l O-----

Nick Owens Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire

Eric Poklar Mike Toal

Motion carried.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler
John Hagan Linda Haycock
Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson

Jenny Kilgore Mark Lamoncha Charlotte McGuire Nick Owens James Sheppard Lisa Woods Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Mike Toal

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 11):

11. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO ADMONISH BRADLEY J. DELERUYELLE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Bradley J. Deleruyelle holds a five-year school treasurer license issued in 2015 and a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS on April 11, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Bradley J. Deleruyelle of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year school treasurer license issued in 2015 and three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Deleruyelle engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when on or about the 2015-2016 school year, while employed as the school treasurer for the Pandora-Gilboa Local School District, Mr. Deleruyelle paid an unlicensed individual, Brent Farley, as a part-time teacher and when, on or about the 2016-2017 school year, he intentionally misrepresented and directed others to intentionally misrepresent information to the Ohio Department of Education during the course of the Department's investigation of his conduct related to Brent Farley's position or licensure status during the 2015-2016 school year on multiple occasions, including but not limited to the following misrepresentations: on or about October 2016, Mr. Deleruyelle asked the superintendent of the Pandora-Gilboa Local School District, R. Todd Schmutz, and Brent Farley to provide false information that Brent Farley was not teaching and was only serving as athletic director in the district and/or that Brent Farley tried to apply for a five-year long term substitute teaching license prior to his lapse in licensure; and on or about November 8, 2016, Mr. Deleruyelle sent an email to Professional Conduct Staff Attorney M. Abigail Miller of the Department's Office of Professional Conduct which falsely claimed that the high school principal of the Pandora-Gilboa School District, Jeff Wise, told him that Brent Farley qualified for a five-year license during the 2014-2015 school year; and

WHEREAS Mr. Deleruyelle requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent: and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on September 27, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Deleruyelle was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Deleruyelle be admonished by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Deleruyelle engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession during the 2015-2016 school year when he paid an unlicensed teacher in violation of his statutory duty pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.36 but finding in mitigation that Mr. Deleruyelle's conduct was not purposeful, he was not aware of his personal statutory responsibility to track teachers' licenses, and upon learning of his personal statutory responsibility, Mr. Deleruyelle began personally checking teacher licenses and implemented a system to double-check district teacher licenses with the records of the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **ADMONISHES** Bradley J. Deleruyelle, who holds a five-year school treasurer license issued in 2015 and three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016, based upon Mr. Deleruyelle, on or about the 2015-2016 school year, while employed as the school treasurer for the Pandora-Gilboa Local School District, paying an unlicensed individual, Brent Farley, as a part-time teacher; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Deleruyelle of this action.

It was Moved by Dr. Kilgore and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 11) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler John Hagan Linda Havcock Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson Jenny Kilgore Laura Kohler Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Eric Poklar James Sheppard Mike Toal

Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 12):

12. RESOLUTION TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION OF KERRIGHAN E. FANNING

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Kerrighan E. Fanning has applied for a five-year professional early childhood teaching license; and

WHEREAS on January 2, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Kerrighan E. Fanning of its intent to deny or permanently deny her application for a five-year professional early childhood teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Fanning's 2017 conviction in the Kettering Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2017 conviction in the Xenia Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs (OVI), 2017 conviction in the Warren County Court for one misdemeanor count of physical control, 2016 conviction in the Dayton Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of drugs or alcohol (OVI), 2014 conviction in the Springboro Mayor's Court for one misdemeanor count of reckless operation, and 2013 conviction in the Xenia Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Fanning that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to deny or permanently deny her application for a five-year professional early childhood teaching license; and

WHEREAS Kerrighan E. Fanning did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Kettering Municipal Court, Xenia Municipal Court, Warren County Court, Dayton Municipal Court, and Springboro Mayor's Court, and certified police records from the Montgomery County Sheriff's Office, Springboro Police Department, and Sugarcreek Township Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for

the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Kerrighan E. Fanning's application for a five-year professional early childhood teaching license based upon Ms. Fanning's 2017 conviction in the Kettering Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2017 conviction in the Xenia Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs (OVI), 2017 conviction in the Warren County Court for one misdemeanor count of physical control, 2016 conviction in the Dayton Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of drugs or alcohol (OVI), 2014 conviction in the Springboro Mayor's Court for one misdemeanor count of reckless operation, and 2013 conviction in the Xenia Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders that Kerrighan E. Fanning be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Fanning of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Hill that the above recommendation (Item 12) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd John Hagan Kirsten Hill Jenny Kilgore Mark Lamoncha Charlotte McGuire James Sheppard Lisa Woods Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Mike Toal

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 13):

13. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF SARAH M. MOSES

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Sarah M. Moses held a one-year educational aide permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS on January 24, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Sarah M. Moses of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year educational aide permit issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b). The notice was based upon Ms. Moses' 2018 conviction in the Tiffin-Fostoria Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of domestic violence; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Moses that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year educational aide permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Sarah M. Moses did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Tiffin-Fostoria Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Hancock County Sheriff's Office; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b), hereby **REVOKES** Sarah M. Moses' one-year educational aide permit issued in 2017 based upon Ms. Moses' 2018 conviction in the Tiffin-Fostoria Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of domestic violence. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders that Sarah M. Moses be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Moses of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Manchester and Seconded by Ms. Johnson that the above recommendation (Item 13) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler John Hagan Linda Haycock Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson Jenny Kilgore Laura Kohler Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Eric Poklar James Sheppard Mike Toal

Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 14):

14. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE THE FOUR-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF LORIE A. OWENS (AKA LORI A. OWENS)

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Lorie A. Owens (aka Lori A. Owens) held a four-year educational aide permit issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on July 20, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Lorie A. Owens of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year educational aide permit issued in 2014 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Owens engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about January 11, 2017, when she improperly escorted a student down a school hallway by putting her arm around the student's neck; and

WHEREAS Ms. Owens did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on December 5, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Owens was not present at the hearing, nor was she represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Owens' four-year educational aide permit issued in 2014 be revoked and that she not be permitted to reapply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the Ohio Department of Education for a period of three years and that prior to reapplication, she complete sixteen hours of non-physical intervention training. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Owens engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession when she escorted a student unsafely and could potentially have caused him harm; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Lorie A. Owens' four-year educational aide permit issued in 2014 based upon Ms. Owens engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about January 11, 2017, when she improperly escorted a student down a school hallway by putting her arm around the student's neck. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a), orders that Lorie A. Owens be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after April 9, 2022, and that upon reapplication, she must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, sixteen hours of non-physical intervention training that is pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Owens of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hill and Seconded by Mr. Hagan that the above recommendation (Item 14) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd John Hagan Kirsten Hill Jenny Kilgore Mark Lamoncha Charlotte McGuire Nick Owens James Sheppard Lisa Woods Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Mike Toal

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 15):

15. RESOLUTION TO DENY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT APPLICATION OF JEFFREY M. REESE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jeffrey M. Reese has applied for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS on January 2, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Jeffrey M. Reese of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Reese's 2017 conviction in the Cleveland Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of physical control while under the influence, 2017 conviction in the Cleveland Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one minor misdemeanor count of drug abuse, 2016 conviction in the Huron Municipal Court for two minor misdemeanor counts of disorderly conduct, and Mr. Reese's failure to fully disclose his criminal background on his application for a three-year pupil activity permit that he submitted to the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Reese that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS Jeffrey M. Reese did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Cleveland Municipal Court and the Huron Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Cleveland State University Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Jeffrey M. Reese's application for a three-year

pupil activity permit based upon Mr. Reese's 2017 conviction in the Cleveland Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of physical control while under the influence, 2017 conviction in the Cleveland Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one minor misdemeanor count of drug abuse, 2016 conviction in the Huron Municipal Court for two minor misdemeanor counts of disorderly conduct, and Mr. Reese's failure to fully disclose his criminal background on his application for a three-year pupil activity permit that he submitted to the Ohio Department of Education. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that Jeffrey M. Reese be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after April 9, 2021 provided that upon reapplication Mr. Reese provides verification to the Ohio Department of Education he has completed, at his own expense, a drug/alcohol assessment along with any recommendations and forty hours of community service with the drug/alcohol assessment and community service to be preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Reese of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Dr. Kilgore that the above recommendation (Item 15) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler John Hagan Linda Haycock Kirsten Hill Meryl Johnson Jenny Kilgore Laura Kohler Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar James Sheppard Mike Toal Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 16):

16. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FOUR-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF TERESA J. ROSNAGLE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Teresa J. Rosnagle holds a four-year educational aide permit issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on June 8, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Teresa J. Rosnagle of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year educational aide permit issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Rosnagle engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about September 22, 2016, when she struck a student on the hand while assisting the student in the lunch line; and

WHEREAS Ms. Rosnagle did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on October 11, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Rosnagle was not present at the hearing, nor was she represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Rosnagle's permit be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Ms. Rosnagle be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Rosnagle engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession when she slapped the hand of a low functioning and almost non-verbal student while assisting the student in the lunch line and that her continued employment in the teaching profession could potentially jeopardize the health, safety, or welfare of the school community and/or statewide education community; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Teresa J. Rosnagle's four-year educational aide permit issued in 2015 based upon Ms. Rosnagle engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about September 22, 2016, when she struck a student on the hand while assisting the student in the lunch line. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Teresa J. Rosnagle be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Rosnagle of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Manchester and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 16) be approved.

Mrs. Haycock Moved to amend by substitution. She proposed the following resolution. Ms. Johnson Seconded the motion. Mrs. Haycock stated she felt the proposed resolution was consistent with the infraction and similar cases which had come before the Board.

Ms. Johnson stated she considered the infraction committed by the individual related to their losing their livelihood when there was a recommendation of a permanent revocation. She stated she would support the proposed amendment.

16. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT OF THE HEARING OFFICER, TO MODIFY THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, AND TO REVOKE THE FOUR-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF TERESA J. ROSNAGLE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Teresa J. Rosnagle holds a four-year educational aide permit issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on June 8, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Teresa J. Rosnagle of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year educational aide permit issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Rosnagle engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about September 22, 2016, when she struck a student on the hand while assisting the student in the lunch line; and

WHEREAS Ms. Rosnagle did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on October 11, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Rosnagle was not present at the hearing, nor was she represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Rosnagle's permit be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Ms. Rosnagle be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Rosnagle engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession when she slapped the hand of a low functioning and almost non-verbal student while assisting the student in the lunch line and that her continued employment in the teaching profession could potentially jeopardize the health, safety, or welfare of the school community and/or statewide education community; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's Report and Recommendation: reject in its entirety the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in its entirety the fifth paragraph of the Executive Summary of the Report and Recommendation; reject in its entirety Conclusion of Law numbered 10 in the Report and Recommendation; reject in its entirety Conclusion of Law numbered 14 in the Report and Recommendation; and reject in its entirety the Recommendation section on page 5 of the Report and Recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board may determine that a penalty outside the range of the disciplinary guidelines listed in the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators* is more appropriate in an individual case based upon the aggravating and mitigating factors as outlined in Section 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and any other factors the State Board considers relevant; and

WHEREAS the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following mitigating factors: the nature of Ms. Rosnagle's conduct indicates that it was an isolated incident that was an instinctive response to unhygienic behavior by the student; Ms. Rosnagle is an experienced classroom aide who has no history of any disciplinary action by the State Board of Education; and Ms. Rosnagle accepted responsibility for her actions by being forthright with the district and submitting her resignation; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when she did not consider the preceding facts and mitigating factors when she made her recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that based on the mitigating factors in this case a more appropriate sanction would be to revoke Ms. Rosnagle's permit but allow her to reapply after a three-year period if she completes, at her own expense, sixteen hours of non-physical intervention training: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's Report and Recommendation: reject in its entirety the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in its entirety the fifth paragraph of the Executive Summary of the Report and Recommendation; reject in its entirety Conclusion of Law numbered 10 in the Report and Recommendation; reject in its entirety Conclusion of Law numbered 14 in the Report and Recommendation; and reject in its entirety the Recommendation section on page 5 of the Report and Recommendation; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board may determine that a penalty outside the range of the disciplinary guidelines listed in the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators* is more appropriate in an individual case based upon the aggravating and mitigating factors as outlined in Section 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and any other factors the State Board considers relevant; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following mitigating factors: the nature of Ms. Rosnagle's conduct indicates that it was an isolated incident that was an instinctive response to unhygienic behavior by the student; Ms. Rosnagle is an experienced classroom aide who has no history of any disciplinary action by the State Board of Education; and Ms. Rosnagle accepted responsibility for her actions by being forthright with the district and submitting her resignation; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when she did not consider the preceding facts and mitigating factors when she made her recommendation; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that based on the mitigating factors in this case a more appropriate sanction would be to revoke Ms. Rosnagle's permit but allow her to reapply after a three-year period if she completes, at her own expense, sixteen hours of non-physical intervention training; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Teresa J. Rosnagle's four-year educational aide permit issued in 2015 based upon Ms. Rosnagle engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about September 22, 2016, when she struck a student on the hand while assisting the student in the lunch line. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a), orders Teresa J. Rosnagle be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after April 9, 2022, and that upon reapplication, she must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, sixteen hours of non-physical intervention training that is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Rosnagle of this action.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

YES VOTES

Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester
James Sheppard
Lisa Woods

John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Jenny Kilgore
Mark Lamoncha
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal

NO VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Charlotte McGuire Eric Poklar

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd John Hagan Kirsten Hill Jenny Kilgore Mark Lamoncha Charlotte McGuire Eric Poklar Mike Toal Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda James Sheppard Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 17):

17. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND TO DISAPPROVE WEST CLERMONT LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT'S DETERMINATION OF IMPRACTICAL TRANSPORTATION AND PAYMENT IN LIEU OF TRANSPORTATION OF CERTAIN STUDENTS ATTENDING ST. LOUIS SCHOOL, CLERMONT COUNTY.

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Sections 3327.01 and 3327.02, West Clermont Local School District ("West Clermont LSD") determined it is impractical to transport students from West Clermont LSD to St. Louis School, Clermont County;

A hearing was held on January 28, 2019, before a duly appointed hearing officer;

In her report, filed on or around February 28, 2019, hearing officer Melissa Riggins recommends the State Board of Education disapprove West Clermont LSD's determination of impractical transportation and payment in lieu of transporting certain students attending St. Louis School; and

Based on the evidence presented and factors set forth in ORC 3327.02, the hearing officer found West Clermont LSD's arguments unpersuasive, and she determined the following: 1) West Clermont LSD failed to explain how it concluded that it cost \$66,000 per year to transport three pupils; 2) West Clermont failed to provide evidence or testimony on the average cost of transporting other students per year; 3) West Clermont failed to provide any evidence demonstrating the cost of equipment, administration, personnel, or maintenance; and 4) West Clermont did not provide evidence or testimony to establish that other methods of transportation were investigated or considered.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that upon consideration of the hearing officer's report and recommendation and the relevant law, the State Board of Education hereby adopts the recommendation of the hearing officer and disapproves West Clermont LSD's payment in lieu of transporting certain students attending St. Louis School for all the reasons set forth in the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to serve a true copy of this resolution on the petitioners, West Clermont LSD, and counsel of record, if applicable.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Ms. Woods that the above recommendation (Item 17) be approved.

Mrs. Haycock Moved to amend the resolution by substitution. She proposed the following substitute resolution. Mr. Owens Seconded the motion. She noted items a-c listed below.

Ms. Fowler noted the district provided no explanation of how costs were determined. She stated the Hearing Officer based the recommendation for disapproval on several issues she found significant; Failing to show how costs were determined, no testimony or other evidence was provided by the district to explain costs of equipment, maintenance, personnel or administration, no cost was given for transporting other students within the district, no testimony was provided regarding the disruption of the district's current transportation schedule, and no testimony was provided that other means of transportation was investigated.

Ms. Johnson stated she saw no evidence of hard-ship to the students in this case if they were not provided transportation.

Mrs. McGuire spoke in favor of the original motion.

17. RESOLUTION TO REJECT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND TO APPROVE WEST CLERMONT LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT'S DETERMINATION OF IMPRACTICAL TRANSPORTATION AND PAYMENT IN LIEU OF TRANSPORTATION OF CERTAIN STUDENTS ATTENDING ST. LOUIS SCHOOL, CLERMONT COUNTY.

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Sections 3327.01 and 3327.02, West Clermont Local School District ("West Clermont LSD") determined it is impractical to transport students from West Clermont LSD to St. Louis School, Clermont County;

A hearing was held on January 28, 2019, before a duly appointed hearing officer;

In her report, filed on or around February 28, 2019, hearing officer Melissa Riggins recommends the State Board of Education disapprove West Clermont LSD's determination of impractical transportation and payment in lieu of transporting certain students attending St. Louis School;

Based on the evidence presented and factors set forth in ORC 3327.02, the hearing officer found West Clermont LSD's arguments unpersuasive. She determined that West Clermont LSD failed to present evidence as to how it concluded the total costs per year to transport three pupils and failed to provide any evidence demonstrating the cost of equipment, administration, personnel, maintenance, or that other methods of transportation were considered;

Notwithstanding the hearing officer's report and recommendation, West Clermont LSD:

- (a) Testified that it currently transports only three pupils, which costs \$22,000 per pupil, and results in an overall cost of \$66,000 per year;
- (b) Determined that the benchmark for providing transportation to a chartered non-public school is twelve students and it Clermont LSD presented evidence that it could not combine transportation routes because its start time differs from St. Louis School's start time; and
- (c) the total amount of time to transport three students to St. Louis School varied and could take up to 46 minutes.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that upon consideration of the hearing officer's report and recommendation and the relevant law, the State Board of Education hereby rejects the recommendation of the hearing officer and approves West Clermont LSD's payment in lieu of transporting certain students attending St. Louis School because West Clermont LSD demonstrated that transporting pupils to St. Louis School is impractical for the 3 reasons noted in the preceding preamble; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to serve a true copy of this resolution on the petitioners, West Clermont LSD, and counsel of record, if applicable.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

YES VOTES

Linda Haycock Jenny Kilgore Antoinette Miranda James Sheppard Meryl Johnson Mark Lamoncha Nick Owens

NO VOTES

Stephanie Dodd John Hagan Charlotte McGuire Lisa Woods Sarah Fowler Martha Manchester Mike Toal Laura Kohler

ABSTAIN

Kirsten Hill

Motion denied.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the original resolution.

Minutes of the April 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler
John Hagan Kirsten Hill
Jenny Kilgore Laura Kohler
Mark Lamoncha Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire James Sheppard
Mike Toal Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens

Motion carried.

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 18):

18. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE USE OF QUASI-JUDICIAL DELIBERATIONS AND TO AMEND THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION POLICIES AND PROCEDURES MANUAL

The State Board of Education (State Board) hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22 (Ohio's Open Meetings Law), generally requires the State Board, as a public body, to hold meetings that are open to the public;

The Supreme Court of Ohio has long recognized that quasi-judicial deliberations are not subject to Ohio's Open Meetings Law;

The State Board serves in a quasi-judicial role and executes quasi-judicial functions as a part of its statutory duties that are recognized and set forth in the State Board's Policies and Procedures Manual (the "Policies and Procedures");

The Executive Committee recommends that the State Board of Education approve using quasi-judicial deliberations outlined in the Policies and Procedures Manual provided the Policies and Procedures are amended to require the agenda for the State Board of Education meeting to include when the quasi-judicial deliberations are held.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board approves adopting the use of quasi-judicial deliberations for those matters outlined in the Policies and Procedures;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the State Board amends Sections B and K of Article VII the Policies and Procedures in the form attached hereto.

It was Moved by President Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 18) be approved.

Mr. Owens spoke in favor of the resolution.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd John Hagan Kirsten Hill Jenny Kilgore Mark Lamoncha Charlotte McGuire Nick Owens Lisa Woods Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda

Mike Toal

Motion carried.

Ms. Woods presented the following recommendation (Item 19):

19. RESOLUTION THAT THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION FORM A WORK GROUP TO STUDY THE STATUS AND APPLICATION OF CURRENT REGULATORY REQUIREMENTS FOR DROPOUT PREVENTION AND RECOVERY SCHOOLS

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

WHEREAS, the State Board of Education has learned of the documented success of several dropout prevention and recovery schools in serving the at-risk population through competency-based educational programs that incorporate elements of blended learning and credit flexibility in a more individualized educational program;

WHEREAS, the 2017–2018 state report cards for dropout prevention and recovery schools provide that 70% of all dropout prevention and recovery schools received a rating of "Meets Standards" or "Exceeds Standards";

WHEREAS, the state's and Board's efforts to improve quality among all educational entities including traditional public schools, community schools and community school sponsors have had a beneficial impact on the state of education in Ohio and quality improvement deserves to be a continuing focus of the State Board of Education's actions;

WHEREAS, the State Board of Education recognizes the important role that many dropout prevention and recovery schools play in successfully serving their at-risk populations;

WHEREAS, the State Board of Education recognizes that different modes of learning and measurement are necessary to engage at-risk students and promote academic achievement:

WHEREAS, the State Board of Education has learned that questions have arisen as to whether certain successful dropout prevention and recovery school models

align with interpretations of state law relative to blended learning and credit flexibility:

WHEREAS, questions relating to these models appear to be rooted in the Ohio Department of Education's interpretation of state law;

WHEREAS, the State Board of Education has been tasked expressly by the General Assembly to develop administrative rules and/or a state plan for both blended learning and credit flexibility;

WHEREAS, the State Board of Education members are not currently aware of any statutes or regulations expressly linking blended learning models to seat time in a school facility;

WHEREAS, the State Board of Education members are not currently aware of any statutes or regulations expressly preventing participation in credit flexibility or blended learning programs from counting as funded learning opportunities without regard to a facility seat-time requirement, and regardless of whether they occur within a school facility, at home, or at sites available to the public;

WHEREAS, the State Board of Education has also developed rules relating to dropout prevention and recovery and is in the process of reviewing those rules;

WHEREAS, the State Board of Education believes further study is needed regarding the status and implementation of accountability and programmatic regulations of dropout prevention and recovery schools; and

WHEREAS, the Assessment and Accountability Committee reviewed this resolution and adopted a resolution to recommend approval of this resolution on March 13, 2019.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education shall form a work group to study the status and application of current regulatory requirements for dropout prevention and recovery schools, including accountability measures, full-time equivalency requirements, use of facilities or other sites available to the public, blended learning requirements, credit flexibility requirements;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Chair and Vice-Chair of the Assessment and Accountability Committee shall serve in the same capacity for the work group, that the work group's membership shall not exceed nine (9) members, and the work group's membership consist of at least four (4) representatives from dropout prevention and recovery community schools and one ex officio member who is an (1) attorney from the Ohio Attorney General's office; and, Be It Further

FURTHER RESOLVED, that this work group shall produce a report to the State Board of Education outlining its findings for clarifications and changes to state laws and rules and recommendations regarding the above-listed topics by October 1, 2019.

It was Moved by Ms. Woods that the above recommendation (Item 19) be approved.

Mr. Hagan Moved to amend the resolution by substitution. He proposed the last further resolved clause be changed to; "FURTHER RESOLVED, that this work group shall produce a report to the State Board of Education outlining its findings for clarifications and changes to state laws and rules and recommendations regarding the above-listed topics prior to the December 2019 State Board of Education meeting. Dr. Kilgore Seconded the motion. President Kohler asked if there were any objections. As there were no objections, the motion carried.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the resolution, including the friendly amendment.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler
John Hagan Linda Haycock
Kirsten Hill Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens
Mike Toal Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 20):

20. RESOLUTION TO AUTHORIZE THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION TO NEGOTIATE SETTLEMENT TERMS WITH CHAD A. ABRAHAM

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Chad A. Abraham held a five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS on October 30, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Chad A. Abraham of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his fiveyear professional intervention specialist teaching license issued in 2016 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(c), and (B)(3). The notice was based upon Mr. Abraham engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about March 31, 2017, he pled guilty in the Delaware Municipal Court to one misdemeanor count of theft and subsequently entered into an intervention in lieu of conviction program; on or about May 5, 2017, Mr. Abraham's community control officer filed a notice of violation with the Delaware Municipal Court based on Mr. Abraham's failure to report for weekly contact on April 27-28, 2017 and May 2, 2017 and for testing positive for TCH and benzodiazepines without a prescription; on or about July 18, 2017, the Delaware Municipal Court terminated Mr. Abraham's intervention in lieu of conviction program and he pled guilty to one misdemeanor count of theft; on or about February 24, 2017, Mr. Abraham pled guilty in the Franklin County Municipal Court to one misdemeanor count of theft and subsequently entered into an intervention in lieu of conviction program; on or about April 20, 2018, the Franklin County Municipal Court terminated his intervention in lieu of

conviction program and placed him on community control for a period of two years; on or about July 24, 2000, Mr. Abraham was convicted in the Bowling Green Municipal Court of one misdemeanor count of underage consumption; and on or about August 2, 2016 and June 10, 2011, Mr. Abraham failed to fully disclose his criminal convictions on the applications that he submitted to the Ohio Department of Education in 2016 and 2011; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Abraham that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS Chad A. Abraham did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code;

WHEREAS, on February 13, 2019, the State Board of Education revoked Mr. Abraham's five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license and further ordered him permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education;

WHEREAS, Mr. Abraham appealed the State Board of Education's resolution on March 15, 2019 in the Delaware County Court of Common Pleas;

WHEREAS, Mr. Abraham has expressed a desire to settle his pending appeal with the State Board of Education; and

WHEREAS, the Department of Education is interested in resolving Mr. Abraham's appeal through settlement: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(E), hereby **AUTHORIZES** the Superintendent of Public Instruction to negotiate settlement terms with Mr. Abraham; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, that the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Abraham of this action.

It was Moved by Dr. Miranda and Seconded by Mrs. Kilgore that the above recommendation (Item 20) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler
John Hagan Linda Haycock
Kirsten Hill Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens
Mike Toal Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Non-Resolutions

New Business

Mrs. Hill asked if individuals were permitted to provide testimony through electronic means. Ms. Lease stated individuals could provide testimony in writing or in person under the open meetings requirements.

Mr. Hagan Moved to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Fowler Seconded the motion.

The President requested a voice vote.

Lama Kopen

Motion carried.

President Kohler adjourned the meeting at 4:15 p.m. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Education is May 13-14, 2019.

ATTEST:

Laura Kohler President

State Board of Education

Paolo DeMaria

Superintendent of Public Instruction

Please note: Copies of the attachments referenced in the Minutes may be obtained by contacting the Office of Board Relations at the Ohio Department of Education at (614) 728-2754.