

**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF OHIO  
MINUTES**

June 2019  
Ohio Department of Education  
25 South Front Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

**MEMBERS OF THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION**

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

**EX OFFICIO MEMBERS**

Senator Peggy Lehner	Representative Louis W. Blessing III
----------------------	--------------------------------------

**SECRETARY**

Paolo DeMaria  
Superintendent of Public Instruction

NOTE: Mrs. Collins was absent on Monday.

---

The State Board convened on Monday, June 10, at the Ohio Department of Education in Columbus.

---

**Chapter 119 Hearing**

June 10, 2019  
8:30 a.m.

Hearing Regarding the Amending, Rescinding and Adoption of Rules

President Kohler stated the Board would proceed with the public hearing on the following rule actions:

- The amendment of 3301-83-16 Non-routine use of school buses.

President Kohler called on Mia Yaniko, from the Office of the Attorney General, Assistant Chief, Education section. Ms. Yaniko called on Immy Singh, Chief Legal Counsel for the Ohio Department of Education.

Ms. Singh presented the following Board Exhibits:

- Board Exhibit 1 is the public notice that appears in the Register of Ohio and references the proposed rule action subject to this hearing;
- Board Exhibit 2 would be a true and accurate copy of the resolution adopted by the State Board of Education regarding this rule,
- Board Exhibit 3 would be a true and accurate copy of the rule as filed with the Joint Committee on Agency Rule Review (JCARR), Legislative Service Commission (LSC) and the Secretary of State.

Ms. Singh explained the rules had been made available to all persons affected by the rules.

President Kohler stated that testimony would be received, either orally or in writing, for or against, the amendment of the rules that are under consideration. Anyone who wished to testify must complete the registration sheet. All testimony would be limited to no more than five minutes. If additional time is needed, consideration would be given to a reasonable extension. Any written testimony would be marked as Group Exhibit 4.

President Kohler announced that the Board would now receive testimony on the proposed actions before the Board.

---

## **PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON THE PROPOSED RULE ACTIONS**

There were no requests.

---

President Kohler called on Ms. Yaniko, who submitted into evidence State Board Exhibits 1 through 3.

President Kohler stated that the exhibits were so received. As there was no more testimony, she declared the public hearing closed at 8:36 a.m.

---

## **STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING**

President Kohler convened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, June 10, at 8:37 a.m.

President Kohler asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

### **YES VOTES**

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore

Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler

Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Mike Toal

Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

President Kohler called on Vice President McGuire, who Moved that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion or compensation of a public employee or official; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the investigation of charges or complaints against a public employee, official, licensee, or regulated individual; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(3) for the purpose of conferring with legal counsel about matters that are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

Ms. Fowler Seconded the motion.

The President called for a roll call vote.

### **YES VOTES**

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Mike Toal

Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

The Board went into Executive Session at 8:37 a.m.

The Board recessed from Executive Session at 9:00 a.m.

Following the recess of the State Board Business meeting, the Board held a Quasi-Judicial discussion, including those functions outlined in the State Board of Education's Policies and Procedures Manual.

---

Following Executive Session and Quasi-Judicial discussion, The Board's Teaching, Leading and Learning and Continuous Improvement Committees met beginning at 9:30 a.m.

---

The State Board recessed for lunch.

---

---

**RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING**

President Kohler reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, June 10, at 1:30 p.m.

---

---

President Kohler welcomed Board members and guests and led the Board in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Review of Written Reports and Items for Vote

---

---

**REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION**

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

- 2018 – 2019 Goals Review
- Draft 2019-2020 Goals Presentation
- Social and Emotional Learning Standards Discussion
- Third Grade Reading Promotion Score Discussion

**2018 – 2019 GOALS REVIEW:**

**Outline;**

- Superintendent’s Evaluation – 2018-19
- Superintendent’s Goals – 2019-20
- Policy and Practice Support

Superintendent’s Evaluation – 2018-19:

2017-18 Goal Areas

- Leadership
- Communication
- Policy and Practice Support

**Leadership**

**Goal**

Strategic Plan Implementation Approach  
Dept. of Education Budget  
School Improvement  
ODE Operations

**Rating**

Effective  
Very Effective  
Effective  
Somewhat Effective

**Communications**

**Goal**

Communications Plan  
Relationships  
Stakeholder Engagement

**Rating**

Somewhat Effective  
Effective  
Ineffective

Advocacy and Goodwill

Very Effective

**Policy and Practice Support**

**Goal**

**Rating**

**Strategy 1:** Teacher Supply and Support

Effective

**Strategy 2:** Highly Effective Principals

Effective

**Strategy 3:** Excellent Instruction

Somewhat Effective

**Strategy 4:** Standards

Effective

**Strategy 5:** Assessments

Somewhat Effective

**Policy and Practice Support**

**Goal**

**Rating**

**Strategy 6:** Accountability & Report Cards

Somewhat Effective

**Strategy 7:** Whole Child Support

Effective

**Strategy 8:** Early Learning

Effective

**Strategy 9:** Literacy

Very Effective

**Strategy 10:** H.S. & Graduation Requirements

Effective

**Other Activity**

- Statewide Family Engagement Grant – US Dept. of Education (OSU as lead)
- STOP Act Safety Grant (partnering with Sandy Hook Promise)
- School Climate Transformation Grant – US Dept. of Education
- Troops to Teachers Grant – US Dept. of Education
- Preschool Development Grant – Birth to Age 5 – US Dept. of Education (Ohio Dept. of Job and Family Services as lead)
- Academic Distress Commission support
- Carl D. Perkins Career Technical Education Act – State Transition Plan
- Ohio Arts Education Data Project
- Equity Award – Urban League of Greater Cleveland
- State Audits and Management Letter
- EMIS Advisory Council

**Superintendent's Goals - 2018-19:**

**2018-19 Goal Areas**

- Leadership
- Communications
- Policy and Practice Support

**Leadership**

- School Improvement & Improvement Culture
- ODE Operations

**Communication**

- Communications Plan
- Relationships & Partnerships
- Stakeholder Engagement
- Advocacy and Goodwill

**Policy and Practice Support**

- Strategy 1: Teacher supply & support
- Strategy 2: Highly effective principals
- Strategy 3: Effective Instruction
- Strategy 4: Standards

## Minutes of the June 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

- Strategy 5: Assessments & Data
- Strategy 6: Accountability & Report Cards
- Strategy 7: Whole Child Support
- Strategy 8: Early Learning
- Strategy 9: Literacy
- Strategy 10: High School & Grad Requirements

### **Timeline:**

- June Board meeting (June 10-11): Paolo presents self-evaluation for 2018-19, and draft goals for 2019-20
- June 12 – June 26: Board members individually prepare evaluation input (using online template); Board members provide feedback on goals
- June 27 – July 3: Processing of Board input to evaluation in preparation for July Board meeting discussion; Paolo makes modifications to goals based on Board feedback
- July Board Meeting (July 8-9): Executive Session discussion of evaluation results; Executive Committee discussion of 2019-20 superintendent's goals.
- July 10-July 19: Additional individual Board member feedback to 2018-19 goals.
- August – No Board Meeting
- September Board Meeting (Sept. 16-17): Executive Committee approval of evaluation/compensation resolution, and 2018-19 goals resolution. Full board approval of both resolutions.

### **K-12 Social-Emotional Learning Standards:**

#### **What is Social and Emotional Learning (SEL)?**

The process of developing and using the skills, attitudes, behavior and knowledge that help youth and adults:

- Identify and regulate emotions
- Develop positive relationships
- Make responsible decisions

#### **Why K-12 Social and Emotional Learning Standards?**

- Most frequent issue raised through Strategic Plan stakeholder engagement
- Strong and compelling research base to support use of social and emotional learning approaches in schools
- Many schools/districts already addressing these skills
- Social emotional learning improves children's mental health

#### **Advisory and Writing Teams**

- Advisory Committee met Between February and November 2018, invited experts
- Writing teams met between May and July 2018, selected from application
- Ohioans from higher education, teachers, administrators, school counselors, psychologists, intervention specialists, librarians, career tech, state support teams

#### **Standards Structure**

- Five competencies
- Topics in each competency
- Standard statements in each topic
- Organized by grade band
- Standard statements are skills in place by the end of the grade band

#### **Standards Competencies**

- Self-awareness – the ability to accurately recognize one’s own emotions and thoughts, and how these things influence behavior. Self-awareness is the ability to accurately assess one’s strengths and limitations, with a sense of confidence and optimism.
- Self-Management – the ability to navigate emotions, thoughts and behaviors across different situations while managing stress, controlling impulses and motivating oneself. Self-management includes the ability to set and work toward personal and academic goals.
- Social Awareness – the ability to take the perspective of and empathize with others, including those from diverse backgrounds and cultures. It also reflects the ability to understand social and ethical norms for behavior across settings and to be able to identify and use family, school and community resources and supports.
- Relationship Skills – the ability to establish and maintain healthy relationships with diverse individuals and groups. Developing relationship skills promotes the ability to communicate clearly, listen well, cooperate with others, resist social/peer pressure, negotiate conflict and seek or offer help to others.
- Responsible Decision-making – the ability to make constructive choices about personal behavior and social interactions within the context of ethical standards, safety concerns, and social norms. It involves making realistic evaluations of the consequences of one’s actions and a consideration of the wellbeing of self and others.

### **Use of Standards**

- Standards are voluntary
- Ohio will **not** develop any state level SEL assessment or measure
- Ohio will **not** use SEL measures for accountability
- Districts/schools may choose to use local measures

### **Critical Support**

- Students experience better academic performance, improved attitudes and behaviors
- Educators experience improved engagement with students, classroom management, increased time on instruction
- Schools experience improved climate, safety, trauma informed practices

### **Strategic Plan Revisions**

#### **Strategy 5**

Move toward a varied system of assessments that allows students to demonstrate academic competency and mastery in ways beyond state standardized tests. Acknowledge local choice in gauging non-academic knowledge and skills.

#### **Strategy 5**

**Identifying robust and diverse ways to measure performance:** The state should explore innovative approaches to assessing academic knowledge and skills that go beyond traditional standardized testing. Schools and districts should determine the extent to which they require feedback regarding student knowledge and skill development in other areas. A handful of schools in Ohio already have worked with community partners—including employers and business leaders—to develop rubrics that gauge non-academic learning domains. The state will not assess student acquisition or demonstration of any K-12 social-emotional learning standards.

#### **Strategy 6**

Refine the state’s accountability system to be a fairer, more meaningful process.

#### **Strategy 6**

**Providing tools and information to gauge progress:**

As Ohio seeks to value all four equal learning domains, it will need to enhance existing tools and create new supports. These tools and supports should concentrate on bringing greater meaning and usefulness to report card data. The state should not, however, include any information on the state report card related to social-emotional learning. At their discretion, schools and districts can develop their own feedback mechanisms that extend beyond those provided by the state.

**Strategy 6:**

**Equity:** Academically challenging standards for what each child should know and be able to do are fundamental to achieving equity in education. A diverse system of assessments of academic content ensures fairness for students by recognizing that there are many ways to demonstrate the acquisition of knowledge and skills.

**Setting the 2019-2020 Third Grade Promotion Score Discussion:  
Board Responsibility**

Under ORC 3301.0710 (A), The State Board of Education is responsible for annually determining and designating a level of achievement, between limited and proficient, on the third grade English language arts achievement assessment. This level must rise until it is set equal to the level designated as proficient.

Notes:

- Current promotion score 677; proficient is 700.
- Department uses reading sub-score as an alternative; current reading sub-score set at 45; proficient is 50.

**Promotion Rates for Students Subject to Retention 2015-2018**

Between 2015-16 and 2017-18, as the promotion score has increased, the promotion rate for students subject to retention has also increased from 84.8% to 90.6%. Also, the number of students who rely on the alternative assessment for promotion has decreased by more than half – from 8.3% in 2015-16 to 3.2% in 2017-2018

**Promotion Score Committee vote 2019-2020**

- Increase the promotion score for the 2019-2020 school year to 683 which equates to a Reading sub-score of 45
- This recommendation aligns with district expectations and is consistent with past increases

---

President Kohler recessed the Board meeting at 5:02 p.m.

---

**EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

President Kohler welcomed the Executive Committee at 5:03 p.m.

President Kohler asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

**MEMBERS PRESENT**

Laura Kohler

Charlotte McGuire



Sarah Fowler  
Antoinette Miranda

John Hagan

President Kohler stated the Executive Committee had one item(s) to cover today:

- Discuss: Proposed changes to the Policies and Procedures Manual Regarding Guidance (Possible Vote)

1) Discuss: Proposed changes to the Policies and Procedures Manual Regarding Guidance (Possible Vote)

President Kohler reviewed with Committee members the proposed changes.

Proposed Changes to add Article V, Section E:

V. Roles and Responsibilities of the Superintendent

E. Superintendent Performance, Accountability and Evaluation

The Superintendent shall ensure that the Department's guidance is issued in a manner that is practical and meaningful that supports compliance and effective implementation, while adhering to governing federal and state statutes and rules/regulations, including the provisions of Ohio Revised Code 101.352 and 101.353. In addition, the Superintendent shall ensure that the State Board of Education members promptly receive a copy of any guidance issued by the Department

Mrs. McGuire Moved to approve the proposed changes to the Policies and Procedures Manual regarding Guidance. Dr. Miranda Seconded the motion.

Ms. Fowler asked if the guidance proposed is required to stay within federal and state statutes or is there additional flexibility to go beyond the rule of law in creating regulations or expectations that districts are required to follow. Immy Singh, Chief Legal Counsel, responded that guidance provided by the Department would not conflict with statutes and regulations that are in place, but would support and enhance those rules and regulations.

Ms. Fowler Moved to Amend the proposal with the following language change to add:

The Superintendent shall ensure that the Department's guidance is issued in a manner that is practical and meaningful that supports compliance and effective implementation, while adhering to and constrained by governing federal and state statutes and rules/regulations, including the provisions of Ohio Revised Code 101.352 and 101.353. In addition, the Superintendent shall ensure that the State Board of Education members promptly receive a copy of any guidance issued by the Department. Mr. Hagan Seconded the motion. President Kohler asked if there were any objections to the proposed amendment. There were no objections noted. Motion passed.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote:

YES VOTES

Laura Kohler  
Sarah Fowler  
Antoinette Miranda

Charlotte McGuire  
John Hagan

Minutes of the June 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

President Kohler announced that a member of the Attorney General's office would be attending the Board meetings on Monday and Tuesday afternoon and also if a Board member had an issue that may conflict with the Department, that Board member could, through the chair, ask for clarification on the issue in question.

President Kohler adjourned the meeting of the Executive Committee at 5:20 p.m.

---

President Kohler reconvened the meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, June 11, at 8:30 a.m.

---

The Board's Integrated Student Supports and Assessment & Accountability Committees met beginning at 8:30 a.m.

---

**RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING**

President Kohler reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, June 11, at 11:08 a.m.

President Kohler asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

**MEMBERS PRESENT**

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

NOTE: Mrs. Dodd and Ms. Fowler entered the room after roll call.

---

President Kohler called for the approval of the Minutes of the May 2019 meeting. She asked if there were any corrections to the Minutes.

There were no corrections.

It was Moved by Mr. Hagan and Seconded by Dr. Kilgore that the Minutes be approved as presented. The President called for a voice vote.

Motion carried unanimously.

---

---

**LEGISLATIVE REPORT**

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

- Budget Update
- HB 239 – Test Reductions; Elimination of Geometry Math Test, English II, Social Studies
- HB 123 – Sandy Hook Promise Legislation
- SB 89 – Career Technical Education
- SB 34 – Licensing
- HB 165 – Health Standards
- HB 154 – Academic Distress Commissions

Item 24 on the Board’s Voting Agenda was originally brought forth during the legislative update, but has been moved to the Voting Agenda area of the minutes.

---

---

The State Board recessed for lunch.

---

---

**RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING**

President Kohler reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, June 11, at 1:08 p.m.

---

---

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON VOTING AGENDA ITEMS**

1) Mr. Chad Belville, Superintendent, Fairfield Union Local S.D., Mr. Belville spoke to the Board regarding Social and Emotional Learning Standards (SEL).

2) Ms. Stacy Hamsher on behalf of Ms. Melanie Elsey. Ms. Hamsher Belville spoke to the Board regarding Social and Emotional Learning Standards (SEL).

3) Mr. Brian Bachtel, Ohio Association Career Technical Education, Kent City Schools. Mr. Bachtel spoke to the Board regarding the Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component.

4) Mr. Eric Price, Exchange Club of Dayton. Mr. Price spoke to the Board regarding the Social Studies Model Curriculum.

---

---

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-VOTING ITEMS**

- 1) Dr. Joyce L. Malainy, Superintendent, C-TEC, OACTS. Dr. Malainy spoke to the Board regarding an Amendment to ORC 3319.229.
- 2) Dr. Patricia Farrenkopf. Dr. Farrenkopf spoke to the Board regarding the gifted assessment list.
- 3) Ms. Debra Smith. Ms. Smith spoke to the Board regarding the gifted assessment list.
- 4) Ms. Beth Wilson-Fish. Ms. Wilson-Fish spoke to the Board regarding the gifted assessment list.
- 5) Dr. Colleen Boyle. Dr. Boyle submitted written testimony to the Board regarding the gifted assessment list.

---

### **BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE**

Chair: Laura Kohler, Vice Chair: Charlotte McGuire

Mrs. McGuire gave a report from the Executive Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

**Members Present:** Kohler (Chair), McGuire, Hagan, Fowler, Miranda

#### **Proposed Changes to the Policies and Procedures Manual Regarding Guidance:**

- Committee voted to approve changes in section V. of the Board Policies and Procedures Manual, with the addition of a paragraph on guidance. This change would ensure that the Department's guidance is issued in a manner that is practical and meaningful that supports compliance and effective implementation. Board member Fowler suggested a small language change, which was approved. The Committee recommended that the Board adopt the language as amended. This will go to the Board for a vote at the July meeting.

#### **Discussion on Attorney General's office present at all State Board of Education meetings:**

- The Executive Committee discussed having a representative from the Attorney General's office present at all afternoon meetings of the State Board of Education. They agreed that beginning in July there would be a representative at all meetings moving forward.

---

### **BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE TEACHING, LEADING AND LEARNING COMMITTEE**

Chair: Sarah Fowler, Vice Chair: Nick Owens

Ms. Fowler gave a report from the Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

**Members Present:** Fowler (Chair), Owens (Vice-Chair) Haycock, Hill, Johnson, Manchester

#### **Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-16-08 State Seal of Biliteracy (*Strategies 4 & 10*):**

- Department staff provided a brief overview of proposed revision to OAC 3301-16-08 State Seal of Biliteracy. The revisions proposed by the Department provide clarity to the field.
- Following discussion, committee members requested that the Department provide information about the districts currently offering the State Seal of Biliteracy as they continue their review of the rule in July.

- The rule is presented for discussion only this month and is currently posted for a 30-day public comment period. Discussion will continue in July with a possible vote to recommend adoption to the State Board.

**Third Grade Reading Guarantee: Statutory Questions and Discussion** (*Strategies 1-3, 5, 7-9*):

- Department Staff provided committee members with a brief presentation to help facilitate member discussion of current statute and whether it provides students, schools and districts the support needed to ensure continued improvement on the grade 3 English Language Arts assessment.
- The goal this month was to begin discussion among committee members about what, if any, recommendations they might make to revise the current statute.
- Following discussion, members agreed to continue discussion at its July meeting with a possible vote to recommend revisions to the current statute.

**Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators** (*Strategy 7*)

- Committee staff provided members with a brief overview of the Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators (LCPCOE) and the work that has taken place with the Public and the Educator Standards Board since 2018 to revise and improve the LCPCOE.
- The goal of this month's discussion was to share the draft revisions and gather any additional recommendations for further revision.
- Following discussion, members agreed to continue discussion at its July meeting with a possible vote to recommend adoption of the revised Code of Conduct to the State Board.

**Requirements for Career-Technical Workforce Development Teaching Licenses:**

**Ohio Revised Code 3319.229** (*Strategies 1 & 2*):

- To address concerns gathered through public comments surrounding the requirements required for licensure as a Career-Technical Workforce Development teacher, Chair Fowler allowed the in-person and written testimony of individuals and associations both against and in favor of the current requirements set forth in ORC 3319.229.
- The committee agreed by consensus to delay voting to recommend any changes to coursework requirements of the preparation programs provided by Institutes of Higher Education. The delay will provide members and Department staff time to gather additional information to better inform any recommendations by the committee.
- Following testimony and discussion, the committee voted unanimously in favor of recommending a resolution to the State Board for adoption that would request that the legislature consider allowing both High School Diploma AND Graduation Equivalents as a prerequisite to apply for a Career-Technical Workforce Development Teaching License. Current law provides only for a High School Diploma. The State Board will be asked to vote on this resolution at their July 2019 meeting.

**Ohio Assessments for Educators (OAE): Update and Data Review** (*Strategies 1 & 2*):

- Department staff and representatives from the Evaluation Systems Group of Pearson provided committee members with an overview of the development and qualifying score setting processes of the Ohio Assessment for Educators tests that are required for initial educator licensure in Ohio.
- A similar review was conducted in April by the Ohio Educator Standards Board. Following their review of qualifying scores and passage rates for the 51 OAE tests, no changes to qualifying scores were recommended.
- Following discussion and review of the passage rate data, committee members agreed by consensus with the Educator Standards Board recommendation to maintain current qualifying scores on all current OAE tests. As a result of this decision, no action is required by committee or State Board.

---

---

**BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE**

Chair: Antoinette Miranda, Vice Chair: Mike Toal

Dr. Miranda gave a report from the Continuous Improvement Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

**Members Present:** Antoinette Miranda (Chair), Mike Toal (Vice Chair), Stephanie Dodd, John Hagan, Mark Lamoncha and Eric Poklar.

**Purpose(s) and/or Goal(s) of Meeting:**

- Discuss and review proposed changes to OAC 3301-83-07, 08 and 13 for a possible committee vote.
- Discuss and review the amendment process for OAC 3301-35 Operating Standards for Kindergarten through Twelfth Grade.
- Discuss and review the functions of the Office of Community Schools
- Discuss and review grants overseen by the Office of Improvement and Innovation: School Quality Improvement Grant, 21<sup>st</sup> Century Grant and Expanding Opportunities for Each Child Grant

**OAC 3301-83 Ohio Pupil Transportation Rules:**

- Members reviewed and discussed revisions made to the Ohio Pupil Transportation rules which are being amended pursuant to the five-year rule review.
- Committee members reviewed feedback received by the Department after the June 3, 2019 stakeholder meeting.
- Members voted unanimously to recommend and adopt OAC 3301-83-07, 08 and 13 to the State Board. The State Board will be asked to vote to adopt the revised rules during its July 2019 meeting.

**Overview of Operating Standards – OAC 3301-35-03 – 06 Steps and Process:**

- Members reviewed and discussed the timeline for the review process for the revision of the Operating Standards which are being amended pursuant the five-year rule review.
- Department staff provided a high-level overview of the current requirements under the following rules: OAC 3301-35-03 Blended learning, OAC 3301-35-04 Student and other stakeholder focus, OAC 3301-35-05 Faculty and staff focus and OAC 3301-35-06 Education programs and support.
- In the upcoming months, committee members will continue to review each rule in the Operating Standards, for a possible committee vote in December 2019 and a full board vote in January 2020.

**Community Schools Overview:**

- Department staff discussed the major functions of the Office for Community Schools.
- Members were informed of the Department's role in overseeing, monitoring and evaluating community schools' sponsors.
- Department staff answered questions regarding student transition when a community school is closed and the Department's efforts to improve student's transition during this process.

**School Quality Improvement Grant:**

- Department staff discussed the purpose of the School Quality Improvement Grant, which is to carry out school improvement activities.

- Department staff provided examples of how districts can use funds towards the four grant target areas: 1. Excellent educators and instructional practices, 2. Standards, assessment accountability, 3. Positive climate and culture, and 4. Research-based collaboration.
- Members asked Department staff to discuss how the Department chooses to award some application over others and to provide the average amount of funds awarded to each school.

**21<sup>ST</sup> Century Grant:**

- Department staff discussed the purpose of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century Grant, which is to provide opportunities for communities to establish or expand activities in community learning centers.
- Department staff provided a description of the grant 3 target areas: 1. Academics (reading and math), 2. Positive youth development and 3. Family engagement.
- Department staff provided examples on how funds are currently being used, based on community needs, by community organizations and the impact this has on students and families in the area.
- Department staff discussed how the funds are being monitored and answered members' question regarding how targeted areas are measured during the evaluation process.

**Expanding Opportunities for Each Child Grant:**

- Department staff discussed the purpose of the Expanding Opportunities for Each Child Grant, which is targeted towards districts in improvement status and low-achieving students in other local education agencies.
- Members were informed of 2019 grant target areas which included: 1. Career pathways development and expansion and 2. Advanced coursework access and success. Members asked Department staff to discuss the roles of grant writers during the application process and how the Department solicitates applications.
- Members were informed of the challenge in the solicitation of applications for this specific grant and how the Department plans to improve in this area.

**Items Voted on and Outcome of Vote:**

Members voted unanimously to recommend and adopt OAC 3301-83-07, 08 and 13 to the State Board. The State Board will be asked to vote to adopt the revised rules during its July 2019 meeting

**Will there be a vote or information in front of the Full Board at Next or Upcoming Meeting?**

The full board is expected to vote on OAC 3301-83-07, 08, and 13 during the July 2019 State Board meeting. The full board is also expected to vote on OAC 3301-35-01 – 10 during the December 2019 State Board meeting.

---

**BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE INTEGRATED STUDENT SUPPORTS COMMITTEE**

Chair: Charlotte McGuire, Vice Chair: Martha Manchester

Mrs. McGuire gave a report from the Integrated Student Supports Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

**Members Present:** Charlotte McGuire, Committee Chair, Martha Manchester, Committee Vice Chair, Kirsten Hill, Meryl Johnson, Mark Lamoncha, Cindy Collins and Antoinette Miranda.

**Plan to Improve Learning Experiences and Outcomes for Students with Disabilities:**

- Staff presented information on the Plan to Improve Learning Experiences and Outcomes for Students with Disabilities. The presentation included data from the Equity in Education: Students with Disabilities Data Story which demonstrates the performance gap for this group of students. Board members discussed the data and provided feedback on additional data that would be helpful to inform the discussion.
- Additionally, staff provided information on the statewide survey, focus groups, family town halls and student focus groups. The data and feedback gained from these efforts will inform the Plan to Improve Learning Experiences and Outcomes for Students with Disabilities.

**Nutrition and Wellness in Schools and Communities:**

- Staff presented information on the nutrition and wellness programs administered by the Department to support the whole child through nutrition programs. These programs included the school breakfast program and summer food service program. Board members discussed the food programs in their communities.
- Bookmarks to share information on the summer food service program were developed and distributed to libraries throughout the state. Staff provided bookmarks to the committee members to distribute in their communities.

**Updates on Strategic Plan Strategies (Strategies 7 and 8):**

- Committee members received updates on activities occurring with Strategic Plan Strategy 7 Meet the Needs of the Whole Child and Strategy 8 Expand Quality Early Learning.
- Committee members Mark Lamocha and Meryl Johnson volunteered to be on the Whole Child Advisory Committee.

**Revision to the May Meeting Minutes:**

- Board member Hill requested the committee reopen the May minutes for revision.
- The committee approved the revisions to the meeting minutes.

---

**BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ASSESSMENTS & ACCOUNTABILITY COMMITTEE**

Chair: John Hagan, Vice Chair: Lisa Woods

Mr. Hagan gave a report from the Assessments & Accountability Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

**Members Present:** John Hagan (Chair), Lisa Woods (Vice Chair), Linda Haycock, Jenny Kilgore, Mike Toal

**Dropout Recovery Workgroup Update:**

- Chair Hagan provided a brief update regarding the Dropout recovery workgroup meeting held on June 3.
- The next meeting is scheduled for June 17, 2019 from 10:00 – 3:00 at ODE.

**Introduction to Rule 3301-13-09 – Assessment Waiver:**

- Staff provided background on the 22+ program for new committee members. He indicated that the rule is up for five-year review, and it is currently posted for public comment which closes Friday, June 15.
- Staff indicated that this rule review is a technical cleanup of revised code corrections and wording updates.



- Staff will provide more in-depth program overview of the assessment waiver and related programs (22+, Adult Diploma, etc.) at the July committee meeting with the intent to vote it out of committee and move forward to full board.

**Report Card Rule Review:**

- Staff provided background on the report rule review process. Discussion began with review of the Performance Indicators/Indicators Met (Ohio Administrative Code 3301-28-04).
- The committee had significant conversation around the historical performance data and creation of this report card measure, assessment transitions, and next steps for decision making on this rule and other report card rules.
- Discussion will continue at the July committee meeting and staff will bring data simulations related to decisions points under the purview of the State Board. (For example – the Indicators Met threshold and grade scale associated with B, C, D and F ranges.)

---

**BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS TASK FORCE**

Chair: Martha Manchester

**Members Present:** Task Force Members: Manchester (chair), Johnson, LaMoncha, Miranda, Ficklin, Fabiano, Vaughn, Lehner, Kohler, Jones, McGuire

**Draft Guidance, Toolkit and Rubric for the Capstone Project for the Class of 2020** (*Strategy 10*):

- Members were provided an overview of the final guidance documents and rubric for the class of 2020 capstone project that address the requirements set forth in House Bill 491.
- Members provided final feedback on the guidance documents and toolkit.
- The capstone guidance and toolkits were released by May 31<sup>st</sup>, which met the legislative deadline.

**Graduation Update:**

- An overview was provided of the joint graduation proposal submitted by the Alliance for High Education, Ohio Excels and the Fordham Institute.

**High School Redesign Discussion:**

- Staff facilitated a discussion of several ongoing Department high school redesign initiatives including SuccessBound and the High School Redesign Collaborative.

---

**BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE DROP OUT PREVENTION AND RECOVERY WORKGROUP**

Chair: John Hagan

**June 3, 2019**

Members Present: John Hagan (Chair), Lisa Woods (Vice Chair), David Cash, Cris Gulacy, Stewart Jesse, Mary Rumpz, Rosemary Rooker, Roger Fox, Anthony Fisher

**Topic: Introductions and Discussion of Students Served in Dropout Prevention & Recovery:**

Members of the workgroup provided introductions of themselves, their backgrounds, their reason for serving on the workgroup and their desired outcomes for the workgroup. Members also provided examples of students served in their schools, including but not limited to, parenting and pregnant students, LGBTQ+ students; working students; students who do not feel supported by their traditional school.

Desired outcomes for the workgroup and for dropout recovery and prevention schools mentioned by members including:

- Ensure students are prepared for post-secondary life and real-world successes
- Provide flexibility for schools regarding educational plans for individual students; make connections for students to individual goals
- Acknowledge improvement in areas of attendance; reading; progress
- Address legislative changes, rule reviews, and alignment of rules and laws
- Connection between serving students in dropout prevention & recovery schools to other programs (GED, 22+, etc.)

**Topic: Report Cards and Accountability:**

Members of the workgroup discussed the report card and accountability measures, including:

- How to use alternative measures for improvement or progress
- Rethinking how Gap Closing (achievement gaps) are measured with different scales
- Ensure that accountability measures are capturing students being served appropriately by schools
- Consider the definitions of success for these schools and students; re-engaging students is key
- Ensure mental health considerations are included in service and support for students
- Consider expanded measures for post-secondary success (GED, transition back to home school, credentials, etc.)
- Missing a measure of equity or focus on equity for dropout recovery & prevention schools via the report card

**Topic: Blended Learning and Designation Requirements:**

Members of the workgroup discussed the use of blended learning, including:

- The goal is to provide alternatives for flexibility to get students to graduation
- Blended learning is difficult to operationalize while also obtaining funding
- Schools are using blended learning without the designation
- Schools do not have systems to track hourly schedules of students
- Flexibility is needed to implement
- Need to address technical document from ODE regarding attendance percentages; updates should include stakeholder input
- All guidance or guidelines should focus on encouraging schools to re-engage their students

**Topic: Credit Flexibility and Requirements:**

Members of the workgroup discussed the use of credit flexibility and the requirements, including:

- The goal is to give credit to students for things they are already doing (working, skills testing, etc.)
- There is positive feedback overall on this program availability
- There is uncertainty of the existing rules

**Topic: Use of Facilities:**

Members of the workgroup discussed the use of facilities, including:

- The need for facilities to be safe, clean and a professional environment to learn
- The challenge is outreach and making sure students are aware of school options
- Transportation is a variable in school costs and services
- Need to further discuss options for facilities for dropout prevention & recovery schools including public funding, multi-use buildings, and/or investments possible
- Need to further discuss the challenges of community schools, district schools regarding facilities and options

---

**VOTING ON THE REPORT & RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION**

President Kohler called on Superintendent DeMaria for his report and recommendations.

President Kohler presented the following recommendations (Items 1-5) on the Consent Agenda:

1. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY NATHON M. BRECHT AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Nathon M. Brecht has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on April 29, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Nathon M. Brecht that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Brecht's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Nathon M. Brecht is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Nathon M. Brecht has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

**RESOLVED**, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Nathon M. Brecht's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and

**DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Brecht's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Nathon M. Brecht be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Brecht of this action.

2. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY GREG M. HOLDINESS AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Greg M. Holdiness has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on May 10, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Greg M. Holdiness that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Holdiness' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Greg M. Holdiness is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Greg M. Holdiness has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Greg M. Holdiness' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Holdiness' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Greg M. Holdiness be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Holdiness of this action.

3. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY THOMAS E. MELLOTT AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Thomas E. Mellott has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on May 6, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Thomas E. Mellott that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Mellott's 2018 felony conviction for one count of tampering with records in the Fairfield County Court of Common Pleas; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Thomas E. Mellott is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Thomas E. Mellott has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Thomas E. Mellott's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Mellott's 2018 felony conviction for one count of tampering with records in the Fairfield County Court of Common Pleas. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Thomas E. Mellott be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Mellott of this action.

4. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY ELLISA P. POFF AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Ellisa P. Poff has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on April 24, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Ellisa P. Poff that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Poff's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Ellisa P. Poff is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Ellisa P. Poff has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Ellisa P. Poff's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Poff's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Ellisa P. Poff be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Poff of this action.

5. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY CORY J. RUDIBAUGH AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Cory J. Rudibaugh has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on April 12, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Cory J. Rudibaugh that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Rudibaugh's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Cory J. Rudibaugh is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Cory J. Rudibaugh has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Cory J. Rudibaugh's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Rudibaugh's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Cory J. Rudibaugh be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Rudibaugh of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Mrs. Hill that the Consent Agenda (Items 1-5) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

**YES VOTES**

Cindy Collins  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Mike Toal

Motion carried.

---

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 6):

**6. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-4-01 / NOTICE OF MEETINGS**

The State Board of Education (“Board”) hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) 121.22 requires the State Board of Education (“Board”) to adopt a rule establishing a reasonable method by which any person may determine the time and place of all regularly scheduled meetings and the time, place and purpose of all special meetings;

The State Board of Education’s policies and procedures manual allows for the creation of task forces, as needed, to carry out specific tasks of the State Board;

Staff recommends that Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-4-01 be amended to also reference task forces, which would align with and document current practice; and

The Executive Committee recommended at its May 2019 meeting that the Board adopt Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-4-01 / Notice of Meetings in the form attached hereto.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board approves adopting OAC 3301-4-01 in the form attached hereto;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relates.

It was Moved by President Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 6) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

**YES VOTES**

Cindy Collins  
Sarah Fowler

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan



Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Mike Toal

Motion carried.

---

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 7):

**7. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE  
3301-24-05 / LICENSURE**

The State Board of Education (“Board”) **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.07 allows the Board to adopt rules necessary for carrying out any function imposed on it by law;

ORC 3319.22 allows the Board to adopt, amend, or rescind rules for educator licenses;

OAC 3301-24-05 is being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review;

OAC 3301-24-05 is being amended due to changes in grade bands in ORC 3319.22, as amended by Senate Bill 216;

Further, OAC 3301-24-05 is being amended to remove credentials for which there are no institutions of higher education offering educator preparation programs, to remove requirements set forth in rule that are duplicative of the requirements for the respective educator preparation programs, and to provide clarity and align with current policies and practices;

The Educator Standards Board recommended at its March 2019 meeting that the rule be amended in the form attached hereto, except for one revision that was incorporated at a later time due to responses received during the public comment period; and

The Teaching, Leading, and Learning Committee recommended at its May 2019 meeting that the rule be amended in the form attached hereto.

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED**, that the Board adopts the changes to OAC 3301-24-05 / Licensure in the form attached hereto;

**FURTHER RESOLVED**, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relates.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 7) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

Motion carried.

---

Mrs. McGuire presented the following recommendation (Item 8):

**8. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-51-10 TRANSPORTATION OF CHILDREN WITH DISABILITIES**

The State Board of Education (“Board”) hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.07 allows the Board to adopt rules necessary for carrying out any function imposed on it by law;

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3323.02 requires the State Board of Education (“Board”) to establish rules or standards for the provision of special education and related services for all children with disabilities who are at least three years of age and less than twenty-two years of age residing in the state;

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3327.01 requires the State Board of Education (“Board”) to adopt rules establishing the minimum standards for the provision of children who are so disabled that they are unable to walk to and from the school; and

The Integrated Student Supports Committee recommended at its May 2019 meeting that the Board adopt Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-51-10 Transportation of Children with Disabilities in the form attached hereto;

In accordance with the Legislative Service Commission Rule Drafting Manual Section 4.3.1, since more than 50 percent of the rule is being amended, the existing rule is being rescinded and a new rule, bearing the same number, is being adopted.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Board approves rescinding the existing OAC 3301-51-10 and adopting a new rule, bearing the same number, in the form attached hereto;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relates.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 8) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

- |                    |                   |
|--------------------|-------------------|
| Cindy Collins      | Stephanie Dodd    |
| Sarah Fowler       | John Hagan        |
| Linda Haycock      | Kirsten Hill      |
| Meryl Johnson      | Jenny Kilgore     |
| Laura Kohler       | Mark Lamoncha     |
| Martha Manchester  | Charlotte McGuire |
| Antoinette Miranda | Nick Owens        |
| Eric Poklar        | Mike Toal         |
| Lisa Woods         |                   |

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 9):

- 9. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL ELEMENTARY TEACHING LICENSE OF LYNNE M. BAMBERGER**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Lynne M. Bamberger held a five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2013; and

WHEREAS on August 17, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Lynne M. Bamberger of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2013 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Bamberger engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about November 16, 2016, Ms. Bamberger was discovered to be under the influence of alcohol and/or Valium at school in the presence of students; and on or about November 16, 2016, it was discovered that she had an empty bottle of vodka in her purse and days later an additional, partially-full bottle of vodka was discovered in her office/classroom; and

WHEREAS Ms. Bamberger requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent, but she withdrew her request prior to the hearing; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on December 12, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Bamberger was not present at the hearing, nor was she represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Bamberger's license be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Ms. Bamberger be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Bamberger engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession when she was under the influence of alcohol and Valium during the school day in the presence of her students, in addition to having empty and partially-filled bottles of vodka in her purse and in her classroom and, as a result, was unable to perform the functions of her job and presented a safety risk to her students; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Lynne M. Bamberger's five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2013 based upon Ms. Bamberger engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about November 16, 2016, Ms. Bamberger was discovered to be under the influence of alcohol and/or Valium at school in the presence of students; and on or about November 16, 2016, it was discovered that she had an empty bottle of vodka in her purse and days later an additional, partially-full bottle of vodka was discovered in her office/classroom. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Lynne M. Bamberger be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Bamberger of this action.

It was Moved by Mr. Poklar and Seconded by Mr. Owens that the above recommendation (Item 9) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

**YES VOTES**

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

Motion carried.

---

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 10):

**10. RESOLUTION TO DENY THE ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT APPLICATION AND TO REVOKE THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF ROBERT M. BROWN**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Robert M. Brown has applied for a one-year educational aide permit and holds a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS on March 27, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Robert M. Brown of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a one-year educational aide permit and to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Brown's 2017 conviction in the Mount Vernon Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of persistent disorderly conduct; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Brown that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to deny or permanently deny his application for a one-year educational aide permit and limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Robert M. Brown did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Mount Vernon Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Knox County Sheriff's Office; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Robert M. Brown's application for a one-year educational aide permit and **REVOKES** Robert M. Brown's three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 based upon Mr. Brown's 2017 conviction in the Mount Vernon Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of persistent disorderly conduct. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that Robert M. Brown be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after June 11, 2021, and that upon reapplication, he must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed, at his own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education, and any additional counseling and/or treatment recommended by the licensed psychologist or psychiatrist and that he has completed a drug/alcohol assessment by an evaluator pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education and any treatment recommended by the evaluator; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Brown of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 10) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Eric Poklar

Mike Toal

Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

---

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 11):

**11. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FOUR-YEAR RESIDENT EDUCATOR EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHING LICENSE OF AMANDA M. GEORGE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Amanda M. George held a four-year resident educator early childhood teaching license issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on March 29, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Amanda M. George of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year resident educator early childhood teaching license issued in 2014 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. George's 2017 conviction in the Logan County Common Pleas Court for one misdemeanor count of complicity to intimidation of attorney, victim or witness in a criminal case or delinquent child action proceeding; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. George that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year resident educator early childhood teaching license issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS Amanda M. George did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Logan County Common Pleas Court, and certified police records from the Bellefontaine Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure*

*Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Amanda M. George’s four-year resident educator early childhood teaching license issued in 2014 based upon Ms. George's 2017 conviction in the Logan County Common Pleas Court for one misdemeanor count of complicity to intimidation of attorney, victim or witness in a criminal case or delinquent child action proceeding. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders that Amanda M. George be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. George of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Manchester and Seconded by Mrs. Collins that the above recommendation (Item 11) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

- |                    |                   |
|--------------------|-------------------|
| Cindy Collins      | Stephanie Dodd    |
| Sarah Fowler       | John Hagan        |
| Linda Haycock      | Kirsten Hill      |
| Meryl Johnson      | Jenny Kilgore     |
| Laura Kohler       | Mark Lamoncha     |
| Martha Manchester  | Charlotte McGuire |
| Antoinette Miranda | Nick Owens        |
| Eric Poklar        | Mike Toal         |
| Lisa Woods         |                   |

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 12):

12. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL ELEMENTARY TEACHING LICENSE OF SHAWN M. JOHNSON**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Shawn M. Johnson holds a five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015; and



WHEREAS on October 4, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Shawn M. Johnson of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Johnson engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about September 30, 2016, when he dragged a student by the foot across the hallway to another classroom and when he picked up a second student, carried that student out of his classroom, and put the student on the floor of another classroom; and

WHEREAS Mr. Johnson did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on January 10, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Johnson was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Johnson's license be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Mr. Johnson be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Johnson engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession when he physically picked up and moved one student across a hallway and into another classroom and dragged another student by the foot across the hallway into another classroom, thereby interacting physically with students in a manner that was not for the purpose of ensuring the health, safety, or welfare of the students; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Shawn M. Johnson's five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015 based upon Mr. Johnson engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about September 30, 2016, when he dragged a student by the foot across the hallway to another classroom and when he picked up a second student, carried that student out of his classroom, and put the student on the floor of another classroom. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Shawn M. Johnson be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Johnson of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Mr. Poklar that the above recommendation (Item 12) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

- |                    |                   |
|--------------------|-------------------|
| Cindy Collins      | Stephanie Dodd    |
| Sarah Fowler       | John Hagan        |
| Linda Haycock      | Kirsten Hill      |
| Meryl Johnson      | Jenny Kilgore     |
| Laura Kohler       | Mark Lamoncha     |
| Martha Manchester  | Charlotte McGuire |
| Antoinette Miranda | Nick Owens        |
| Eric Poklar        | Mike Toal         |
| Lisa Woods         |                   |

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 13):

**13. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF DANIELLE N. LUCAS**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Danielle N. Lucas holds a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS on February 20, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Danielle N. Lucas of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(c), (B)(2)(e) and (F). The notice was based upon Ms. Lucas' 2018 conviction in the Butler County Court of Common Pleas for one misdemeanor count of theft, 2011 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of unauthorized use of property, 2001 conviction in the Middletown Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of petty theft, and failure to fully disclose her criminal background on the applications that she submitted to the Ohio Department of Education in 2014 and 2017; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Lucas that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Danielle N. Lucas did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of

Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Butler County Court of Common Pleas, Hamilton Municipal Court, and Middletown Municipal Court, and the applications that Ms. Lucas submitted in 2014 and 2017; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(c), (B)(2)(e) and (F), hereby **REVOKES** Danielle N. Lucas' three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 based upon Ms. Lucas' 2018 conviction in the Butler County Court of Common Pleas for one misdemeanor count of petty theft, 2011 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of unauthorized use of property, 2001 conviction in the Middletown Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of petty theft, and failure to fully disclose her criminal background on the applications that she submitted to the Ohio Department of Education in 2014 and 2017. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders that Danielle N. Lucas be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Lucas of this action.

It was Moved by Mr. Owens and Seconded by Mrs. Hill that the above recommendation (Item 13) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

Motion carried.

---

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 14):

**14. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT APPLICATION OF AARON A. NICHOLS**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Aaron A. Nichols has applied for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS on August 7, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Aaron A. Nichols of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(b), and (F) and Rule 3301-20-01(E)(2) of the Ohio Administrative Code. The notice was based upon Mr. Nichols' 2012 conviction in the Euclid Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2009 conviction in the Beachwood Mayor's Court for one misdemeanor count of open container prohibited, 2007 conviction in the Cleveland Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of open container prohibited, 2003 conviction in the Somerset County Superior Court-Skowhagen, Maine for one misdemeanor count of assault, and failure to fully disclose his criminal convictions on his pending application to the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS Mr. Nichols requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on February 1, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Nichols was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Nichols' application be denied. Further it is recommended that Mr. Nichols be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Nichols engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession as a result of his four criminal convictions, which included an offense of violence, and his failure to disclose three of his four convictions on his pending application to the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

**RESOLVED**, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(b), and (F) and Rule 3301-20-01(E)(2) of the Ohio

Administrative Code, hereby **DENIES** Aaron A. Nichols' application for a three-year pupil activity permit based upon Mr. Nichols' 2012 conviction in the Euclid Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2009 conviction in the Beachwood Mayor's Court for one misdemeanor count of open container prohibited, 2007 conviction in the Cleveland Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of open container prohibited, 2003 conviction in the Somerset County Superior Court-Skowhagen, Maine for one misdemeanor count of assault, and failure to fully disclose his criminal convictions on his pending application to the Ohio Department of Education. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Aaron A. Nichols be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Nichols of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Ms. Woods that the above recommendation (Item 14) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

Motion carried.

---

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 15):

**15. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION OF THE HANDICAPPED TEACHING LICENSE OF TASHA O'NEILL**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Tasha O'Neill holds a five-year professional education of the handicapped teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on October 10, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Tasha O'Neill of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year professional education of the handicapped teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. O'Neill, while employed as an intervention specialist with the Olentangy Local School District during the 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 school years, engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when she failed to maintain appropriate student-teacher boundaries with a student, including, but not limited to, the following conduct: while at school, hanging out with the student, sitting close together, and eating lunch privately; driving the student home in violation of school policy and having the student over to her house; and taking the student shopping and buying the student gifts. The notice also was based upon Ms. O'Neill frequently communicating with the student via text messages, Facebook Messenger, KIK, phone calls, and email with some of the communications occurring late at night and involving inappropriate conversations that were not school related, including, but not limited to, the following communications: Ms. O'Neill sending variations of "I love you" to the student; Ms. O'Neill having inappropriate communication about sex with the student and allowing the student to send inappropriate communications to her without letting the student know that they were inappropriate and without reporting these communications to the district; the student sending naked pictures of girls to Ms. O'Neill, who failed to report these inappropriate communications to the district; and Ms. O'Neill telling the student to delete messages that she sent to the student. Additionally, the student inappropriately touched Ms. O'Neill multiple times, including touching her breasts, buttocks, and crotch area, and the student kissed Ms. O'Neill, who continued to put herself in a position where this inappropriate physical contact could occur and failed to report it to the school district; and

WHEREAS Ms. O'Neill requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on February 13, 2019; and

WHEREAS Ms. O'Neill was present at the hearing, but she was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. O'Neill's license be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Ms. O'Neill be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. O'Neill engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession when she established and maintained an extremely inappropriate relationship with a student over a two-year period; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Tasha O'Neill's five-year professional education

of the handicapped teaching license issued in 2015 based upon Ms. O'Neill, while employed as an intervention specialist with the Olentangy Local School District during the 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 school years, engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when she failed to maintain appropriate student-teacher boundaries with a student, including, but not limited to, the following conduct: while at school, hanging out with the student, sitting close together, and eating lunch privately; driving the student home in violation of school policy and having the student over to her house; and taking the student shopping and buying the student gifts. The notice also was based upon Ms. O'Neill frequently communicating with the student via text messages, Facebook Messenger, KIK, phone calls, and email with some of the communications occurring late at night and involving inappropriate conversations that were not school related, including, but not limited to, the following communications: Ms. O'Neill sending variations of "I love you" to the student; Ms. O'Neill having inappropriate communication about sex with the student and allowing the student to send inappropriate communications to her without letting the student know that they were inappropriate and without reporting these communications to the district; the student sending naked pictures of girls to Ms. O'Neill, who failed to report these inappropriate communications to the district; and Ms. O'Neill telling the student to delete messages that she sent to the student. Additionally, the student inappropriately touched Ms. O'Neill multiple times, including touching her breasts, buttocks, and crotch area, and the student kissed Ms. O'Neill, who continued to put herself in a position where this inappropriate physical contact could occur and failed to report it to the school district. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Tasha O'Neill be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. O'Neill of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Manchester and Seconded by Mr. Poklar that the above recommendation (Item 15) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Mike Toal

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

---

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 16):

**16. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO ISSUE AND SUSPEND THE ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT APPLICATION OF DEREK M. ROWLES**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Derek M. Rowles has applied for a one-year educational aide permit; and

WHEREAS on February 7, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Derek M. Rowles of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a one-year educational aide permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Rowles engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about April 10, 2017, when he failed to disclose on his pending application to the Ohio Department of Education his 1977 misdemeanor conviction for resisting arrest, 1978 misdemeanor conviction for disorderly conduct, 1978 misdemeanor conviction for disorderly conduct in a separate case, and 1980 misdemeanor conviction for theft. Further, the notice included as an aggravating factor that on or about August 15, 2016, Mr. Rowles was disciplined by the State Board of Education when he accepted a letter of admonishment based on his failure to disclose his 1977, 1978, and 1980 misdemeanor convictions on his 2016 application for a one-year educational aide permit; and

WHEREAS Mr. Rowles requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on February 8, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Rowles was present at the hearing, but he was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that that the State Board of Education approve Mr. Rowles' pending application for a one-year educational aide permit and then suspend the permit for a period of one year with all but thirty days stayed, with the thirty day suspension to be served during the summer. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Rowles engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession when he failed to disclose his 1977, 1978, and 1980 misdemeanor convictions on his pending application to the Ohio Department of Education after receiving a letter of admonishment from the State Board of Education in 2016 for the same conduct, but finding in mitigation based on Mr. Rowles' age at the time he submitted his pending application and his lack of computer skills, that Mr. Rowles did not intentionally try to defraud anyone or omit anything on his pending application; and



WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **ISSUES** Derek M. Rowles' application for a one-year educational aide permit and **SUSPENDS** the permit from July 1, 2017 through June 30, 2018 with all but thirty days stayed with the thirty day suspension to run from July 1, 2017 through July 30, 2017. The suspension is based upon Mr. Rowles engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about April 10, 2017, when he failed to disclose on his pending application to the Ohio Department of Education his 1977 misdemeanor conviction for resisting arrest, 1978 misdemeanor conviction for disorderly conduct, 1978 misdemeanor conviction for disorderly conduct in a separate case, and 1980 misdemeanor conviction for theft. Pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-21(B), the State Board of Education further considers in aggravation that on or about August 15, 2016, Mr. Rowles was disciplined by the State Board of Education when he accepted a letter of admonishment based on his failure to disclose his 1977, 1978, and 1980 misdemeanor convictions on his 2016 application for a one-year educational aide permit; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Rowles of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Dr. Miranda that the above recommendation (Item 16) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Eric Poklar
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

---

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 17):

**17. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO ADMONISH TRAVIS W. RUCKMAN**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Travis W. Ruckman holds a five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on July 9, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Travis W. Ruckman of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Ruckman engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about April 6, 2017, when he was discovered to be under the influence of alcohol at school in the presence of students and subsequently failed an employment-related alcohol screen, which indicated a blood alcohol content (BAC) of .170; and

WHEREAS Mr. Ruckman requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on January 29, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Ruckman was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Ruckman be admonished by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Ruckman engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession on April 6, 2017, when he showed up at a school to teach while under the influence of alcohol but finding in mitigation that Mr. Ruckman took full responsibility for his actions, complied with all of the requirements of his last chance agreement with the Bloom-Carroll Local School District, and has maintained a clean disciplinary record since the isolated incident and returned to teaching with high accolades; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

**RESOLVED**, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **ADMONISHES** Travis W. Ruckman, who holds a five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015, based upon Mr. Ruckman engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about April 6, 2017, when he was discovered to be under the influence of alcohol at school in the presence of students and subsequently failed an employment-related alcohol screen, which indicated a blood alcohol content (BAC) of .170; and, Be It Further

**RESOLVED**, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Ruckman of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mr. Hagan that the above recommendation (Item 17) be approved.

Mrs. Haycock Moved to Amend by Substitution. Ms. Johnson Seconded the motion. She proposed the following resolution. She stated she believed Mr. Ruckman did put students in harm's way and discipline was warranted. Ms. Johnson spoke in favor of the proposed amendment and believed a letter of admonishment was not strong enough in this case.

**RESOLUTION TO MODIFY THE REPORT OF THE HEARING OFFICER,  
TO REJECT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER,  
AND TO SUSPEND THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL ELEMENTARY  
TEACHING LICENSE OF TRAVIS W. RUCKMAN**

**I RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Travis W. Ruckman holds a five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on July 9, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Travis W. Ruckman of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Ruckman engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about April 6, 2017, when he was discovered to be under the influence of alcohol at school in the presence of students and subsequently failed an employment-related alcohol screen, which indicated a blood alcohol content (BAC) of .170; and

WHEREAS Mr. Ruckman requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on January 29, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Ruckman was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Ruckman be admonished by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Ruckman engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession on April 6, 2017, when he showed up at a school to teach while under the influence of alcohol but finding in mitigation that Mr. Ruckman took full responsibility for his actions, complied with all of the requirements of his last chance agreement with the Bloom-Carroll Local School District, and has maintained a clean disciplinary record since the isolated incident and returned to teaching with high accolades; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for

the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's Report and Recommendation: reject in its entirety the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in its entirety Conclusion of Law numbered 11; reject in its entirety the third full sentence on page 16 of the Report and Recommendation that reads, "There is no need to continue to punish Mr. Ruckman by revoking his license and applying a time period before he can reapply for his license."; reject in its entirety the last sentence of the first paragraph on page 16 of the Report and Recommendation that reads, "Therefore, a letter of admonishment is the recommended action in this instance."; reject in its entirety the first sentence of the second paragraph on page 16 of the Report and Recommendation that reads, "Therefore, it is this Hearing Officer's recommendation that Mr. Ruckman receive a letter of admonishment from the Board for his misconduct of April 6, 2017."; and reject in its entirety the Recommendation section on page 16 of the Report and Recommendation;

WHEREAS the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board may determine which penalty within the range of the disciplinary guidelines listed in the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators* is appropriate in an individual case based upon the aggravating and mitigating factors as outlined in Section 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and any other factors the State Board considers relevant; and

WHEREAS the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following aggravating factors: the nature of Mr. Ruckman's conduct includes him being under the influence of alcohol while on school property with a very high blood alcohol content; the seriousness of Mr. Ruckman's conduct includes him being under the influence of alcohol while having the responsibility for the care, custody, and control of middle school children; given Mr. Ruckman's age and his 17 years of experience as a teacher, he should have understood the importance of providing a safe environment and being a role model to his students; Mr. Ruckman's demonstrated extremely bad judgment and poor decision making when he decided to come to work while under the influence of alcohol; and his actions negatively impacted the school community and reflected negatively on the teaching profession; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when she did not appreciate the seriousness of Mr. Ruckman's conduct and did not give the preceding facts and aggravating factors the weight they deserved when she made her recommendation as evidenced by her recommending a disciplinary sanction that is below the lowest level of the disciplinary range in the discipline guidelines of the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that based on the seriousness of Mr. Ruckman's conduct and the other aggravating factors in this case a more appropriate sanction would be to monitor Mr. Ruckman's conduct and to suspend Mr. Ruckman's license for two years with all but thirty days stayed provided he completes, at his own expense, two years of random drug/alcohol tests as

determined by the Ohio Department of Education and two years of administrative reporting; and

WHEREAS the State Board acknowledges that Mr. Ruckman's license expires on June 30, 2020 and the terms of its sanction will not be complete prior to June 30, 2020: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's Report and Recommendation: reject in its entirety the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in its entirety Conclusion of Law numbered 11; reject in its entirety the third full sentence on page 16 of the Report and Recommendation that reads, "There is no need to continue to punish Mr. Ruckman by revoking his license and applying a time period before he can reapply for his license."; reject in its entirety the last sentence of the first paragraph on page 16 of the Report and Recommendation that reads, "Therefore, a letter of admonishment is the recommended action in this instance."; reject in its entirety the first sentence of the second paragraph on page 16 of the Report and Recommendation that reads, "Therefore, it is this Hearing Officer's recommendation that Mr. Ruckman receive a letter of admonishment from the Board for his misconduct of April 6, 2017."; and reject in its entirety the Recommendation section on page 16 of the Report and Recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following aggravating factors: the nature of Mr. Ruckman's conduct includes him being under the influence of alcohol while on school property with a very high blood alcohol content; the seriousness of Mr. Ruckman's conduct includes him being under the influence of alcohol while having the responsibility for the care, custody, and control of middle school children; given Mr. Ruckman's age and his 17 years of experience as a teacher, he should have understood the importance of providing a safe environment and being a role model to his students; Mr. Ruckman's demonstrated extremely bad judgment and poor decision making when he decided to come to work while under the influence of alcohol; and his actions negatively impacted the school community and reflected negatively on the teaching profession; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when she did not appreciate the seriousness of Mr. Ruckman's conduct and did not give the preceding facts and aggravating factors the weight they deserved when she made her recommendation as evidenced by her recommending a disciplinary sanction that is below the lowest level of the disciplinary range in the discipline guidelines of the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that based on the seriousness of Mr. Ruckman's conduct and the other aggravating factors in this case a more appropriate sanction would be to monitor Mr. Ruckman's conduct and to suspend Mr. Ruckman's license for two years with all but thirty days stayed provided he completes, at his own expense, two years of random drug/alcohol tests as determined by the Ohio Department of Education and two years of administrative reporting; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That Mr. Ruckman's license expires on June 30, 2020 and the terms of the State Board's sanction will not be complete prior to June 30, 2020; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **SUSPENDS** Travis W. Ruckman's five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015 from June 11, 2019 through its expiration date, June 30, 2020, and suspends any subsequent license for an additional 347 days, with all but thirty days stayed with the thirty days to be served from July 1, 2019 through July 30, 2019 provided that Mr. Ruckman, at his own expense, completes two years of random drug/alcohol tests as determined by the Ohio Department of Education and two years of administrative reporting. The stay of the suspension will be lifted and his license will be suspended immediately if Mr. Ruckman fails a random drug/alcohol test, fails to complete a test, or provides a diluted sample or Mr. Ruckman has an negative administrative report as evidenced by his further conduct resulting in disciplinary action by his employing district, termination by his employing district, and/or his resignation under threat of termination by his employing district. The suspension is based upon Mr. Ruckman engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about April 6, 2017, when he was discovered to be under the influence of alcohol at school in the presence of students and subsequently failed an employment-related alcohol screen, which indicated a blood alcohol content (BAC) of .170; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, directs the Ohio Department of Education, on its behalf, to implement the aforementioned terms and conditions regarding Mr. Ruckman's licenses. Further, if said terms and conditions have not been fulfilled completely upon Mr. Ruckman applying for a new license, the State Board directs the Ohio Department of Education to evaluate the new application in accordance with its orders and ensure all outstanding terms and conditions are addressed; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Ruckman of this action.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd	Sarah Fowler
John Hagan	Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Mark Lamoncha	Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda	Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods	

NO VOTES

Cindy Collins	Kirsten Hill
Charlotte McGuire	Mike Toal
Laura Kohler	

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Mark Lamoncha	Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda	Eric Poklar
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Charlotte McGuire	Laura Kohler
-------------------	--------------

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

---

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 18):

**18. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF JACOB T. STOVALL**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jacob T. Stovall holds a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018; and

WHEREAS on March 18, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Jacob T. Stovall of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Stovall's 2018 conviction in the Kettering Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Stovall that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018; and

WHEREAS Jacob T. Stovall did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Kettering Municipal Court, and police records from the Moraine Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Jacob T. Stovall's three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 based upon Mr. Stovall's 2018 conviction in the Kettering Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a), orders that Jacob T. Stovall be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after June 11, 2021, and that upon reapplication, he must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed at his own expense a drug/alcohol assessment by a licensed counselor and, should the licensed counselor recommend any additional counseling and/or treatment, Mr. Stovall must successfully complete all recommended counseling and/or treatment prior to reapplying for a license, permit, or certificate with the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Stovall of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 18) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Mike Toal



Motion carried.

---

Mrs. McGuire presented the following recommendation (Item 19):

**19. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE SOCIAL AND EMOTIONAL LEARNING STANDARDS**

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

*Each Child, Our Future*, Ohio's Strategic Plan for Education, recognizes four equally-valued learning domains, one of which is social-emotional learning;

In 2012, the State Board of Education adopted Ohio's Early Learning and Development Standards, which present a continuum of learning and development from birth to age five in each of five domains, including social-emotional development;

In 2015, the Department of Education worked with a diverse set of education stakeholders and the State Board of Education and extended the social and emotional learning standards up to third grade;

As part of the process to extend social and emotional learning to all grades as part of the fulfillment of Ohio's Strategic Plan, the Department of Education initiated a stakeholder-driven process to develop social and emotional learning standards to guide instructional practices for educators in grades kindergarten through twelve;

In November 2017, the Department of Education conducted a statewide survey to gauge the awareness of and interest in additional social and emotional learning standards and resources;

Beginning in February 2018, the Department of Education assembled a social and emotional learning advisory group of Ohio educators and social-emotional learning experts to advise and assist in the development of standards;

From May through July 2018, a writing team of Ohio teachers, school counselors, and education professionals drafted social and emotional learning standards for grades kindergarten through twelve;

In November and December 2018, the draft standards were reviewed by the social and emotional learning advisory group and national experts not only for alignment, but also for bias sensitivity, equity, and cultural sensitivity;

From February 11 through March 11, 2019, the Department of Education posted the draft standards for public comment and solicited the feedback of educators, key stakeholders, and the public;

At the close of the public comment period, a cross-agency team at the Department reviewed all comments and prepared revisions based on comments; and

Minutes of the June 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

The Integrated Student Supports Committee in its May 2019 meeting recommended that the Board adopt the Social and Emotional Learning Standards as provided in the document attached hereto.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education adopts the Social and Emotional Learning Standards as provided in the document attached hereto.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 19) be approved.

Mrs. Hill Moved to Amend the resolution by Substitution. Ms. Woods Seconded the motion. Mrs. Hill proposed the following amendment. Mrs. Hill stated the proposed amendment formalizes concerns raised regarding measurements being conducted by the state and noted the relationship between a student and their teacher.

Mrs. Dodd stated the amendment contained language that was not part of the State Board's control and she was not comfortable supporting the amendment.

Ms. Johnson spoke in opposition to the proposed amendment.

Ms. Woods stated she would support the proposed amendment and felt the most important point was to not measure these standards.

Ms. Fowler stated the most feedback she received related to the collection of student identifiable information and the belief that a parent should be involved.

Proposed Amendment:

Be it further resolved, the Ohio State Board of Education and Ohio Department of Education will not develop any form of assessment to measure or gauge a student's progress in learning or mastering the Social Emotional Learning (SEL) Standards;

Be it further resolved, the SEL standards will not be factored into any form of measurement used to evaluate a teacher;

Be it further resolved, the Ohio Department of Education will not require or recommend that a student's mastery of the SEL standards be measured through any local form of formative or summative assessment;

Be it further resolved, no student shall be required as part of any program or activity, related to the SEL standards, to submit to any form of psychiatric or psychological examination, testing, or treatment without prior written consent of the student's parent or guardian, in which the purpose is to elicit information about the student's attitudes, habits, traits, beliefs, or feelings;

Be it further resolved, any personally identifiable data that identifies a student's attitudes, habits, traits, beliefs, or feelings that is elicited in a local school district activity shall not be transmitted to any entity outside the school to which the student is enrolled without prior written consent of the student's parent or guardian.

After discussion, Ms. Johnson called the question. Mrs. Manchester Seconded the motion.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote to call the question.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Eric Poklar

NO VOTES

Charlotte McGuire	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

Motion carried.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment by Mrs. Hill.

YES VOTES

Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Kirsten Hill	Jenny Kilgore
Nick Owens	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

NO VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Linda Haycock	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Eric Poklar

Motion denied.

Mrs. McGuire stated you cannot mix state and local responsibilities.

Mr. Hagan spoke in opposition to the resolution.

After further discussion, Mrs. Manchester called the question. Dr. Miranda Seconded the motion.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote to call the question.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Linda Haycock	Meryl Johnson

Minutes of the June 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Laura Kohler  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens

Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Eric Poklar

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler  
Kirsten Hill  
Mark Lamoncha  
Lisa Woods

John Hagan  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mike Toal

Motion denied. A two-thirds majority vote was not obtained.

Mr. Toal stated he had concerns regarding implementation and how this would be carried out effectively and would not support the resolution.

Mrs. Hill stated her proposed amendment focused on one issue but noted there were numerous other issues that were identified.

After discussion, Mr. Poklar called the question. Mrs. Manchester Seconded the motion.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote to call the question.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Mike Toal

Motion carried.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the original resolution.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins  
Linda Haycock  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Eric Poklar

Stephanie Dodd  
Meryl Johnson  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler  
Kirsten Hill  
Mike Toal

John Hagan  
Jenny Kilgore  
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 20):

**20. RESOLUTION ADOPT THE MODEL CURRICULUM FOR SOCIAL STUDIES**

The State Board of Education (“Board”) hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.079 states the Board shall adopt a model curriculum for instruction in each subject area for which updated academic standards are required and for each of grades kindergarten through twelve that is sufficient to meet the needs of students in every community;

The revisions to academic standards for social studies were adopted by the Board in February of 2018;

Revisions to academic standards for social studies included a changed focus from passive citizenship to students becoming active and involved citizens, added clarity to content statements, and a review of grade level appropriateness;

The Department convened a model curriculum writing team for social studies consisting of 144 Ohio educators. The writing team worked on revising the model curriculum for social studies over the course of 16 meetings;

The Department engaged with the public through a survey, and the Department received 691 responses pertaining to the proposed model curriculum. Revisions were made to the model curriculum based on survey responses;

The model curriculum for social studies provides content elaborations and expectations for learning;

The Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee recommended adoption of the model curriculum for social studies at its May 2019 meeting.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the Board approves adopting the model curriculum for social studies in the form presented to the Committee;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction is hereby authorized to publish the model curriculum electronically or through other media as Ohio’s model curriculum for social studies and its accompanying forms and to make such revisions to form and style as may be determined necessary of a non-substantive nature, including grammatical and other technical matters; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that this model curriculum shall become operational to support district curriculum immediately upon approval.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 20) be approved.

Ms. Fowler Moved to Postpone Item 20 till the July meeting of the Board. Mr. Hagan Seconded the motion. Ms. Fowler stated she had significant ongoing concerns with the way the model curriculum treats the characterization of our government structure and founding documents. She stated that she felt it would be most helpful to the field to make sure that we are presenting the most accurate, complete and clear information possible on what we believe is important for children to know in social studies.

Mr. Owens spoke in opposition to postponing Item 20.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the motion to postpone Item 20 to the July meeting.

YES VOTES

Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Kirsten Hill	Jenny Kilgore
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

NO VOTE

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Linda Haycock	Laura Kohler
Mark Lamoncha	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Eric Poklar

Motion denied.

Ms. Fowler Moved to Amend the packet of amendments that were provided to Board members. Mr. Hagan Seconded the motion.

Proposed Amendments to Ohio Social Studies Model Curriculum:

Whereas, the Ohio Social Studies Model Curricula are intended as: “a tool to support instructional planning,” which “specify what students should know and be able to do,” and which “provide guidance for how students may be assessed,” the State Board of Education recognizes that the ideas and concepts promoted in the model curriculum will be prioritized in local classroom instruction while those not mentioned may receive lesser attention<sup>1</sup>;

Be it resolved, that the following amendments be made to the Social Studies Model Curricula:

Grade 1 – Government

Pg 12 - As children work and play collaboratively, they understand the importance of ~~fair play~~ courtesy, good sportsmanship, respect for the rights and opinions of others, and the idea of treating others the way they want to be treated. This builds to an understanding of perspective ~~and concern for the common good~~.

Pg 12 - ~~Collaborate in a way that demonstrates respect for the rights and opinions of others.~~ Give examples of how you can show courtesy and respect for a classmate, teacher or family member.

Pg 12 - Building on the concept of the purpose for rules in the home, school, and community, students will understand that there are different rules in different settings.

~~Students understand that rules need to be fair. Fair means justice for all parties and concern for the fair allocation of resources among diverse members of a community. Rules are established for safety, order, and justice. Justice means that each person gets what they deserve. This is why there are consequences to breaking the law or rules.~~

#### Grade 2 – History

Pg 16 - Second grade students need to understand that actions of individuals make a difference in the world, ~~which builds conceptually to individuals working for the common good in grade three.~~

Biographies relate stories of people from diverse backgrounds who have contributed to our heritage. Students should ~~look at~~ read biographies of American social and political leaders, explorers, inventors, and scientists.

#### Grade 2 – Geography

Pg 18 - Examples of physical environment modifications include: • Dams help control flooding and provide areas for recreation, but also ~~may destroy~~ alter animal habitats.

#### Grade 2 – Geography

Pg 19 - ~~The classroom or local community may provide cultural groups for study. Less diverse settings may choose to focus on other world cultures.~~

Teachers may want to use the diversities within their classroom to demonstrate the concept. Concepts should be broader than race and may include: hair or eye color, clothing, background, interest in sports, etc.

#### 3rd Grade – Government

Pg 28 - Local community members have rights and responsibilities that are important for preserving our democracy. Rights and responsibilities include respecting the rights of others, being informed about local issues, paying taxes, voting, and obeying laws.

You demonstrate respect for our Country when you stand and put your hand over your heart when saying the Pledge of Allegiance or singing the National Anthem, exercising proper flag etiquette, and obeying lawful authority figures.

Pg 28 - An understanding of rights and responsibilities of citizenship is very important to the concept of the common good, ~~which is the interest or well being of the whole community.~~

There are different kinds of rights, such as, inalienable rights (Declaration of Independence: Life, Liberty, the Pursuit of Happiness) or rights of citizenship that can be lost under certain circumstances (eg voting).

#### Grade 3 - Government

Pg 29 - Local government has the authority to make and carry out (enforce) laws to provide order, security, public services (e.g., police and fire protection) and protection of individual rights. ~~Rights should focus on being safe and secure.~~

#### 3rd Grade – Economics

Pg 32 - Consumers are people who ~~use~~ acquire goods and services to satisfy their personal needs, ~~and not for resale or in the production of other goods and services.~~

#### Grade 4 – History

~~Pg 36- The Northwest Ordinance incorporated democratic ideals into the territories by:~~

Political leaders in Ohio wrote Ohio's first constitution so Ohio could become a state.  
~~Ohio's Constitution was modeled after the U.S. Constitution.~~

Reword to say:

The Northwest Ordinance incorporated democratic ideals to establish a republican style of government similar to the federal constitution of the United States by:

Grade 4 – History

Pg 37 - Following the American Revolution, the British continued to incentivize violence and supply weapons to the American Indians from their military outposts in Canada, ~~allowing encouraging~~ American Indians to continue to fight against the Americans. The British wanted to keep their hold on both Canada and the profitable fur trade in the Northwest Territory.

Grade 4 - Financial Literacy

Pg 45 - Students need to understand that saving a portion of their income can help them meet short- and long-term goals. Saving money may include short term sacrifices or trade-offs. Saving occurs when spending is reduced. Short-term goals are typically less expensive than long-term goals, while long term goals might include more costly things like a vehicle, home, travel or education.

Grade 5 - Human Systems

Pg 54 People, products, and ideas move from place to place in the Western Hemisphere for political, environmental, social, and economic reasons. Political factors include changes in political leadership and citizen rights; which impact laws, regulations, economic conditions and opportunities.

Grade 5 – Government

Pg 56 Students must also check their sources for accuracy. Criteria for an accurate source include:

- eyewitness accounts;

- source documents;

- information is current and objective;
- information is relevant;
- information is validated by multiple sources; and
- qualifications and reputation of the sources.

Grade 5 - Government - pg 57

The focus of this content statement is on the relationship between those governing and those governed:

- In a democracy, the power of those in authority is limited because the people retain the supreme power.
- In a dictatorship, a ruler or small group with absolute power over the people holds power, often through force.
- In a monarchy, the authority over the people is retained through a tradition of allegiance.

- In a Constitutional Republic, representatives are elected by the people to make public policy decisions on their behalf, rather than by a direct vote. Representatives and the people are equally under the Constitution as the Supreme Law of the Land.

- Autocracy - absolute rule by a self-appointed ruler with unlimited authority.



Explain the relationship between those in power and individual citizens in a democracy, a dictatorship, a constitutional republic and a monarchy.

Grade 5 - Economics, pg 58

In addition to gathering and organizing information, practiced in grade four, effective decision makers understand that economic choices made by individuals and governments have both present and future consequences. For example, at the national level, a government may choose to build a road in an undeveloped area:

- A short-term consequence would include improved transportation and input costs.
- A long-term consequence would be increased maintenance costs and revenue or product transportation.

Explain the present and future consequences of an economic decision; consider potential secondary and indirect effects of such a decision.

Grade 6 - Human Systems, pg 65

Modifications to the environment have intended and unintended consequences. Many Some of the issues facing the world today are the result of unintended consequences of human activities including pollution and disruption of habitat.

Grade 6 - Human Systems, pg 66

People, products, and, ideas move from place to place in the Eastern Hemisphere for political, environmental, social, and economic reasons. Building on prior knowledge from grade five, students will study some of the factors that cause push/pull movement. Students will learn how these factors have influenced cultural diffusion of the Eastern Hemisphere in the past and today. These factors include:

- political - changes in political leadership, ~~and~~ citizen rights, laws, and regulations;
- environmental - the climate and natural disasters;
- social - discrimination, intolerance, and religious freedom; and • economic - the availability of resources, changes in trade patterns, and employment opportunities.

Grade 6 - Government pg 69

Students should understand how power is attained and held, and the relationship between those governing and those being governed for each type of government listed below:

- A monarchy is a government in which authority over the people is retained through a ruling family (e.g., Saudi Arabia).
- A democracy is a government where the power of those in authority is limited because the people retain the supreme power (e.g., ~~United States~~ France).
- A constitutional republic is a form of limited democratic government in which representatives are elected to make decisions on public policy for the people. (eg USA)
- A dictatorship is a government where a ruler or small group with absolute power over the people, often through fear and/or force (e.g., North Korea).
- A theocracy is a government in which authority over the people is held by religious leaders who represent divine power and retain authority through religious beliefs (e.g., Iran).

Grade 7 - First Global Age, pg 79

The Europeans transformed the cultures of their new territories by establishing similar European governmental structures, converting the indigenous peoples to Christianity, and introducing their languages and technology. ~~They also weakened and supplanted established cultures.~~ Frequently, there was an amalgamation of cultures.

Grade 8 - A New Nation, pg 92

Jefferson Administration:

- Marbury v. Madison; and
- Louisiana Purchase;
- Barbary Wars

Grade 8 - Government, pg 99

Throughout early American history, there are examples of how participation in social, ~~and~~ civic and religious groups led to the attainment of individual and public goals.

Grade 8 - Markets, pg 102

Trade barriers, such as tariffs, are used by governments to impact markets. They are the means used to prevent certain exchanges of goods between nations. The US Constitution protects free trade amongst states by prohibiting tariffs on interstate commerce.

American History - pg 103

The use of primary and secondary sources in the study of history includes an analysis of their credibility – that is, whether or not they are believable. This is accomplished by checking sources for:

- eye witness accounts:

- use of source documents:

- the perspective of the author; • agreement with other credible sources;
- the qualifications and reputation of the author;
- bias of the author (including use of stereotypes);
- the circumstances in which the author prepared the source; and
- accuracy and consistency of arguments made throughout the source.

American History, pg 106

One of the key issues in the debate over the ratification of the Constitution concerned individual rights. Anti-Federalist arguments regarding the lack of protections of individual liberties led to the introduction and eventual ratification of the Bill of Rights, which included: • freedom of speech, press, assembly, petition, religion; • due process of law; and • -the right to keep and bear arms, protections against illegal search and seizure.

American History - pg 119

Following World War II, movements began to highlight the need to secure the same freedoms and opportunities for groups of marginalized Americans that other Americans enjoyed. Civil Rights organizations fought for equal opportunities for African Americans and to end segregation.

Organizations such as the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People (NAACP), the Southern Christian Leadership Conference (SCLC), and the Student Nonviolent Coordinating Committee (SNCC) sought redress in the courts to change long-standing policies and laws. Dr. Martin Luther King sought a peaceful end to racial tensions.

Many Civil Rights activists demonstrated to affect political and social change. These activists mobilized to carry out demonstrations to bring light to the injustices plaguing the nation. Examples of these actions included: • the Montgomery Bus Boycott; • the March on Washington; and • the Freedom Rides. Their actions helped to bring about legislative and judicial change including Brown v. Board of Education and the Civil and Voting Rights Acts. Mexican Americans organized through the United Farm Workers of America (UFW) to improve the conditions of migrant workers. Women made progress toward equal opportunities through demonstrations, legislation, ~~and~~ the establishment of

the National Organization for Women (NOW) and maintained their rights through organizations like Eagle Forum. The American Indian Movement (AIM) worked to improve conditions on reservations, protect land rights, and improve opportunities in education and employment. The Gay Liberation Movement began with the Stonewall Riots, which led to an organized effort for full inclusion in public life and institutions.

American History - pg 120

Advances in science and technology following the war also impacted American life in several ways including: • medicine (~~polio vaccine, birth control pill~~); • nuclear power plants; • transportation (passenger jet plane, automobiles); and • television.

American History - pg 123

The post-Cold War period and the attacks on Sept. 11, 2001, presented new domestic challenges for the United States. Issues impacting national security include: • the dynamic of balancing national security with civil liberties (USA PATRIOT Act); • the creation of the Transportation Security Administration (TSA); • ~~an increase in Islamophobia and xenophobia~~; and • increasing fears of domestic terrorism. The continuing debate between the role of the state and federal government in political and social issues includes disagreements over: • LGBTQ rights; • legalization of marijuana ~~for medical conditions~~; • gun rights ~~and gun control~~; • racial and gender equality; and • privacy rights and health care.

American Government, pg 125

~~Devise and implement a plan to address a problem by engaging either the political process or the public policy process.~~

Students should explain the process for civic engagement through either the political process or public policy process.

~~Select a political party or interest group to address a civic issue, identify a type of media as a means of communication, then defend the viability of the choices made in an effort to achieve a successful result in resolving the civic issue.~~

Students should explain the process for civic engagement through either the political process or public policy process.

American Government, pg 126

The focus of this standard is on the group dynamics and interpersonal skills involved in decision making. This complements the focus of other content statements on the formal procedures and institutions of governing. The democratic process depends on these skills for effective functioning. These skills are studied and assessed within a real-world context as a collective, interdependent group as opposed to isolated techniques. For example, negotiation may involve persuasion and lead to compromise. While these skills are presented in the abstract here, students examine them in the context of the rest of the course. No specialized or technical understanding of these terms is required; common definitions are sufficient for examining the contributions these skills make to the democratic process.

Teachers should be aware of political, peer centered, group discussion that can become extremely politicized, silence individual student perspectives that differ from the group, and may increase negative peer pressure and bullying.

Students should have the opportunity to thoughtfully develop their own positions and articulate them in writing or presentation.

American Government, pg 125

Popular sovereignty is the principle that governmental authority is derived from the people. The US Constitution specifically preserves all powers not specifically granted within it to the states and the people. Under this principle, the government governs with the consent of the governed.

American Government, pg 131

The Framers of the Constitution created a method of presidential selection that reflected the nation's federal system of government. The president would be chosen based on electoral votes from the states. A candidate is required to win a majority of the total number of electoral votes in order to secure the presidency. Electoral votes are determined based upon the number of each state's representatives and senators, which preserves a balance of representation between large and small population states.

American Government, pg 133

People in the United States have claims to protection from government intrusion in certain aspects of their lives. These claims are called rights. The federal Bill of Rights not only enumerates many rights but alludes to other unstated rights. Many of the rights held by American citizens protect the ability to participate in the political process, such as speech, press, assembly, petition, suffrage, and hold public office. The U.S. Supreme Court, in its interpretation of the 14th Amendment's due process clause, has instituted the doctrine of incorporation meaning that most of the guarantees in the Bill of Rights also apply to state and local governments. There are general responsibilities of citizenship. They include respecting the rule of law, paying taxes and fees, and accepting responsibility for one's actions.

~~There also are responsibilities associated with the exercise of particular rights. Examples include: • right of free speech—engaging in civil discourse; • right to bear arms—receiving firearms training; • right to jury trial—serving on juries; and • right to vote—registering to vote and being informed on public issues.~~ Citizenship also includes service to the nation which guarantees the rights of the people. This may include military service, community service and serving in public office. Some individual rights are relative, not absolute. Some individual rights are inalienable rights (those derived from God, as a natural right, rather than the government) expressed in the Declaration of Independence: Life, Liberty, and the Pursuit of Happiness. The exercise of rights must be balanced by the rights of others ~~and by the common good.~~

American Government, pg 136

The imposition of government regulations may foster economic benefits such as prohibiting unfair business practices and providing consumer protections. Government regulations may carry costs such as reduced corporate profits and slower economic growth. As there are less regulations, businesses are more free to invest in growth.

Modern & World History, pg 138

The use of primary and secondary sources in the study of history includes an analysis of their credibility – that is, whether or not they are believable. This is accomplished by checking sources for: eyewitness accounts; - source documents; • qualifications and reputation of the author; • agreement with other credible sources; • perspective or bias of the author (including stereotypes); • accuracy and internal consistency; and • circumstances in which the author prepared the source.

Modern World History, Pg 143

Advances in technology, communication, and transportation also had negative impacts for both individuals and the military. As wars are fought new technologies are created and war becomes impersonal, industrialized, and efficient ~~resulting in total war.~~

Economics - pg 158

Increasing federal spending and/or reducing taxes may promote more employment and output in the short run, but price levels and interest rates could rise as a result. Similarly, decreasing federal spending and/or increasing taxes will likely lead to lower price levels and interest rates, but in the short run, they could decrease employment and output levels.

Civic Participation & Skills, pg 172

Effective civic participation requires that individuals evaluate world events, engage in deliberative civil debate, and work to influence public policy. Deliberative civil debate respects multiple views on an issue, allows for questioning and analysis, ~~and is solution oriented.~~

National Security, pg 178

Political costs may include civil unrest or removal from office. ~~Social costs may include increases in censorship, profiling, and surveillance.~~ Social costs may include infringements upon personal freedoms and privacy, such as, increases in censorship, profiling, and surveillance.

Economic costs may include decreased government revenue, higher consumer prices, trade restrictions, and sanctions.

Pg 184

Selective cutting of forests: • is more costly than clear-cutting (expense); • takes more time to produce equivalent amounts of timber as clear-cutting (availability); • does not destroy whole forests (sustainability); ~~and • reduces the overall quality of the forest in some instances by removing only the best trees and leaving behind poorer quality trees to serve as a seed source for forest regeneration (environmental impact).~~

Pg 187

Regions change over time. ~~One example of a changing formal region is the shrinking of the Amazon rainforest due to deforestation.~~

We have multiple examples throughout the United States: the Dust Bowl and the Great Plains, Lake Erie costal changes.

An example of a changing perceptual region would be southern Florida, once primarily an agricultural region, shifting to a region known primarily as a retirement haven.

Mr. Owens Moved the Previous Question on Ms. Fowler's proposed amendment. Dr. Miranda Seconded the motion.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the motion to Move the Previous Question.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins  
Linda Haycock  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens

Stephanie Dodd  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Mike Toal

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler  
Kirsten Hill

John Hagan  
Jenny Kilgore

Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the motion of the packet of amendments moved by Ms. Fowler.

YES VOTES

Sarah Fowler  
Kirsten Hill  
Mike Toal

John Hagan  
Jenny Kilgore  
Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Cindy Collins  
Linda Haycock  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens

Stephanie Dodd  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda

Motion denied.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the original resolution.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins  
Linda Haycock  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens

Stephanie Dodd  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler  
Kirsten Hill  
Mike Toal

John Hagan  
Jenny Kilgore  
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 21):

**21. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE PROMOTION SCORE FOR THE THIRD GRADE ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS ASSESSMENT**

The State Board of Education (Board) hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.0711(B)(1) requires the administration of the English language arts assessment prescribed under ORC 3301.0710(A)(1)(a) to all students in the third grade;

The levels of achievement for the third grade English language arts assessment are limited, basic, proficient, accelerated and advanced;

ORC 3301.0710(A)(3) requires the Board to determine and designate a level of achievement on the third grade English language arts assessment for a student to be promoted to the fourth grade;

ORC 3301.0710(A)(3) requires the Board to adjust upward the level of achievement each year the third grade English language arts assessment is administered until the level is set equal to the proficient level of skill;

The promotion score for the English language arts assessment was set at 677 for the 2018-2019 school year; and

The Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee, at its May 2019 meeting, recommended adopting a promotion score of 683 for the 2019-2020 school year and stating that the Board has an expectation that the General Assembly will explore options to increase equity in Ohio schools.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board adopts a promotion score of 683 for the third grade English language arts assessment for the 2019-2020 school year;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Board adopts this promotion score with the expectation that the General Assembly will explore options to increase equity in Ohio schools.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 21) be approved.

Ms. Fowler Moved to Amend the resolution by Substitution. She proposed to adopt a promotion score of 700 for the third grade English language arts assessment for the 2019-2020 school year and provided the following substitute resolution. Mr. Hagan Seconded the motion. Ms. Fowler stated she remained concerned the data received points out we continue to lack progress in NAEP reading scores from year to year.

**SUBSTITUTE RESOLUTION TO ADOPT OHIO'S PROFICIENCY SCORE FOR THE THIRD GRADE READING GUARANTEE**

Whereas, SB 316 strengthening Ohio's Third Grade Reading Guarantee (TGRG) requirements was signed into law in 2012 and requires the State Board of Education to raise the cut score for promotion to the fourth grade each year until the minimum score is the same as the proficiency cut score; and

Whereas, the State Board of Education has incrementally increased the TGRG cut score over the past seven years but has not yet reached the proficient level; and

Whereas, with the change in the cut score each year, there is no longitudinal data available to consider the long-term impacts of the TGRG on student's ability to read; and

Whereas, the Spring 2019 report from the Ohio State University and Crane Center for Early Childhood Research and Policy titled “Has Ohio’s Third-Grade Reading Guarantee Led to Reading Improvements?” highlighted a lack of improvement from 2002 to 2017 on Ohio’s NAEP reading scores, finding that approximately 30% of Ohio’s fourth graders are reading below basic levels; and

Whereas, the passage of seven years since the passage of SB 316 has enabled districts to provide professional development, seek additional highly qualified reading instructors, and provide remedial interventions to students K3 to meet the passage criteria within ORC 3313.3360 and in 2017-2018 ninety-five percent of third graders were reported as passing the Third Grade Reading Guarantee; and

Whereas, the State Board of Education is statutorily charged in ORC 3301.0710(A) and 3301.0711(B) to continue increasing the Third Grade Reading Guarantee cut score until proficiency is reached;

Resolved, that the State Board of Education recognizes the need for stable expectations and longitudinal data in determining the policy benefits of the TGRG and the ongoing reading instruction needs of Ohio’s students; and

Resolved, that the State Board of Education charges the Superintendent of Public Instruction and the Ohio Department of Education to provide needful support to districts to increase student’s passage rates of the TGRG, making districts and schools aware of the resources available, including the Striving Readers Grant and the Scientific Approach to Reading, and

Resolved, that the State Board of Education urges Education Service Centers to support local school districts and schools in strengthening all student’s reading abilities through professional development opportunities, including the Scientific Approach to Reading, and

Resolved, that the State Board of Education hereby raises the TGRG cut score to the proficiency level for the 2019-2020 school year and will continue to annually review student reading performance and report on that performance to the legislature and Governor by the beginning of each school year (September 1).

Dr. Miranda and Mr. Owens spoke in opposition to the proposed amendment.

Mrs. Dodd stated without having the full impact of what this would do across the state, she felt it would be irresponsible of the Board to adopt this, and would not support the proposed amendment.

Mrs. Haycock called the question. President Kohler asked if there were any objections to calling the question. There were no objections.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment by Ms. Fowler.

YES VOTES

Sarah Fowler  
Kirsten Hill

John Hagan



NO VOTE

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Linda Haycock	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

Motion denied.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the original resolution.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Jenny Kilgore	Laura Kohler
Mark Lamoncha	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

Motion carried.

---

Mr. Hagan presented the following recommendation (Item 22):

**22. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO THE CAREER AND POST-SECONDARY READINESS COMPONENT FOR THE CAREER-TECHNICAL PLANNING DISTRICT REPORT CARD BEGINNING THE 2018-2019 SCHOOL YEAR**

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code 3302.033 requires the State Board of Education to approve a report card for joint vocational school districts and for other career-technical planning districts that are not joint vocational districts;

In July 2018, the State Board of Education adopted a resolution delaying the implementation for one year of the overall grade for the Career-Technical Planning District (CTPD) report card while a stakeholder workgroup, including State Board members, reviewed the CTPD report card and made recommendations for updates and improvements;

In August, September and October 2018, the workgroup convened to review report card measures and components with representation from the required stakeholders in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 3302.033;

In November 2018, the workgroup concluded its work and submitted a set of recommendations to the Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee;

In November 2018, the Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the recommendations of the stakeholder workgroup;

In December 2018, the State Board of Education approved the recommendations of the stakeholder workgroup, which included changing the name of the Prepared for Success Component to the Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component;

Beginning in February 2019, the Assessment and Accountability Committee considered additional changes to the Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component, as approved by the State Board of Education in December 2018; and

In May 2019, the Assessment and Accountability Committee recommended the approval of the changes to the Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component of the CTPD report card, and the implementation timeline, as provided in the supporting documentation attached hereto.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the State Board of Education approves the changes to the Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component of the CTPD report card and the implementation timeline as provided in the supporting documentation attached hereto; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Superintendent of Public Instruction is hereby directed to implement the changes to the Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component on the CTPD report card in accordance with the supporting documentation attached hereto.

It was Moved by Mr. Hagan that the above recommendation (Item 22) be approved.

Mr. Hagan Moved to incorporate the language change to the Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component on the CTPD report card; “For CTE concentrators meeting a combination of emerging readiness measures, at least one element must come from each category (Career Tech & Advanced Coursework, Work-Based and Service Learning) to earn the full 1.00, or 1.33 points with bonus. For example, full points (1.00) could be earned through meeting the College Credit Plus element and the CTSO Leadership element from the “Career Tech & Advanced Coursework” category, and an OhioMeansJobs Readiness Seal from the “Work-Based and Service Learning” category.” Mrs. Haycock Seconded the motion. There were no objections to the language change.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the resolution with the agreed changes to the supplemental documents which contain the framework details.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Mike Toal

Motion carried.

---

NOTE: Item 24 was voted on before Item 23 at the meeting.

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 23):

**23. RESOLUTION APPOINTING MEMBER TO THE SUBCOMMITTEE ON STANDARDS FOR TEACHER PREPARATION OF THE EDUCATOR STANDARDS BOARD**

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolution:

Ohio Revised Code Section 3319.60 provides for the creation of an Educator Standards Board charged with bringing to the State Board of Education recommendations on standards for teachers and principals, professional development and other educator-related items;

Ohio Revised Code Section 3319.613 establishes the Subcommittee on Standards for Teacher Preparation of the Educator Standards Board (the “Subcommittee”) and directs the State Board of Education to appoint two higher education representatives to the Subcommittee. One shall represent state institutions of higher education and one shall represent private nonprofit institutions of higher education;

The designated stakeholder groups have nominated two individuals for each open seat on the Subcommittee;

The State Board has reviewed the nominations for the Subcommittee for the position noted below;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education hereby appoints the following individual to the Subcommittee for the position noted below for a two-year term beginning the date of this Resolution and expiring on June 30, 2021:

Diane Garlough                      Higher Education Representative

Wendy Adams                         Higher Education Representative

**Higher Education Representative: Ohio Association of Private Colleges for Teacher Education (OAPCTE)**

President Kohler opened the floor for nominations.

Ms. Fowler Moved the nomination for Sandy Barnhart. Mrs. Haycock Moved the nomination for Diane Garlough.

President Kohler asked if there were any objections to closing nominations. There were no objections. Motion carried. Ms. Fowler spoke in favor of Ms. Barnhart. Mrs. Haycock spoke in favor of Ms. Garlough.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote for Board members to say the name of the candidate they were voting for.

**SANDY BARNHART**

Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Jenny Kilgore	Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens	Lisa Woods
Laura Kohler	

**DIANE GARLOUGH**

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Mark Lamoncha	Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda	Mike Toal

Diane Garlough received 8 votes and the appointment to the Educator Standards Board.

**Higher Education Representative: State University Education Dean (SUED)**

President Kohler opened the floor for nominations.

Ms. Fowler Moved the nomination for Wendy Adams. Mrs. Haycock Moved the nomination for Swami Rajeev.

President Kohler asked if there were any objections to closing nominations. There were no objections. Motion carried. Ms. Fowler spoke in favor of Ms. Adams. Mrs. Haycock spoke in favor of Mr. Rajeev.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote for Board members to say the name of the candidate they were voting for.

**WENDY ADAMS**

Cindy Collins	Sarah Fowler
John Hagan	Kirsten Hill
Jenny Kilgore	Mark Lamoncha
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

**SWAMI RAJEEV**

Stephanie Dodd	Linda Haycock
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Laura Kohler	

Wendy Adams received 8 votes and the appointment to the Educator Standards Board.

---

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 24):

**RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND THE INTEGRATION OF THE  
CULMINATING STUDENT EXPERIENCE AS A COMPETENCY  
COMPONENT INTO PROPOSED GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS**

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

The State Board of Education at its November 2018 meeting adopted the recommendations of the Superintendent's Advisory Committee for High School Graduation Requirements, which included education-based stakeholders, regarding the high school graduation requirements beginning with the class of 2022;

One of the recommendations included a culminating student experience as an option to demonstrate competency and satisfy graduation requirements;

The Superintendent of Public Instruction submitted these recommendations to the General Assembly for its consideration and potential adoption;

The State Board of Education has learned that there is an additional graduation proposal submitted to the General Assembly by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute that does not include the culminating student experience as an option to demonstrate competency; and

While the State Board of Education supports the recommendations of the Superintendent's Advisory Committee for High School Graduation Requirements, the State Board will, as a compromise, support the proposal submitted by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute, with the inclusion of a culminating student experience as an option to demonstrate competency.

**NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED**, that the State Board of Education will support the proposal submitted by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute, as long as the culminating student experience is integrated in the proposal as an option to demonstrate competency.

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, that the State Board of Education hereby directs the Superintendent of Public Instruction to prepare a recommendation, subject to the approval of the President of the State Board of Education, to integrate the culminating student experience as a key competency component of the graduation requirements proposal submitted to the General Assembly by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute; and

**BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED**, that the Superintendent submit the recommendation to the Ohio General Assembly and take any appropriate action to advocate for its adoption.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Mr. Lamoncha that the above recommendation (Item 24) be approved.

Mrs. Manchester Moved to Amend the resolution by Substitution. Mr. Owens Seconded the motion. She proposed that content area Grade Point Average (GPA) be included in the resolution. Mrs. Manchester provided the following substitute resolution and noted the Alliance for High Quality Education proposal and the Superintendent's Advisory Committee both included GPA as an option.

Proposed Substitute Resolution:

**RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND THE INTEGRATION OF THE  
CULMINATING STUDENT EXPERIENCE AS A COMPETENCY  
COMPONENT INTO PROPOSED GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS**

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

The State Board of Education at its November 2018 meeting adopted the recommendations of the Superintendent's Advisory Committee for High School Graduation Requirements, which included education-based stakeholders, regarding the high school graduation requirements beginning with the class of 2022;

Included in the recommendations were a culminating student experience and content-area grade point average as options to demonstrate competency and satisfy graduation requirements;

The Superintendent of Public Instruction submitted these recommendations to the General Assembly for its consideration and potential adoption;

The State Board of Education has learned that there is an additional graduation proposal submitted to the General Assembly by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute that does not include the culminating student experience or the content-area grade point average as options to demonstrate competency; and

While the State Board of Education supports the recommendations of the Superintendent's Advisory Committee for High School Graduation Requirements, the State Board will, as a compromise, support the proposal submitted by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute, with the inclusion of a culminating student experience and content-area grade point average as options to demonstrate competency.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education will support the proposal submitted by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute, as long as the culminating student experience and content-area grade point average are integrated in the proposal as options to demonstrate competency.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education hereby directs the Superintendent of Public Instruction to prepare a recommendation, subject to the approval of the President of the State Board of Education, to integrate the culminating student experience and content-area grade point average as a key competency components of the graduation requirements proposal submitted to the General Assembly by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute; and

Minutes of the June 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent submit the recommendation to the Ohio General Assembly and take any appropriate action to advocate for its adoption.

Mrs. Dodd stated that much work has still not been done to address concerns in the areas of GPA and the culminating student experience and would not support this.

Mr. Hagan stated he believed the original resolution should stand and this issue be addressed in a separate resolution.

Dr. Kilgore spoke in favor of the original resolution.

Mrs. Haycock stated she was not in support of the GPA addition, but would support the culminating student experience.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment by Mrs. Manchester.

YES VOTES

Martha Manchester  
Nick Owens

Antoinette Miranda

NO VOTES

Cindy Collins  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Mike Toal

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Laura Kohler  
Charlotte McGuire

ABSTAIN

Lisa Woods

Motion denied.

Mrs. McGuire Moved the changes to the following paragraph of the resolution:

While the State Board of Education ~~supports~~ approved the recommendations of the Superintendent's Advisory Committee for High School Graduation Requirements, the State Board will, as a compromise toward a shared vision, support the proposal submitted by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute, with the inclusion of a culminating student experience as an option to demonstrate competency.

President Kohler asked if there were any objections to the changes proposed by Mrs. McGuire. The President noted there was an objection by Mrs. Hill, so a second would be required to the proposed amendment. Ms. Fowler Seconded the motion. Mrs. McGuire stated the proposed amendment reflects the work that has been done by the Board and to promote ideals set forth in the strategic plan.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment by Mrs. McGuire.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Mike Toal

Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Stephanie Dodd

Motion carried.

Resolution as amended:

**RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND THE INTEGRATION OF THE  
CULMINATING STUDENT EXPERIENCE AS A COMPETENCY  
COMPONENT INTO PROPOSED GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS**

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

The State Board of Education at its November 2018 meeting adopted the recommendations of the Superintendent’s Advisory Committee for High School Graduation Requirements, which included education-based stakeholders, regarding the high school graduation requirements beginning with the class of 2022;

One of the recommendations included a culminating student experience as an option to demonstrate competency and satisfy graduation requirements;

The Superintendent of Public Instruction submitted these recommendations to the General Assembly for its consideration and potential adoption;

The State Board of Education has learned that there is an additional graduation proposal submitted to the General Assembly by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute that does not include the culminating student experience as an option to demonstrate competency; and

While the State Board of Education approved the recommendations of the Superintendent’s Advisory Committee for High School Graduation Requirements, the State Board will, as a compromise toward a shared vision, support the proposal submitted by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute, with the inclusion of a culminating student experience as an option to demonstrate competency.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education will support the proposal submitted by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute, as long as the culminating student experience is integrated in the proposal as an option to demonstrate competency.



BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education hereby directs the Superintendent of Public Instruction to prepare a recommendation, subject to the approval of the President of the State Board of Education, to integrate the culminating student experience as a key competency component of the graduation requirements proposal submitted to the General Assembly by Ohio Excels, the Alliance for High Quality Education, and the Thomas B. Fordham Institute; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent submit the recommendation to the Ohio General Assembly and take any appropriate action to advocate for its adoption.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Laura Kohler  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Mike Toal

Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Stephanie Dodd

Motion carried.

---

**Non-Resolutions**  
**New Business**

Ms. Woods noted the correction to the Assessment and Accountability Committee Report Out;

**Introduction to Rule 3301-13-09 – Assessment Waiver:**

- Staff provided background on the 22+ program for new committee members. He indicated that the rule is up for five-year review, and it is currently posted for public comment which closes Friday, June 15.

Mrs. Haycock highlighted the “Run to the Moon” celebrating the 50<sup>th</sup> anniversary of Neil Armstrong’s first steps on the moon.

Mrs. McGuire thanked everyone who reached out with concerns regarding the tornado that affected the Dayton area.

---

Mrs. Manchester Moved to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Woods Seconded the motion.

Minutes of the June 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

The President requested a voice vote.

Motion carried.

President Kohler adjourned the meeting at 7:25 p.m. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Education is July 8-9, 2019.

ATTEST:



Laura Kohler  
President  
State Board of Education



Paolo DeMaria  
Superintendent of Public Instruction

---

**Please note:** Copies of the attachments referenced in the Minutes may be obtained by contacting the Office of Board Relations at the Ohio Department of Education at (614) 728-2754.