

**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF OHIO  
MINUTES**

December 2020  
Ohio Department of Education  
25 South Front Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

**MEMBERS OF THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION**

Stephen Dackin	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Arthur	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Paul LaRue
Mark Lamoncha	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Eric Poklar
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

**EX OFFICIO MEMBERS**

Senator Peggy Lehner	Representative Don Jones
----------------------	--------------------------

**SECRETARY**

Paolo DeMaria  
Superintendent of Public Instruction

---

The State Board convened a virtual Board meeting on Monday, December 14, 2020.

---

The Board's Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee met beginning at 9:00 a.m.

Topics of discussion were:

- Discuss: OAC 3301-43 Adult High School Continuation Programs (Possible Vote)
- Discuss: Reading Achievement Plan Template

---

The Board's Continuous Improvement Committee met beginning at 10:30 a.m.

Topics of discussion were:

- Discuss: Remote Learning

---

The Board's Assessment & Accountability Committee met beginning at 1:00 p.m.

Minutes of the December 2020 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Topics of discussion were:

- Discuss: Impact of Charter Schools
  - Chad Aldis, Vice President Ohio Policy and Advocacy Fordham Institute
  - Stéphane Lavertu, Professor John Glenn College of Public Affairs
- Discuss: Standards Confirmation Update

---

The Board's Integrated Student Supports Committee met beginning at 2:30 p.m.

Topics of discussion were:

- Discuss: Family Resources and Supports
- Discuss: Early Childhood Inclusive Leadership Grant
- Discuss: Sexual Harassment and Assault Data
- Discuss: Strategy Updates

---

**STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING**

President Kohler convened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, December 14, at 4:00 p.m.

President Kohler asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

**YES VOTES**

Stephanie Dodd	Sarah Fowler Arthur
John Hagan	Linda Haycock
Kirsten Hill	Meryl Johnson
Jenny Kilgore	Laura Kohler
Paul LaRue	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

President Kohler welcomed Board members and guests and led the Board in the Pledge of Allegiance.

---

President Kohler called for the approval of the Minutes of the November 2020 meeting. She asked if there were any corrections to the Minutes.

There were no corrections.

It was Moved by Mr. Hagan and Seconded by Mr. LaRue that the Minutes be approved as presented. The President called for a voice vote.

Motion carried unanimously.

---

Review of Written Reports and Items for Vote

---

## **REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION**

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

### **Youth Risk Behavior Surveys and Ohio Prevention Efforts**

Presenters: Jennifer Vargo, Director, Office of Integrated Student Supports, Ohio Department of Education, Sara Haig, Youth Survey Coordinator, Ohio Department of Health, Lara Belliston, OHYES! Administrator, Prevention Epidemiologist, Ohio Department of Mental Health and Addiction Services

#### **Presentation Topics**

- Youth Risk Behavior Survey (YRBS)
- Ohio Healthy Youth Environmental Survey (OHYES!)
- Ohio Cross-Agency Prevention Efforts

#### **What is the Youth Risk Behavior Survey (YRBS)?**

- Monitors health behaviors that contribute markedly to the leading causes of death, disability and social problems among youth in the U.S.
- Includes national, state, territorial, tribal government and local school-based surveys of representative samples of 9th through 12th grade students in public and private schools

#### **Health Behaviors Monitored**

- Behaviors often established during childhood and early adolescence
- Categories include:
  - Unintentional injury and violence
  - Sexual behaviors
  - Tobacco use— Alcohol and other drug use
  - Dietary behaviors — Physical inactivity
  - Other health issues such as asthma, adequate hours of sleep, sunscreen usage and dental visits

#### **Survey Background**

- Ohio has participated since 1993
- 2019 was first cycle since 2013 Ohio achieved state-level data
- Led by Ohio Department of Health
- Only reliable source of state-level, health behavior data for the teen population in Ohio
- Sample size for Ohio: ~50 high schools and ~1,200 students

#### **Comparisons to Ohio**

## Minutes of the December 2020 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

- U.S. (separate national survey sample, not a sum of state surveys)
- 6 states closest in population to Ohio
  - 3 Midwestern States (Pennsylvania, Michigan and Illinois)
  - 2 Southern States (North Carolina and Georgia)
  - 1 Northeastern State (New Jersey)
- States have comparable poverty levels and diversity

### **Ohio Healthy Youth Environments Survey (OHYES!)**

- State initiative led by Ohio MHAS, ODE and ODH
- Ohio communities called for an inexpensive and valid local survey to:
  - Guide local policy
  - Guide program development and implementation efforts
  - Meet federal discretionary grant reporting requirements
- Voluntary online survey to collect risk and protective factor data at the local level
- First available statewide in school-year 2015-2016
- Voluntary –Superintendents and Principals signup to participate
- Available to all Ohio schools (public and private)

### **Schools Use OHYES! Data**

- Schools can utilize results in their planning processes, partnering and implementation:
  - Positive Behavioral Interventions and Supports (PBIS)
  - Ohio Improvement Process (OIP)
  - District and Building Leadership Teams
  - Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) Title IV Part A
  - Making funding decisions
  - Used by youth-led groups
  - Partnering with community organizations (behavioral health boards, health departments, law enforcement, etc.)

### **Communities Use OHYES! Data**

- Behavioral Health Boards use these data for needs assessment and planning.
- Health Departments can use in their Community Health Assessments.
- Community coalitions use data for needs assessment, planning, and advocacy (e.g., suicide prevention coalitions).
- Data can be used to meet federal grant reporting requirements (e.g., Drug-free communities grants).
- Data can use these when applying for local grants (e.g., United Way).

### **Ohio Healthy Youth Environments Survey (OHYES!)**

- FREE to schools
- Voluntary
- Anonymous
- For grades 7-12
- Online
- Quick ~ 15-30 mins
- 110-items standard or 119 optional version
- Administered by schools
  - School flexibility (grades, dates)
  - Passive parent consent

### **Ohio Healthy Youth Environments Survey Content Areas (OHYES!)**

- Demographics
- Alcohol

- Tobacco & Vapor Products
- Marijuana
- Prescription Drugs
- Bullying
- Safety and Violence
- Physical Health & Well-being
- Mental Health
- Suicide (now standard)
- Adverse Childhood Experiences
- School Climate and Safety
- Gambling
- Family and Peer Factors
- School Success
- Community Environment
- Sex-related (Optional)

**Ohio Healthy Youth Environments Survey Participation (OHYES!)  
School Year 2015-2016**

- 40,298 students
- 90 public schools
- 163 schools

**School Year 2019-2020; Data collection was interrupted in March due to Covid**

- 35,129 students
- 79 public schools
- 139 schools

**Interagency Youth Survey Partnership**

- Members of program and leadership staff from Ohio MHAS, ODH, ODE and Medicaid.
- Goal to strengthen use of student surveys and increase the availability of statewide data, through increased participation in YRBS and OHYES!
- Currently identifying potential actions to be taken.

**Ohio's Cross Agency Prevention Efforts**

**Prevention Education**

- Partnership between the Ohio departments of Education and Mental Health and Addiction Services
- \$20 million state budget investment
- K-12 Prevention Education
- Professional development
- Every student, every grade, every school

**Other Prevention Efforts**

- Be Present Youth Suicide Prevention and Mental Health Supports
- Anti-Harassment, Intimidation and Bullying policies, programs, supports
- Breakfast Expansion Initiative

---

**LEGISLATIVE UPDATE**

Presenter: Marjorie Yano, Director, Office of Policy and Legislative Affairs, Ohio Department of Education.

**Recently Enacted Legislation**

**Senate Bill 89**

- Sen. Matt Huffman - Career-technical education and EdChoice.
- Effective Date: March 2, 2021
- Career-technical education updates.
- New methodology for designating schools for traditional EdChoice and delays application window to March 1, 2021.
- Repeals territory transfer language from HB 166 as of September 1, 2021.

**House Bill 404**

- Rep. Manchester and Rep. Sweeney – Address education issues related to COVID-19 pandemic.
- Effective Date: November 22, 2020
- Originally a bill to allow state university trustees to meet electronically.
- COVID-19 related provisions were added by the Senate.
- Safe harbor for schools that could not administer fall assessments and health screenings.
- Permits a community school to accept responsibility for transporting students for the current school year by December 31, 2020.
- Restricts student growth data use for 2021-22 evaluations.
- Makes teacher evaluations optional for 2020-2021 school year.

**House Bill 123**

- Rep. Manning – School safety
- Effective Date: TBD
- Instruction on suicide awareness and prevention, safety training and violence prevention, and social inclusion.
- Transfers rulemaking for emergency management plans to DPS.
- Establishes a pilot program to provide additional funding to qualifying dropout prevention and recovery e-schools for FY 2021.

**Other Pending Legislation**

- House Bill 436 – Dyslexia
- House Bill 305 – School Funding
- Senate Bill 358 – School Year 2020-2021 COVID Response
- Senate Bill 121 – Health Education Standards

**What's Next**

- Last scheduled session days:
  - House: Dec 17
  - Senate: Dec 22
- The 134<sup>th</sup> General Assembly will organize on Monday, January 4.

---

President Kohler recessed the Board meeting at 6:00 p.m.

---

**RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING**

Minutes of the December 2020 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

President Kohler reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, December 15, 2020, at 9:00 a.m.

President Kohler asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

YES VOTES

Stephen Dackin	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Arthur	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Meryl Johnson
Jenny Kilgore	Laura Kohler
Paul LaRue	Mark Lamoncha
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

Motion carried.

NOTE: Mrs. Fowler Arthur confirmed her attendance thru email.

---

---

**Chapter 119 Hearing**

December 15, 2020  
9:02 a.m.

Hearing Regarding the Amending, Rescinding and Adoption of Rules

President Kohler stated the Board would proceed with the public hearing on the following rule actions:

- The amendment of OAC 3301-14-01 Operation of the education management information system.
- The amendment of OAC 3301-18-01 Calculating student attendance rate to meet minimum performance standards.
- The rescission and adoption of new OAC 3301-24-23 Resident educator license renewal.
- The rescission and adoption of new OAC 3301-24-24 Alternative resident educator license renewal.

President Kohler called on Mia Yaniko, from the Office of the Attorney General, Chief, Education section. Ms. Yaniko called on Immy Singh, Chief Legal Counsel for the Ohio Department of Education.

Ms. Singh presented the following Board Exhibits:

- Board Exhibit 1 is the public notice that appears in the Register of Ohio and references the proposed rule actions subject to this hearing;
- Board Exhibit 2 would be a true and accurate copy of the resolutions adopted by the State Board of Education regarding these rules;

- Board Exhibit 3 would be true and accurate copies of the rules as filed with the Joint Committee on Agency Rule Review (JCARR), Legislative Service Commission (LSC) and the Secretary of State.

Ms. Singh explained the rules had been made available to all persons affected by the rules.

President Kohler stated that testimony would be received, either orally or in writing, for or against, the amendment of the rules that are under consideration. Anyone who wished to testify must complete the registration sheet. All testimony would be limited to no more than five minutes. If additional time is needed, consideration would be given to a reasonable extension. Any written testimony would be marked as Group Exhibit 4.

President Kohler announced that the Board would now receive testimony on the proposed actions before the Board.

---

### **PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON THE PROPOSED RULE ACTIONS**

There were no requests.

---

President Kohler called on Ms. Yaniko, who submitted into evidence State Board Exhibits 1 through 3.

President Kohler stated that the exhibits were so received. As there was no more testimony, she declared the public hearing closed at 9: 06 a.m.

---

### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

President Kohler called on Vice President McGuire, who Moved that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion or compensation of a public employee or official; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the investigation of charges or complaints against a public employee, official, licensee, or regulated individual; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(3) for the purpose of conferring with legal counsel about matters that are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

Mrs. Haycock Seconded the motion.

The President called for a roll call vote.

#### **YES VOTES**

Stephen Dackin  
Sarah Fowler Arthur

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan



Linda Haycock  
Laura Kohler  
Mark Lamoncha  
Charlotte McGuire  
Mike Toal

Kirsten Hill  
Paul LaRue  
Martha Manchester  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

The Board went into Executive Session and Quasi-Judicial discussion at 9:07 a.m.

The Board recessed from Executive Session and Quasi-Judicial discussion at 10:30 a.m.

---

**BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE TEACHING, LEADING AND LEARNING COMMITTEE**

Chair: Sarah Fowler Arthur, Vice Chair: Nick Owens

Mr. Owens gave a report from the Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

**Members Present:** Fowler Arthur (Chair), Owens (Vice-Chair), Dackin, Haycock, Hill, Johnson, LaRue, Manchester.

**OAC 3301-43 Adult High School Continuation Programs** (*Strategy 10*)

- Department staff provided Members with an overview of Ohio Administrative Code 3301-43 Adult High School Continuation Programs, currently due for five-year review. The Department presented the rules to committee with revisions based on discussions at the November committee meeting. Department staff also shared a draft information document outlining diploma options for Ohio's students ages 16 through adulthood.
- Committee members reviewed and discussed the rules and offered feedback on the draft information document. Member feedback will be incorporated on the final document.
- Following discussion, Members voted 8-0 in favor of recommending approval of the proposed revised rules as presented. A resolution to adopt the revised rules will appear on the State Board's January 2021 voting agenda.

**Discuss: Reading Achievement Plan Template** (*Strategy 7 & 9*)

- Department staff provided Members with an overview of the draft revised template for Reading Achievement Plans. Staff discussed the revision process and noted revisions made at the suggestion of Committee Members and stakeholders.
- Committee members reviewed and discussed the draft revised template, noting that further clarification may be needed to highlight areas of the plan that are required by Ohio revised code.
- Department staff also noted Members' suggestions for clarification that will be addressed in guidance documents for districts. Areas of discussion included clarifying 'leadership team' membership and definitions for disaggregated data. Members also requested that the Department involve a larger and more diverse set of districts to review template revisions in the future.

The Committee recognized out-going members.

## **BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE**

Chair: Antoinette Miranda, Vice Chair: Mike Toal

Dr. Miranda gave a report from the Continuous Improvement Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

**Members Present:** All committee members were present.

### **REMOTE LEARNING**

- Staff from the Center for Continuous Improvement and the Unit of Field Relations provided the committee with updates about remote learning around the state.
  - Staff provided an overview of what remote learning looked like at the beginning of the school year and what remote learning looks like now that the pandemic is surging statewide. Currently, 60% of districts are conducting some form of remote learning.
  - Staff also shared data from a sample study of the remote plans of 90 districts where districts identify connectivity and training of learning management systems as the top challenges. 94% of plans address supports for vulnerable student populations.
  - Dr. Henry Pettiegrew, CEO of East Cleveland City Schools, shared information on challenges East Cleveland faced at the beginning of the COVID-19 ordered school building closure and how the district plans to reopen with hybrid learning in January. He also discussed the corporate sponsors who are providing supports for the district.
    - Dr. Pettiegrew answered questions from the committee and other board members regarding:
      - The problems relative to the content available and the content that is needed;
      - That the foundation of the learning experience is the digital platform and no longer the classroom;
      - If the district was connecting with virtual schools;
      - Helping students attend class;
      - Supporting the mental health of students and staff.
  - Department staff answered more questions about:
    - How districts were measuring students required instructional hours;
    - If a remote learning plan template was provided.
  - Staff from the unit of Field Relations shared what learning looks like in Department-sponsored community schools from partitions in the classroom to meetings in parks and parking lots. The overview provided a glimpse into the reality of how teachers, students and parents are dealing with the pandemic while trying to maintain a high level of education.
  - Staff also presented an overview of RemoteEDx and the partnerships at the state level that are creating a support system for remote learning. Staff introduced Connectivity Champions, the Exchange, Support Squad and the Network and Learning Academy.
    - Staff answered questions from the committee about:
      - Who supports community and nonpublic schools with connectivity supports;
      - If parents were being included in the partnership and if there was a hotline available to parents having connectivity problems;
      - If there were any private contributions helping to connect students;
      - Where to find the Reframing Education document created by the Mercer County Educational Service Center
      - If the RemoteEDx Coordinating Committee was created by the state or by legislation
      - Who determines if the information and content shared by InfoOhio meets state standards and if InfoOhio will be the online depository for the future;

- If there is a record of county health departments who instructed districts to begin remote learning.

---

## **BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE INTEGRATED STUDENT SUPPORTS COMMITTEE**

Chair: Charlotte McGuire, Vice Chair: Martha Manchester

Mrs. McGuire and Mrs. Manchester gave a report from the Integrated Student Supports Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

**Members Present:** Charlotte McGuire, Committee Chair, Martha Manchester, Committee Vice Chair, Kirsten Hill, Meryl Johnson, Mark Lamoncha, Paul LaRue and Antoinette Miranda.

### **Family Resources and Supports**

- Staff provided an update on resources and supports available to families, including a review of the Department webpages, Parent Mentor Project and the Family Community Engagement Liaisons work in progress.
- Committee members discussed the value of the state's parent mentor program supporting parents of children with disabilities.
- The agenda item was discussion only, therefore, there was no action by the committee and the item is not scheduled for full board.

### **Early Childhood Inclusive Leadership Grant**

- Staff provided a brief overview of the new grant received from the U.S. Department of Education, Office of Special Education Programs. This five-year grant allows the state to create and deploy a two-year learning and mentoring experience for professionals aimed at building their knowledge and leadership capacity for supporting children with disabilities in Early Intervention, preschool and the early elementary grades.
- The agenda item was discussion only, therefore, there was no action by the committee and the item is not scheduled for full board.

### **Sexual Harassment and Assault Data**

- Staff presented data from the U.S. Department of Education's Civil Rights Data Collection (2017-2018) focusing on sexual harassment and assault in K-12 schools. Also, an overview of the current requirements in Ohio Revised Code specific to health education was provided.
- The agenda item was discussion only, therefore, there was no action by the committee and the item is not scheduled for full board.

### **Strategy Updates**

- Staff shared information on the recently released reset and restart guidance on mandated reporting and identification of presumptive English learners. Staff also shared updates on rollout activities occurring with the Ohio's Whole Child Framework and the Plan to Improve Educational Experiences and Outcomes for Students with Disabilities. This plan will be released this month.
- Meryl Johnson requested the time of the Jan. 28<sup>th</sup> Whole Child Live Social Media event.
- The agenda item was discussion only, therefore, there was no action by the committee and the item is not scheduled for full board.

## **BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ASSESSMENTS & ACCOUNTABILITY COMMITTEE**

Chair: John Hagan, Vice Chair: Lisa Woods

Mr. Hagan gave a report from the Assessments & Accountability Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

**Members Present:** John Hagan (Chair), Lisa Woods (Vice Chair), Steve Dackin, Stephanie Dodd, Linda Haycock, Jenny Kilgore, Eric Poklar, and Mike Toal

### **Research Discussion: Impact of Charter Schools**

*Presentation by Dr. Heather Boughton, Director of the Office of Research, Evaluation and Advanced Analytics with guest speakers:*

- Chad Aldis, Vice President, Ohio Policy and Advocacy, Fordham Institute
- Stéphane Lavertu, Professor, John Glenn College of Public Affairs

### **Fordham Institute – The Impact of Ohio Charter Schools on Student Outcomes 2016-2019**

Previous studies have shown that students learn less in public charter schools than they do attending a traditional public school. Has this changed with the passage of charter school legislative reforms in 2015?

Dr. Lavertu examined the following: achievement, attendance, and disciplinary actions for brick-and-mortar charter schools. Results from the study include:

- In grades 4–8, students attending brick-and-mortar charter schools make significant gains on state math and ELA exams when compared to students of similar backgrounds attending traditional public district.
- Based on gains accumulated over five years, Lavertu estimates that the average Black student who attends a brick-and-mortar charter from grades 4–8 moves from the 25<sup>th</sup> to 40<sup>th</sup> percentile in statewide achievement. Though their gains are more modest, students of other races/ethnicities also make more progress in brick and- mortar charters than in traditional public schools, as do both high and low achievers.
- Ohio’s general education charter high schools also deliver notable academic benefits. The analysis shows that students’ scores on state English end-of course exams improve when they attend a brick-and-mortar charter high school, although gains on math end-of-course and ACT exams are not statistically significant.
- In grades 4–8 and in high school, brick and-mortar charters boost attendance and reduce disciplinary incidents.

### **Performance Standards Confirmation Update**

*Presentation by Lisa Chandler, Director of the Office of Assessment*

**Process and feedback:** Parents and educators took part in the process to confirm the performance standards originally set in 2015 on Ohio’s State Tests in English language arts and mathematics. Parents participated in discussion groups reviewing the standard-setting process and provided input on the performance standards. These groups agreed that the standard setting was fair and thorough, involving teachers from across the state. Parents noted the continued importance of communication to them and their feedback on education policy at the local and state levels.

Panels of educators were convened to examine the Performance Level Descriptors and the knowledge and skills from Ohio’s Learning Standards required for students to qualify for each of the performance levels based on Ohio-developed test items.

The educators confirmed performance levels were validly differentiating students into the performance classifications of Basic, Proficient, Accelerated or Advanced for almost every English

language arts and mathematics test in grades 3-8 and high school.

- **Grade 3 mathematics:** This panel supports the existing performance standards but recommended developing more detailed Performance Level Descriptors in the future to assist in the development of district curriculum.
- **Grade 5 mathematics:** This panel recommended some minor revisions to the skills listed in the Advanced performance level but overall supported the existing performance standards.
- **Grade 5 English language arts:** This panel did not confirm the performance standards of Basic and Proficient, judging them to be too rigorous, but reached consensus that the Accelerated and Advanced performance levels were appropriately set.

#### **Planning for Next Meeting & Adjourn**

- 2021 Committee Agenda: Committee members and Department staff will continue to discuss test standards. The Department will work with the SBOE to develop additional committee priorities in the New Year.

---

### **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON VOTING AGENDA ITEMS**

There was no Public Participation on Voting Agenda Items.

---

### **VOTING ON THE REPORT & RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION**

President Kohler called on Superintendent DeMaria for his report and recommendations.

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 1) on the Consent Agenda:

1. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY NICHOLAS A. EVANS AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Nicholas A. Evans has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 2, 2020, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Nicholas A. Evans that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Evans' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Nicholas A. Evans is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Nicholas A. Evans has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Nicholas A. Evans's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Evans' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Nicholas A. Evans be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Evans of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Mr. Hagan that the Consent Agenda (Item 1) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephen Dackin	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Arthur	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Paul LaRue	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

Motion carried.

---

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 2):

**2. RESOLUTION TO RESCIND OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE 3301-1-01  
RULE FOR GIVING PUBLIC NOTICE OF HEARINGS**

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Minutes of the December 2020 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-1-01 is duplicative of the requirements that are already contained in Ohio Revised Code (ORC) section 119.03 for giving notice of the procedure for the adoption, amendment, or rescission of rules.

With OAC 3301-1-01 being duplicative of the requirements of ORC 119.03, OAC 3301-1-01 is unnecessary.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board approves rescinding OAC 3301-1-01.

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rule with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rule; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rule; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rule relates.

Mrs. Fowler Arthur clarified the reason the rule is being rescinded is that Ohio Revised Code remains in place and the Department would still be giving notice of meetings.

It was Moved by President Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 2) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephen Dackin	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Arthur	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Paul LaRue	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Mike Toal
Lisa Woods	

Motion carried.

---

Mrs. Fowler Arthur presented the following recommendation (Item 3):

**3. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-56-02 / READING ACHIEVEMENT IMPROVEMENT PLANS**

The State Board of Education (“Board”) hereby **ADOPTS** changes to Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-56-02 / Reading Achievement Improvement Plans as follows:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) 3301.07 allows the Board to adopt rules necessary for carrying out any function imposed on it by law;

ORC 3302.13 requires the Board to adopt rules prescribing the content of and deadlines for the reading achievement improvement plans required under that section;

ORC 3302.13 requires the rules to prescribe that the plan include, at a minimum, an analysis of relevant student performance data, measurable student performance goals, strategies to meet specific student needs, a staffing and professional development plan, and instructional strategies for improving literacy;

During the revision process for this rule, input was provided by a culturally responsive practices workgroup, an equity lens workgroup, and a Regional Education Laboratory Midwest Research Study;

Changes to the rule include adding relevant definitions, adding detail to plan components, and a requirement that the plans must include descriptions of how the plans will be funded and how stakeholders were involved in plan development;

The Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee recommended adoption of the rule in the form attached hereto at its November 2020 meeting.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board adopts the changes to OAC 3301-56-02 / Reading Achievement Improvement Plans in the form attached hereto;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rule with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rule; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rule; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rule relates.

It was Moved by Mrs. Fowler Arthur that the above recommendation (Item 3) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephen Dackin  
Sarah Fowler Arthur  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Paul LaRue

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Martha Manchester



Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

Antoinette Miranda  
Mike Toal

Motion carried.

---

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 3.A.):

**3.A. MOTION FOR THE EMERGENCY ADOPTION OF OHIO  
ADMINISTRATIVE CODE 3301-32-06.1 / TRANSITIONAL PANDEMIC  
REQUIREMENTS FOR A LICENSED SCHOOL CHILD PROGRAM AND  
3301-37-03.1/ PANDEMIC REQUIREMENTS FOR A LICENSED CHILD  
DAY-CARE PROGRAM**

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** Ohio Administrative Code 3301-32-06.1/Transitional Pandemic Requirements for a Licensed School Child Program and OAC 3301-37-03.1/ Transitional Pandemic Requirements for a Licensed Child Day-Care Program in the forms attached hereto.

It was Moved by Mrs. Manchester and Seconded by Mrs. Haycock that the above recommendation (Item 3.A.) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

**YES VOTES**

Stephen Dackin  
Sarah Fowler Arthur  
Linda Haycock  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Mike Toal

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Paul LaRue  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

**ABSTAIN**

Kirsten Hill

Motion carried.

---

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 3.B.):

**3.B. MOTION FOR THE EMERGENCY ADOPTION OF OHIO  
ADMINISTRATIVE CODE 3301-32-06.1 / TRANSITIONAL PANDEMIC  
REQUIREMENTS FOR A LICENSED SCHOOL CHILD PROGRAM AND  
3301-37-03.1/ PANDEMIC REQUIREMENTS FOR A LICENSED CHILD  
DAY-CARE PROGRAM**

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** Ohio Administrative Code 3301-32-06.1/Transitional Pandemic Requirements for a Licensed School Child Program and OAC 3301-37-03.1/ Transitional Pandemic Requirements for a Licensed Child Day-Care Program in the forms attached hereto.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Dr. Miranda that the above recommendation (Item 3.B.) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

**YES VOTES**

Stephen Dackin	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Arthur	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Meryl Johnson
Jenny Kilgore	Laura Kohler
Mark Lamoncha	Paul LaRue
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Nick Owens
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

**ABSTAIN**

Kirsten Hill

Motion carried.

---

Kelly Edwards, Assistant Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 4):

4. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY CYNTHIA WILSON AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Cynthia Wilson has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on October 27, 2020, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Cynthia Wilson that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Wilson's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Cynthia Wilson is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Cynthia Wilson has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Cynthia Wilson's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Wilson's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Cynthia Wilson be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Wilson of this action.

It was Moved by Mr. LaRue and Seconded by Mrs. Fowler Arthur that the above recommendation (Item 4) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephen Dackin  
Sarah Fowler Arthur  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Paul LaRue  
Antoinette Miranda  
Mike Toal

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Martha Manchester  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Charlotte McGuire

Motion carried.

---

Aaron Ross, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 5):

**5. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF ALEXANDRIA M. KUNTZMAN**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Alexandria M. Kuntzman held a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS on August 18, 2020, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Alexandria M. Kuntzman of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Kuntzman's 2018 conviction in the Alliance Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence and 2018 conviction in the Alliance Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of underage consumption; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Kuntzman that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Ohio Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Alexandria M. Kuntzman did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Ohio Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, the State Board of Education's Notice of Opportunity for Hearing, certified court records from the Alliance Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Alliance Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Ohio Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Alexandria M. Kuntzman's three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 based upon Ms. Kuntzman's 2018 conviction in the Alliance Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence and 2018 conviction in the Alliance Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of underage consumption. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a), orders that Alexandria M. Kuntzman be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after December 15, 2021, and that upon reapplication, she must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, a drug/alcohol assessment by a licensed chemical dependency

counselor who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education and any additional counseling and/or treatment recommended by the licensed counselor; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Kuntzman of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Mrs. Manchester that the above recommendation (Item 5) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephen Dackin	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Arthur	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Paul LaRue	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

---

Aaron Ross, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 6):

**6. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF BRADLEY R. PARKER**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Bradley R. Parker holds a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018; and

WHEREAS on October 1, 2020, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Bradley R. Parker of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(a), and (B)(2)(d). The notice was based upon Mr. Parker's 2020 conviction in the Fairfield County Common Pleas Court for one felony count of aggravated possession of drugs, one misdemeanor count of possession of drugs, and one misdemeanor count of illegal use or possession of drug paraphernalia; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Parker that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Ohio Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018; and

WHEREAS Bradley R. Parker did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Ohio Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, the State Board of Education's Notice of Opportunity for Hearing, and certified court records from the Fairfield County Common Pleas Court; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Ohio Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(a), and (B)(2)(d), hereby **REVOKES** Bradley R. Parker's three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 based upon Mr. Parker's 2020 conviction in the Fairfield County Common Pleas Court for one felony count of aggravated possession of drugs, one misdemeanor count of possession of drugs, and one misdemeanor count of illegal use or possession of drug paraphernalia. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders that Bradley R. Parker be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Parker of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Fowler Arthur and Seconded by Mrs. Haycock that the above recommendation (Item 6) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephen Dackin  
Sarah Fowler Arthur  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha

Paul LaRue  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Mike Toal

Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

Aaron Ross, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 7):

**7. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR  
SUBSTITUTE GENERAL EDUCATION TEACHING LICENSE OF  
JACQUELINE Y. ROZIER**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jacqueline Y. Rozier held a one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS on August 19, 2020, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Jacqueline Y. Rozier of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Rozier's 2018 plea of guilty in the Euclid Municipal Court to an amended charge of one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after having been initially charged with assault on a student; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Rozier that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Ohio Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Jacqueline Y. Rozier did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Ohio Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, the State Board of Education's Notice of Opportunity for Hearing, certified court records from the Euclid Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Euclid Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Ohio Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure*

*Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Jacqueline Y. Rozier’s one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2017 based upon Ms. Rozier's 2018 plea of guilty in the Euclid Municipal Court to an amended charge of one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after having been initially charged with assault on a student. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders that Jacqueline Y. Rozier be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Rozier of this action.

It was Moved by Mr. Owens and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 7) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephen Dackin	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Arthur	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Paul LaRue	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Eric Poklar
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

Kelly Edwards, Assistant Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 8):

**8. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION OF THE HANDICAPPED TEACHING LICENSE OF JOANNA V. YILDIRIM**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Joanna V. Yildirim held a five-year professional education of the handicapped teaching license issued in 2015; and



WHEREAS on February 18, 2020, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Joanna V. Yildirim of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year professional education of the handicapped teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Yildirim engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about April 28, 2017, Ms. Yildirim was on school premises in her official capacity while consuming, possessing, and being under the influence of alcohol, specifically she consumed alcohol on school property and subsequently failed an employment related alcohol screen when her BAC was .337; her 2013 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs (OVI); her 2008 conviction in the Hamilton County

Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of OVI; and her 2003 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of OVI; and

WHEREAS Ms. Yildirim did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on August 6, 2020; and

WHEREAS Ms. Yildirim was not present at the hearing or represented by counsel, but she did submit her contentions in writing; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Yildirim's license be revoked and that she be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon the nature and seriousness of Ms. Yildirim's conduct including her working with handicapped children while under the influence of alcohol (at an astonishing BAC level of .337); her apparent denial of her ongoing substance abuse issue; and that her continued employment could jeopardize the health, safety, and welfare of the school community and/or statewide education community; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Joanna V. Yildirim's five-year professional education of the handicapped teaching license issued in 2015 based upon Ms. Yildirim engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about April 28, 2017, Ms. Yildirim was on school premises in her official capacity while consuming, possessing, and being under the influence of alcohol, specifically she consumed alcohol on school property and subsequently failed an employment related alcohol screen when her BAC was .337; her 2013 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs (OVI); her 2008 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of OVI; and her 2003 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of OVI. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance

with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Joanna V. Yildirim be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Yildirim of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Woods and Seconded by Mr. Lamoncha that the above recommendation (Item 8) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephen Dackin	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Arthur	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Paul LaRue	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Eric Poklar
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

Kelly Edwards, Assistant Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 9):

**9. RESOLUTION TO RESCIND THE PRIOR RESOLUTION ADOPTED BY THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION ON OCTOBER 17, 2008 THAT PERMANENTLY DENIED THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION OF MARQUIEE L. SMITH**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Marquiee L. Smith does not hold a license, certificate, or permit issued by the State Board of Education and does not have an application pending; and

WHEREAS on October 17, 2008, the State Board of Education adopted a resolution that permanently denied Mr. Smith's application for a one-year substitute teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), [redacted in accordance with Ohio law] based on his [redacted in accordance with Ohio law]. Further, the State Board ordered that Mr. Smith be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, certificate, or permit issued by the State Board of Education; and

WHEREAS Mr. Smith has requested the ability to reapply for a license; and

WHEREAS Mr. Smith, in support of his request, provided to the Ohio Department of Education documentation demonstrating that on January 4, 2012, he received *[redacted in accordance with Ohio law]*; and

WHEREAS *[redacted in accordance with Ohio law]*

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the *[redacted in accordance with Ohio law]*; and the materials reviewed and final resolution adopted by the State Board of Education at its October 17, 2008 meeting; and

WHEREAS the resolution adopted by the State Board of Education on October 17, 2008 was based solely on Mr. Smith's *[redacted in accordance with Ohio law]*:  
Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Educational hereby **RESCINDS** its prior resolution adopted on October 17, 2008 that permanently denied Mr. Smith's application for a one-year substitute teaching license and further ordered that Mr. Smith be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education: and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, that the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Smith of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Mr. LaRue that the above recommendation (Item 9) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Stephen Dackin	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Arthur	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Mark Lamoncha
Paul LaRue	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Eric Poklar
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

Mrs. Fowler Arthur presented the following recommendation (Item 10):

10. **RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE REVISED “RIGOROUS TEST OF PRINCIPLES OF SCIENTIFICALLY RESEARCH-BASED READING INSTRUCTION” AS PRESCRIBED BY ORC 3313.608(H)(1)(E)**

The State Board of Education (“Board”) **ADOPTS** the revised “rigorous test of principles of scientifically research-based reading instruction” as prescribed by Ohio Revised Code (ORC) 3313.608(H)(1)(e) as follows:

ORC 3313.608(H)(1)(e) requires the Board to approve a rigorous test of principles of scientifically research-based reading instruction as one of the criteria a teacher may meet to satisfy the requirement of providing intensive remediation services or intervention services under division (B)(3) or (C) of ORC 3313.608;

The Board previously adopted Praxis Test #5203, Teaching Reading: Elementary Education as the test for this purpose at its July 2013 meeting with a passing score of 162 or higher;

The vendor for Praxis Test #5203, Teaching Reading: Elementary Education is phasing out that test and replacing it with Praxis Test #5205, Teaching Reading: Elementary;

The vendor is recommending a passing score of 159 or higher for Praxis Test #5205, Teaching Reading: Elementary;

The Educator Standards Board recommended approval of Praxis Test #5205, Teaching Reading: Elementary with a passing score of 159 and an effective date of November 16, 2020 for the purpose of ORC 3313.608(H)(1)(e) at its October 2020 meeting;

The Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee recommended approval of Praxis Test #5205, Teaching Reading: Elementary with a passing score of 159 and an effective date of November 16, 2020 for the purpose of ORC 3313.608(H)(1)(e) at its November 2020 meeting.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board approves Praxis Test #5205, Teaching Reading: Elementary to serve as the rigorous test of principles of scientifically research-based reading instruction pursuant to ORC 3313.608(H)(1)(e) with a passing score of 159 or higher, effective as immediately as practically possible.

It was Moved by Mrs. Fowler Arthur that the above recommendation (Item 10) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

**YES VOTES**

Stephen Dackin  
Sarah Fowler Arthur  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Laura Kohler  
Paul LaRue  
Charlotte McGuire  
Nick Owens  
Mike Toal

Stephanie Dodd  
John Hagan  
Kirsten Hill  
Jenny Kilgore  
Mark Lamoncha  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

**PRESIDENT'S REMARKS**

President Kohler provided a review of accomplishments of 2020.

Board members provided remarks for outgoing members of the Board.

- Steve Dackin provided remarks for outgoing Board member Stephanie Dodd
- Martha Manchester provided remarks for outgoing Board member Sarah Fowler Arthur

---

The State Board recessed for lunch.

---

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-VOTING AGENDA ITEMS**

1) Mrs. Vicki Kerman, Cardington, Ohio. Mrs. Kerman spoke to the Board regarding the pandemic and the effects on children in and out of school.

2) Dr. Elizabeth Laffay, Huron, Ohio. Dr. Laffay spoke to the Board regarding the pandemic and the effects on children being out of school.

3) Mrs. Kathryn Kennedy, Amherst, Ohio. Mrs. Kennedy spoke to the Board regarding the pandemic and support of the return of all Ohio school children to the classroom.

This concludes Public Participation on Non-Voting Agenda Items.

---

**PRESIDENT'S REMARKS**

Board members provided remarks for outgoing members of the Board.

- Meryl Johnson provided remarks for outgoing Board member Linda Haycock
- Dr. Antoinette Miranda provided remarks for outgoing Board member Nick Owens
- Dr. Jenny Kilgore provided remarks for outgoing Board member Lisa Woods. Ms. Woods provided contributing remarks and asked they be part of the record. A copy of her remarks is included at the end of the minutes.

Race in America Video

- President Kohler invited Board members to join her in viewing and discussing a video entitled "Holy Post - Race in America", narrated by Phil Vischer

---

**Non-Resolutions**

**Old Business**

There was no Old Business to come before the Board.

---

**New Business**

Mrs. Fowler Arthur reminded Board members of the invitation for a virtual presentation from the Ohio School for the Deaf and Ohio State School for the Blind.

---

Ms. Johnson Moved to adjourn the meeting. Mr. Hagan Seconded the motion.

The President requested a voice vote.

Motion carried.

President Kohler adjourned the meeting at 4:46 p.m. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Education is January 11-12, 2021.

ATTEST:



Laura Kohler  
President  
State Board of Education



Paolo DeMaria  
Superintendent of Public Instruction

---

**Please note:** Copies of the attachments referenced in the Minutes may be obtained by contacting the Office of Board Relations at the Ohio Department of Education at (614) 728-2754.

Committee Report of Board Member Lisa Woods District 5:

Good afternoon. This is my last meeting as an elected Member of the Ohio State Board of Education, and I wanted to take a few moments to reflect upon the past four years, make some comments for the record, thank my colleagues for this experience, and offer some thoughts and advice for the future of public education in Ohio.

I sought this office to make a difference and to strongly work to be both a voice and ears for parents and students in Ohio public education. I hope that as 2020 gives way to 2021, this Board will seek to prioritize hearing those voices of the parents of Ohio. I ran for office as a parent, as a widowed parent, of 5 wonderful children, one of special needs.

Over four incredible years, I have had the opportunity to work with each and every one of you, to learn your perspectives, the priorities of your constituents, the uniqueness that is Ohio with different regions, different types of educational needs and desires. Our 11.7 million people are incredible and they are incredible because they are unique individuals, not statistics. We have initiative, drive, smarts, innovation. We also have ideas and concerns. I have tried to advance many of those over the years, even if they don't fit neatly into perceptions of what can and should happen in public education.

When I ran for office and was elected, I did so as a grassroot parent, and have tried to think and act like a parent throughout my tenure. I encourage this thinking. I saw every educational policy question through this prism and always ask some basic questions: "Does this policy help children to learn, to earn, to advance their careers? Does this policy or priority of this Board make the best use of hard-earned money of the citizens? Would a family support this policy as in the best interests of their school children? Would an employer support this policy to hire and train the best possible employees? Does this policy make school kids smarter and more inclined to success?"

I hope that you would ask yourself some of these questions as you continue to debate public educational policy.

Our time together in the pre-COVID-19 world helped foster relationships and alliances that helped Ohio school children. I am so fortunate to have visited schools both in my district and outside that provided great and different perspectives on the kinds of children and learning environments that Ohioans learn in. From big city to suburban to rural, to the public community schools, homeschooling parents, and the schools that cater to underserved and sometimes forgotten children, I learned a lot and applied that knowledge to my participation on this Board.

I am most proud of efforts to save and nurture drop out recovery schools in Ohio. At the same token, I am disappointed that I had to do that. Our own staff continues to operate as an entity of their own, enforcing their ideology and not necessarily the policies of the elected Board, elected by the people. I issue a challenge to the incoming Board, set policy and reign in ODE employees. We have some tremendously talented people that work for the Department, but they should be carrying out policy adopted by and considered by the Board, not themselves. The efforts to essentially shut down drop our recovery schools, already operating with such a challenged school population with challenged funding were most disappointing and did a disservice to the people of Ohio.

Among unfinished business is the awful state report card, a report card that itself deserves a Big Fat "F" for failure. Despite all of our efforts, Ohio still has a report card that does not reflect actual learning, that carries fundamental flaws, that makes all of our schools look bad, and maybe that is the intent in some twisted way. Four years later, we still have a report card that does not accurately report student learning. Please, Board, Governor DeWine, and Ohio General Assembly, roll up your sleeves and make our State Report Card meaningful and reflective of reality. The people of Ohio deserve more.

I know that a farewell message usually includes a lot of platitudes and thank you's and I certainly am grateful to you all for your collegial approach, for your consideration of my ideas, and I know I tried at all times to see your perspectives. To our Superintendent and Staff, thank you for the courtesies extended to me, I know you will do the same for my successor who won the election, and to whom I wish success as someone who deeply wants to see Ohio succeed.

I also am compelled to be honest and straightforward. This position did have disappointments. We talk a lot about accountability, and sometimes get so carried away with accountability we forget about the big picture – Are Ohio school children learning with the knowledge sets that they need to be successful? I would argue that this is an open-ended question. The Employer Community does not think so, they tell us that young people are not prepared to enter the work world. Higher Education feels the same way, 27% of high school graduates have to take at least one remedial class in college. We can't sit here and congratulate ourselves when these truths are seldom addressed and glossed over with desires for more money. At some point in time, this Board has to grasp that maybe the curriculum, the teaching methods, the lack of parental engagement, the truancy have to be addressed in more meaningful ways and force meaningful change so that parents and taxpayers are getting the highest bang for their buck, and children are ready to work or pursue higher education upon graduation.

This body also needs to be more deliberate and use fact-based logic for decision making. The rush in one meeting, with almost zero public input aside from predestined advocates to force divisive and factually questionable racial regimen upon this Board and Ohio's school children really was not our finest hour. Now, instead of working to improve students learning, we are rushing to force more divisions upon our kids and poisoning the educational environment with race based theories that have never been proven to be factual, in fact, have been proven to be nonfactual like the 1619 Project that we cannot get an honest answer as to how it got on the Department's website, and our Superintendent will not remove it. The 1619 Project has been debunked as a fraud and false teaching of history by historical scholars of the political left, right, and middle, but it remains a teaching resource in Ohio. Why? We can't get an honest answer and that should scare Ohioans and Board Members who deserve an honest debate on this topic, and have not received one.

I hope I challenged you all a bit. I hope to stay engaged in Ohio and our education system and will continue to be an advocate for parents and students, the reason we here. I wish each and every one of you the very best, and thank my great kids, mother, constituents, the people and education professionals of District 5 for allowing me this time to be a voice for the voiceless, the kids and parents who do not have the public employee dues money to talk for them, but we do need to listen to them.

Thank you all for an amazing four years, and I wish this Board great success in your future deliberations and policy making.