

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF OHIO  
MINUTES**

December 2018  
Ohio Department of Education  
25 South Front Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

MEMBERS OF THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Tess Elshoff	Joe Farmer
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	

EX OFFICIO MEMBERS

Senator Peggy Lehner	Representative Andrew Brenner
----------------------	-------------------------------

SECRETARY

Paolo DeMaria  
Superintendent of Public Instruction

Mr. Farmer was absent from the meeting.

---

The State Board convened on Monday, December 10, at the Ohio Department of Education in Columbus.

---

**Chapter 119 Hearing**

December 10, 2018  
8:30 a.m.

Hearing Regarding the Amending, Rescinding and Adoption of Rules

President Elshoff stated the Board would proceed with the public hearing on the following rule actions:

The rescission of 3301-57-01 Administering the in-service training program. The rescission of 3301-102-01 Purpose.

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

President Elshoff called on Hannah Stoneburner, from the Office of the Attorney General, Assistant Attorney General, Education section. Ms. Stoneburner called on Diane Lease, Chief Legal Counsel for the Ohio Department of Education.

Ms. Lease presented the following Board Exhibits:

- Board Exhibit 1 is the public notice that appears in the Register of Ohio and references the proposed rule actions subject to this hearing
- Board Exhibits 2 and 3 would be true and accurate copies of the resolutions adopted by the State Board of Education regarding these rules
- Board Exhibits 4 and 5 would be true and accurate copies of the rules as filed with the Joint Committee on Agency Rule Review (JCARR), Legislative Service Commission (LSC) and the Secretary of State

Ms. Lease explained the rules had been made available to all persons affected by the rules.

President Elshoff stated that testimony would be received, either orally or in writing, for or against, the amendment of the rules that are under consideration. Anyone who wished to testify must complete the registration sheet. All testimony would be limited to no more than five minutes. If additional time is needed, consideration would be given to a reasonable extension. Any written testimony would be marked as Group Exhibit 6.

President Elshoff announced that the Board would now receive testimony on the proposed actions before the Board.

---

### **PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON THE PROPOSED RULE ACTIONS**

There were no requests.

---

President Elshoff called on Ms. Stoneburner, who submitted into evidence State Board Exhibits 1 through 5.

President Elshoff stated that the exhibits were so received. As there was no more testimony, she declared the public hearing closed at 8: 36 a.m.

---

Following the Chapter 119 Hearing, The Board's Educators & Student Options and Accountability & Continuous Improvement Committees met beginning at 8:45 a.m.

---

### **STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING**

# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

President Elshoff convened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, December 10, at 10:35 a.m.

President Elshoff asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

## YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	Eric Poklar
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

## EXECUTIVE SESSION

President Elshoff called on Vice President Hollister, who Moved that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion or compensation of a public employee or official; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the investigation of charges or complaints against a public employee, official, licensee, or regulated individual; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(3) for the purpose of conferring with legal counsel about matters that are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

Mrs. McGuire Seconded the motion.

The President called for a roll call vote.

## YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	Eric Poklar
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

The Board went into Executive Session at 10:35 a.m.

The Board recessed from Executive Session at 11:50 a.m.

# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

The State Board recessed for lunch.

---

## **RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING**

President Elshoff reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, December 10, at 1:00 p.m.

President Elshoff welcomed Board members and guests, and led the Board in the Pledge of Allegiance.

---

## **EDUCATION SPOTLIGHT**

The State Board of Education's Education Spotlight program challenges board members to identify outstanding districts, schools, teachers and students in their state board districts and showcase them at monthly board meetings.

The state Board received a presentation from the Auglaize Mercer Business Education Alliance (AMBE):

AMBE's mission is to create a bridge between area businesses and schools to connect students to the career opportunities in Mercer and Auglaize counties. Through career resources, programs and events, the area is retaining and growing the world-class workforce that keeps their communities strong.

The AMBE Alliance is a private organization of business, service group and school leaders from Mercer and Auglaize counties working to raise awareness of local careers to create a sustainable future workforce. The Alliance is locally supported and funded and serve all schools in Auglaize and Mercer counties.

The alliance formed in 2013 with membership and support continuing to grow each year. Local businesses have shown their commitment through member investments that allow AMBE to work with the schools to build programs that prepare our local students for future local jobs.

AMBE provides career resources, programs and events that connect students with local business professionals. Students gain hands-on insight into real-world careers. The Alliance also helps schools align curriculums to match the skillsets that local businesses need today. Together, they strive to give students a solid foundation for career success.

---

## **FULL BOARD PRESENTATION**

The International Dyslexia Association of Central Ohio made a presentation to the state Board entitled "Dyslexia and the Science of Reading".

Mission:

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

- Increase awareness of dyslexia and related learning disabilities
- Train professionals, provide resource info and advice for families
- Promote the use of effective teaching methods based on the science of reading
- Disseminate scientific research-based knowledge related to neuroscience, cognitive science, technology and equity

### Impact:

Learners with dyslexia will achieve success in K-12 and make a positive transition to college, trade schools and careers

### Definition of Dyslexia:

Dyslexia is a specific learning disability that is neurobiological in origin. It is characterized by difficulties with accurate and/or fluent word recognition and by poor spelling and decoding abilities. These difficulties typically result from a deficit in the phonological component of language that is often unexpected in relation to other cognitive abilities and the provision of effective classroom instruction. Secondary consequences may include problems in reading comprehension and reduced reading experience that can impede growth of vocabulary and background knowledge.

### Informal Dyslexia Definition & Myths:

- Easy definition of dyslexia
- NOT reversal of letters - NOT vision issue
- Compare other assessments - artistic, athletic
- CEO of Cisco, Daymond John, Barbara Corcoran, Kevin O'Leary, Richard Branson, Charles Schwab
- 35% entrepreneurs – dyslexia

### U.S. Dept. of Education – 2017 Nation's Report Card:

- 63% of 4<sup>th</sup> graders NOT proficient in reading
- 64% of 8<sup>th</sup> graders NOT proficient in reading
- 63% of 12<sup>th</sup> graders NOT proficient in reading
- These percentages have remained relatively stable since 1992 ranging from 63% – 71% that are NOT proficient

### Failing Significant Percent of Population:

- We know with 100% certainty – current reading programs are not working for a large portion of student population
- Poverty & English Language Learners explain certain part of it
- 1 in 5 have dyslexia (Yale University)
- Approximately 350,000 Ohio students have dyslexia
- Fortunately, there are decades of scientific research studies that shows us how to teach reading

### Reading Panel Studies:

- 100,000+ studies on reading 1966 – 1997
- About 80,000 studies eliminated due to lack of science based research
- Conclusion: All reading programs must contain 5 components (AKA 5 Big Ideas)

### Action Plan as Result of Reading Panel:

- Reading Panel recommendations largely ignored
- Not implemented in colleges & school districts
- Was not mandated

### Story Changes for Some:

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

- Years of failure for significant portion of students
- Some teachers pursued answers - Structured Literacy
- Highly successful with students with dyslexia and others with reading challenges

### Essential Additions/Changes at MEVSD:

- Raised awareness and understanding of all Big 5 Ideas in Reading
- Revised assessment battery (K-8) & implemented dyslexia screener (K/1)
- Created MTSS process that works and is consistent across all K-8 buildings
- Adopted a diagnostic prescriptive approach to teaching and learning
- Evidenced based practices in place for dyslexia across Tiers 1, 2 & 3

### Most Prevalent Challenges/Obstacles:

- Accountability/Training
- Serving multiple masters
  - Evidence based practice v the implementation of evidence based practice
  - KRA and SLO Windows

### Recommendations:

- Form committee with IDA recommendations
- Committee will help advise as plan is developed
- Committee will advise how to create model district-wide programs based on current successful district programs (roadmap - working on it now)
- Committee will create plan to evaluate reading program to assure 5 components are properly & effectively included in programs

---

## STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION RECOGNITION CEREMONY

The State Board recognized Joe Farmer, President Elshoff, Pat Bruns, Nancy Hollister and Charles Froehlich for their service on the State Board. The State Board also recognized Department of Education staff members Suzan Zelman and Steve Gratz for their service.

---

## REVIEW OF WRITTEN REPORTS AND ITEMS FOR VOTE

There were no questions from Board members.

---

## REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

- Strategic Plan Implementation Strategies 2,3,10

# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

President Elshoff recessed the Board meeting at 5:45 p.m.

---

President Elshoff reconvened the meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, December 11, at 8:30 a.m.

---

The Board's Achievement & Graduation Requirements Committee met beginning at 8:30 a.m.

---

## RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Elshoff reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, December 11, at 11:15 a.m.

President Elshoff asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

### MEMBERS PRESENT

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Tess Elshoff	Cathye Flory
Sarah Fowler	Charles Froehlich
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	Eric Poklar
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods

NOTE: Ms. Bruns, Mrs. Haycock and Mrs. Manchester entered the room after roll call.

---

President Elshoff called for the approval of the Minutes of the November 2018 meeting. She asked if there were any corrections to the Minutes.

There were no corrections.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Mrs. Flory that the Minutes be approved as presented. The President called for a voice vote.

Motion carried unanimously.

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

### **BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE EDUCATORS & STUDENT OPTIONS COMMITTEE**

Chair: Joe Farmer, Vice Chair: Sarah Fowler

Ms. Fowler gave a report from the Educators & Student Options Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Immy Singh and Carolyn Everidge-Frey provided members with a presentation outlining proposed revisions to the follow Ohio Administrative Code rules:

- OAC 3301-23-44 Temporary and Substitute Licenses is being amended due to the passage of Senate Bill 216, which amended the educator licenses for substitute teaching under ORC 3319.226.
- OAC 3301-24-15 Provisional Educator License for Teachers in STEM Schools is being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review process.
- OAC 3301-24-27 Early College High School Educator License is being created due to the passage of Senate Bill 216, which provides for the license in ORC 3319.262.
- OAC 3301-26-01 Examinations for Educator Licensure is being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review process.

Following discussion, Committee Members made separate votes to recommend adoption of each of the above four rules to the State Board. The State Board will be asked to vote on these recommendations at its next meeting.

Wendy Grove and Paolo DeMaria provided members with a presentation that provided an overview of preschool special education in Ohio, as well as the proposed amendments to OAC 3301-51-11 Preschool Children Eligible for Special Education. The rule is being amended due to passage of House Bill 49, which changed ORC requirements for teacher to student ratio in preschool special education classrooms. Additional amendments are proposed following extensive contact with and feedback from stakeholders, as well as guidance provided by the United States Department of Education. The rule is being presented this month for discussion only and will return for a committee vote in 2019.

---

### **BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ACCOUNTABILITY & CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE**

Chair: Nancy Hollister, Vice Chair: Cathye Flory

Mrs. Hollister gave a report from the Accountability & Continuous Improvement Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Career Technical Planning District (CTPD) Report Card Discussion – Facilitated by Chris Woolard: Mr. Woolard provided background on the CTPD report card recommendations that were voted out of committee at the November meeting. Chris reiterated the recommendation to maintain existing elements in the prepared for success component and expand the elements included in the prepared for success component, (it was recommended this component be renamed the Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component).

Rule Review: OAC 3301-1-2-10,11,12 – Facilitated by Colleen Grady:

Ms. Grady introduced a discussion of revising the graduation benchmarks for dropout prevention and recovery schools. Based on additional analysis and stakeholder feedback, the Department has



## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

provided two options of revised benchmarks for the committee's consideration. This topic of benchmark calibration will continue in February 2019.

---

### **BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ACHIEVEMENT & GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS COMMITTEE**

Chair: Laura Kohler, Vice Chair: Stephanie Dodd

Mrs. Kohler gave a report from the Achievement & Graduation Requirements Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

#### Graduation Requirements:

Staff presented graduation data for the class of 2018. This included information on the percentages of graduates meeting the three original pathways and the HB49 options. Additionally, staff provided a legislative update on graduation requirements for classes of 2019 and beyond.

#### Standards and Model Curriculum Update:

Staff provided an update on the process and timelines for revising and updating the World Language and Fine Arts standards, as well as the timelines for revisions and committee review of the Social Studies, Science and Financial Literacy model curriculum.

---

### **BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ALTERNATIVE ASSESSMENTS WORKGROUP**

Chair: Charlotte McGuire      Workgroup members: Pat Bruns, Laura Kohler

Department Staff: Alex Goodman, Buddy Harris and Sarah Wilson

Mrs. McGuire gave a report from the Alternative Assessments Workgroup meeting focusing on the following issues:

#### Final Report of the Alternative Assessments Action Team:

The Alternative Assessments Action Team was convened by President Elshoff as part of an initiative to provide an opportunity for State Board of Education members to conduct independent research about a particular topic in order to enrich members' understanding of the issue and to make recommendations to the full board. Our small group met in person, through telephone conferences and spent time both reading and watching a relevant video. We were aided in our work by staff members Alex Goodman, Buddy Harris and Sarah Wilson. We are grateful for their help.

#### Focus of Our Work:

Our goal was to learn about best practices for the use of alternative assessments, both here in Ohio and, less fully researched, around the country. We were interested in understanding how these assessments are being used currently, and how they might be improved and expanded.

Initially, we focused exclusively on alternative assessments used as a tool for students to demonstrate readiness for post-secondary work, military enrollment or entering the workplace. However, we realized that the Achievement and Graduation Committee as well as Ohio's new strategic plan implementation team were also working on that particular application. We felt that our work in that arena would be duplicative, and would not serve to move the board forward.

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

To that end, we discussed and agreed upon a broader definition of alternative assessments, and used a wider lens as we continued to learn about the benefits of relying less exclusively on standardized testing to measure student learning.

### Definition of Alternative Assessments:

Defining what is met by “alternative assessments” proved to be more challenging than we expected. We discovered many slightly different definitions. In the end, we determined that alternative assessments are authentic ways to assess a student’s, skills, knowledge and abilities beyond the use of standardized tests.

Further, we determined that ODE’s role in promoting the use of proven and reliable alternative assessments is to make innovative research, best practices and other resources available to local districts.

### Purpose of Alternative Assessments:

The purpose of using assessment methods that are different from standardized testing is to provide students with additional and non-traditional avenues to demonstrate both what they know and what they can do. Research suggests that standardized tests are not the most authentic representation of how well a student has learned and can apply subject specific material. The case for alternative assessments is also strong for many of the so-called “soft skills” desired by employers, the military and college admissions alike.

Although there is an excellent application of alternative assessments for those students who simply don’t perform as expected on standardized tests, we believe that the application should be much broader. Expecting a student to research, write, present and defend a project based on the standards he or she is expected to master is a far richer experience than taking a pen and paper or electronic test. A standardized test doesn’t allow a student to demonstrate passion, resiliency, communications skills or the ability to synthesize complex information in new and creative ways.

We have learned that the best alternative assessments are aligned to state standards and should be coupled with some standardized measures. Work is on-going here in Ohio to attempt to correlate student outcomes measured by alternative assessments to those generated by standardized tests, however thus far the alignment hasn’t been proven. We recognize that until and unless the alternative assessment results can be aligned with confidence to standardized test data, some statewide testing data will be required for accountability purposes.

### Recommendations:

Our Action Team makes the following recommendations for the Board’s future consideration:

1. Identify exemplars of district-level alternative assessments and evaluation of those assessments.
2. Review best practices and guidelines for the development of alternative assessments, focused on specifically on high school capstones and culminating projects.
3. Examine opportunities for incorporation of performance-based assessments K-12.
4. Direct Department staff to develop a crosswalk/list of current ODE assessments, categories of assessments, use of assessment, content area.
5. ODE has multiple ongoing competency-based pilot programs. We recommend further review and discussion of the data and findings from these pilots.
6. Charge the Achievement and Graduation Committee with responsibility for championing and developing further recommendations for best practices, appropriate use, data alignment and developing supports for local districts using alternative assessments including those that are competency and/or mastery-based.

**BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE WRAP AROUND SERVICES WORKGROUP**

Chair: Meryl Johnson

Ms. Johnson gave a report from the Wrap Around Services Workgroup meeting focusing on the following issues:

The Wrap Around Services Workgroup will be submitting a final report which will be shared with the Board when available.

---

**BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE HOW ARE WE USING DATA WORKGROUP**

Chair: Dr. Kara Morgan

Dr. Morgan gave a report from the How Are We Using Data Workgroup meeting focusing on the following issues:

Findings and Recommendations from “How we use data” Impact Team – July 2018 (will serve as final report)

Kara Morgan, lead Members: Stephanie Dodd, Sarah Fowler, Linda Haycock, Martha Manchester, Lisa Woods

The Impact Team spent time looking deeply at the KRA, gathered information on how schools use report card and how they use local assessments, and were introduced to the potential ways that value-added data could be used by schools. The Impact Team is interested in having more time to investigate some of these issues in greater depth.

1. Locally-selected assessments are preferred for identifying gaps in curriculum and for identifying teacher professional development needs.
2. State Report Card data is used for comparison to other districts and other schools.
3. Some of the use of state assessment data is limited because it is only collected one time a year, so teachers cannot use it to measure progress over the year.
4. Some of the use of the state assessment data is limited because of the timing when the results are returned.
5. There are many ways that the schools and districts can use student-level value-added data to help plan courses, offerings, placements. We would like to learn more about this from the 36 regional data leads who have been trained by SAS, to help support item #9 below.
6. We would like to offer our support to the work of these 36 data leads and to help when we can in terms of improving understanding of the value-added measure.
7. There are several accountability triggers in the law related to report card data, and we would like to have more time to investigate and understand those to ensure the Board has all the need knowledge and information to make decisions on this issue.
8. It would be useful to have a matrix indicating what is required by federal law, by federal guidance, by state law, by Board policy and by Department policy. This information has been collected on the

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

state report card as part of the work of the Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee. We would like to work with the Department to develop this information format.

9. We recommend that work be done to improve communication with teachers about value-add so that it can be more impactful for improving student learning.

10. We recommend that work be done to improve parent and community understanding of value-added so they can start to see the potential value of state assessments for improving learning.

11. We request an estimate be developed of the resources used to plan, conduct and evaluate the state assessments. We realize there will be contract costs that will be relevant, as well as in-school costs that will be very difficult to estimate and are likely to vary greatly from district to district. We recommend that a methodology be developed so that this information can be collected regularly. This is a research need rather than an operational need.

12. We request that information on schools that have improved school climate be evaluated to determine what the impact has been on achievement and growth. This is a research question rather than an operational need.

13. We recommend that the work of this Impact Team continue to address and oversee the items underlined above, and the recommendations in items 9-12.

---

### **REPORT CARD STAKEHOLDER WORKGROUP RECOMMENDATIONS**

Facilitated by Chris Woolard, Senior Executive Director, Center for Performance and Impact.

#### **Report Card Workgroup:**

The State Board of Education invited education stakeholders to address short-term (2017-18 Report Card) and long-term (next iteration of the Report Card) issues surrounding the Ohio School Report Cards.

- Committee membership:
  - 8 State Board of Education members
  - 9 external members representing education stakeholders such as administrators, educators, and parents
- Committee meetings March 2018 – June 2018; October 2018
- Initial recommendations presented to Board in July 2018; final recommendations presented to Board in November 2018

#### **Recommendations:**

1. Design Principles
2. Achievement Component
3. K-3 Literacy Component
4. Prepared for Success Component
5. Progress Component (Value-Added)
6. A – F Letter Grades
7. Design & Communications
8. Additional Considerations

#### **Report Card Purpose:**

Report cards are not meant to replace local data, but instead should complement local data sources. Report Cards are annual, summative snapshots of performance and are not meant to be formative.

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Report Card data, including the corresponding diagnostic information, should inform ongoing instructional decisions, but are not intended to be the primary source of information used during the school year to make adjustments to instructional activity.

### **Design Principles:**

- Fair
- Honest
- Reliable and Valid
- Clear and easy to understand

### **Legislative: Achievement Component**

Achievement Component should rely solely on the performance index.

- Indicators Met measure will be eliminated as a graded measure.
- Percentage of students performing proficient or higher will be reported.

### **Consideration: K-3 Literacy**

If the current measure is maintained, it should be renamed to more accurately reflect its focus on struggling readers.

*Note:* This consideration was implemented for the 2018 Ohio School Report Cards. The measure was renamed “Improving At-Risk K-3 Readers”.

### **Legislative: K-3 Literacy Component**

The K-3 Literacy Component should be eliminated. If an early literacy measure continues to be included, it should be the Promotion Rate.

### **Legislative: Prepared for Success**

The Prepared for Success measure should be refined to include additional measures of college, career and life preparedness.

For example: military enlistment, ASVAB, CLEP, CTAG, career prep program credentials, OhioMeansJobs Readiness Seal, etc.

### **Board: Prepared for Success**

The dual tier structure of Prepared for Success be restructured into a single tier that provides similar credit for all measures.

The recommendations should apply to the Career Technical Planning District Report Card as well.

### **Board: Progress (Value-Added)**

Include the Value-Added Technical Advisory Group report as an appendix to the Committee’s final report (see Appendix B).

### **Legislative: Progress (Value-Added)**

- Use one-year value-added for accountability purposes, while reporting multi-year value-added for the additional benefit of viewing larger trends.
- Eliminate the subgroup demotion.
- Eliminate the Value-Added Rankings required in Ohio Revised Code 3302.21(A)(2).

### **Legislative: A – F Letter Grades**

Eliminate the A – F letter grades for the entire report card; and adopt an ESSA-compliant dashboard while still maintaining high expectations and aspirational goals.

# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

## **Ohio Department of Education: Design and Communications**

- Descriptive narratives on purpose of report card added to landing page
- Improve clarity of language
- Relocate District Profile link (Note: implemented on 2018 Ohio School Report Cards)

## **Additional Considerations:**

- Additional Profile information in alignment with Each Child, Our Future
- Interest in national comparisons of student performance

---

## **STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION AWARD RECOGNITION CEREMONY**

Each year the State Board of Education has the opportunity to recognize schools across the State that are doing great work in Education.

### **The All A Award:**

The All A Award recognizes schools that earned straight A's on all of their applicable report card measures.

### **The Momentum Award:**

The Momentum recognizes schools for exceeding expectations in student growth for the year. Schools must earn straight A's on all Value-Added measures on the report card. The school or district must have at least two Value-Added subgroups of students, which includes gifted, lowest 20% in achievement, and students with disabilities.

### **The Overall A Award:**

The Overall A Award recognizes districts and schools that earned an Overall A.

---

The State Board recessed for lunch.

---

## **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON ACTION ITEMS**

There was no Public Participation on Action Items.

---

## **VOTING ON THE REPORT & RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION**

President Elshoff called on Superintendent DeMaria for his report and recommendations.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendations (Items 1-11) on the Consent Agenda:

- 1. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY KIMBERLEY H. BURDETT AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Kimberley H. Burdett has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 15, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Kimberley H. Burdett that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Burdett's inappropriate relationship with a student; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Kimberley H. Burdett is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Kimberley H. Burdett has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Kimberley H. Burdett's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Burdett's inappropriate relationship with a student. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Kimberley H. Burdett be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Burdett of this action.

- 2. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY NELL A. HATON-MICICH AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS Nell A. Haton-Micich has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on October 25, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Nell A. Haton-Micich that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Haton-Micich's decision not to participate in any proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Nell A. Haton-Micich is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Nell A. Haton-Micich has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Nell A. Haton-Micich's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Haton-Micich's decision not to participate in any proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Nell A. Haton-Micich be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Haton-Micich of this action.

3. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY AMANDA M. HINES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Amanda M. Hines has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on October 25, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Amanda M. Hines that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order



Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Hines' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Amanda M. Hines is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Amanda M. Hines has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Amanda M. Hines' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Hines' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Amanda M. Hines be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Hines of this action.

4. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY FLORENT M. LOISY AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Florent M. Loisy has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 2, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Florent M. Loisy that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Loisy's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Florent M. Loisy is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS Florent M. Loisy has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Florent M. Loisy's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Loisy's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Florent M. Loisy be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Loisy of this action.

5. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY JOSEPH W. MILESKI AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Joseph W. Mileski has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on October 25, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Joseph W. Mileski that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Mileski's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Joseph W. Mileski is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Joseph W. Mileski has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Joseph W. Mileski's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Mileski's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Joseph W. Mileski be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Mileski of this action.

6. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY JENNIFER L. MOUNTFORD AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jennifer L. Mountford has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 9, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Jennifer L. Mountford that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Mountford's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Jennifer L. Mountford is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Jennifer L. Mountford has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Jennifer L. Mountford's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Mountford's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Jennifer L. Mountford be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Mountford of this action.

7. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY CONNIE RING AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Connie Ring has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on October 22, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Connie Ring that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Ring's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Connie Ring is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Connie Ring has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Connie Ring's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Ring's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Connie Ring be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Ring of this action.

8. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY CARIE A. SCAHILL AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Carie A. Scahill has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 5, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Carie A. Scahill that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Scahill's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Carie A. Scahill is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Carie A. Scahill has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Carie A. Scahill's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Scahill's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Carie A. Scahill be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Scahill of this action.

9. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY SAMANTHA A. SNYDER AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Samantha A. Snyder has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on October 24, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Samantha A. Snyder that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Snyder's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Samantha A. Snyder is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Samantha A. Snyder has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Samantha A. Snyder's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Snyder's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Samantha A. Snyder be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Snyder of this action.

10. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY JACELYN L. TEMPEL AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jacelyn L. Tempel has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on October 16, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Jacelyn L.

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Tempel that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Tempel's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Jacelyn L. Tempel is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Jacelyn L. Tempel has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Jacelyn L. Tempel's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Tempel's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Jacelyn L. Tempel be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Tempel of this action.

11. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY LAURA N. TEMPLIN AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Laura N. Templin has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 19, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Laura N. Templin that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Templin's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS the form specifies that Laura N. Templin is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Laura N. Templin has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Laura N. Templin's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Templin's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Laura N. Templin be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Templin of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the Consent Agenda (Items 1-11) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

Mrs. Hollister presented the following recommendation (Item 12):

**12. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-8-01 / PAYMENT OF DEBT CHARGES UNDER THE STATE CREDIT ENHANCEMENT PROGRAM**

The State Board of Education hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:



# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Ohio Revised Code Section 3317.18(I) permitted the Department of Education, with the advice of the Office of Budget and Management, to adopt and enforce rules relating to the withholding and depositing of payments under ORC Chapter 3317 to secure payment of debt charges on school district securities;

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-8-01 is being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review;

OAC 3301-8-01 is being amended to clarify requirements and remove unnecessary requirements, such as 1) requiring school districts to identify persons or entities owning property representing in aggregate more than 5 percent of the total taxable value of the school district and 2) reducing the school district's current and proposed state education aid by any projected deficit on its five-year forecast;

The Executive Committee recommended in its November 14, 2018, meeting that the State Board of Education (State Board) adopt the changes proposed to OAC 3301-8-01; and

More than 50 percent of the rule is being amended, so the existing rule is being rescinded and the new rule, bearing the same number, is being adopted.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board approves rescinding the existing OAC 3301-8-01 and adopting the new rule, bearing the same number, in the form attached hereto;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relates.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 12) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

## YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

Mrs. Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 13):

**13. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE NO CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE 3301-52-01/APPROPRIATE USES OF EARLY CHILDHOOD EDUCATION SCREENING AND ASSESSMENT INFORMATION**

The State Board of Education (“State Board”) **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Section 4.02 of Am. Sub. H.B. 282 (123<sup>rd</sup> GA) requires the State Board to adopt rules addressing the use of screening and assessment data;

Ohio Revised Code (“ORC”) Section 3301.07 requires the State Board to prescribe minimum standards to be applied to all elementary and secondary schools in this state for the purpose of providing children access to a general education of high quality according to the learning needs of each individual;

ORC Section 3301.53 requires the State Board to adopt rules prescribing the minimum standards to be applied to preschool programs;

Ohio Administrative Code (“OAC”) Section 3301-52-01 is being proposed as a no change rule as part of the five-year rule review process;

The Department of Education recommends the State Board adopt the rule as a no change rule; and

The Achievement and Graduation Requirements Committee recommended to the State Board in its November meeting that the State Board adopt the rule as a no change rule.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board hereby approves the filing of Ohio Administrative Code 3301-52-01 as a no change rule;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relate.

It was Moved by Mrs. Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 13) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns  
Cathye Flory  
Charles Froehlich  
Nancy Hollister  
Laura Kohler  
Charlotte McGuire  
Kara Morgan  
James Sheppard  
Tess Elshoff

Stephanie Dodd  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 14.A.):

**14.A. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-83-01, 3301-83-05, 3301-83-07, 3301-83-09, 3301-83-10, 3301-83-12, 3301-83-15, 3301-83-16, 3301-83-17, 3301-83-18, 3301-83-19, 3301-83-22, AND 3301-83-23; TO ADOPT NO CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-83-04, 3301-83-14, AND 3301-83-21; AND TO RESCIND OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-83-03**

The State Board of Education hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code Section 4511.76(B) mandated the Department of Education, by and with the advice of the director of the Department of Public Safety, to adopt and enforce rules relating to the operation of all vehicles used for pupil transportation;

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-83-01, 3301-83-05, 3301-83-07, 3301-83-09, 3301-83-10, 3301-83-12, 3301-83-15, 3301-83-16, 3301-83-17, 3301-83-18, 3301-83-19, 3301-83-22, and 3301-83-23 are being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review and these rules are being amended to clarify requirements and language;

OAC 3301-83-04, 3301-83-14, and 3301-83-21 are not being amended;

OAC 3301-83-03 is being rescinded because the purpose of the rule is already set forth in law; and

The Educators and Student Options Committee recommended in its November 14, 2018, meeting that the State Board of Education adopt the rules in the form presented to the State Board.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board approves changes to OAC 3301-83-01, 3301-83-05, 3301-83-07, 3301-83-09, 3301-83-10, 3301-83-12, 3301-83-15, 3301-83-16, 3301-83-17, 3301-83-18, 3301-83-19, 3301-83-22, and 3301-83-23, in the form presented to the State Board; approves no changes to OAC 3301-83-04, 3301-83-14, and 3301-83-21; and approves rescinding OAC 3301-83-03;

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relates.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 14.A.) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 14.B.):

**14.B. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE  
3301-83-24**

The State Board of Education hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code Section 4511.76(B) mandated the Department of Education, by and with the advice of the director of the Department of Public Safety, to adopt and enforce rules relating to the operation of all vehicles used for pupil transportation;

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-83-24 is being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review and is being amended to clarify requirements and language; and

The Educators and Student Options Committee recommended in its November 14, 2018, meeting that the State Board of Education adopt the rule in the form presented to the State Board.

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board approves changes to OAC 3301-83-24 in the form presented to the State Board;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rule with the proper agencies and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rule; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rule; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rule relates.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 14.B.) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Cathye Flory
Sarah Fowler	Charles Froehlich
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

ABSTAIN

Stephanie Dodd

Motion carried.

---

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 15):

**15. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-102-09/APPROVING APPLICATIONS FOR NEW INTERNET- OR COMPUTER-BASED COMMUNITY SCHOOLS**

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code Section 3314.013 requires the State Board to adopt rules prescribing measures to determine the experience and quality of applicants for new internet- or computer-based community schools;

Ohio Administrative Code (“OAC”) Section 3301-102-09 is being amended as part of the five-year rule review process;

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

The Department of Education recommends the State Board adopt changes to OAC Section 3301-102-09 in the form attached hereto to remove provisions that are duplicative of other provisions of the Revised Code, clarify the requirements, and align the rule more closely with the enabling statute; and

The Educators and Student Options Committee recommended to the State Board in its November meeting to approve the amendments to OAC 3301-102-09 in the form attached hereto.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, the State Board of Education approves the changes to OAC Section 3301-102-09 in the form attached hereto;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to file the rule with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rule; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rule; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rule relates.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 15) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

Aaron Ross, Professional Conduct Managing Attorney, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 16):

**16. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE GENERAL EDUCATION TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION OF HEATHER L. DORSTEN**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS Heather L. Dorsten has applied for a one-year substitute general education teaching license; and

WHEREAS on August 31, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Heather L. Dorsten of its intent to deny or permanently deny her application for a one-year substitute general education teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Dorsten's 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of allowing underage persons to have alcohol, 2006 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of failing to file city income tax, 2006 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of possession of drug paraphernalia, 2006 guilty plea in the Auglaize County Municipal Court to one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle while under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2005 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of failing to file city income tax, 2004 conviction in the Auglaize County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle while under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2001 guilty plea in the Auglaize County Municipal Court to one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2000 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of criminal falsification, and Ms. Dorsten's failure to disclose her convictions on the application she submitted to the Ohio Department of Education in 2017; and

WHEREAS Ms. Dorsten requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on August 14, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Dorsten was present at the hearing, but she was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Dorsten's application be denied. Further it is recommended that Ms. Dorsten be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Dorsten engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession and whose licensure would have a negative impact on the health, safety, and welfare of the school community due to her conduct that resulted in four OVI misdemeanor convictions, one misdemeanor conviction for possessing drug paraphernalia, one misdemeanor conviction for allowing underage persons to have alcohol, one misdemeanor conviction for criminal falsification, one misdemeanor conviction for disorderly conduct, and two misdemeanor convictions for failing to file city income tax, in addition to her failure to disclose those convictions on her application to the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Heather L. Dorsten's application for a one-year substitute general education teaching license based upon Ms. Dorsten's 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of allowing underage persons to have alcohol, 2006 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of failing to file city income tax, 2006 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of possession of drug paraphernalia, 2006 guilty plea in the Auglaize County Municipal Court to one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle while under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2005 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of failing to file city income tax, 2004 conviction in the Auglaize County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle while under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2001 guilty plea in the Auglaize County Municipal Court to one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2000 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of criminal falsification, and Ms. Dorsten's failure to disclose her convictions on the application she submitted to the Ohio Department of Education in 2017. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Heather L. Dorsten be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Dorsten of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 16) be approved.

Mrs. McGuire Moved to Amend the resolution by substitution. She proposed that Ms. Dorsten be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after December 11, 2019 provided she meets all applicable licensure qualification requirements and she had no new criminal convictions. Ms. Woods Seconded the motion. Mrs. McGuire stated that it had been 10 years since Ms. Dorsten had last been convicted and those convictions were misdemeanors. Also, Ms. Dorsten was remorseful about her addiction issues and has maintained her sobriety since 2008 and continues to seek treatment.

### **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT OF THE HEARING OFFICER, TO MODIFY THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, AND TO DENY THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE GENERAL EDUCATION TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION OF HEATHER L. DORSTEN**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:



## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS Heather L. Dorsten has applied for a one-year substitute general education teaching license; and

WHEREAS on August 31, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Heather L. Dorsten of its intent to deny or permanently deny her application for a one-year substitute general education teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Dorsten's 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of allowing underage persons to have alcohol, 2006 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of failing to file city income tax, 2006 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of possession of drug paraphernalia, 2006 guilty plea in the Auglaize County Municipal Court to one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle while under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2005 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of failing to file city income tax, 2004 conviction in the Auglaize County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle while under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2001 guilty plea in the Auglaize County Municipal Court to one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2000 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of criminal falsification, and Ms. Dorsten's failure to disclose her convictions on the application she submitted to the Ohio Department of Education in 2017; and

WHEREAS Ms. Dorsten requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on August 14, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Dorsten was present at the hearing, but she was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Dorsten's application be denied. Further it is recommended that Ms. Dorsten be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Dorsten engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession and whose licensure would have a negative impact on the health, safety, and welfare of the school community due to her conduct that resulted in four OVI misdemeanor convictions, one misdemeanor conviction for possessing drug paraphernalia, one misdemeanor conviction for allowing underage persons to have alcohol, one misdemeanor conviction for criminal falsification, one misdemeanor conviction for disorderly conduct, and two misdemeanor convictions for failing to file city income tax, in addition to her failure to disclose those convictions on her application to the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession; and

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation: reject in its entirety the aggravating factor numbered 3 in the Aggravating Factors section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in its entirety the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in their entirety conclusions of law number 16, 24 and 25; and reject the second paragraph in its entirety of the Recommendation section of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board may determine that a penalty outside the range of the disciplinary guidelines listed in the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators* is more appropriate in an individual case based upon the aggravating and mitigating factors as outlined in Section 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and any other factors the State Board considers relevant; and

WHEREAS the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following mitigating factors: a significant amount of time has elapsed since Ms. Dorsten's last conviction in 2008; all of Ms. Dorsten's convictions were misdemeanors; Ms. Dorsten was forthcoming at the hearing by discussing her battle with substance abuse issues, poor relationship choices, and bad-decision making; Ms. Dorsten has maintained her sobriety since 2008; Ms. Dorsten completed intensive outpatient treatment and is currently participating in counseling and a community drug prevention group; Ms. Dorsten earned her Associate's degree, served as an adult education instructor at the vocational level, and graduated with a Bachelor of Science degree in middle childhood education in 2015; for two years, Ms. Dorsten worked for the AmeriCorps Volunteer in Service to America program that focuses on alleviating poverty in the United States, and she has obtained a professional license from the Ohio Department of Insurance; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when she did not give the preceding facts and mitigating factors the weight they deserved when she made her recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that a permanent denial of Ms. Dorsten's license is not warranted based on the substantial mitigating factors in this case. Further, the State Board concludes that a more appropriate sanction would be for Ms. Dorsten's application to be denied but allow her to apply for a license on or about December 11, 2019 provided she meets all the applicable licensure qualification requirements and she has no new criminal convictions: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation: reject in its entirety the aggravating factor numbered 3 in the Aggravating Factors section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in its entirety the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in their entirety conclusions of law number 16, 24 and 25; and reject the second paragraph in its entirety of the Recommendation section of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and, Be It Further

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following mitigating factors: a significant amount of time has elapsed since Ms. Dorsten's last conviction in 2008; all of Ms. Dorsten's convictions were misdemeanors; Ms. Dorsten was forthcoming at the hearing by discussing her battle with substance abuse issues, poor relationship choices, and bad-decision making; Ms. Dorsten has maintained her sobriety since 2008; Ms. Dorsten completed intensive outpatient treatment and is currently participating in counseling and a community drug prevention group; Ms. Dorsten earned her Associate's degree, served as an adult education instructor at the vocational level, and graduated with a Bachelor of Science degree in middle childhood education in 2015; for two years, Ms. Dorsten worked for the AmeriCorps Volunteer in Service to America program that focuses on alleviating poverty in the United States, and she has obtained a professional license from the Ohio Department of Insurance; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when she did not give the preceding facts and mitigating factors the weight they deserved when she made her recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that a permanent denial of Ms. Dorsten's license is not warranted based on the substantial mitigating factors in this case. Further, the State Board concludes that a more appropriate sanction would be for Ms. Dorsten's application to be denied but allow her to apply for a license on or about December 11, 2019 provided she meets all the applicable licensure qualification requirements and she has no new criminal convictions; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Heather L. Dorsten's application for a one-year substitute general education teaching license based upon Ms. Dorsten's 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2008 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of allowing underage persons to have alcohol, 2006 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of failing to file city income tax, 2006 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of possession of drug paraphernalia, 2006 guilty plea in the Auglaize County Municipal Court to one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle while under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2005 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of failing to file city income tax, 2004 conviction in the Auglaize County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of operating a vehicle while under the influence of alcohol or drugs, 2001 guilty plea in the Auglaize County Municipal Court to one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2000 conviction in the Celina Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of criminal falsification, and Ms. Dorsten's failure to disclose her convictions on the application she submitted to the Ohio Department of Education in 2017. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders Heather L. Dorsten be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after December 11, 2019 provided she meets all

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

applicable licensure qualification requirements and she had no new criminal convictions; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Dorsten of this action.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

Aaron Ross, Professional Conduct Managing Attorney, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 17):

**17. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF DEVIONE J. EDWARDS**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Devione J. Edwards holds a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 with an effective year of 2017; and

WHEREAS on September 25, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Devione J.

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Edwards of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b). The notice was based upon Mr. Edwards' 2018 conviction in the Bowling Green Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of assault; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Edwards that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018; and

WHEREAS Devione J. Edwards did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Bowling Green Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Bowling Green Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b), hereby **REVOKES** Devione J. Edwards's three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 with an effective year of 2017 based upon Mr. Edwards' 2018 conviction in the Bowling Green Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of assault. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Devione J. Edwards be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Edwards of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Dodd and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 17) be approved.

Ms. Johnson Moved to amend the resolution by substitution. She proposed that Mr. Edwards' three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 with an effective year of 2017 with the suspension beginning on December 11, 2018 and ending on the date that he provides to the Ohio Department of

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Education verification that he has completed eight hours of anger management counseling, pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education. Ms. Woods Seconded the motion. Ms. Johnson stated this was a fight that resulted from too much drinking by all individuals involved.

### **RESOLUTION TO SUSPEND THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF DEVIONE J. EDWARDS**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Devione J. Edwards holds a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 with an effective year of 2017; and

WHEREAS on September 25, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Devione J. Edwards of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b). The notice was based upon Mr. Edwards' 2018 conviction in the Bowling Green Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of assault; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Edwards that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018; and

WHEREAS Devione J. Edwards did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Bowling Green Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Bowling Green Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

**RESOLVED**, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b), hereby **SUSPENDS** Devione J. Edwards' three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2018 with an effective year of 2017 with the suspension beginning on December 11, 2018 and ending on the date that he provides to the Ohio Department of Education verification that he has completed eight hours of anger management counseling, pre-approved by the Ohio

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Department of Education. The suspension is based upon Mr. Edwards' 2018 conviction in the Bowling Green Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of assault. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(1)(e), orders Devione J. Edwards be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until the suspension of his three-year pupil activity permit has ended or if his three-year pupil activity permit expires before the required counseling is completed until the date that he provides verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed eight hours of anger management counseling, pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Edwards of this action.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed resolution.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Charles Froehlich
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler	James Sheppard
--------------	----------------

Motion carried.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

ABSTAIN

Laura Kohler

Motion carried.

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Aaron Ross, Professional Conduct Managing Attorney, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 18):

**18. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT APPLICATION OF ANTONIO T. MCBRIDE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Antonio T. McBride has applied for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS on November 13, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Antonio T. McBride of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. McBride engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when, on or about January 27, 2016, he became involved in a physical altercation with a student that began in the gymnasium and continued to the principal's office and, while in the area of the principal's office, Mr. McBride grabbed the student by the shirt collar, physically removed the student from the principal's office, slammed the student against a wall, and pushed his fist into the student's throat; and

WHEREAS Mr. McBride did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on June 7, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. McBride was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. McBride's application be denied. Further it is recommended that Mr. McBride be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. McBride engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when he had a deliberate and aggressive physical altercation with a student that resulted in the student sustaining injuries and that was clearly inappropriate in a school setting for any reason; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

**RESOLVED**, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Antonio T. McBride's application for a three-year pupil activity permit based upon Mr. McBride engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when, on or about January 27, 2016, he became involved in a physical altercation with a student that began in the



Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

gymnasium and continued to the principal's office and, while in the area of the principal's office, Mr. McBride grabbed the student by the shirt collar, physically removed the student from the principal's office, slammed the student against a wall, and pushed his fist into the student's throat. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Antonio T. McBride be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. McBride of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 18) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

Aaron Ross, Professional Conduct Managing Attorney, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 19):

**19. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF MARIAH A. MCCOLLUM**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Mariah A. McCollum held a one-year educational aide permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS on September 25, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Mariah A. McCollum of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year educational aide permit issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(a), (B)(2)(c), and (B)(3). The notice was based upon Ms. McCollum's 2018 guilty plea in the Hamilton County Court of Common Pleas to felony tampering with records, felony theft, and felony

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

unauthorized use of property and her subsequent entry into the Court's pre-trial diversion program; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. McCollum that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year educational aide permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Mariah A. McCollum did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, and certified court records from the Hamilton County Court of Common Pleas; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(a), (B)(2)(c), and (B)(3), hereby **REVOKES** Mariah A. McCollum's one-year educational aide permit issued in 2017 based upon Ms. McCollum's 2018 guilty plea in the Hamilton County Court of Common Pleas to one felony count of tampering with records, one felony count of theft, and one felony count of unauthorized use of property and her subsequent entry into the Court's pre-trial diversion program. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Mariah A. McCollum be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. McCollum of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Dodd and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 19) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns  
Cathye Flory  
Charles Froehlich

Stephanie Dodd  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Nancy Hollister  
Laura Kohler  
Charlotte McGuire  
Kara Morgan  
James Sheppard  
Tess Elshoff

Meryl Johnson  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

Aaron Ross, Professional Conduct Managing Attorney, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 20):

**20. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR ADOLESCENT TO YOUNG ADULT TEMPORARY TEACHING LICENSE OF JOSEPH J. PETERS**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Joseph J. Peters held a one-year adolescent to young adult temporary teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on August 25, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Joseph J. Peters of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his one-year adolescent to young adult temporary teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Peters engaging in the following conduct that is negligent, incompetent, or unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about September 14, 2012, Mr. Peters made an inappropriate racially disparaging statement to students and as a result of this incident, he received a written reprimand from the Great Oaks Career Campuses; on or about May 29, 2015, Mr. Peters allowed students to shoot air rifles on an indoor range unsupervised and as a result of this incident, he was placed on an improvement plan that required him to supervise his students at all times; on or about December 15, 2015, Mr. Peters left his students unsupervised while he went to the office and his actions were in violation of his improvement plan; and on or about March 14, 2016, in violation of his improvement plan, Mr. Peters allowed his class to go outside without proper supervision while he remained in the classroom and during this time, a student fell off the roof of the school and was injured; and

WHEREAS Mr. Peters did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on June 4, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Peters was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Peters' license be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Mr. Peters be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Peters engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession and whose continued licensure would negatively impact students and the education community as a result of his making inappropriate racially disparaging remarks to students and consistently failing to supervise his students despite having been reprimanded and put on an improvement plan, resulting in an incident where a student fell off a roof and was injured while Mr. Peters was inside the classroom working on grades; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Joseph J. Peters' one-year adolescent to young adult temporary teaching license issued in 2015 based upon Mr. Peters engaging in the following conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about September 14, 2012, Mr. Peters made an inappropriate racially disparaging statement to students and as a result of this incident, he received a written reprimand from the Great Oaks Career Campuses; on or about May 29, 2015, Mr. Peters allowed students to shoot air rifles on an indoor range unsupervised and as a result of this incident, he was placed on an improvement plan that required him to supervise his students at all times; on or about December 15, 2015, Mr. Peters left his students unsupervised while he went to the office and his actions were in violation of his improvement plan; and on or about March 14, 2016, in violation of his improvement plan, Mr. Peters allowed his class to go outside without proper supervision while he remained in the classroom and during this time, a student fell off the roof of the school and was injured. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Joseph J. Peters be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Peters of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Manchester and Seconded by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 20) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns  
Cathye Flory  
Charles Froehlich  
Nancy Hollister

Stephanie Dodd  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Laura Kohler  
Charlotte McGuire  
Kara Morgan  
James Sheppard  
Tess Elshoff

Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

---

Aaron Ross, Professional Conduct Managing Attorney, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 21):

**21. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF PATRICK T. RHOMBERG**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Patrick T. Rhomberg holds a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS on October 1, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Patrick T. Rhomberg of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Rhomberg's 2018 conviction in the Franklin County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of resisting arrest; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Rhomberg that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Patrick T. Rhomberg did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Franklin County Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Columbus Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure*

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

*Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Patrick T. Rhomberg's three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 based upon Mr. Rhomberg's 2018 conviction in the Franklin County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of resisting arrest. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a), orders that Patrick T. Rhomberg be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after July 1, 2020, and that upon reapplication, he must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed at his own expense a drug/alcohol assessment by a licensed counselor who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education and, should the licensed counselor recommend any additional counseling and/or treatment, Mr. Rhomberg must successfully complete all recommended counseling and/or treatment prior to reapplying for a license, permit, or certificate with the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Rhomberg of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Bruns and Seconded by Ms. Woods that the above recommendation (Item 21) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

Aaron Ross, Professional Conduct Managing Attorney, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 22):

**22. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR LEAD PROFESSIONAL HIGH SCHOOL TEACHING LICENSE AND**

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

**FIVE-YEAR LEAD PROFESSIONAL CAREER TECHNICAL TEACHING  
LICENSE OF ADRIENNE R. SCHMIDT**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Adrienne R. Schmidt held a five-year lead professional high school teaching license issued in 2013 and a five-year lead professional career technical teaching license issued in 2013; and

WHEREAS on October 26, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Adrienne R. Schmidt of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year lead professional high school teaching license issued in 2013 and her five-year lead professional career technical teaching license issued in 2013 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Schmidt engaging in the following conduct that is incompetent, negligent or unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about the 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 school years, while employed as a teacher with the Warren County Career Center, Ms. Schmidt interacted with students in an inappropriate manner during class when Ms. Schmidt discussed suicide with the class and instructed students on the proper way to commit suicide so that they would not end up in a vegetative state, when Ms. Schmidt browsed Facebook during class while students were present and made comments about her personal life, including making fun of her family members, in addition to presenting inappropriate materials from her personal Facebook account to the students, when Ms. Schmidt made disparaging comments about her IEP students publicly to other staff and students, and when Ms. Schmidt used disparaging terms to describe students including, but not limited to, "slow," "stupid," "white trash," and "hoes."; during the 2014-2015 school year, Ms. Schmidt failed to supervise her students on a field trip to the Cincinnati Zoo; on or about the 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 school years, Ms. Schmidt failed to humanely care for the animals in her care at the Warren County Career Center including, but not limited to, neglecting to seek veterinary care for a rabbit with a torn eye, and she failed to meet the minimum qualifications required for her position; on or about September 18, 2015, Ms. Schmidt disclosed a student's learning disability to a classroom of students and staff members; on or about 2009-2015, Ms. Schmidt was disciplined by the Warren County Career Center when, on or about September 11, 2009, she received a written reprimand and a two-day suspension for falsification of mileage reimbursement documentation, when, on or about February 7, 2011, she received a one-day suspension and a conflict management meetings requirement for verbally abusing a student in the classroom, for disclosing confidential information about students to third parties, and for insubordination, and when, on or about September 8, 2015, she received a three-day suspension for an unprofessional email sent to a member of the public; and

WHEREAS Ms. Schmidt requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on June 26 and 27, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Schmidt was present at the hearing and was represented by counsel; and

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Schmidt's licenses be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Ms. Schmidt be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Schmidt engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when she made disparaging remarks to and about her students, divulged a student's learning disability to a classroom of students, discussed suicide with her students, accessed her Facebook account during class, in addition to her past disciplinary record; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation which Ms. Schmidt timely filed; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Adrienne R. Schmidt's five-year lead professional high school teaching license issued in 2013 and five-year lead professional career technical teaching license issued in 2013 based upon Ms. Schmidt engaging in the following conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about the 2014-2015 and 2015-2016 school years, while employed as a teacher with the Warren County Career Center, Ms. Schmidt interacted with students in an inappropriate manner during class when Ms. Schmidt discussed suicide with the class, when Ms. Schmidt browsed Facebook during class while students were present, and when Ms. Schmidt used disparaging terms to describe students; on or about September 18, 2015, Ms. Schmidt disclosed a student's learning disability to a classroom of students and staff members; on or about 2009-2015, Ms. Schmidt was disciplined by the Warren County Career Center when, on or about September 11, 2009, she received a written reprimand and a two-day suspension for falsification of mileage reimbursement documentation, when, on or about February 7, 2011, she received a one-day suspension and a conflict management meetings requirement for verbally abusing a student in the classroom, for disclosing confidential information about students to third parties, and for insubordination, and when, on or about September 8, 2015, she received a three-day suspension for an unprofessional email sent to a member of the public. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Adrienne R. Schmidt be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Schmidt of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister and Seconded by Mrs. Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 22) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.



Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Laura Kohler
Meryl Johnson	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

Aaron Ross, Professional Conduct Managing Attorney, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 23):

**23. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FOUR-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF DAVANZO L. TATE, SR.**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Davanzo L. Tate, Sr. holds a four-year educational aide permit issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on October 9, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Davanzo L. Tate, Sr. of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his four-year educational aide permit issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(a). The notice was based upon Mr. Tate's 2017 conviction in the Mahoning County Court of Common Pleas for one felony count of patient neglect based on an incident in which he hit about the body and threatened to kill a functionally impaired person for who Mr. Tate had the responsibility to care; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Tate that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his four-year educational aide permit issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS Davanzo L. Tate, Sr. did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS Davanzo L. Tate, Sr. did submit his contentions in writing; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Mahoning County Court of Common Pleas, certified police

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

records from the Youngstown Police Department, and certified records consisting of four videos from the Mahoning County Board of Developmental Disabilities; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered Mr. Tate's contentions in writing; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(a), hereby **REVOKES** Davanzo L. Tate, Sr.'s four-year educational aide permit issued in 2015 based upon Mr. Tate's 2017 conviction in the Mahoning County Court of Common Pleas for one felony count of patient neglect based on an incident in which he hit about the body and threatened to kill a functionally impaired person for who Mr. Tate had the responsibility to care. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Davanzo L. Tate, Sr. be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Tate of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 23) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

Mrs. Hollister presented the following recommendation (Item 24):

**24. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE A PARITY INCREASE TO THE ANNUAL COMPENSATION FOR THE DEPUTY SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION**

The Executive Committee hereby **ADOPTS** the following preamble and resolution:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3301.13, the Executive Committee reviewed the State Superintendent's request that Deputy Superintendent John Richard receive a two and three-quarter percent (2.75%) parity salary increase since all state employees were eligible to receive this increase.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Executive Committee recommends that the State Board of Education approve a two and three-quarter percent (2.75%) salary increase for the Deputy Superintendent, so that his compensation will be increased from \$163,987.20 (\$78.84/hour) to \$168,500.80 (\$81.01/hour), with the increase being effective on February 3, 2019.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 24) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

**YES VOTES**

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 25):

**25. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND TO DISAPPROVE CRESTWOOD LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT'S DETERMINATION OF IMPRACTICAL TRANSPORTATION AND PAYMENT IN LIEU OF TRANSPORTATION OF CERTAIN STUDENTS ATTENDING NOTRE DAME ELEMENTARY SCHOOL, GEAUGA COUNTY.**

# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code (“ORC”) Sections 3327.01 and 3327.02, Crestwood Local School District (“Crestwood LSD”) determined it is impractical to transport students from Crestwood LSD to Notre Dame Elementary School (“Notre Dame”), Geauga County;

A hearing was held on September 6, 2018, before a duly appointed hearing officer;

In his report, filed on or around October 22, 2018, hearing officer Philip King recommends the State Board of Education disapprove Crestwood LSD’s determination of impractical transportation and payment in lieu of transporting certain students attending Notre Dame;

Based on the evidence presented and factors set forth in ORC 3327.02, the hearing officer found Crestwood LSD’s arguments unpersuasive, and he determined the following: 1) Crestwood LSD failed to submit and conduct a cost analysis to determine the average cost per student aboard the Notre Dame bus; 2) Crestwood LSD is not currently in financial jeopardy and the savings from eliminating the bus route transporting to Notre Dame is insignificant compared to the unallocated cash balance held by Crestwood LSD; 3) After deeming the Notre Dame bus route impractical, Crestwood LSD continued to transport a similar number of students to another private school within the district and transport high school students who are not entitled to transportation; and 4) Crestwood LSD selected the \$250 amount because it was the minimum allowed by the state despite the fact parents would be required to pay \$1,400 yearly per student for Notre Dame to transport the students from Crestwood LSD to Notre Dame.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that upon consideration of the hearing officer’s report and recommendation and the relevant law, the State Board of Education hereby adopts the recommendation of the hearing officer and disapproves Crestwood Local School District’s payment in lieu of transporting certain students attending Notre Dame Elementary School for all the reasons set forth in the hearing officer’s report and recommendation; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to serve a true copy of this resolution on the petitioners, Crestwood Local School District, and counsel of record, if applicable.

It was Moved by Ms. Bruns and Seconded by Mrs. Dodd that the above recommendation (Item 25) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

## YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd  
Sarah Fowler  
Charlotte McGuire  
James Sheppard  
Tess Elshoff

Cathye Flory  
Nancy Hollister  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

## NO VOTES

Pat Bruns  
Linda Haycock  
Martha Manchester  
Kara Morgan

Charles Froehlich  
Laura Kohler  
Antoinette Miranda

## ABSTAIN

Meryl Johnson

Motion carried.

---

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 26):

### **26. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE LEARNING STANDARDS AND MODEL CURRICULUM IN COMPUTER SCIENCE**

The State Board of Education hereby **ADOPTS** the following preambles and resolutions:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) §3301.079 requires the State Board of Education to adopt statewide academic standards for each of grades kindergarten through twelve not later than December 31, 2018, that emphasize coherence, focus, essential knowledge, and rigor, as well as, reviewed relative to international standards and the model curriculum for instruction aligned to these standards for each of grades kindergarten through twelve;

The Department initiated the standards and model curriculum development process by using comments received from the two surveys conducted March 19 – April 6, 2018 (industry survey) and March 22 – April 11, 2018 (K-12 survey);

The Department convened standards and model curriculum writing teams consisting of 43 computer science educators to develop standards and model curriculum. Writing teams worked in grade band and topic specific groups from May 2018 through August 2018 to complete this work;

The Department facilitated the development process by then seeking public comment on the draft standards and model curriculum through public survey. The public comment survey was conducted July 16 – August 13, 2018 and resulted in 114 responses which allowed stakeholders to recommend revisions;

The standards advisory committee and working groups made up of representatives from Ohio educational organizations made recommended revisions and addressed issues of clarity, grade level appropriateness, content, and other comments raised through the public comment survey;

The model curriculum for computer science provides the following sections for each topic:

- Expectations for Learning; and
- Content Elaboration.

# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

At its November 2018 meeting, the Achievement and Graduation Requirements Committee recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the learning standards and model curriculum in computer science.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education hereby approves the adoption of the Ohio learning standards and model curriculum in computer science;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction is hereby authorized to publish these standards and model curriculum electronically or through other media as Ohio's learning standards in computer science and their accompanying forms and to make such revisions to form and style as may be determined necessary of a non-substantive nature, including grammatical and other technical matters;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that these standards shall become operational to inform district curriculum in the school year 2019-2020;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction shall make periodic reports on the implementation of Ohio's learning standards and model curriculum for computer science to the State Board of Education in order to inform its understanding of the transition to full operation of the standards; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction shall be authorized to inform all school districts, community schools, STEM schools and nonpublic schools of the adoption of these standards and model curriculum to provide such technical assistance and professional development possible to assist in the implementation of Ohio's learning standards and model curriculum in computer science.

It was Moved by Mrs. Dodd and Seconded by Mrs. Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 26) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

## YES VOTES

Pat Bruns  
Cathye Flory  
Linda Haycock  
Laura Kohler  
Charlotte McGuire  
Kara Morgan  
James Sheppard  
Tess Elshoff

Stephanie Dodd  
Charles Froehlich  
Nancy Hollister  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

## NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler

Meryl Johnson

Motion carried.

---

Mrs. Hollister presented the following recommendation (Item 27):

**27. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT OF THE CAREER-TECHNICAL PLANNING DISTRICT REPORT CARD WORKGROUP AND ADOPT CAREER-TECHNICAL PLANNING DISTRICT REPORT CARD UPDATES**

The State Board of Education **APPROVES** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

In July 2018, the State Board of Education adopted a Resolution delaying the implementation for one year of the overall grade for the Career-Technical Planning District (CTPD) report card while a stakeholder workgroup, including State Board members, reviewed the CTPD report card and made recommendations for updates and improvements;

In August, September and October 2018, the workgroup convened to review report card measures and components with representation from the required stakeholders in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 3302.033;

In November 2018, the workgroup concluded its work and submitted a set of recommendations to the Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee; and

On November 14, 2018, the Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the recommendations of the stakeholder workgroup.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education accepts the report of the Career-Technical Planning District Report Card Workgroup, provided as supporting materials dated November 2018, and approves the recommended changes to the CTPD report card, as detailed in supporting materials dated November 2018.

IT IS FURTHER RESOLVED, the State Board of Education approves the overall grade and the following graded components for inclusion on the Career-Technical Planning District report card: Achievement Component, Graduation Rate Component, Post-Program Outcomes Component, and Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component.

IT IS FURTHER RESOLVED, the State Board of Education approves implementation of the following changes to the Achievement Component:

- (1) Reporting the Performance Index for the 2018-2019 CTPD report card as a report-only measure, but not a graded measure until the 2019-2020 report card, understanding that the Performance Index will thereafter be used as a graded measure in place of the Indicators Met measure; and

## Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

- (2) Removing the Indicators Met measure as a graded measure starting with the 2018-2019 report card in preparation for Perkins V and ESSA academic requirements.

### **CAREER-TECHNICAL PLANNING DISTRICT REPORT CARD RECOMMENDED CHANGES NOVEMBER 2018**

The CTPD report card will include four graded components (Achievement, Graduation Rate, Post-Program Outcomes, and Career and Post-Secondary Readiness) and an overall grade.

#### **Achievement Component**

The Achievement Component will include two measures: Technical Skills and Performance Index. Both measures will be graded and when combined into the Achievement Component grade, Technical Skills will be weighted at 80 percent and Performance Index will be weighted at 20 percent.

- The Performance Index measure will include the performance results of all applicable end of course assessments for first-time test takers identified as concentrators (consistent with the 'concentrator' definition in the recently released requirements of Perkins V).
- The Technical Skill measure will remain as is currently on the CTPD report card.

#### **Graduation Rate Component**

The Graduation Rate Component will remain as is currently reported on the CTPD report card.

#### **Post-Program Outcomes Component**

The Post-Program Outcomes Component will remain as is currently reported on the CTPD report card.

#### **Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component**

The Career and Post-Secondary Readiness Component, previously known as the Prepared for Success Component, will expand the possible elements included in the calculation to better capture demonstrations of readiness by Career-Technical Education students. These elements were identified by the CTPD Report Card Workgroup and the Department is tasked with determining the implementation timeline of each new element.

#### **Overall Grade**

The four components Achievement, Career and Post-Secondary Readiness, Graduation Rate, and Post-Program Outcomes will be weighted equally at 25 percent for ease of public understanding.

#### **Report Card Reporting Structure**

While the CTPD report card will continue grading and reporting these components at the CTPD level, each district and community school shall receive a CTPD report card as applicable with relevant and available data.

#### **Federal Perkins Reporting**

The Federal Accountability Results will remain being reported on the CTPD report card.



# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 27) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

## YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

Motion carried.

---

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 28):

## **28. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION'S ELECTION OF A TEMPORARY CHAIR FOR THE JANUARY 2019 STATE BOARD MEETING**

The State Board of Education hereby elects the following person to serve as temporary chair for the January 2019 State Board meeting:

Stephanie Dodd

President Elshoff asked Board members if they approved of the process to appoint a temporary chair. There were no objections to the process.

President Elshoff opened the floor for nominations.

Ms. Johnson Moved the nomination for Dr. Antoinette Miranda. Dr. Miranda declined the nomination.

Dr. Miranda Moved the nomination for Stephanie Dodd. Mrs. Dodd accepted the nomination.

President Elshoff stated nominations would be closed barring any objections. There were no objections.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote for Board members to say the name of the candidate they were voting for.

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

STEPHANIE DODD

Pat Bruns  
Cathye Flory  
Charles Froehlich  
Nancy Hollister  
Laura Kohler  
Charlotte McGuire  
Kara Morgan  
James Sheppard  
Tess Elshoff

Stephanie Dodd  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Nick Owens  
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd received 17 votes and was elected as the temporary chair of the January 2019, State Board of Education meeting.

---

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 29):

**29. RESOLUTION TO AUTHORIZE THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION TO NEGOTIATE SETTLEMENT TERMS WITH MARKEATA A. LEE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Preambles and Resolution:

WHEREAS, Markeata A. Lee held a four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2015;

WHEREAS, on June 28, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Markeata A. Lee of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Lee's 2017 conviction in the Montgomery County Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after initially being charged with one misdemeanor count of domestic violence stemming from an incident in which Ms. Lee struck the victim in the head with a rock while his back was turned;

WHEREAS, the notice informed Ms. Lee that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2015;

WHEREAS, Markeata A. Lee did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code;

WHEREAS, on October 16, 2018, the State Board of Education revoked Ms. Lee's four-year resident educator adolescence to young adult teaching license and further prohibited Ms. Lee from reapplying for any license, permit, or certificate until on or after October 15, 2023;

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS, Ms. Lee appealed the State Board of Education's resolution on November 5, 2018 in the Montgomery County Court of Common Pleas;

WHEREAS, Ms. Lee has expressed a desire to settle her pending appeal with the State Board of Education;

WHEREAS the Department of Education is interested in resolving Ms. Lee's appeal through settlement.

NOW, THEREFORE, Be It RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(D), hereby **AUTHORIZES** the Superintendent of Public Instruction to negotiate settlement terms with Ms. Lee; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Lee of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 29) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

**YES VOTES**

Pat Bruns  
Cathye Flory  
Charles Froehlich  
Nancy Hollister  
Laura Kohler  
Charlotte McGuire  
Kara Morgan  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Nick Owens  
James Sheppard  
Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

---

**PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NONACTION ITEMS**

There was no Public Participation on Nonaction Items.

---

**Non-Resolutions**  
**Old Business**

Mrs. Hollister thanked Dr. Morgan and Mrs. Flory for their service on the Board.

# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 30):

Ms. Fowler requested Emergency Consideration for Item 30 to be voted on at this month's Board meeting. Board Leadership granted emergency consideration.

## **30. RESOLUTION TO REQUEST A FORMAL LEGAL OPINION REGARDING BOARD ELECTION ISSUES**

The State Board of Education ("State Board") **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

The State Board of Education was established by an amendment to the Ohio Constitution in November 1953. Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.07 then details the terms of the members of the State Board of Education. Specifically, ORC 3301.02(A) outlines the terms of the elected members and ORC 3301.02(C) outlines the terms of the appointed members.

In light of the numerous vacancies that will be occurring on the State Board of Education on December 31, 2018, and the upcoming organization meeting of the State Board in January 2019, which will involve the election of the President and Vice President of the State Board, there are questions regarding who is eligible to vote in such election

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board hereby approves submitting the request for a formal legal opinion from the Ohio Attorney General in the form attached as Exhibit A.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Ms. Woods that the above recommendation (Item 30) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

### NO VOTES

James Sheppard

Motion carried.

---

### New Business

# Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Mrs. Dodd provided a brief from the Education in Excellence Summit in Washington, which she attended.

---

## Once Around

Board members were encouraged to share with the rest of the Board, something positive occurring in their districts.

Mrs. Dodd raised the point of the January meeting of the Board and the discussion. President Elshoff requested a motion to reschedule the date for the January meeting of the Board in light of the Governor's inauguration on Monday, January 14, 2019.

Mrs. Dodd presented the following recommendation (Item 31):

**31. MOTION TO RESCHEDULE THE JANUARY 2019 MEETING DATES OF THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION**

Whereas, the 2019 Inauguration for Governor Mike DeWine is scheduled for January 14<sup>th</sup>, 2019, which is the same date as the regularly scheduled State Board of Education meeting; and

Therefore, it is resolved that the State Board of Education hereby reschedules the January 14<sup>th</sup> & 15<sup>th</sup>, 2019 State Board of Education meeting to January 15<sup>th</sup> & 16<sup>th</sup>, 2019.

It was Moved by Mrs. Dodd and Seconded by Ms. Johnson that the above recommendation (Item 31) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

## YES VOTES

Pat Bruns  
Cathye Flory  
Charles Froehlich  
Nancy Hollister  
Laura Kohler  
Charlotte McGuire  
Kara Morgan  
Eric Poklar  
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd  
Sarah Fowler  
Linda Haycock  
Meryl Johnson  
Martha Manchester  
Antoinette Miranda  
Nick Owens  
James Sheppard  
Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Minutes of the December 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Mrs. Flory Moved to adjourn the meeting. Mrs. McGuire Seconded the motion.

The President requested a voice vote.

Motion carried.

President Elshoff adjourned the meeting at 2:45 p.m. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Education is January 15-16, 2019.

ATTEST:



Tess Elshoff  
President  
State Board of Education



Paolo DeMaria  
Superintendent of Public Instruction

---

**Please note:** Copies of the attachments referenced in the Minutes may be obtained by contacting the Office of Board Relations at the Ohio Department of Education at (614) 728-2754.