

**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF OHIO
MINUTES**

July 2018
Ohio Department of Education
25 South Front Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215

MEMBERS OF THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Tess Elshoff	Joe Farmer
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	

EX OFFICIO MEMBERS

Senator Peggy Lehner	Representative Andrew Brenner
----------------------	-------------------------------

SECRETARY

Paolo DeMaria
Superintendent of Public Instruction

Mr. Farmer was absent on Tuesday. Mrs. Kohler was absent from the meeting.

The State Board convened on Monday, July 9, at the Ohio Department of Education in Columbus.

The Board's Educators & Student Options and Accountability & Continuous Improvement Committees met beginning at 8:30 a.m.

STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Elshoff convened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, November 13, at 8:36 a.m.

President Elshoff asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Joe Farmer	Cathye Flory

Minutes of the July 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

NOTE: Ms. Johnson entered the room after roll call.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

President Elshoff called on Vice President Hollister, who Moved that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion or compensation of a public employee or official; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the investigation of charges or complaints against a public employee, official, licensee, or regulated individual; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(3) for the purpose of conferring with legal counsel about matters that are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

Ms. Johnson Seconded the motion.

The President called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Joe Farmer
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

The Board went into Executive Session at 10:45 a.m.

The Board recessed from Executive Session at 11:20 a.m.

=====
The State Board recessed for lunch.
=====

RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Elshoff reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, July 9, at 12:30 p.m.

Ms. Bruns welcomed Board members and guests, and led the Board in the Pledge of Allegiance.

EDUCATION SPOTLIGHT

The State Board of Education's Education Spotlight program challenges board members to identify outstanding districts, schools, teachers and students in their state board districts and showcase them at monthly board meetings.

Presenter: Mrs. Carrie Barnett, Art Educator, Colerain High School, Adjunct Professor of Art Education, Miami University, President Elect, Ohio Art Education Association (OAEA).

Mrs. Barnett made a presentation to the Board entitled "The ABC's; The Arts Build Creativity...but that's not all".

REVIEW OF WRITTEN REPORTS AND ITEMS FOR VOTE

CONSENT AGENDA

1. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF WILLIAM C. BAILEY AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
2. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF JODY L. DASCO AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
3. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF TIFFANY M. EICHLER AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
4. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF ANN E. FRUEH AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
5. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE VOLUNTARY DENIAL AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL HIGH SCHOOL

TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION OF GLENN A. GREENE

6. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF SUSAN E. HAYASHI AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
7. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FOUR-YEAR ALTERNATIVE CAREER TECHNICAL WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT EDUCATOR LICENSE OF PAUL M. IKEHORN
8. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF CODY A. MACCOMBS AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
9. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF DOUGLAS B. SANDERS AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
10. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF ROBB A. SLUSSER AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
11. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF KURT J. WARD AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

ADMINISTRATIVE RULES

12. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-37-04 CHILD CARE PROGRAMS AND 3301-51-11 PRESCHOOL CHILDREN ELIGIBLE FOR SPECIAL EDUCATION (REQUEST FOR EMERGENCY FROM EDUCATORS & STUDENT OPTIONS COMMITTEE)

ITEM 12 HAD BEEN PULLED FROM THE VOTING AGENDA.

13. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO JON PETERSON SPECIAL NEEDS SCHOLARSHIP PROGRAM OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-101-01, 3301-101-02, 3301-101-04 THROUGH 09, AND 3301-101-11 THROUGH 13 AND ADOPT OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-101-03 AND 3301-101-10 (EDUCATORS & STUDENT OPTIONS COMMITTEE)

TERRITORY TRANSFERS

14. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE LITTLE MIAMI LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, WARREN COUNTY, TO THE LOVELAND CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT, HAMILTON COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.

ITEM 14 HAD BEEN PULLED FROM THE VOTING AGENDA.

15. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE MILFORD EXEMPTED VILLAGE SCHOOL DISTRICT, CLERMONT COUNTY, TO THE INDIAN HILL EXEMPTED VILLAGE SCHOOL DISTRICT, HAMILTON COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.

Items 16 through 21 were school personnel resolutions.

MISCELLANEOUS RESOLUTIONS

22. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE 2018 OHIO STANDARDS FOR PRINCIPALS (EDUCATORS & STUDENT OPTIONS COMMITTEE)
23. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE PROMOTION SCORE FOR THE THIRD GRADE ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS ASSESSMENT (EMERGENCY REQUEST FROM ACHIEVEMENT & GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS COMMITTEE)
24. RESOLUTION AMENDING IMPLEMENTATION TIMELINE OF AN OVERALL GRADE FOR CAREER TECHNICAL PLANNING DISTRICTS PURSUANT TO O.R.C. 3302.033 (ACCOUNTABILITY & CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE)
25. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CHANGES TO IMPROVE UNDERSTANDING AND USABILITY OF STATE REPORT CARD

REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

- Fiscal Year 2020-2021 Budget Development
- Superintendent Goals Discussion for 2018-2019

IMPACT TEAM DISCUSSION

The State Board Impact Teams; Wrap Around Services and How do we use Data met.

Minutes of the July 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

President Elshoff recessed the Board meeting at 3:40 p.m.

President Elshoff reconvened the meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, July 10, at 8:30 a.m.

The Board's Achievement & Graduation Requirements Committee met beginning at 8:30 a.m.

RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Elshoff reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, July 10, at 10:45 a.m.

President Elshoff asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Tess Elshoff	Cathye Flory
Sarah Fowler	Charles Froehlich
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
Eric Poklar	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	

NOTE: Mrs. Dodd, Mr. Poklar and Mr. Sheppard entered the room after roll call.

President Elshoff called for the approval of the Minutes of the June 2018 meeting. She asked if there were any corrections to the Minutes.

There were no corrections.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister and Seconded by Mrs. Flory that the Minutes be approved as presented. The President called for a voice vote.

Motion carried unanimously.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE EDUCATORS & STUDENT OPTIONS COMMITTEE

Chair: Joe Farmer, Vice Chair: Sarah Fowler

Ms. Fowler gave a report from the Educators & Student Options Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Superintendent Paolo DeMaria and Wendy Grove provided a brief update to Committee Members on proposed revised rules OAC 3301-37-04 Child Day-Care Program: Staff and OAC 3301-51-11 Preschool Children Eligible for Special Education. Supt. DeMaria noted these rules have been removed from the July voting agenda following a discussion with USDOE and receipt of additional comments from stakeholders. The Department will continue to engage with the field regarding these rules and return them to Committee for consideration at upcoming meetings.

Staff from the Office of Professional Conduct presented Committee Members with proposed revisions to OAC 3301-73 Professional Conduct Educator Rules & OAC 3301-20-01 Employment of Individuals with Criminal Convictions. The rules are being revised as part of the five-year rule review process. Following discussion, the Committee voted to recommend adoption of the rules by the Full Board. The Full Board will be asked to vote on their recommendation to adopt at its September 2018 meeting.

Committee Members were provided an overview of two proposed new Ohio Assessments for Educators (OAE) in the subjects of Gifted Education (OAE 053) and American Sign Language (OAE 050 & 051) and their associated qualifying scores as recommended by the Educator Standards Board. Following discussion, the Committee voted to recommend both exams and recommended qualifying scores for adoption by the Full Board at their September meeting.

Members also conducted their annual review of OAE examination passage rates. These data were also reviewed by the Educator Standards Board at their June 2018 meeting and made no recommendation for changes based on current passage rates. The Committee agreed that no changes are needed and will continue to review this data annually.

Department staff discussed with Committee Members the proposed revisions to OAC 3301-45 Adult High School Diplomas. These revised rules will be posted for public comment in the coming weeks. Board Members will be notified of their posting and will also be provided with a summary of comments following the close of the comment period.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ACCOUNTABILITY & CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE

Chair: Nancy Hollister, Vice Chair: Cathye Flory

Mrs. Hollister gave a report from the Accountability & Continuous Improvement Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Extended Workgroup Process – Facilitated by Nancy Hollister:

Mrs. Hollister opened the discussion regarding the report recommendations from the Report Card External Stakeholder Workgroup, she indicated that the workgroup will reconvene in October to continue discussion of the report card components. She shared with the committee that the CTE report card workgroup will convene in August to begin discussing updates to the Career Technical Education report card, Cathye Flory and Chuck Froehlich will participate in the CTE workgroup meetings as committee representatives. Pat Bruns made a motion to move the extended workgroup report card recommendations to full board for review and discussion, Chuck Froehlich seconded the motion. The committee voted in agreement and the motion carried.

Guest Presentation: Cleveland Metropolitan School District – Lorri Hobson (Director, Office of Attendance, CMSD) and Darryle Torbert (Vice President, Burges and Burges Strategists) were welcomed by Nancy Hollister and Brittany Miracle to the committee. Lorri and Darryle presented information on the attendance campaign run in Cleveland Metro schools to reduce chronic absenteeism. More information on their work can be found at www.get2schoolcleveland.com

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ACHIEVEMENT & GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS COMMITTEE

Chair: Laura Kohler, Vice Chair: Stephanie Dodd

Mrs. Dodd gave a report from the Achievement & Graduation Requirements Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Third Grade Reading Guarantee Promotion Score:

The committee continued to discuss the proposed Third Grade Reading Guarantee promotion score for the 2018-2019 school year. The committee voted to approve a resolution to adopt the promotion score of 682 for the 2018-2019 school year. The full board will consider emergency approval this month.

Ohio Learning Standards – Extended:

Staff provided a presentation on the draft Ohio Learning Standards – Extended. The committee voted to approve the resolution to adopt the Ohio Learning Standards - Extended. The full board vote is expected to occur in September.

Computer Science Standards and Model Curriculum:

Staff provided an update to the committee on the development of the Computer Science standards and model curriculum. The draft standards and model curriculum will be posted for public feedback later this month.

Graduation Requirements:

Staff provided updates regarding the Superintendent’s Advisory Committee for High School Graduation Requirements discussions and meetings.

State Testing Update:

Department staff provided a brief update on state testing.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE WRAP AROUND SERVICES WORKGROUP

Chair: Meryl Johnson

Ms. Johnson gave a report from the Wrap Around Services Workgroup meeting focusing on the following issues:

Team members shared updates around next steps from June meeting. Updates include:

- Board Member Johnson reached out to United Way of Greater Cleveland and is waiting for additional information regarding services provided by other regional United Ways in Ohio.
- Board Member Miranda shared that Hughes High School, Cincinnati City Schools partners with Children’s Hospital and provides full services five days a week. Board Member Miranda

is waiting to hear back from Principal Wright at Hughes High School regarding additional information.

- Board Member Owens shared that Manchester Local Schools, Adams County and Western Brown Local Schools, Brown County, both have school based health care partnerships. Western Brown partners with HealthSource. West Clermont also has a newly renovated middle which includes a school based clinic. Board Member Owen stated he will follow up with Western Brown Local Schools.

Board Member Owens shared with the impact team the School Based Health Care Toolkit from the Ohio Department of Education's website. Superintendent DeMaria shared information with the impact team around the School Based Health Care Network and the toolkit.

Next Steps include:

- Each Impact member will review the Toolkit on the Department's webpage <http://education.ohio.gov/Administrators/School-Based-Health-Care-Support-Toolkit>
- The Department will provide additional information about the healthcare provided in Springfield City Schools.
- The Department will see if there is a list of those school/districts providing wrap around services and provide identified schools or districts to the Impact team.
- The Department will provide the Impact Team with additional information about the different ways students, not covered for medical services, are covered in school based services.

Impact Team asks that the Ohio Facilities Construction Commission presents to the full Board to discuss how the work of the commission and how it collaborates with districts.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE HOW ARE WE USING DATA WORKGROUP

Chair: Dr. Kara Morgan

Dr. Morgan gave a report from the How Are We Using Date Workgroup meeting focusing on the following issues:

The Impact Team spent time looking deeply at the KRA, gathered information on how schools use report card and how they use local assessments, and were introduced to the potential ways that value-added data could be used by schools. The Impact Team is interested in having more time to investigate some of these issues in greater depth.

1. Locally-selected assessments are preferred for identifying gaps in curriculum and for identifying teacher professional development needs.
2. State Report Card data is used for comparison to other districts and other schools.
3. Some of the use of state assessment data is limited because it is only collected one time a year, so teachers cannot use it to measure progress over the year.
4. Some of the use of the state assessment data is limited because of the timing when the results are returned.

5. There are many ways that the schools and districts can use student-level value-added data to help plan courses, offerings, placements. We would like to learn more about this from the 36 regional data leads who have been trained by SAS, to help support item #9 below.
6. We would like to offer our support to the work of these 36 data leads and to help when we can in terms of improving understanding of the value-added measure.
7. There are several accountability triggers in the law related to report card data, and we would like to have more time to investigate and understand those to ensure the Board has all the need knowledge and information to make decisions on this issue.
8. It would be useful to have a matrix indicating what is required by federal law, by federal guidance, by state law, by Board policy and by Department policy. This information has been collected on the state report card as part of the work of the Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee. We would like to work with the Department to develop this information format.
9. We recommend that work be done to improve communication with teachers about value-add so that it can be more impactful for improving student learning.
10. We recommend that work be done to improve parent and community understanding of Value-added so they can start to see the potential value of state assessments for improving learning.
11. We request an estimate be developed of the resources used to plan, conduct and evaluate the state assessments. We realize there will be contract costs that will be relevant, as well as in-school costs that will be very difficult to estimate and are likely to vary greatly from district to district. We recommend that a methodology be developed so that this information can be collected regularly. This is a research need rather than an operational need.
12. We request that information on schools that have improved school climate be evaluated to determine what the impact has been on achievement and growth. This is a research question rather than an operational need.
13. We recommend that the work of this Impact Team continue to address and oversee the items underlined above, and the recommendations in items 9-12.

REPORT CARD DISCUSSION

Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee/ Report Card Review

Presenter: Chris Woolard, Senior Executive Director, Center for Accountability & Continuous Improvement

BACKGROUND:

The State Board of Education invited education stakeholders to participate in an expanded series of Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee meetings, as noted in Ohio's Strategic Plan for Education, to address short-term (2017-18 Report Card) and long-term (next iteration of the Report Card) issues surrounding the Ohio School Report Cards. The group reviewed each element of the report card including the federal ESSA requirements, state Ohio Revised Code requirements, state board authority and previously identified issues and options.

The group recognizes the value of the Report Card as part of the statewide accountability system. At the same time, it shares a belief that the current version needs improvement by means of additional clarity and providing a more complete story for each district and school.

Report Cards are very high profile and generate much interest from stakeholders across the state. Many ongoing discussions are occurring regarding the purpose and future of Ohio School report cards. Multiple legislative proposals have been presented to the General Assembly including work by Representative Mike Duffey (R- Worthington) who has actively participated in the work of this committee. Other groups including the Buckeye Association of School Administrators (BASA), Ohio Association for Gifted Children and the Fordham Institute have made recommendations that informed the work of this committee.

The desired outcome of the group is to collaboratively work on improving the Report Card in order to better communicate the story of Ohio's schools and districts by making recommendations to the State Board of Education's Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee. These recommendations could include Board actions through their direct authority and/or recommendations for future legislative change.

PURPOSES OF THE REPORT CARD:

Ohio School Report Cards are designed to meet multiple purposes. The group has identified these as the most important:

Support the state's interest in gauging its education system's performance: The state has a legitimate interest in knowing how well its education system performs, and the extent to which the students in the system are being prepared for future success. District and school report cards help the state to identify excellence as well as underperformance. In the latter case, report cards identify districts and schools that need support with improvement efforts.

Advance equity: Ensuring equity in the education system is challenging. A well-designed accountability system can help shine light on inequities based on specific student characteristics – socio-economic status, race/ethnicity, disability, English language competency, etc.

Communicate to parents and the community: Report cards can provide communities with information related to certain aspects of the preparation of students for future success. It should answer key questions:

- Are students, generally, learning foundational skills and knowledge?
- Are subgroups of students learning foundational skills and knowledge?
- Is the school or district improving in its fundamental mission to educate students?

Support school and district improvement efforts: Report cards can drive discussions among local boards, teachers and administrators about the causes of underperformance and the strategies and actions that can lead to improvement. The data included demonstrates to educators, school administrators and families where their schools are succeeding as well as areas where they need to improve. The data provided by the report card system, combined with important local data, becomes the basis for a continuous improvement process to build on areas of success and identify targeted plans to address challenges. There are many examples across the state where report card data has stimulated actions to be taken to improve education.

What report cards are not: Report cards are not meant to replace local data, but instead should complement local data sources. Report cards are annual, summative snapshots of performance and are not meant to be formative. Report Card data, including the corresponding diagnostic information, should inform ongoing instructional decisions, but are not intended to be the primary source of information used during the school year to make adjustments to instructional activity. Report cards are not intended to be punitive even though some people may use them in this manner.

DESIGN PRINCIPLES:

The group's work was guided by these design principles:

- Fair: Perhaps the most common complaint about report cards is whether they fairly portray the performance of the school or district. Report cards need to be fair.
- Honest: Report cards need to be able to honestly differentiate between schools and districts that are performing well and those that are not. They need to be an honest portrayal of what is happening.
- Reliable and Valid: Report cards should provide information that consistently measures the concepts intended to be measured.
- Clear and Easy to Understand: While the measures may be complex, the public facing communications should be clear, easy to understand, and simplified.

RECOMMENDATIONS:

It is in that context that this list of recommendations regarding the state report card is presented, as well a recommendation for additional work to be initiated soon.

ACHIEVEMENT:

The Indicators Met measure within the Achievement Component has inherent weaknesses (such as not differentiating between schools that are close to meeting or far from meeting a target).

1) Legislative recommendation: Therefore, the Achievement components should rely solely on the performance index. The Indicators Met measure should be eliminated as a graded measure. Data about the percentage of students performing proficient or better on state assessments should continue to be reported. For comparison purposes, reporting should also include similar districts and state level data.

K-3 LITERACY:

The Committee has determined that the current K-3 Literacy component is misleading. Report card users think it is a measure literacy performance for all K-3 students when in fact it is a complicated portrayal of efforts to improve outcomes for struggling readers. Some schools may have a small number of students struggling with literacy, while the vast majority of students are succeeding – but the current measure only reflects the struggling students. Making sense of this measure is very challenging.

1) Legislative recommendation: It is recommended that the K-3 Literacy measure be eliminated. If an early literacy measure continues to be included, it should be the Promotion Rate which measures the percentage of students meeting literacy requirements to be promoted to the fourth grade. This should include comparisons to similar districts and the state average.

2) Additional consideration: If the current measure is maintained, it should be renamed to more accurately reflect its focus on struggling readers; and the label of “Not Rated” should be reconsidered for clarity.

PREPARED FOR SUCCESS:

The committee believes the Prepared for Success measure has promise. Its current structure does not appropriately value different accomplishments. Its tiered structure adds confusion and makes debatable differentiations between various accomplishments. The group discussed several options to improve the Prepared for Success measure.

- 1) Legislative recommendation: The Prepared for Success measure should be refined to include additional measures of college, career and life preparedness (for example: military enlistment, ASVAB, CLEP, CTAG, career prep program credentials, Ohio Means Jobs Readiness Seal, etc.).
- 2) Board Recommendation: The Committee also recommends that the dual tier structure of Prepared for Success be restructured into a single tier that provides similar credit for all measures (for example, AP and College Credit Plus would have the same weight as remediation free status).
- 3) Board Recommendation: The above recommendations should apply to the Career Technical Planning District Report Card as well.

VALUE-ADDED:

The Committee recognizes the importance of growth measures in understanding the progress of students and supports its use as an important equity consideration. At the same time, measuring growth is complex and Ohio's current system has many challenges including how the measure is communicated, translated into a letter grade, and interrelated with other policies and systems (such as formative assessments).

- 1) Board Recommendation: The ACI Committee's Report Card Stakeholder Workgroup shall reconvene in October 2018 to further explore options for all identified themes related to value-added. See Appendix A.

A-F LETTER GRADES:

The Committee spent much time discussing the A-F letter grade system, which is the current system of meaningful differentiation of school and district performance required by state law and used to meet federal ESSA requirements.

- 1) Legislative recommendation: The committee recommends eliminating all A-F letter grades for the entire report card; and replacing the rating system with a system of descriptive labels (e.g. 'Exceeds Standards', 'Meets Standards', 'Approaching Standards' and 'Does Not Meet Standards'); while still maintaining high expectations and aspirational goals.

- The Committee recommends revisiting this issue in more detail when reconvening in the fall.

DESIGN & COMMUNICATIONS:

The committee extensively considered how the "report card" is presented. To some, the report card is the landing page (first screen) that appears on a computer screen when a school or district is selected on the Department's report card web page. Others consider the report card to include all pages of the report card PDF – in many cases in excess of 30 pages. Ultimately users need to be able to access both high level information as well as the background detail. However, the most important consideration is what appears on the first page. In all actions taken to improve the report card, the goal is for the first page to provide clarity of content and be understandable to parents, caregivers, and the community.

- 1) Department recommendations: The design could be improved by:
 - Adding more descriptive narrative on the purpose of the report card to the landing page (i.e. homepage);
 - Reviewing language to improve clarity; and ensure clear definitions and descriptions of measures are accessible up front;
 - Relocating the "District Profile" link to the Report Card overview for increased prominence;
 - Adding additional clarifying language regarding the graduation rate cohorts.

FUTURE CONSIDERATIONS:

The workgroup participated in a brainstorm activity with the purpose of generating ideas for future consideration to be addressed beginning in the fall of 2018. The following is a list of the ideas generated by the group:

- Reconvene this workgroup in October 2018 to further consider more complex issues around the Report Card
- Further explore opportunities to improve the value-added measure
- Further discuss the A-F system and other rating systems, including a review of descriptive labels used by other states.

The members of the Accountability and Continuous Improvement Report Card Workgroup, appreciate the opportunity to be part of this process to make a meaningful contribution to addressing the present challenge of the Ohio School Report Card.

Committee Members: Nancy Hollister, Chair Cathye Flory, Vice Chair Lisa Woods Pat Bruns Laura Kohler Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Charles Froehlich

External Committee Members: Randy Smith, OSBA Stephanie Starcher, BASA Scott Emery, OAESA Tyler Keener, OASSA Margie Toy Ma, OPTA Donna O'Connor, OEA Brad Dillman, OFT Jamey Palma, Career Tech Jan Osborn, ESC

APPENDIX A: VALUE-ADDED THEMES:

While clear recommendations have not yet emerged, several key themes have been identified for future discussion when the Committee reconvenes.

1) Testing structure. The Committee understands that the Value-Added system is exclusively dependent on the underlying assessments used. The Committee discussed the differences in intent and practice of formative assessment systems (such as MAP and STAR) and state assessments. In many cases, formative systems provide useful information that the current state system is not intended or designed to provide. At the same time, multiple testing structures lead to concerns about over-testing and incoherent feedback from the data. The committee is interested in exploring innovative approaches to formative assessments or state testing that may address these concerns. This could include working with formative assessment vendors to address state concerns on issues such as alignment with state standards and, in particular, the depth of knowledge required to meet state standards.

2) Formally studying the relationship between state and vendor test results. A related point is that state data and formative vendor data do not always produce consistent results, even though they are both supposedly aligned to state standards. The committee discussed possible reasons for this (breadth and depth, above grade level testing, etc.). However, it would be beneficial to more formally study and understand these relationships.

3) Distribution of results. While the committee discussed a general preference to eliminate all A-F letter grades (including Value-Added), concerns were also raised about the distribution of letter grades in the current system. Specifically, there are concerns regarding the “W” shaped distribution of results for Value-Added, that is, significant numbers of A’s and F’s, very few B’s and C’s, and a moderate amount of C’s. This issue was also raised during ESSA stakeholder feedback and reiterated by staff. This phenomenon is solely a function of where/how the letter grade cut lines are established – a policy that is prescribed in state law, but for which recommendations to adjust could be made.

4) Number of years of data. A related point, and one that had been raised during ESSA stakeholder engagement (particularly from urban districts) is the statutorily required use of three years of data.

The Value-Added grade is essentially a three-year average, which means that results from previous years influence current and future grades. Districts with poor results a few years ago are still connected to those results even if improvements have since occurred. This three-year approach was implemented to add more stability to the measure, but conversely means the measure is not necessarily reflective of the most recent year.

5) Relative weight of growth measure. Many measures, especially achievement measures, are correlated with socio-economic status. All students, regardless of their starting point, can show growth in Ohio's system and the Value-Added measures are designed to measure that growth – which is an important tool with which to evaluate the equity of educational outcomes. Many stakeholders have suggested increasing the relative weight of growth measures. Currently, it is equal to achievement (by state law), and 20% of the overall grade (by administrative rule).

6) Technical fixes. There are some technical options that could be considered including the following:

- a. How to communicate grades (ratings) when a school's achievement improves, but does not meet growth expectations.
- b. The current subgroup demotion when calculating the component grade. In state law, schools cannot receive an "A" for the Progress Component if any of the subgroup grades are lower than a "B".
- c. The interpretation of the Value-Added gain index, which is currently based on growth and a measure of statistical strength.
- d. The availability of a predictive model to support the system properly accounting for gifted students (e.g. how do middle school students count when they accelerate over a grade into Algebra I?) and assisting with acceleration decisions.

7) Communications. Measuring growth is inherently complex and there are known challenges to effectively communicating Value-Added measures. These range from branding, to interpretation, to understanding the formula. The communication challenges vary between different audiences – how value-added should be communicated to parents is different than how it should be communicated to Building Leadership Teams (BLTs).

8) Training and Professional Learning. Emphasis should also be placed on education and training on Value-Added data and measures. This could build on the current structure of Regional Data Leads (RDLs).

The State Board recessed for lunch.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON VOTING AGENDA ITEMS

There was no Public Participation on Action Items.

VOTING ON THE REPORT & RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

President Elshoff called on Superintendent DeMaria for his report and recommendations.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendations (Items 1-11) on the Consent Agenda:

- 1. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF WILLIAM C. BAILEY AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS William C. Bailey has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on June 11, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from William C. Bailey that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted based upon Mr. Bailey's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that William C. Bailey is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS William C. Bailey has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** William C. Bailey's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted based upon Mr. Bailey's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders William C. Bailey be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Bailey of this action.

2. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF JODY L. DASCO AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jody L. Dasco has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on June 18, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Jody L. Dasco that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted based upon Ms. Dasco's decision to not participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Jody L. Dasco is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Jody L. Dasco has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Jody L. Dasco's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted based upon Ms. Dasco's decision to not participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Jody L. Dasco be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Dasco of this action.

3. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF TIFFANY M. EICHLER AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Tiffany M. Eichler has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on June 14, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Tiffany M. Eichler that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted based upon Ms. Eichler's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Tiffany M. Eichler is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Tiffany M. Eichler has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Tiffany M. Eichler's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted based upon Ms. Eichler's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Tiffany M. Eichler be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Eichler of this action.

4. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF ANN E. FRUEH AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Ann E. Frueh has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on June 21, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Ann E. Frueh

that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted based upon Ms. Frueh's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Ann E. Frueh is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Ann E. Frueh has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Ann E. Frueh's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted based upon Ms. Frueh's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Ann E. Frueh be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Frueh of this action.

5. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE VOLUNTARY DENIAL AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL HIGH SCHOOL TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION OF GLENN A. GREENE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Glenn A. Greene has applied for a five-year professional high school teaching license; and

WHEREAS on June 8, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a voluntary denial form from Glenn A. Greene that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently denying his application for a five-year professional high school teaching license based upon Mr. Greene's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Glenn A. Greene is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Glenn A. Greene has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently denying his application for a five-year professional high school teaching license: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **DENIES** Glenn A. Greene's application for a five-year professional high school teaching license based upon Mr. Greene's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Glenn A. Greene be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and Be, It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Greene of this action.

6. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF SUSAN E. HAYASHI AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Susan E. Hayashi has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on June 11, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Susan E. Hayashi that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted based upon Ms. Hayashi's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Susan E. Hayashi is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Susan E. Hayashi has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Susan E. Hayashi's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that she has submitted based upon Ms. Hayashi's decision not to participate in any further

proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Susan E. Hayashi be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Hayashi of this action.

7. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FOUR-YEAR ALTERNATIVE CAREER TECHNICAL WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT EDUCATOR LICENSE OF PAUL M. IKEHORN

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Paul M. Ikehorn held a four-year alternative career technical workforce development educator license issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on June 6, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a voluntary surrender form from Paul M. Ikehorn that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking his four-year alternative career technical workforce development educator license issued in 2014 based upon Mr. Ikehorn's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Paul M. Ikehorn is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Paul M. Ikehorn has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking his four-year alternative career technical workforce development educator license issued in 2014: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Paul M. Ikehorn's four-year alternative career technical workforce development educator license issued in 2014 based upon Mr. Ikehorn's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Paul M. Ikehorn be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Ikehorn of this action.

8. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF CODY A. MACCOMBS

AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Cody A. Maccombs has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on May 15, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Cody A. Maccombs that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted based upon a plea bargain made on or about February 16, 2018 in the Athens County Municipal Court in case number 2018CR00284; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Cody A. Maccombs is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Cody A. Maccombs has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Cody A. Maccombs' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted based upon a plea bargain made on or about February 16, 2018 in the Athens County Municipal Court in case number 2018CR00284. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Cody A. Maccombs be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Maccombs of this action.

9. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF DOUGLAS B. SANDERS AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Douglas B. Sanders has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on June 6, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Douglas B. Sanders that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted based upon Mr. Sanders' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Douglas B. Sanders is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Douglas B. Sanders has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Douglas B. Sanders' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted based upon Mr. Sanders' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Douglas B. Sanders be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Sanders of this action.

10. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF ROBB A. SLUSSER AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Robb A. Slusser has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate, by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on May 25, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Robb A. Slusser that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates

and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted based upon Mr. Slusser's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Robb A. Slusser is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Robb A. Slusser has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Robb A. Slusser's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted based upon Mr. Slusser's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Robb A. Slusser be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Slusser of this action.

11. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES OF KURT J. WARD AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Kurt J. Ward has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on June 18, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Kurt J. Ward that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted based upon Mr. Ward's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Kurt J. Ward is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

Minutes of the July 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS Kurt J. Ward has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Kurt J. Ward's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate that he has submitted based upon Mr. Ward's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Kurt J. Ward be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Ward of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Mr. Froehlich that the Consent Agenda (Items 1-11) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Meryl Johnson
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
Tess Elshoff

Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Item 12 was pulled from the Voting Agenda.

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 13):

13. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT CHANGES TO OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-101-01, 3301-101-02, 3301-101-04 THROUGH 09, AND 3301-101-11 THROUGH 13 AND ADOPT OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-101-03 AND 3301-101-10

The State Board of Education hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preamble and Resolution:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3310.52 established the Jon Peterson Special Needs Scholarship Program. The program requires the Ohio Department of Education to annually pay a scholarship to eligible applicants for services provided by an alternative public provider or registered private provider for a qualified special education child;

ORC Section 3310.64 requires the State Board of Education (Board) to adopt rules prescribing procedures necessary to implement ORC Sections 3310.51 to 3310.63 including, but not limited to, procedures for parents to apply for scholarships, standards for registered private providers, and procedures for registration of private providers;

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) Chapter 3301-101 is being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review process;

OAC 3301-101-01, 3301-101-02, 3301-101-04 through 09, and 3301-101-11 through 13 are being amended to clarify the requirements of the program and to align with changes in the Ohio Revised Code;

OAC 3301-101-03 and 3301-101-10 are being rescinded because more than fifty percent of the rules are being amended, and the new rules, bearing the same numbers, are being adopted; and

The Educators and Student Options Committee recommended in its June 11, 2018 meeting that the Board adopt the changes to OAC 3301-101-01, 3301-101-02, 3301-101-04 through 09, and 3301-101-11 through 13 and rescind the existing OAC 3301-101-03 and 3301-101-10 and adopt new rules, bearing the same numbers.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board approves the adoption of OAC 3301-101-01, 3301-101-02, 3301-101-04 through 09, and 3301-101-11 through 13 in the form attached hereto and approves rescinding the existing OAC 3301-101-03 and 3301-101-10 and the adoption of new OAC 3301-101-03 and 3301-101-10 in the form attached hereto;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and he hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relates.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 13) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Cathye Flory
Sarah Fowler	Charles Froehlich
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

ABSTAIN

Stephanie Dodd

Motion carried.

Item 14 was pulled from the Voting Agenda.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 15):

15. **RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE MILFORD EXEMPTED VILLAGE SCHOOL DISTRICT, CLERMONT COUNTY, TO THE INDIAN HILL EXEMPTED VILLAGE SCHOOL DISTRICT, HAMILTON COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following resolution:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 3311.24, a petitioner that owns property currently located in Milford Exempted Village School District (Milford EVSD) has petitioned for the transfer of school district territory from the Milford EVSD, Clermont County, to the Indian Hill Exempted Village School District (Indian Hill EVSD), Hamilton County;

Petitioner has obtained the required 75% of signatures from the owners of the parcels located within the property proposed for transfer and has set forth several reasons for the transfer, including that all other residences located on the same street are in the Indian Hill EVSD and the Indian Hill EVSD' buildings are closer than the Milford EVSD buildings to the property proposed for transfer; and

All affected parties received an opportunity to request a hearing, but none of the parties requested one.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that upon consideration of the petition, all submitted documents, and the relevant law, the State Board of Education hereby approves the request for the transfer of territory from the Milford EVSD, Clermont County, to the Indian Hill EVSD, Hamilton County, for the reasons outlined in the petitioner's request; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to serve a true copy of this resolution on the petitioner, the Milford EVSD, Clermont County, the Indian Hill EVSD, Hamilton County, and counsel of record, if applicable.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Ms. Johnson that the above recommendation (Item 15) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 16):

- 16. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT OF THE HEARING OFFICER, TO AMEND AND RECONCILE THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, AND TO DENY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL PRINCIPAL LICENSE APPLICATION AND TO SUSPEND THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL ADOLESCENCE TO YOUNG ADULT TEACHING LICENSE AND FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL PUPIL SERVICES LICENSE OF JILL A. DERAMO**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jill A. DeRamo has applied for a five-year professional principal license and holds a five-year professional adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 and five-year professional pupil services license issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on January 17, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Jill A. DeRamo of its intent to

deny or permanently deny her application for a five-year professional principal license and whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year professional adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 and five-year professional pupil services license issued in 2014 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. DeRamo engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when on or about June 2014, after being notified by the West Branch Local School District of her new placement at the West Branch Middle School, Ms. DeRamo deleted electronic files from her office computer and network drive without authorization from the district, removed physical files from her office without authorization from the district, made unauthorized changes to her office equipment, and made unprofessional comments on her personal social media accounts related to her impending transfer; and

WHEREAS Ms. DeRamo requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on January 23-24, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. DeRamo was present at the hearing, and she was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. DeRamo's pending application be denied, that her five-year professional adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 and five-year professional pupil services license issued in 2014 be suspended for a period of two years, and that she be ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education for a period of two years, and that upon reapplication she must provide verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. DeRamo's conduct being unbecoming to the teaching profession and the totality of the facts, as reflected in the administrative record, showing that Ms. DeRamo's actions at the school were in retaliation of the school's decision to transfer her to the middle school and an attempt to make the transition to a new counselor at the high school more difficult; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation which Ms. DeRamo timely filed; and

WHEREAS Ms. DeRamo's five-year professional adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 and five-year professional pupil services license issued in 2014 will expire on June 30, 2019; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education must reconcile the hearing officer's recommendation to suspend Ms. DeRamo's teaching licenses for a total period of two years with the expiration of her licenses in 2019; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby DENIES Jill A. DeRamo's application for a five-year professional principal license and SUSPENDS Jill A. DeRamo's five-year professional adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 and five-year professional pupil services license issued in 2014 from July 10, 2018 through June 30, 2019, their expiration date. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-7322(A)(3)(a), orders that Jill A. DeRamo be ineligible to reapply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after July 10, 2020, and that prior to reapplication, Ms. DeRamo must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education and who determines that Ms. DeRamo is fit to return to the school community as an educator. The two-year disciplinary period is based upon Ms. DeRamo engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when on or about June 2014, after being notified by the West Branch Local School District of her new placement at the West Branch Middle School, Ms. DeRamo deleted electronic files from her office computer and network drive without authorization from the district, made unauthorized changes to her office equipment, and made unprofessional comments on her personal social media accounts related to her impending transfer; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education, on its behalf, to implement the aforementioned terms and conditions regarding Ms. DeRamo's licenses. Further, if said terms and conditions have not been fulfilled completely upon Ms. DeRamo applying for a new license, the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education to evaluate any new application in accordance with its orders and ensure all outstanding terms and conditions are addressed; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. DeRamo of this action.

It was Moved by Mr. Owens and Seconded by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 16) be approved.

Ms. Bruns Moved to Amend the resolution by substitution. She proposed the following resolution. Ms. Fowler Seconded the motion. Ms. Bruns spoke in support of Ms. DeRamo.

Ms. Fowler stated she did not find the evidence in the Hearing Officer's report to be compelling and consideration should be given to the school district's work record.

16. RESOLUTION TO MODIFY THE REPORT OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO LIMIT THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL PRINCIPAL LICENSE, FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL ADOLESCENCE TO YOUNG ADULT TEACHING LICENSE, AND FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL PUPIL SERVICES LICENSE OF JILL A. DERAMO

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jill A. DeRamo has applied for a five-year professional principal license and holds a five-year professional adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 and five-year professional pupil services license issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on January 17, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Jill A. DeRamo of its intent to deny or permanently deny her application for a five-year professional principal license and whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year professional adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 and five-year professional pupil services license issued in 2014 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. DeRamo engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when on or about June 2014, after being notified by the West Branch Local School District of her new placement at the West Branch Middle School, Ms. DeRamo deleted electronic files from her office computer and network drive without authorization from the district, removed physical files from her office without authorization from the district, made unauthorized changes to her office equipment, and made unprofessional comments on her personal social media accounts related to her impending transfer; and

WHEREAS Ms. DeRamo requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on January 23-24, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. DeRamo was present at the hearing, and she was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. DeRamo's pending application be denied, that her five-year professional adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 and five-year professional pupil services license issued in 2014 be suspended for a period of two years, and that she be ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education for a period of two years, and that upon reapplication she must provide verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. DeRamo's conduct being unbecoming to the teaching profession and the totality of the facts, as reflected in the administrative record, showing that Ms. DeRamo's actions at the school were in retaliation of the school's decision to transfer her to the middle school and an attempt to make the transition to a new counselor at the high school more difficult; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation which Ms. DeRamo timely filed; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education modifies the following portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation: reject the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet except for the portion that requires Ms. DeRamo to complete a fitness to teach evaluation; reject in its entirety Conclusion of Law and

Discussion numbered I in the hearing officer's report and recommendation; reject in its entirety the first full paragraph on page 26 of the hearing officer's report and recommendation which begins, "Upon considering both the aggravating and mitigating factors..."; and reject the Recommendation section of the hearing officer's report and recommendation except for the portion that requires Ms. DeRamo to complete a fitness to teach evaluation; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession; and

WHEREAS the State Board may determine that a penalty outside the range of the disciplinary guidelines listed in the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators* is more appropriate in an individual case based upon the aggravating and mitigating factors as outlined in Section 3301-73-21(B) of the Ohio Administrative Code and any other factors the State Board considers relevant; and

WHEREAS the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following mitigating factors: Ms. DeRamo has held an educator license since 2001 and she has no history of disciplinary action by the State Board of Education or any of her employing districts; Ms. DeRamo took responsibility for the posts she made on her social media account and expressed remorse for making them; witnesses at the hearing testified to Ms. DeRamo's good work record both before and after Ms. DeRamo's misconduct; Ms. DeRamo was described by witnesses at the hearing as a dedicated and hard-working employee; and Ms. DeRamo worked with school district personnel so all of the files deleted by Ms. DeRamo were recovered; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that a two-year suspension of Ms. DeRamo's license is not warranted based on the mitigation factors in this matter; and

WHEREAS, the State Board concludes that a more appropriate sanction in this matter is to require Ms. DeRamo to complete, at her own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation conduct by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who is pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education modifies the following portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation: reject the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet except for the portion that requires Ms. DeRamo to complete a fitness to teach evaluation; reject in its entirety Conclusion of Law and Discussion numbered I in the hearing officer's report and recommendation; reject in its entirety the first full paragraph on page 26 of the hearing officer's report and recommendation which begins, "Upon considering both the aggravating and mitigating factors..."; and reject the Recommendation section of the hearing officer's report and recommendation except for the portion that requires Ms. DeRamo to complete a fitness to teach evaluation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following mitigating factors: Ms. DeRamo has held an educator license since 2001 and she has no history of disciplinary action by the State Board of Education or any of her employing districts; Ms. DeRamo took responsibility for the posts she made on her social media account and expressed remorse for making them; witnesses at the hearing testified to Ms. DeRamo's good work record both before and after Ms. DeRamo's misconduct; Ms. DeRamo was described by witnesses at the hearing as a dedicated and hard-working employee; and Ms. DeRamo worked with school district personnel so all of the files deleted by Ms. DeRamo were recovered; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that a two-year suspension of Ms. DeRamo's license is not warranted based on the mitigation factors in this matter; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board concludes that a more appropriate sanction in this matter is to require Ms. DeRamo to complete, at her own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation conduct by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who is pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby ISSUES Jill A. DeRamo's application for a five-year professional principal license and LIMITS her five-year professional principal license, five-year professional adolescence to young adult teaching license issued in 2014 and five-year professional pupil services license issued in 2014 by requiring her to complete a fitness to teach evaluation. Prior to the first day that students in her employing district are required to attend school for the 2018-2019 school year, Ms. DeRamo must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education and who determines that Ms. DeRamo is fit to serve in the school community as an educator. This limitation is based upon Ms. DeRamo engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when on or about June 2014, after being notified by the West Branch Local School District of her new placement at the West Branch Middle School, Ms. DeRamo deleted electronic files from her office computer and network drive without authorization from the district, made unauthorized changes to her office equipment, and made unprofessional comments on her personal social media accounts related to her impending transfer; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education, on its behalf, to implement the aforementioned terms and conditions regarding Ms. DeRamo's licenses; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. DeRamo of this action.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

Minutes of the July 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

NO VOTES

Nick Owens

ABSTAIN

Charles Froehlich

Motion carried.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 17):

17. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FOUR-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF HOLLIE B. JOHNSON

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Hollie B. Johnson held a four-year educational aide permit issued in 2013; and

WHEREAS on September 7, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Hollie B. Johnson of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year educational aide permit issued in 2013 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Johnson engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when, on or about October 4, 2015, she

exchanged inappropriate alcohol and sexually related text messages with a student and, on or about October 2015, she failed to report to her administration that she received a text message with a picture of the student's genitalia; and

WHEREAS Ms. Johnson did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on March 8, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Johnson was not present at the hearing, nor was she represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Johnson's license be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Ms. Johnson be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Johnson's conduct being unbecoming to the teaching profession and her continued licensure would negatively impact the health, safety, and welfare of the school community because there is no evidence that she had taken or intends to take any steps to ensure that she will not exceed professional boundaries with a student again; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Hollie B. Johnson's four-year educational aide permit issued in 2013 based upon Ms. Johnson engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when, on or about October 4, 2015, she exchanged inappropriate alcohol and sexually related text messages with a student and, on or about October 2015, she failed to report to her administration that she received a text message with a picture of the student's genitalia. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Hollie B. Johnson be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Johnson of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 17) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich

Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock

Nancy Hollister
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens
Lisa Woods

Meryl Johnson
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 18):

18. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL HIGH SCHOOL TEACHING LICENSE OF MARK L. JONES

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Mark L. Jones holds a five-year professional high school teaching license issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on July 11, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Mark L. Jones of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year professional high school teaching license issued in 2014 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Jones engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when, on or about January 20, 2015 and January 28, 2015, while serving as a high school teacher in the Fairfield City School District, he instructed students to do poorly on a Student Learning Objective (SLO) pre-assessment test. Further, the notice included as an aggravating factor that on or about October 23, 2014, Mr. Jones was disciplined by the Fairfield City School District and given a verbal warning for not having lesson plans available for a substitute teacher and for slamming a golf club on a classroom desk and/or table while in the presence of students and then making a comment to the effect of, "I'm about to get pissed off."; and

WHEREAS Mr. Jones did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on April 4, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Jones was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Jones' license be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Mr. Jones be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Jones engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession when he deliberately instructed his students to do poorly on an SLO pre-assessment test in an effort to make himself

look better as a teacher at a time when he had already received a verbal warning for several incidents of misconduct and that continued licensure of an individual with so little regard for his role as an educator and such an absence of ethical integrity would negatively impact the health, safety, and welfare of the school community and/or the statewide education community; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Mark L. Jones' five-year professional high school teaching license issued in 2014 based upon Mr. Jones engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when, on or about January 20, 2015 and January 28, 2015, while serving as a high school teacher in the Fairfield City School District, he instructed students to do poorly on a Student Learning Objective (SLO) pre-assessment test. Pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-21(B), the State Board of Education further considers in aggravation that on or about October 23, 2014, Mr. Jones was disciplined by the Fairfield City School District and given a verbal warning for not having lesson plans available for a substitute teacher and for slamming a golf club on a classroom desk and/or table while in the presence of students and then making a comment to the effect of, "I'm about to get pissed off." Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Mark L. Jones be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Jones of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 18) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 19):

19. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL INTERVENTION SPECIALIST TEACHING LICENSE AND FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL SPECIAL ALL GRADES TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATIONS OF BRIAN N. LUEBKE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Brian N. Luebke has applied for a five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license and five-year professional special all grades teaching license; and

WHEREAS on August 29, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Brian N. Luebke of its intent to deny or permanently deny his applications for a five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license and five-year professional special all grades teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Luebke engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession while he was employed in the Centerville City School District: on or about December 3, 2015, in a group text message conversation to other football coaches, he sent two pictures of a student, one with the student in profile wearing only a shirt and underwear and one with the student wearing a swimsuit; on or about December 2015, he had the above-referenced pictures of the student on his school-owned laptop and/or his school email account; and on or about September through December 2015, he visited inappropriate websites, or allowed inappropriate websites to be visited, on his school-owned laptop, as demonstrated by a search history including, but not limited to, visits to craigslist listings such as "Well endowed figure model wanted," "Nude male model wanted," "Discreet Entertainers," "Hot Girls Wanted! Free Flight to New Jersey \$\$\$," "Now Casting: Young Grandmothers," "+size models," and "all females 18-35 \$\$\$." The notice also alleged that Mr. Luebke was negligent for having the two pictures of the student on his school-owned laptop and visiting inappropriate websites, or allowing inappropriate websites to be visited, on his school-owned laptop; and

WHEREAS Mr. Luebke requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on January 16-17, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Luebke was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Luebke's applications be denied. Further it is recommended that Mr. Luebke be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Luebke engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession when he texted inappropriate and suggestive photos of a minor student to other football coaches, maintained the pictures on his school-owned computer and/or email account, and conducted internet searches for non-

school, inappropriate, and suggestive websites on his school-provided computer; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation which Mr. Luebke timely filed; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Brian N. Luebke's applications for a five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license and five-year professional special all grades teaching license based upon Mr. Luebke engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession while he was employed in the Centerville City School District: on or about December 3, 2015, in a group text message conversation to other football coaches, he sent two pictures of a student, one with the student in profile wearing only a shirt and underwear and one with the student wearing a swimsuit; on or about December 2015, he had the above-referenced pictures of the student on his school-owned laptop and/or his school email account; and on or about September through December 2015, he visited inappropriate websites, or allowed inappropriate websites to be visited, on his school-owned laptop, as demonstrated by a search history including, but not limited to, visits to craigslist listings such as "Well endowed figure model wanted," "Nude male model wanted," "Discreet Entertainers," "Hot Girls Wanted! Free Flight to New Jersey \$\$\$," "Now Casting: Young Grandmothers," "+size models," and "all females 18-35 \$\$\$." The denial of Mr. Luebke's license is also based on Mr. Luebke's negligence for having the two pictures of the student on his school-owned laptop and visiting inappropriate websites, or allowing inappropriate websites to be visited, on his school-owned laptop. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Brian N. Luebke be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Luebke of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Manchester that the above recommendation (Item 19) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Martha Manchester

Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Charlotte McGuire

Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens
Lisa Woods

Kara Morgan
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 20):

20. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE HIGH SCHOOL TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION OF MICHAEL A. MAAG

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Michael A. Maag has applied for a one-year substitute high school teaching license; and

WHEREAS on September 15, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Michael A. Maag of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a one-year substitute high school teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Maag engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about May 23, 2016 while he was working at the Center for Autism and Dyslexia in Findlay, Ohio, when he had inappropriate contact with a student that included grabbing the seated student's arm, pulling the student forward in a forceful manner, and yelling or talking loudly directly into the student's face and, as a result, the student attempted to pull away from Mr. Maag and look away but Mr. Maag grabbed the student's head or face with his hand and roughly turned the student's face towards his face while continuing to yell or talk loudly to the student; and

WHEREAS Mr. Maag requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent, but his hearing request was not made in accordance with Ohio Revised Code 119.07; and

WHEREAS the Ohio Department of Education notified Mr. Maag by letter that it would not honor his hearing request because the request was not timely submitted; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on February 15, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Maag was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Maag's application be denied. Further, it is recommended that Mr. Maag be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon there being no evidence of rehabilitation in the

records and Mr. Maag's apology being so unremorseful that it could not be sent to the school or the student's parents; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Michael A. Maag's application for a one-year substitute high school teaching license based upon Mr. Maag engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about May 23, 2016 while he was working at the Center for Autism and Dyslexia in Findlay, Ohio, when he had inappropriate contact with a student that included grabbing the seated student's arm, pulling the student forward in a forceful manner, and yelling or talking loudly directly into the student's face and, as a result, the student attempted to pull away from Mr. Maag and look away but Mr. Maag grabbed the student's head or face with his hand and roughly turned the student's face towards his face while continuing to yell or talk loudly to the student. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Michael A. Maag be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Maag of this action.

It was Moved by Mr. Froehlich and Seconded by Ms. Woods that the above recommendation (Item 20) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Stephanie Dodd
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens
Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Cathye Flory

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 21):

21. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE GENERAL EDUCATION TEACHING LICENSE OF TIMOTHY E. SKUDLAREK

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Timothy E. Skudlarek held a one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on April 13, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Timothy E. Skudlarek of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Skudlarek engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when, on or about January 10, 2017, his Ohio Athletic Training license issued in 2011 was revoked by the Ohio Occupational Therapy, Physical Therapy, and Athletic Trainers Board after they found that from about February 2016 to April 2016, Mr. Skudlarek engaged in sexual conduct while providing athletic training services at Plymouth High School, he sent text messages of a sexual nature to a minor student, and the sexual conduct occurred in the course of his practice as an athletic trainer. Further, the notice was based upon the Virginia Department of Health Professions, on or about February 13, 2017, suspending Mr. Skudlarek's Virginia Athletic Training license based on the revocation of his Ohio Athletic Training license by the Ohio Occupational Therapy, Physical Therapy, and Athletic Trainers Board; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Skudlarek that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS Timothy E. Skudlarek did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, and certified records from the Ohio Occupational Therapy, Physical Therapy, and Athletic Trainers Board and the Virginia Department of Health Professions; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for

the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Timothy E. Skudlarek's one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2015 based upon Mr. Skudlarek engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when, on or about January 10, 2017, his Ohio Athletic Training license issued in 2011 was revoked by the Ohio Occupational Therapy, Physical Therapy, and Athletic Trainers Board after they found that from about February 2016 to April 2016, Mr. Skudlarek engaged in sexual conduct while providing athletic training services at Plymouth High School, he sent text messages of a sexual nature to a minor student, and the sexual conduct occurred in the course of his practice as an athletic trainer and further based upon the Virginia Department of Health Professions, on or about February 13, 2017, suspending Mr. Skudlarek's Virginia Athletic Training license based on the revocation of his Ohio Athletic Training license by the Ohio Occupational Therapy, Physical Therapy, and Athletic Trainers Board. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Timothy E. Skudlarek be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Skudlarek of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Mr. Froehlich that the above recommendation (Item 21) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 22):

22. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE 2018 OHIO STANDARDS FOR PRINCIPALS

Minutes of the July 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

The Educators and Student Options Committee **RECOMMENDS** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following preambles and Resolution:

Ohio Revised Code Section 3319.61 directs the Educator Standards Board to develop standards for principals that shall be aligned with the Interstate School Leaders Licensing Consortium (ISLLC) standards and reflect what principals are expected to know and be able to do at all stages of their careers;

The Educator Standards Board developed and the State Board of Education adopted the Ohio Standards for Principals in 2005;

The Interstate School Leaders Licensing Consortium (ISLLC) standards were updated to the Professional Standards for Educational Leaders (PSEL) in 2015;

The Ohio Department of Education worked in consultation with a school leadership stakeholder group consisting of representation for the chancellor of higher education, experts, principals employed in public schools, and representatives of stakeholder groups to update and revise the 2005 Ohio Standards for Principals in light of the 2015 Professional Standards for Educational Leaders during the 2017-2018 school year;

WHEREAS the Educator Standards Board reviewed the draft 2018 Ohio Standards for Principals proposed by this stakeholder group and were afforded opportunities to provide feedback on their development;

WHEREAS, at its June 2018 meeting, the Educator Standards Board recommended that the State Board of Education adopt the proposed 2018 Ohio Standards for Principals; and

WHEREAS the Educators and Student Options Committee of the State Board of Education reviewed and voted to recommend approval of the proposed 2018 Ohio Standards for Principals at its June 2018 meeting;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education hereby adopts the 2018 Ohio Standards for Principals in the form attached hereto.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 22) be approved.

Ms. Johnson Moved to Amend the resolution by substitution. She proposed that under Standard three: School Improvement, to change the word “working” to “teaching”. Mrs. Manchester Seconded the motion. She stated she felt the word “teaching” better related to students.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda

Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Meryl Johnson
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan

Nick Owens

Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Stephanie Dodd
Tess Elshoff

James Sheppard

ABSTAIN

Nancy Hollister

Motion carried.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Charles Froehlich
Nancy Hollister
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan
James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Mrs. Dodd presented the following recommendation (Item 23):

23. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE PROMOTION SCORE FOR THE THIRD GRADE ENGLISH LANGUAGE ARTS ASSESSMENT

The Achievement and Graduation Requirements Committee **RECOMMENDS** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following preambles and resolution and that emergency consideration be given for this resolution:

ORC §3301.0711(B)(1) requires the administration of the English language arts assessment prescribed under ORC §3301.0710(A)(1)(a) to all students in the third grade;

The levels of achievement for the third grade English language arts assessment are limited, basic, proficient, accelerated and advanced;

ORC §3301.0710(A)(3) requires the State Board of Education to determine and designate a level of achievement on the third grade English language arts assessment for a student to be promoted to the fourth grade; and

ORC §3301.0710(A)(3) requires the State Board of Education to adjust upward the level of achievement each year the third grade English language arts assessment is administered until the level is set equal to the proficient level of skill.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the State Board of Education hereby adopts the promotion score of 682, for the 2018-2019 school year for the third grade English language arts assessment, which is an increase from the 2017-2018 school year's promotion score of 672.

It was Moved by Mrs. Dodd that the above recommendation (Item 23) be approved.

Ms. Bruns spoke in opposition to the resolution and would not support it.

Ms. Johnson believed this was an unfunded mandate and would not support the resolution.

Mrs. McGuire Called the question. Mrs. Hollister Seconded the motion.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed resolution.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Tess Elshoff	

NO VOTES

Pat Bruns	Cathye Flory
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Lisa Woods	

Motion defeated.

Ms. Bruns Moved to reconsider Item 23. Ms. Woods Seconded the motion.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote to reconsider Item 23.

Minutes of the July 2018 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Mrs. Dodd Moved Amend the resolution by substitution. She proposed the State Board of Education adopt the promotion score of 677. Mr. Sheppard Seconded the motion.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Charles Froehlich
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler

Motion carried.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Mrs. Hollister presented the following recommendation (Item 24):

24. RESOLUTION AMENDING IMPLEMENTATION TIMELINE OF AN OVERALL GRADE FOR CAREER TECHNICAL PLANNING DISTRICTS PURSUANT TO O.R.C. 3302.033

The Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee **RECOMMENDS** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

Ohio Revised Code 3302.033 requires the State Board of Education to approve a report card for joint vocational school districts and other career-technical planning districts that are not joint vocational school districts;

The Board adopted a resolution in 2013 to report overall and component grades on the career technical education planning district report card in 2015 and beyond; and

In 2015, the Board adopted a resolution to delay the implementation of the overall grade until the 2018 report card in alignment with the release of the overall grade for the traditional school report cards; and

Since the Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee will convene a stakeholder workgroup to review and make recommendations to update the career-technical education report card starting in July 2018, the Committee is requesting that the State Board of Education further delay the implementation of the overall grade for the career technical planning districts.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Accountability and Continuous Improvement Committee hereby recommends that the State Board of Education delay the implementation of the overall grade for the career-technical education report cards while the workgroup is reviewing the career technical education planning district report card, with the understanding that the overall grade will then be included in the report card beginning with the 2018-2019 school year.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 24) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Sarah Fowler
Charles Froehlich	Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister	Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Kara Morgan
Nick Owens	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Ms. Woods presented the following recommendation (Item 25):

25. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CHANGES TO IMPROVE UNDERSTANDING AND USABILITY OF STATE REPORT CARD

Sponsored by Member Lisa Woods- 5th District

WHEREAS, the State Report Card continues to be criticized by school officials, teachers, administrators, parents, legislators, and the general public as an inaccurate measurement of true learning; WHEREAS, the State Report Card requires considerable resources to create and must be useful to those whom it was intended to inform as well as be a usable tool to track student and school performance; WHEREAS, listening to the feedback of the people of Ohio, educational constituency groups, and elected officials, they no longer have confidence in the Report Card as currently constituted, and must be replaced by a more trustworthy and proven performance measurement that properly reflects learning in Ohio's schools. THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED:

1. The Indicators Met measure within the Achievement Component has inherent weaknesses (such as not differentiating between schools that are close to meeting or far from meeting a target). Therefore the Indicators Met measure should be eliminated as a graded measure. The data should continue to be reported including comparisons to similar districts and state average.

*Additional Consideration: The Study Committee has expressed a preference for eliminating all letter grades for all measure – including the Performance Index.

2. The current K-3 literacy measure is misleading and should be improved. Therefore, it is recommended that the K-3 Literacy Improvement Measure be eliminated. If an early literacy measure continues to be included, it should be the Promotion Rate which measures the percentage of students meeting literacy requirements to be promoted to the fourth grade. This should include comparisons to similar districts and the state average.

*Additional Consideration: If the current measure is maintained, it should be renamed to more accurately reflect its focus on struggling readers.

3. The Prepared for Success measure should be refined to include additional measures of college, career, and life preparedness (for example: military enlistment, ASVAB, CLEP, CTAG, personal transition plans, career preparatory program credentials, Ohio Means Jobs Readiness Seal, enrollment in advanced training within six (6) months of graduation). This should apply to the Career Technical Planning District Report Card as well. It is recommended that the dual tier structure of Preparedness for Success be restructured into a single tier that provides similar credit for all measures (for example, AP and College Credit Plus would have the same weight as remediation free status).

4. The A-F all letter grades should be eliminated for the entire report card and replaced with more suitable descriptive identifiers such as:

- a. 90% to 100% – Most Effective
- b. 80% to 89% - Effective
- c. 70% to 79%- Average Effective
- d. 60% to 69%- Below Average and Ineffective
- e. 59% and lower- Ineffective and Deficient

5. Plain language identifiers should be established for all remaining categories of the Report Card, and applied.

6. The Value- Added Measurement has been criticized as not properly reflective of the intent of the Measurement. A study committee on Value Added that takes testimony from all Ohio public, both traditional and community schools, should be constituted, and make recommendations as to how to properly account for the measures. No outside consultant or current staff whom has previously reviewed this Measurement may be employed to make recommendations, to avoid institutional bias.

IT IS THEREFORE RESOLVED THAT THIS RESOLUTION BE THE OFFICIAL BOARD POLICY ON THIS SUBJECT, AND BE COMMUNICATED TO APPROPRIATE STATE OF OHIO OFFICIALS INCLUDING THE GOVERNOR, SPEAKER OF THE HOUSE, SENATE PRESIDENT, MINORITY LEADERSHIP OF THE HOUSE AND SENATE. THE BOARD SHALL INSTRUCT ITS STAFF TO AMPLIFY THIS RESOLUTION FOR THE BENEFIT OF THE GOVERNOR AND GENERAL ASSEMBLY AND MAKE STAFF AVAILABLE TO ASSIST THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY IN EFFORTS TO RECONSTITUTE THE STATE EDUCATIONAL REPORT CARD WITH THESE AGREED TO CHANGES.

It was Moved by Ms. Bruns and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 25) be approved.

Ms. Woods Moved to postpone Item 25 to the November meeting of the Board. Ms. Woods stated that while she appreciated what the work-group had accomplished, she was disappointed not to have been able to address the current school year and that window of opportunity had passed. Mrs. Hollister Seconded the motion.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns	Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory	Charles Froehlich
Linda Haycock	Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan	Nick Owens
James Sheppard	Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff	

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler

Motion carried.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-VOTING ITEMS

1) Representative Mike Duffy, Ohio House of Representatives. Representative Duffy spoke to the Board regarding Report Card Recommendations.

2) Mrs. Suzanne Palmer, President-elect, Ohio Association for Gifted Children, school district gifted coordinator. Mrs. Palmer spoke to the Board regarding Chart of Approved Test Instruments for Gifted Identification.

3) Ms. Colleen Boyle, President, Ohio Association for Gifted Children. Ms. Boyle provided written testimony to the Board regarding Chart of Approved Test Instruments for Gifted Identification.

Non-Resolutions
New Business

Ms. Flory stated she felt to many of the school personnel items were to permanently revoke licenses and would prefer other options as well.

Once Around

Board members were encouraged to share with the rest of the Board, something positive occurring in their districts.

Mrs. Hollister Moved to adjourn the meeting. Mrs. Flory Seconded the motion.

The President requested a voice vote.

Motion carried.

President Elshoff adjourned the meeting at 2:50 p.m. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Education is September 17-18, 2018. President Elshoff announced the September meeting of the Board had been pushed back one week to the 17th-18th.

ATTEST:



Tess Elshoff
President
State Board of Education



Paolo DeMaria
Superintendent of Public Instruction

Please note: Copies of the attachments referenced in the Minutes may be obtained by contacting the Office of Board Relations at the Ohio Department of Education at (614) 728-2754.