# STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF OHIO MINUTES

September 2018 Ohio Department of Education 25 South Front Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

#### MEMBERS OF THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Tess Elshoff Joe Farmer Cathve Flory Sarah Fowler Charles Froehlich Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Nick Owens Kara Morgan Eric Poklar James Sheppard

Lisa Woods

#### EX OFFICIO MEMBERS

Senator Peggy Lehner Representative Andrew Brenner

#### SECRETARY

Paolo DeMaria

Superintendent of Public Instruction

Mr. Farmer and Mr. Froehlich were absent from the meeting. Mr. Owens was absent on Tuesday.

The State Board convened on Monday, September 17, at the Ohio Department of Education in Columbus.

## **Chapter 119 Hearing**

September 17, 2018 8:30 a.m.

#### Hearing Regarding the Amending, Rescinding and Adoption of Rules

President Elshoff stated the Board would proceed with the public hearing on the following rule actions:

- The amendment of 3301-13-06: Scoring and reporting assessments
- The adoption of 3301-25-10: One-year instructional assistant permit; Renewal thereof

President Elshoff called on Hannah Stoneburner, from the Office of the Attorney General, Assistant Attorney General, Education section. Ms. Stoneburner called on Diane Lease, Chief Legal Counsel for the Ohio Department of Education.

Ms. Lease presented the following Board Exhibits:

- Board Exhibit 1 is the public notice that appears in the Register of Ohio and references the proposed rule actions subject to this hearing;
- Board Exhibits 2 and 3 would be true and accurate copies of the resolutions adopted by the State Board of Education regarding these rules,
- Board Exhibits 4 and 5 would be true and accurate copies of the rules as filed with the Joint Committee on Agency Rule Review (JCARR), Legislative Service Commission (LSC) and the Secretary of State.

Ms. Lease explained the rules had been made available to all persons affected by the rules.

President Elshoff stated that testimony would be received, either orally or in writing, for or against, the amendment of the rules that are under consideration. Anyone who wished to testify must complete the registration sheet. All testimony would be limited to no more than five minutes. If additional time is needed, consideration would be given to a reasonable extension. Any written testimony would be marked as Group Exhibit 6.

President Elshoff announced that the Board would now receive testimony on the proposed actions before the Board.

#### PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON THE PROPOSED RULE ACTIONS

There were no requests.

President Elshoff called on Ms. Stoneburner, who submitted into evidence State Board Exhibits 1 through 5.

President Elshoff stated that the exhibits were so received. As there was no more testimony, she declared the public hearing closed at 8: 35 a.m.

Following the Chapter 119 Hearing, The Board's Educators & Student Options and Accountability & Continuous Improvement Committees met beginning at 8:40 a.m.

#### STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Elshoff convened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, September 17, at 10:15 a.m.

President Elshoff asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan Nick Owens
Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

#### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

President Elshoff called on Vice President Hollister, who Moved that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion or compensation of a public employee or official; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the investigation of charges or complaints against a public employee, official, licensee, or regulated individual; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(3) for the purpose of conferring with legal counsel about matters that are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

Mrs. Kohler Seconded the motion.

The President called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan Nick Owens

Kara Morgan Nick Owens Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

The Board went into Executive Session at 10:15 a.m.

The Board recessed from Executive Session at 11:35 a.m.

The State Board recessed for lunch.

#### RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Elshoff reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, September 17, at 12:55 p.m.

Antoinette Miranda welcomed Board members and guests, and led the Board in the Pledge of Allegiance.

#### **EDUCATION SPOTLIGHT**

The State Board of Education's Education Spotlight program challenges board members to identify outstanding districts, schools, teachers and students in their state board districts and showcase them at monthly board meetings.

#### **DELAWARE AREA CAREER CENTER (DACC):**

Every student is different and will realize success in a variety of ways. Delaware Area Career Center (DACC) leadership knew this when they began a transformative redesign of their school. With a goal to create a dynamic and personalized learning environment tailored to the needs of each student, school officials had an exciting story to share with the State Board of Education as part of the Education Spotlight Award.

In response to the school's poor academic data and the realization that today's Generation Z students might benefit from a new model of learning, DACC didn't just add more remediation, more support or more intervention. Instead, DACC completed a total overhaul of their academic program and created a school that meets the needs of  $21^{\rm st}$  century learners. Their staff engaged in multiple book studies about blended learning and visited several schools with individualized learning opportunities, including Hilliard's Innovative Learning Center and High Tech High in San Diego. They reimagined a school with flexibility as its central tenant. Students at DACC enjoy flexibility in the spaces they learn, the pace at which they learn and the support they require from teachers.

DACC's academic space is modeled to have the look and feel of a coffee shop or college student union. Students have a variety of choices, from tables to couches to clustered seating. They can work independently or in groups as they tackle their coursework, which is available to them in a Google Classroom. Students follow a schedule with dedicated time in each class, but how teachers and students use that time is flexible and allows for a lot of creativity and innovation. Teachers can plan mandatory or optional mini lessons and labs, or co-teach to targeted groups of students or all students. They can also pull groups of students for remediation or enrichment and use a mobile white board to transform any space into instructional space. Students also have a lot of flexibility in how they tackle their coursework. If students complete their work, they are free to return to the commons to work on other subjects or seek help from another teacher. The teachers use a collaborative approach, so they can make connections across disciplines and provide basic help to students in any subject. Students like this model, with 98 percent reporting the blended model has been good or great for them.

In addition to increased general satisfaction with the approach, the model is working. DACC has seen a 71 percent decrease in math failures and a 62 percent decrease in ELA failures. These decreases are a direct result of the flexibility in their program, and 90 percent of the students reported they can get more support from teachers in this model.

DACC's model is meeting its goals and providing students with opportunities for deep learning and practical skills development in a truly 21st century environment.

#### REVIEW OF WRITTEN REPORTS AND ITEMS FOR VOTE

#### CONSENT AGENDA

- 1. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF COURTNEY R. ALFRED AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 2. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF DAVID L. ANGUS AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 3. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF SUSAN L. BATY-GRAHAM AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 4. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF KEVIN P. BROOKS AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 5. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MATTHEW A. CRAYCRAFT AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 6. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF ALEXIS M. CROSS AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

#### Consent Agenda continued

- 7. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MARY S. DAVIS AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 8. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF ZACHARY C. DEATON AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 9. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF DENNIS L. DELLIFIELD AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 10. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF SHELLIE L. DYE AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 11. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MELODY B. GELSONE AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 12. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF LISA M. KERR AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 13. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF ANNE M. LONGO AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE
- 14. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MARK J. MODARELLI AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

15. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF Samuel J. Tindall AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF his PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

#### ADMINISTRATIVE RULES

16. RESOLUTION REGARDING REVIEW OF PROFESSIONAL CONDUCT OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-73-01 THROUGH 27 AND 3301-20-01 (EDUCATORS & STUDENT OPTIONS COMMITTEE)

#### TERRITORY TRANSFERS

- 17. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE CENTERBURG LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, KNOX COUNTY, TO THE BIG WALNUT LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, DELAWARE COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.
- 18. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND TO DISAPPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE ADENA LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, ROSS COUNTY, TO THE WESTFALL LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, PICKAWAY COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.
- 19. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND DISAPPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE EVERGREEN LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, FULTON COUNTY, TO THE SYLVANIA CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT, LUCAS COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.

Items 20 through 35 were school personnel resolutions.

#### MISCELLANEOUS RESOLUTIONS

- 36. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND TO APPROVE THE INDIAN HILL EXEMPTED VILLAGE SCHOOL DISTRICT'S DETERMINATION OF IMPRACTICAL TRANSPORTATION AND PAYMENT IN LIEU OF TRANSPORTATION OF A STUDENT ATTENDING ST. MARY'S SCHOOL, HAMILTON COUNTY
- 37. RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND THE ADOPTION OF THE ASSESSMENT AND QUALIFYING SCORE FOR THE INTERVENTION SPECIALIST GIFTED LICENSE AND GIFTED INTERVENTION SPECIALIST ENDORSEMENT (OAE 053) LICENSURE EXAM (EDUCATORS & STUDENT OPTIONS COMMITTEE)
- 38. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE ASSESSMENT AND QUALIFYING SCORE FOR THE MULTI-AGE AMERICAN SIGN LANGUAGE SUBTESTS (OAE 050/051) LICENSURE EXAM (EDUCATORS & STUDENT OPTIONS COMMITTEE)
- 39. RESOLUTION APPOINTING MEMBER TO THE EDUCATOR STANDARDS BOARD
- 40. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE OHIO LEARNING STANDARDS EXTENDED

(ACHIEVEMENT & GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS COMMITTEE)

- 41. RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND ADOPTION OF THE STATE SUPERINTENDENT GOALS (EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE)
- 42. RESOLUTION ON THE ANNUAL EVALUATION AND COMPENSATION FOR THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION (EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE)

#### REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

- Report Card Presentation
- Budget Discussion

Mrs. McGuire Moved to recess the meeting. Mrs. Flory Seconded the motion.

The President requested a voice vote.

Motion carried.

President Elshoff recessed the Board meeting at 4:35 p.m.

# IMPACT TEAM DISCUSSION

Following the Board meeting, the State Board Impact Teams; Wrap Around Services and How do we use Data met.

President Elshoff reconvened the meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, September 18, at 8:30 a.m.

The Board's Achievement & Graduation Requirements Committee met beginning at 8:30 a.m.

#### RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Elshoff reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, September 18, at 10:45 a.m.

President Elshoff asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

#### MEMBERS PRESENT

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Tess Elshoff Cathye Flory
Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda
Kara Morgan Eric Poklar

President Elshoff called for the approval of the Minutes of the July 2018 meeting. She asked if there were any corrections to the Minutes.

Lisa Woods

There were no corrections.

James Sheppard

It was Moved by Mrs. Flory and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the Minutes be approved as presented. The President called for a voice vote.

Motion carried unanimously.

# BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

Chair: Tess Elshoff, Vice Chair: Nancy Hollister

Mrs. Hollister gave a report from the Executive Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

#### July 18, 2018:

- Committee Members discussed Superintendent Paolo DeMaria's evaluation process and the results of the Board's evaluation. After reviewing the results, the Executive Committee recommended a 2.75% salary increase that most State of Ohio employees receive and a bonus of \$20,000. The Executive Committee recommends the State Board's approve the 2.75% salary increase and a bonus of \$20,000.
- Committee Members discussed Superintendent Paolo DeMaria's 2018-2019 goals. Superintendent DeMaria joined the discussion and answered questions the committee members had. The committee recommends the State Board approve the 2018-2019 goals for the State Superintendent.

# BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE EDUCATORS & STUDENT OPTIONS COMMITTEE

Chair: Joe Farmer, Vice Chair: Sarah Fowler Ms. Fowler gave a report from the Educators & Student Options Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

- Diane Lease, Chief Legal Counsel, discussed with Committee Members the proposed rescission of OAC 3301-57-01 Administering the In-Service Training Program. The rule is being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review process. Following discussion, the Committee voted to recommend rescission of the rule to the State Board. The State Board will be asked to vote on this recommendation at its October 2018 meeting.
- Colleen Grady, Executive Director, School Options, discussed with Committee Members the
  proposed rescission of OAC 3301-102-01 Purpose (Community School Rules). The rule is
  being reviewed as part of the five-year rule review process. Following discussion, the
  Committee voted to recommend rescission of the rule to the State Board. The State Board
  will be asked to vote on this recommendation at its October 2018 meeting.
- Colleen Grady, Executive Director, Unit for School Options, presented to Committee
  Members proposed revisions to OAC 3301-102-09 Approving Applications for New Internetor Computer-Based Community Schools (Community School Rules). The rule is being
  reviewed as part of the five-year rule review process. Following discussion with Department
  staff, members agreed by consensus to move a possible vote on the revised rule to the
  October 2018 committee meeting.

# BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ACCOUNTABILITY & CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE

Chair: Nancy Hollister, Vice Chair: Cathye Flory

Mrs. Hollister gave a report from the Accountability & Continuous Improvement Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

### Report Card Stakeholder Work Group Update - Facilitated by Chris Woolard:

Mr. Woolard opened the discussion with an update regarding the CTPD report card workgroup, he shared with committee members that the group has met four times and have two meetings left before a draft of final recommendations will be complete.

Mr. Woolard also provided an update regarding the External Report Card Stakeholder workgroup that will reconvene in late September or early October to continue discussion on the report card components. The external stakeholder workgroup will hold three meetings to discuss at length the VA and overall grade components of the report card. The outcome of these meetings will be to formulate recommendations to move to the full board for review and discussion.

#### Arts Education Data Dashboard - Facilitated by Scott Wilson and Heather Boughton:

Mr. Wilson shared with the committee that the Ohio Arts Education Data Project: purpose is to provide a snapshot and direction of arts education. by using the Ohio Arts education data, districts can make informed decisions about course offerings, it can help determine where increased exposure to arts education may be needed and identify where arts enrollment is growing. Ohio is the fifth state to join the nationwide project. Heather provided a tutorial of the Arts Education Data Dashboard.

#### Ohio's Evidence -Based Clearing House, Facilitated by Heather Boughton:

Ms. Boughton provided a tutorial of Ohio's Evidence-Based Clearinghouse.

# BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ACHIEVEMENT & GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS COMMITTEE

Chair: Laura Kohler, Vice Chair: Stephanie Dodd

Mrs. Kohler gave a report from the Achievement & Graduation Requirements Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

#### **Graduation Requirements:**

Staff provided updates regarding the Superintendent's Advisory Committee for High School Graduation Requirements discussions and meetings. The committee discussed the graduation requirements for future cohorts. Additionally, staff shared the results of the 2018 graduation options survey, as well as the timeline for sharing graduation data for graduating cohorts 2018, 2019 and 2020. Committee members are excited about the proposed graduation requirements, there are concerns regarding the GPA options and consolidation of some learning domains. The committee will further discuss in October. Vice Chair, Stephanie Dodd introduced a resolution regarding graduation requirements. The resolution included adjustments that the state board has authority to make including the cumulative performance level (18pts), minimum scores for content areas, as well as WorkKeys cut score. She did not ask the committee for a vote on the resolution this month but requested the committee discuss this as an option in the event the General Assembly does not take action to extend the HB49 options to the class of 2019. Staff indicated they would provide data next month to inform the committee discussion of this resolution.

#### Computer Science Standards and Model Curriculum:

Staff provided an update to the committee on the development of the Computer Science standards and model curriculum including information on the public comments received on the draft standards and model curriculum. The draft standards and model curriculum will be presented to the committee in October.

#### Social and Emotional Learning Standards:

Staff provided an update on the development of the Social and Emotional learning standards.

#### Standards and Model Curriculum Update:

Staff provided a brief update on the model curriculum for science, social studies and financial literacy and the revision process for fine arts and world languages.

#### **State Testing Update:**

Department staff introduced Lisa Chandler, the new Director of the Office of Assessment.

# BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE WRAP AROUND SERVICES WORKGROUP

Chair: Meryl Johnson

Ms. Johnson gave a report from the Wrap Around Services Workgroup meeting focusing on the following issues:

Board Member Johnson shared an article entitled "Reinventing School Healthcare" from the August Ohio School Boards Association (OSBA) journal. Ms. Johnson gave an overview of the article and members discussed the article information.

Board Member Johnson shared an article entitled "Do Community Schools and wraparound services boost academic? Here's what we know". Board Miranda gave an overview of the article and members discussed the article information.

# BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE HOW ARE WE USING DATA WORKGROUP

Chair: Dr. Kara Morgan

Dr. Morgan gave a report from the How Are We Using Date Workgroup meeting focusing on the following issues:

### PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON ACTION ITEMS

There was no Public Participation on Action Items.

The State Board recessed for lunch.

# VOTING ON THE REPORT & RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

President Elshoff called on Superintendent DeMaria for his report and recommendations.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendations (Items 1-15) on the Consent Agenda:

1. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER
TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD
LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF COURTNEY R. ALFRED
AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS
FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Courtney R. Alfred has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on July 27, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Courtney R. Alfred that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Alfred's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Courtney R. Alfred is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Courtney R. Alfred has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of her pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Courtney R. Alfred's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Alfred's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Courtney R. Alfred be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Alfred of this action.

2. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF DAVID L. ANGUS AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS David L. Angus has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on June 25, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from David L. Angus that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Angus' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that David L. Angus is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS David L. Angus has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of his pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** David L. Angus' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Angus' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders David L. Angus be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Angus of this action.

3. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF SUSAN L. BATY-GRAHAM AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Susan L. Baty-Graham has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 3, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Susan L. Baty-Graham that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Baty-Graham's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Susan L. Baty-Graham is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Susan L. Baty-Graham has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of her pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Susan L. Baty-Graham's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Baty-Graham's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule

3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Susan L. Baty-Graham be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Baty-Graham of this action.

4. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF KEVIN P. BROOKS AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Kevin P. Brooks has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on July 18, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Kevin P. Brooks that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Brooks' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Kevin P. Brooks is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Kevin P. Brooks has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of his pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Kevin P. Brooks' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Brooks' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Kevin P. Brooks be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Brooks of this action.

5. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER
TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD
LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MATTHEW A.
CRAYCRAFT AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING
APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Matthew A. Craycraft has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on July 17, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Matthew A. Craycraft that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Craycraft's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Matthew A. Craycraft is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Matthew A. Craycraft has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of his pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Matthew A. Craycraft's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Craycraft's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Matthew A. Craycraft be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Craycraft of this action.

6. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER
TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD
LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF ALEXIS M. CROSS AND
TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR
A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Alexis M. Cross has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on July 27, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Alexis M. Cross that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Cross' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Alexis M. Cross is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Alexis M. Cross has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of her pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Alexis M. Cross' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Cross' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Alexis M. Cross be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Cross of this action.

7. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MARY S. DAVIS AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Mary S. Davis has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 3, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Mary S. Davis that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a

license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Davis' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Mary S. Davis is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Mary S. Davis has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of her pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Mary S. Davis' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Davis' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Mary S. Davis be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Davis of this action.

8. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF ZACHARY C. DEATON AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Zachary C. Deaton has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on July 5, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Zachary C. Deaton that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Deaton's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Zachary C. Deaton is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Zachary C. Deaton has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of his pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Zachary C. Deaton's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Deaton's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Zachary C. Deaton be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Deaton of this action.

9. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF DENNIS L. DELLIFIELD AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Dennis L. Dellifield has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 6, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Dennis L. Dellifield that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Dellifield's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Dennis L. Dellifield is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Dennis L. Dellifield has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of his pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Dennis L. Dellifield's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or

certificate based upon Mr. Dellifield's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Dennis L. Dellifield be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Dellifield of this action.

10. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER
TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD
LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF SHELLIE L. DYE AND
TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR
A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Shellie L. Dye has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 2, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Shellie L. Dye that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Dye's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Shellie L. Dye is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Shellie L. Dye has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of her pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Shellie L. Dye's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Dye's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Shellie L. Dye be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Dye of this action.

11. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER
TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD
LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MELODY B. GELSONE
AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS
FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Melody B. Gelsone has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on July 5, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Melody B. Gelsone that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Gelsone's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Melody B. Gelsone is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Melody B. Gelsone has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of her pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Melody B. Gelsone's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Gelsone's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Melody B. Gelsone be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Gelsone of this action.

12. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER
TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD
LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF LISA M. KERR AND TO

# DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Lisa M. Kerr has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 6, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Lisa M. Kerr that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Kerr's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Lisa M. Kerr is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Lisa M. Kerr has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of her pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Lisa M. Kerr's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Kerr's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Lisa M. Kerr be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Kerr of this action.

13. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY
SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER
TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD
LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF ANNE M. LONGO AND
TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR
A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Anne M. Longo has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on July 12, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Anne M. Longo that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Longo's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Anne M. Longo is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Anne M. Longo has waived her right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of her pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Anne M. Longo's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Longo's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Anne M. Longo be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Longo of this action.

14. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF MARK J. MODARELLI AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Mark J. Modarelli has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on July 27, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Mark J. Modarelli that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Modarelli's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311 as he does not currently reside or work in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Mark J. Modarelli is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Mark J. Modarelli has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of his pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Mark J. Modarelli's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Modarelli's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311 as he does not currently reside or work in the state of Ohio. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Mark J. Modarelli be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Modarelli of this action.

15. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES OF SAMUEL J. TINDALL AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Samuel J. Tindall has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on August 6, 2018, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Samuel J. Tindall that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Tindall's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Samuel J. Tindall is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Samuel J. Tindall has waived his right to a hearing and authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any of his pending applications for a license, permit, or certificate: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Samuel J. Tindall's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Tindall's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Samuel J. Tindall be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Tindall of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Ms. Bruns that the Consent Agenda (Items 1-15) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan Eric Poklar James Sheppard Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 16):

# 16. RESOLUTION REGARDING REVIEW OF PROFESSIONAL CONDUCT OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULES 3301-73-01 THROUGH 27 AND 3301-20-01

The State Board of Education ("Board") hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolution:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.07 allows the Board to adopt rules necessary for carrying out any function imposed on it by law;

ORC Section 3319.31 allows the Board to adopt rules to carry out the duties set forth in that section regarding refusal to issue, suspension, revocations, or limitations of licenses;

ORC Section 3319.311 allows the Board to adopt rules to govern the superintendent's action under that section regarding investigations;

Staff is recommending changes to Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-73-02, 3301-73-03, 3301-73-06, 3301-73-10, 3301-73-13, 3301-73-21 through 25, 3301-73-27 and 3301-20-01;

Staff is recommending that existing OAC 3301-73-26 be rescinded and a new OAC 3301-73-26 be approved and proposed for adoption; and

Staff recommends no changes to OAC 3301-73-01, 3301-73-04, 3301-73-05, 3301-73-07 through 09, 3301-73-11, 3301-73-12, and 3301-73-14 through 20.

The Educators and Student Options Committee recommended in its July 11, 2018 meeting that the Board approve the amendments to OAC 3301-73-02, 3301-73-03, 3301-73-06, 3301-73-10, 3301-73-13, 3301-73-21 through 25, 3301-73-27 and 3301-20-01 in the form presented to the Committee, the rescission and adoption of OAC 3301-73-26 in the form presented to the Committee, and the no changes to OAC 3301-73-01, 3301-73-04, 3301-73-05, 3301-73-07 through 09, 3301-73-11, 3301-73-12, and 3301-73-14 through 20.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board approves the amendments to OAC 3301-73-02, 3301-73-03, 3301-73-06, 3301-73-10, 3301-73-13, 3301-73-21 through 25, 3301-73-27 and 3301-20-01 in the form presented to the Board for the September 2018 Board meeting, the rescission and adoption of OAC 3301-73-26 in the form presented to the Board for the September 2018 Board Meeting, and the no changes to OAC 3301-73-01, 3301-73-04, 3301-73-05, 3301-73-07 through 09, 3301-73-11, 3301-73-12, and 3301-73-14 through 20;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and he hereby is, directed to file the rules with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rules; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rules; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rules relates.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 16) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard

Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 17):

17. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE CENTERBURG LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, KNOX COUNTY, TO THE BIG WALNUT LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, DELAWARE COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following preambles and resolutions:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 3311.24, a petitioner that owns property currently located in Centerburg Local School District (Centerburg LSD) has petitioned for the transfer of school district territory from the Centerburg LSD, Knox County, to the Big Walnut Local School District (Big Walnut LSD), Delaware County;

Petitioner has obtained the required 75% of signatures from the owners of the parcels located within the property proposed for transfer and have set forth several reasons for the transfer, including that Big Walnut LSD has more course offerings than Centerburg LSD; and

All affected parties received an opportunity to request a hearing, but none of the parties requested one.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that upon consideration of the petition, all submitted documents, and the relevant law, the State Board of Education hereby approves the request for the transfer of territory from the Centerburg LSD, Knox County, to the Big Walnut LSD, Delaware County, for the reasons outlined in the petitioner's request; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to serve a true copy of this resolution on the petitioner, the Centerburg LSD, the Big Walnut LSD, and counsel of record, if applicable.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 17) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler
Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan Eric Poklar

James Sheppard Lisa Woods
Tess Elshoff

NO VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Antoinette Miranda

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 18):

18. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND TO DISAPPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE ADENA LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, ROSS COUNTY, TO THE WESTFALL LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, PICKAWAY COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following preambles and resolutions:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code ("ORC") Section 3311.24, residents ("petitioners") who reside within the Adena Local School District (Adena LSD) have petitioned for the transfer of school district territory from the Adena LSD, Ross County, to the Westfall Local School District (Westfall LSD), Pickaway County;

Petitioners requested a hearing, and the hearing was held on May 16, 2018, before a duly appointed hearing officer;

The hearing officer, Paul Stehura, in his report of July 24, 2018, recommends that the State Board of Education disapprove the proposed transfer of territory from the Adena LSD, Ross County, to the Westfall LSD, Pickaway County, pursuant to ORC 3311.24; and

In the report, hearing officer Stehura concludes that Adena LSD's fiscal impact would be insignificant or de minimis on the Adena LSD overall and/or its operations, but no statutes or administrative rules permit petitioners' properties to be noncontiguous properties within the Westfall LSD.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that upon consideration of the hearing officer's report and recommendation and the relevant law, the State Board of Education hereby adopts the recommendation of the hearing officer and disapproves the request for the transfer of territory from the Adena LSD, Ross County, to the Westfall LSD, Pickaway County for the reasons outlined in the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to serve a true copy of this resolution on the petitioners, the Adena LSD, Ross County, the Westfall LSD, Pickaway County, and counsel of record, if applicable.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Mrs. Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 18) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Mervl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan Eric Poklar James Sheppard Tess Elshoff Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 19):

19. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND DISAPPROVE THE TRANSFER OF SCHOOL DISTRICT TERRITORY FROM THE EVERGREEN LOCAL SCHOOL DISTRICT, FULTON COUNTY, TO THE SYLVANIA CITY SCHOOL DISTRICT, LUCAS COUNTY, PURSUANT TO SECTION 3311.24 OF THE OHIO REVISED CODE.

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following preambles and resolutions:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 3311.24, residents ("petitioners") who reside within the Evergreen Local School District (Evergreen LSD) have petitioned for the transfer of school district territory from the Evergreen LSD, Fulton County, to the Sylvania City School District (Sylvania CSD), Lucas County;

Evergreen CSD requested a hearing, and the hearing was held on June 27, 2018, before a duly appointed hearing officer;

The hearing officer, Linda Mosbacher, in her report of August 23, 2018, recommends that the State Board of Education disapprove the proposed transfer of territory from the Evergreen LSD to the Sylvania CSD; and

In the report, hearing officer Mosbacher concludes that while the transfer makes sense from the point of view of the Creque family, testimony and evidence supports the conclusion that the students attending the Evergreen school district would be negatively impacted by the transfer.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that upon consideration of the petition and the hearing officer's report and recommendation, the State Board of Education hereby adopts the report and recommendation and disapproves the request for the transfer of territory from the Evergreen LSD, Fulton County, to the Sylvania CSD, Lucas County, for the reasons set forth in the report and recommendation; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to serve a true copy of this resolution on the petitioners, the Evergreen LSD, Fulton County, the Sylvania CSD, Lucas County, and counsel of record, if applicable.

It was Moved by Mrs. Kohler and Seconded by Mrs. Dodd that the above recommendation (Item 19) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Linda Haycock Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Lisa Woods

#### NO VOTES

Meryl Johnson

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 20):

# 20. RESOLUTION TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT APPLICATION OF NICOLE S. BILTON (AKA NICOLE S. POCOCK)

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Nicole S. Bilton (aka Nicole S. Pocock) has applied for a one-year educational aide permit; and

WHEREAS on June 5, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Nicole S. Bilton of its intent to deny or permanently deny her application for a one-year educational aide permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms.

Bilton's 2017 conviction in the Norwalk Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct stemming from a charge of one misdemeanor count of domestic violence, the victim of which was a minor; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Bilton that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to deny or permanently deny her application for a one-year educational aide permit; and

WHEREAS Nicole S. Bilton did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Norwalk Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Huron County Sheriff's Office; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Nicole S. Bilton's application for a one-year educational aide permit based upon Ms. Bilton's 2017 conviction in the Norwalk Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct stemming from a charge of one misdemeanor count of domestic violence, the victim of which was a minor. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Nicole S. Bilton be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Bilton of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister and Seconded by Dr. Morgan that the above recommendation (Item 20) be approved.

Ms. Fowler Moved to Amend the resolution to deny with re-application in three years based on conditions. Ms. Woods Seconded the motion. Ms. Fowler proposed the following: the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders Nicole S. Bilton be ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education until on or after September 18, 2021 and provided that before reapplication she meets the following conditions: completes, at her own expense, an anger management course that is pre-approved by the Ohio

Department of Education; and completes, at her own expense and within 90 days of reapplication, a fitness to teach evaluation that verifies she is fit to be in a classroom and is not a risk to the health, safety, or welfare of students and others in the school community with the evaluation to be conducted by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist, who is pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education. Ms. Fowler further stated in reading the materials she believed there were mitigating factors that were not taken into consideration.

Mrs. Dodd asked about the other amended resolution that had been circulated. Mrs. McGuire explained her proposed amendment would include the following: the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders Nicole S. Bilton be ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education until she meets the following conditions: completes, at her own expense, an anger management course that is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education; completes, at her own expense, a co-parenting class that is pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education if the victim's paternal parent participates or a parenting class that is pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education if the paternal parent does not participate; and completes, at her own expense, a counseling assessment and follows all counseling recommendations with the evaluator to be pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment by Ms. Fowler.

#### YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Cathye Flory
Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock
Laura Kohler Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan
James Sheppard Lisa Woods

#### NO VOTES

Pat Bruns Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson Charlotte McGuire
Eric Poklar Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Mrs. McGuire Moved to amend the resolution as amended by substitution. She proposed the following: the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders Nicole S. Bilton be ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education until she meets the following conditions: completes, at her own expense, an anger management course that is pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education; completes, at her own expense, a co-parenting class that is pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education if the victim's paternal parent participates or a parenting class that is pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education if the paternal parent does not participate; and completes, at her own expense, a counseling assessment and follows all counseling recommendations with the evaluator to be pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education. Mrs. Flory Seconded the motion. Mrs. McGuire stated she believed the Board should only deny and Ms. Bilton should be personally responsible to seek Department approved counseling, parenting skills and anger-management skills in a time-frame of her choosing.

Mrs. Dodd stated she was concerned with not including a time-frame for the proposed amendment.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment by Mrs. McGuire.

YES VOTES

Cathye Flory Charlotte McGuire

Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler Martha Manchester

Kara Morgan Eric Poklar

Tess Elshoff

Motion denied.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on Ms. Fowler's motion as amended.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 21):

21. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT OF THE HEARING OFFICER, TO AMEND AND RECONCILE THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, AND TO SUSPEND THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL MULTI-AGE TEACHING LICENSE AND PERMANENT NON-TAX TEACHING CERTIFICATE OF KELLY G. BISHOP-FULTON

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Kelly G. Bishop-Fulton holds a five-year professional multi-age teaching license issued in 2014 and permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2006; and

WHEREAS on September 6, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Kelly G. Bishop-Fulton of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year professional multi-age teaching license issued in 2014 and permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2006 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code

3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Bishop-Fulton engaging in the following conduct that is negligent and/or unbecoming to the teaching profession while she was employed by the Western Brown Local School District: on or about January 2015, she inappropriately assisted a student in completing an assignment; and on or about the 2014-2015 school year, she provided her personal teacher access codes to a different student, allowing that student the ability to access confidential student information; and

WHEREAS Ms. Bishop-Fulton requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on December 6, 2017; and

WHEREAS Ms. Bishop-Fulton was not present at the hearing or represented by counsel, but she did submit her contentions in writing; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Bishop-Fulton's licenses be suspended for a period of five years and upon expiration of the suspension period, she must demonstrate that she has completed eight hours of ethics training in order to obtain licensure. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Bishop-Fulton's conduct being unbecoming to the teaching profession and her continued licensure would have a negative impact on the health, safety, and welfare of the school community; and

WHEREAS Ms. Bishop-Fulton's permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2006 does not have an expiration date; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education must reconcile Ms. Bishop-Fulton's permanent non-tax teaching license not expiring with the hearing officer's recommendation that to obtain future licensure Ms. Bishop-Fulton must complete eight hours of ethics training upon the expiration of a five-year suspension; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby SUSPENDS Kelly G. Bishop-Fulton's five-year professional multi-age teaching license issued in 2014 with the suspension beginning on September 18, 2018 and ending on June 30, 2019, its expiration date, and SUSPENDS, for a period of at least five years, her permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2006 with the suspension beginning on September 18, 2018 and ending on September 18, 2023 or when Ms. Bishop-Fulton completes the eight hours of ethics training ordered below, whichever date occurs last. The suspensions are based upon Ms. Bishop-Fulton engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession while she was employed by the Western Brown Local School District: on or about January 2015, she inappropriately assisted a student in completing an assignment; and on or about the 2014-2015 school year, she provided her personal teacher access codes to a different student, allowing that student the ability to access confidential student information. Further, the State Board of Education orders that Kelly G. Bishop-Fulton shall provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education

that she has completed, at her own expense, eight hours of ethics training preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education and further orders, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(1)(e), that she be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until September 10, 2023 or she completes eight hours of ethics training, whichever date occurs last; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education, on its behalf, to implement the aforementioned terms and conditions regarding Ms. Bishop-Fulton's licenses. Further, if said terms and conditions have not been fulfilled completely upon Ms. Bishop-Fulton applying for a new license, permit, or certificate the State Board directs the Ohio Department of Education to evaluate any new applications in accordance with its orders and ensure all outstanding terms and conditions are addressed; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Bishop-Fulton of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Flory and Seconded by Mrs. Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 21) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 22):

22. RESOLUTION TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL EARLY CHILDHOOD TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION OF JENNIFER C. BOS

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jennifer C. Bos has applied for a five-year professional early childhood teaching license; and

WHEREAS on June 5, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Jennifer C. Bos of its intent to deny or permanently deny her application for a five-year professional early childhood teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Bos engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: in 2014, she was convicted in the Superior Court of Arizona, Maricopa County of one misdemeanor count of resisting arrest; on or about July 24, 2015, the Arizona State Board of Nursing revoked her Arizona certified nursing assistant certificate; and on or about January 24, 2017, she failed to disclose on her pending application to the Ohio Department of Education the revocation of her Arizona certified nursing assistant certificate; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Bos that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to deny or permanently deny her application for a five-year professional early childhood teaching license; and

WHEREAS Jennifer C. Bos did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Superior Court of Arizona, Maricopa County, certified police records from the Chandler Police Department, and certified records from the Arizona State Board of Nursing; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Jennifer C. Bos' application for a five-year professional early childhood teaching license based upon Ms. Bos engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: in 2014, she was convicted in the Superior Court of Arizona, Maricopa County of one misdemeanor count of resisting arrest; on or about July 24, 2015, the Arizona State Board of Nursing revoked her Arizona certified nursing assistant certificate; and on or about January 24, 2017, she failed to disclose on her pending application to the Ohio Department of Education the revocation of her Arizona certified nursing assistant certificate. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Jennifer C. Bos be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Bos of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 22) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan Eric Poklar James Sheppard Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 23):

23. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL EDUCATION OF THE HANDICAPPED TEACHING LICENSE AND THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF ANTHONY D. BOYD

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Anthony D. Boyd held a five-year professional education of the handicapped teaching license issued in 2013 and three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on May 29, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Anthony D. Boyd of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year professional education of the handicapped teaching license issued in 2013 and three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(d). The notice was based upon Mr. Boyd's 2018 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of possession of controlled substances; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Boyd that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year professional education of the

handicapped teaching license issued in 2013 and three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS Anthony D. Boyd did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Hamilton County Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Sharonville Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(d), hereby **REVOKES** Anthony D. Boyd's five-year professional education of the handicapped teaching license issued in 2013 and three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2015 based upon Mr. Boyd's 2018 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of possession of controlled substances. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Anthony D. Boyd be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Boyd of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Flory that the above recommendation (Item 23) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 24):

# 24. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FOUR-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF HOLLY E. CORBIN

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Holly E. Corbin holds a four-year educational aide permit issued in 2017 with an effective year of 2016; and

WHEREAS on June 5, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Holly E. Corbin of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year educational aide permit issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(c). The notice was based upon Ms. Corbin's 2018 conviction in the Marion Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of theft, 2008 conviction in the Marion Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2004 conviction in the Marion Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of failure to obtain liability insurance for a vicious dog, 2004 conviction in the Marion Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of failure to confine a vicious dog and one misdemeanor count of failure to obtain liability insurance for a vicious dog, and 2002 conviction in the Marion Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of theft; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Corbin that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year educational aide permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Holly E. Corbin did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Marion Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Marion County Sheriff's Office; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(c), hereby **REVOKES** Holly E. Corbin's four-year educational aide permit issued in 2017 with an effective year of 2016 based upon Ms. Corbin's 2018 conviction in the Marion Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of theft, 2008 conviction in the Marion Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2004 conviction in the Marion Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of failure to obtain liability insurance for a vicious dog, 2004 conviction in the Marion Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of failure to confine a vicious dog and one misdemeanor count of failure to obtain liability insurance for a vicious dog, and 2002 conviction in the Marion Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of theft. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Holly E. Corbin be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Corbin of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Manchester that the above recommendation (Item 24) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 25):

# 25. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF KEVIN W. HARRIS

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Kevin W. Harris held a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on June 5, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Kevin W. Harris of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Harris violating his consent agreement with the State Board of Education, dated July 13, 2017, by failing to complete forty hours of community service, an anger management course, and a drug/alcohol assessment in the time and manner described by the terms of his consent agreement; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Harris that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS Kevin W. Harris did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavits of the director and a paralegal of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, the consent agreement dated July 13, 2017 between Mr. Harris and the State Board of Education, and correspondence between the Ohio Department of Education and Mr. Harris; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Kevin W. Harris' three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2015 based upon Mr. Harris violating his consent agreement with the State Board of Education, dated July 13, 2017, by failing to complete forty hours of community service, an anger management course, and a drug/alcohol assessment in the time and manner described by the terms of his consent agreement. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Kevin W. Harris be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Harris of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Mrs. Manchester that the above recommendation (Item 25) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan Eric Poklar James Sheppard Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 26):

# 26. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE CAREER TECHNICAL TEACHING LICENSE OF TRACY R. HENDERSON

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Tracy R. Henderson held a one-year substitute career technical teaching license issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS on July 6, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Tracy R. Henderson of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year substitute career technical teaching license issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(b), and (B)(2)(c). The notice was based upon Ms. Henderson's 2016 conviction in the Portage County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of assault stemming from an incident where she punched a minor on the side of the head, and 2010 conviction in the Canton Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of passing bad checks; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Henderson that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year substitute career technical teaching license issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Tracy R. Henderson did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Portage County Municipal Court and Canton Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Kent Police Department and Canton Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(b), and (B)(2)(c), hereby **REVOKES** Tracy R. Henderson's one-year substitute career technical teaching license issued in 2017 based upon Ms. Henderson's 2016 conviction in the Portage County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of assault stemming from an incident where she punched a minor on the side of the head, and 2010 conviction in the Canton Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of passing bad checks. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Tracy R. Henderson be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Henderson of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Manchester and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 26) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Lisa Woods Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 27):

# 27. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT APPLICATION OF DEMARCO R. KINAMORE

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Demarco R. Kinamore has applied for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS on June 28, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Demarco R. Kinamore of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B) and (F). The notice was based upon Mr. Kinamore engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when, despite never having held a license or permit from the Ohio Department of Education, Mr. Kinamore accepted employment in the following positions that require an educator to hold a valid license or permit from the Ohio Department of Education: on or about November 2012, he accepted employment as a freshman girls' basketball coach with the Winton Woods City School District; on or about December 2013, he accepted employment as a freshman girls' basketball coach with the Winton Woods City School District; on or about August 2013, he accepted employment as a substitute educational aide with the Winton Woods City School District; on or about January 2014, he accepted employment as an educational aide with the Winton Woods City School District; on or about July 2015, he accepted employment as a girls' varsity tennis coach with the Fairfield City School District; on or about October 2014, he accepted employment as a substitute educational aide with the Fairfield City School District; and on or about October 28, 2015, he accepted employment as a junior varsity boys' basketball coach with the Cincinnati Public School District. The notice was further based on Mr. Kinamore having two Findings for Recovery issued against him by the Ohio Auditor of State pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 117.28, one for \$22,945.00 in favor of the Winton Woods City School District's General Fund and one for \$5,624.00 in favor of the Fairfield City School District's General Fund. In addition, he falsified his employment application to the Cincinnati Public School District when he failed to indicate that his employment with the Winton Woods City School District was terminated as a result of his failure to maintain licensure, listed his mother, Andrea Donegan, as a professional reference and indicated that she had no relationship to him, and indicated that he had a valid Ohio Pupil Activity Supervisor Validation permit despite never having held a license or permit from the Ohio Department of Education. Further, the notice included as an aggravating factor that on or about June 4, 2014, Mr. Kinamore lent his motor vehicle to an unlicensed student driver and after the student struck a garage with the motor vehicle and fled the scene, Mr. Kinamore misled the police investigation by falsely denying that he had the student's phone number, knew where the student resided, or that he had seen the damaged property; and

WHEREAS Mr. Kinamore requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on October 24, 2017; and

WHEREAS Mr. Kinamore was present at the hearing, but he was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Kinamore's pending application be denied and that he be ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education for a period of four years. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Kinamore repeatedly working in Ohio schools without the required licensure, submitting an employment application to a school district that contained false and misleading information, and failing to cooperate with the police in resolving a situation that involved him, his vehicle, and damage to other people's property; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B) and (F), hereby **DENIES** Demarco R. Kinamore's application for a three-year pupil activity permit based upon Mr. Kinamore engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when, despite never having held a license or permit from the Ohio Department of Education, Mr. Kinamore accepted employment in the following positions that require an educator to hold a valid license or permit from the Ohio Department of Education: on or about November 2012, he accepted employment as a freshman girls' basketball coach with the Winton Woods City School District; on or about December 2013, he accepted employment as a freshman girls' basketball coach with the Winton Woods City School District; on or about August 2013, he accepted employment as a substitute educational aide with the Winton Woods City School District; on or about January 2014, he accepted employment as an educational aide with the Winton Woods City School District; and on or about October 2014, he accepted employment as a substitute educational aide with the Fairfield City School District. Also, the State Board's denial is based upon Mr. Kinamore having two Findings for Recovery issued against him by the Ohio Auditor of State pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 117.28, one for \$22,945.00 in favor of the Winton Woods City School District's General Fund and one for \$5,624.00 in favor of the Fairfield City School District's General Fund. In addition, he falsified his employment application to the Cincinnati Public School District when he failed to indicate that his employment with the Winton Woods City School District was terminated as a result of his failure to maintain licensure, he listed his mother, Andrea Donegan, as a professional reference and indicated that she had no relationship to him, and he indicated that he had a valid Ohio Pupil Activity Supervisor Validation permit despite never having held a license or permit from the Ohio Department of Education. Pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-21(B), the State Board of Education further considers in aggravation that on or about June 4, 2014, Mr. Kinamore lent his motor vehicle to an unlicensed student driver and after the student struck a garage with the motor vehicle and fled the scene, Mr. Kinamore misled the police investigation by falsely denying that he had the

student's phone number, that he knew where the student resided, or that he had seen the damaged property. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that Demarco R. Kinamore be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after September 18, 2022; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Kinamore of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 27) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 28):

# 28. RESOLUTION TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE GENERAL EDUCATION TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATION OF SHAQWE LAWSON

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Shaqwe Lawson has applied for a one-year substitute general education teaching license; and

WHEREAS on June 5, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Shaqwe Lawson of its intent to deny or permanently deny her application for a one-year substitute general education teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(d), and (B)(3). The notice was based upon Ms. Lawson's 2016 guilty plea in the Lorain County Court of Common Pleas to one felony count of trafficking in drugs, one misdemeanor count of carrying a concealed weapon, one misdemeanor count of improper handling of a firearm in a motor vehicle, one misdemeanor count of drug possession, and one misdemeanor count of drug paraphernalia offenses and subsequent entry into the Court's intervention in lieu of conviction program, 2014

guilty plea in the Lorain Municipal Court to one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2009 guilty plea in the Oberlin Municipal Court to one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, and [redacted in accordance with Ohio law; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Lawson that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to deny or permanently deny her application for a one-year substitute general education teaching license; and

WHEREAS Shaqwe Lawson did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Lorain County Court of Common Pleas and Oberlin Municipal Court, court records from the Lorain Municipal Court, certified records from the Lorain County Metro Parks, [redacted in accordance with Ohio law]; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(d), and (B)(3), hereby **DENIES** Shaqwe Lawson's application for a one-year substitute general education teaching license based upon Ms. Lawson's 2016 guilty plea in the Lorain County Court of Common Pleas to one felony count of trafficking in drugs, one misdemeanor count of carrying a concealed weapon, one misdemeanor count of improper handling of a firearm in a motor vehicle, one misdemeanor count of drug possession, and one misdemeanor count of drug paraphernalia offenses and subsequent entry into the Court's intervention in lieu of conviction program, 2014 guilty plea in the Lorain Municipal Court to one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2009 guilty plea in the Oberlin Municipal Court to one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, and [redacted in accordance with Ohio law]. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Shaqwe Lawson be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Lawson of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Flory and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 28) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 29):

#### 29. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE PERMANENT NON-TAX TEACHING CERTIFICATE OF AMBER B. MATTERN

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Amber B. Mattern holds a permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS on May 17, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Amber B. Mattern of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2016 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Mattern's 2018 conviction in the Fairborn Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of violation of a temporary protection order and 2018 conviction in the Fairborn Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of falsification and one misdemeanor count of obstructing official business; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Mattern that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS Amber B. Mattern did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's

Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Fairborn Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Fairborn Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Amber B. Mattern's permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2016 based upon Ms. Mattern's 2018 conviction in the Fairborn Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of violation of a temporary protection order and 2018 conviction in the Fairborn Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one misdemeanor count of falsification and one misdemeanor count of obstructing official business. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Amber B. Mattern be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Mattern of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Flory and Seconded by Mrs. Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 29) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 30):

# 30. RESOLUTION TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT APPLICATION OF BRENT A. PAULUS

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Brent A. Paulus has applied for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS on June 11, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Brent A. Paulus of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(a), (B)(2)(c), and (B)(3). The notice was based upon Mr. Paulus' 2018 guilty plea in the Summit County Court of Common Pleas to one felony count of attempted tampering with records and one felony count of theft in office and subsequent entry into the Court's pre-trial diversion program; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Paulus that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS Brent A. Paulus did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Summit County Court of Common Pleas, and certified police records from the Summit County Sheriff's Office; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), (B)(2)(a), (B)(2)(c), and (B)(3), hereby **DENIES** Brent A. Paulus' application for a three-year pupil activity permit based upon Mr. Paulus' 2018 guilty plea in the Summit County Court of Common Pleas to one felony count of attempted tampering with records and one felony count of theft in office and subsequent entry into the Court's pre-trial diversion program. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-

22(A)(3)(b), orders Brent A. Paulus be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Paulus of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Johnson and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 30) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Linda Havcock Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan Eric Poklar James Sheppard Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 31):

# 31. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT APPLICATION OF TIMOTHY M. RAYFORD

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Timothy M. Rayford has applied for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS on October 20, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Timothy M. Rayford of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b). The notice was based upon Mr. Rayford's 2015 conviction in the Toledo Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2015 conviction in the Sylvania Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2005 conviction in the Maumee Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 1999 conviction in the Toledo Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of attempted domestic violence, and failure to fully disclose his misdemeanor convictions on his pending application to the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS Mr. Rayford requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on April 26, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Rayford was present at the hearing, but he was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Rayford's pending application be denied and that he be ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education for a period of three years provided that during this period, he has not been convicted of any additional crimes, has completed forty hours of community service, has taken a course in anger management, and has obtained a fitness to teach evaluation that demonstrates he is not at risk for further anger management issues and would be safe around children. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Rayford's four convictions and his clear unethical act of misleading the State Board of Education about his convictions on his pending application; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b), hereby **DENIES** Timothy M. Rayford's application for a three-year pupil activity permit based upon Mr. Rayford's 2015 conviction in the Toledo Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2015 conviction in the Sylvania Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2005 conviction in the Maumee Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 1999 conviction in the Toledo Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of attempted domestic violence, and failure to fully disclose his misdemeanor convictions on his pending application to the Ohio Department of Education. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that Timothy M. Rayford be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after September 18, 2021, and that upon reapplication he must provide verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has met the following conditions: completed, at his own expense and within thirty days of re-application, FBI and BCI fingerprint background checks establishing that he has not been convicted of any additional crimes during the three-year period; completed forty hours of community service pre-approved by the Ohio Department of Education; completed a course in anger management preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education; and completed, at his own expense, a fitness to teach evaluation by a licensed psychologist or psychiatrist who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education and the evaluation must determine that he is not at risk for further anger management issues and would be safe around children; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education, on its behalf, to implement the aforementioned terms and conditions regarding Mr. Rayford's application. Further, if said terms and conditions have not been fulfilled completely upon Mr. Rayford applying for a new license, permit,

or certificate the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education to evaluate any new application in accordance with its orders and ensure all outstanding terms and conditions are addressed; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Rayford of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Woods and Seconded by Mrs. Hollister that the above recommendation (Item 31) be approved.

Mrs. Haycock Moved to amend the resolution by substitution. She proposed the following resolution:

RESOLUTION TO MODIFY THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND TO PERMANENTLY DENY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT APPLICATION OF TIMOTHY M. RAYFORD

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Timothy M. Rayford has applied for a three-year pupil activity permit; and

WHEREAS on October 20, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Timothy M. Rayford of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a three-year pupil activity permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b). The notice was based upon Mr. Rayford's 2015 conviction in the Toledo Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2015 conviction in the Sylvania Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2005 conviction in the Maumee Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 1999 conviction in the Toledo Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of attempted domestic violence, and failure to fully disclose his misdemeanor convictions on his pending application to the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS Mr. Rayford requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on April 26, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Rayford was present at the hearing, but he was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Rayford's pending application be denied and that he be ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education for a period of three years provided that during this period, he has not been convicted of any additional crimes, has completed forty hours of community service, has taken a course in anger management, and has obtained a fitness to teach evaluation that demonstrates he is not at risk for further anger management issues and would be safe around children. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Rayford's four convictions and his

clear unethical act of misleading the State Board of Education about his convictions on his pending application; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation: reject in its entirety the last full paragraph on page one of the Summary Fact Sheet that begins, "Although licensing an individual with a criminal history is not ordinarily a positive act..."; reject in its entirety the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in its entirety the last sentence on page 20 of the Report and Recommendation that reads, "However, in this case, there is sufficient evidence that Mr. Rayford is a positive role model to the youth which he works."; reject in their entirety the first and second sentences on page 21 of the Report and Recommendation that begin, "And while there is always some risk that a person who has manifested anger management issues..."; reject in its entirety the next to last sentence on page 21 that reads, "It was readily apparent at the hearing as to why Mr. Rayford has thrived as a coach."; reject in its entirety the last sentence that begins on page 21 of the Report and Recommendation and ends on page 22 that begins, "His passion and demeanor..."; reject in its entirety the first full paragraph on page 22 that begins, "The Hearing Officer further agrees with the State..."; reject in their entirety Conclusions of Law numbered 22 and 23 [sic] on page 30 of the Report and Recommendation; and reject in its entirety the last paragraph that begins on page 30 of the Report and Recommendation and ends on page 31 that begins, "It is further the recommendation of this Hearing Officer that Mr. Rayford..."; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board may determine that a penalty outside the range of the disciplinary guidelines listed in the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators* is more appropriate in an individual case based upon the aggravating and mitigating factors as outlined in Section 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and any other factors the State Board considers relevant; and

WHEREAS the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following aggravating factors: the extent of Mr. Rayford's misconduct includes Mr. Rayford engaging in a pattern of criminal conduct as evidenced by his four convictions that span 16 years; Mr. Rayford did not disclose his criminal history to the Ohio Department of Education when he indicated on his pending application that he had not been convicted of any criminal offense; the nature and seriousness of Mr. Rayford's misconduct includes three of Mr. Rayford's convictions involving allegations of physical violence against women; the amount of time that has elapsed since Mr. Rayford's last criminal activity is three years and only one year has elapsed since he falsified his pending application; the conduct and work activity of Mr. Rayford includes a physical altercation with a person in a work setting that resulted in a criminal conviction and him coaching for one year without having a permit issued by the State Board of Education; and Mr.

Rayford's first conviction occurred when he was in his late thirties and his last conviction occurred in his fifties, ages that should have afforded Mr. Rayford the maturity, knowledge, and experience to resolve disputes in a non-physical manner; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when he did not give the preceding facts and aggravating factors the weight they deserved when he made his recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board concludes that denying Mr. Rayford's application and allowing him to reapply in three years would demean the nature and seriousness of his conduct, reflect negatively on the teaching profession, and undermine the State Board's expectation that educators serve as role models who must comply with all laws and resolve their disagreements without resorting to physical aggression and criminal conduct. The State Board concludes that a permanent denial of Mr. Rayford's applications is warranted based on his unbecoming conduct and the aggravating factors in this case: Therefore, Be it

RESOLVED, THAT the State Board of Education rejects the following portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation: reject in its entirety the last full paragraph on page one of the Summary Fact Sheet that begins, "Although licensing an individual with a criminal history is not ordinarily a positive act..."; reject in its entirety the Recommendation section of the Summary Fact Sheet; reject in its entirety the last sentence on page 20 of the Report and Recommendation that reads, "However, in this case, there is sufficient evidence that Mr. Rayford is a positive role model to the youth which he works."; reject in their entirety the first and second sentences on page 21 of the Report and Recommendation that begin, "And while there is always some risk that a person who has manifested anger management issues..."; reject in its entirety the next to last sentence on page 21 that reads, "It was readily apparent at the hearing as to why Mr. Rayford has thrived as a coach."; reject in its entirety the last sentence that begins on page 21 of the Report and Recommendation and ends on page 22 that begins, "His passion and demeanor..."; reject in its entirety the first full paragraph on page 22 that begins, "The Hearing Officer further agrees with the State..."; reject in their entirety Conclusions of Law numbered 22 and 23 [sic] on page 30 of the Report and Recommendation; and reject in its entirety the last paragraph that begins on page 30 of the Report and Recommendation and ends on page 31 that begins, "It is further the recommendation of this Hearing Officer that Mr. Rayford..."; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, THAT the State Board of Education adopts the remaining portions of the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, THAT the State Board finds that the administrative record identifies the following aggravating factors: the extent of Mr. Rayford's misconduct includes Mr. Rayford engaging in a pattern of criminal conduct as evidenced by his four convictions that span 16 years; Mr. Rayford did not disclose his criminal history to the Ohio Department of Education when he indicated on his pending application that he had not been convicted of any criminal offense; the nature and seriousness of Mr. Rayford's misconduct includes three of Mr. Rayford's convictions involving allegations of physical violence against women; the amount of time that has elapsed since Mr. Rayford's last criminal activity is three years and only one year has elapsed since he falsified his pending application; the conduct and work activity of Mr. Rayford includes a physical

altercation with a person in a work setting that resulted in a criminal conviction and him coaching for one year without having a permit issued by the State Board of Education; and Mr. Rayford's first conviction occurred when he was in his late thirties and his last conviction occurred in his fifties, ages that should have afforded Mr. Rayford the maturity, knowledge, and experience to resolve disputes in a non-physical manner; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, THAT the State Board concludes that the hearing officer erred when he did not give the preceding facts and aggravating factors the weight they deserved when he made his recommendation; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, THAT the State Board concludes that denying Mr. Rayford's application and allowing him to reapply in three years would demean the nature and seriousness of his conduct, reflect negatively on the teaching profession, and undermine the State Board's expectation that educators serve as role models who must comply with all laws and resolve their disagreements without resorting to physical aggression and criminal conduct. The State Board concludes that a permanent denial of Mr. Rayford's applications is warranted based on his unbecoming conduct and the aggravating factors in this case; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b), hereby **DENIES** Timothy M. Rayford's application for a three-year pupil activity permit based upon Mr. Rayford's 2015 conviction in the Toledo Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2015 conviction in the Sylvania Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 2005 conviction in the Maumee Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct, 1999 conviction in the Toledo Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of attempted domestic violence, and failure to fully disclose his misdemeanor convictions on his pending application to the Ohio Department of Education. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders that Timothy M. Rayford be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Rayford of this action.

Ms. Johnson Seconded the motion. Mrs. Haycock stated the following concerning Mr. Rayford: 1) He worked for one year without a license, 2) He failed to disclose his misdemeanor convictions on his Ohio Department of Education application, 3) He had multiple domestic violence charges spanning multiple years, 4) Due to his conviction of domestic violence, he was put on probation, which was extended one more year after that probation, and 5) He was convicted of disorderly conduct arising from an incident where he pushed a co-worker. Ms. Johnson spoke in favor of the proposed amendment.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Linda Haycock Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan Stephanie Dodd Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar

James Sheppard Lisa Woods

Tess Elshoff

NO VOTES

Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler

Nancy Hollister

Motion carried.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda
Kana Mangara

Kara Morgan Eric Poklar James Sheppard Lisa Woods

Tess Elshoff

NO VOTES

Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler

Nancy Hollister

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 32):

# 32. RESOLUTION TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT APPLICATION OF WALLACE J. RICE

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Wallace J. Rice has applied for a one-year educational aide permit; and

WHEREAS on June 19, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Wallace J. Rice of its intent to deny or permanently deny his application for a one-year educational aide permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b). The notice was based upon Mr. Rice's 2017 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of aggravated menacing; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Rice that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to deny or permanently deny his application for a one-year educational aide permit; and

WHEREAS Wallace J. Rice did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, and certified court records from the Hamilton County Municipal Court; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b), hereby **DENIES** Wallace J. Rice's application for a one-year educational aide permit based upon Mr. Rice's 2017 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of aggravated menacing. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Wallace J. Rice be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Rice of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Hollister and Seconded by Mrs. Dodd that the above recommendation (Item 32) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 33):

# 33. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY THE ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT APPLICATION OF MARGARET T. RIVERA

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Margaret T. Rivera has applied for a one-year educational aide permit; and

WHEREAS on November 9, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Margaret T. Rivera of its intent to deny or permanently deny her application for a one-year educational aide permit pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Rivera's 2013 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of possession of drugs and 2013 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one minor misdemeanor count of possession of marijuana drug paraphernalia; and

WHEREAS Ms. Rivera requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on May 10, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Rivera was present at the hearing, but she was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Rivera's pending application be denied and that she be ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education for a period of six months, and that upon reapplication she must provide verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, a drug and alcohol assessment by a licensed professional who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education and followed all recommendations made by the licensed professional and it is further recommended that upon reapplying for a license with the Ohio Department of Education, Ms. Rivera must submit to a random drug and alcohol test at a date to be determined by the Ohio Department of Education, in addition to signing any releases necessary for the Ohio Department of Education to obtain the results of her drug and alcohol assessment and random drug and alcohol test. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon the evidence showing that Ms. Rivera has learned from her mistakes, she testified that she has been sober for five years, and she was honest and forthright at the hearing and putting safeguards in place will ensure that she is drug and alcohol free upon her reapplying for a license; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Margaret T. Rivera's application for a one-year educational aide permit based upon Ms. Rivera's 2013 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court for one minor misdemeanor count of possession of drugs and 2013 conviction in the Hamilton County Municipal Court, in a separate case, for one minor misdemeanor count of possession of marijuana drug paraphernalia. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that Margaret T. Rivera be ineligible to reapply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after March 18, 2019, and that prior to reapplication, Ms. Rivera must provide verification to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, a drug and alcohol assessment by a licensed professional who is preapproved by the Ohio Department of Education and followed all recommendations made by the licensed professional and it is further ordered that upon reapplying for a license, certificate, or permit with the Ohio Department of Education, Ms. Rivera, at her own expense, must submit to a random drug and alcohol test at a date to be determined by the Ohio Department of Education, in addition to signing any releases necessary for the Ohio Department of Education to obtain the results of her drug and alcohol assessment and random drug and alcohol test; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education, on its behalf, to implement the aforementioned terms and conditions regarding Ms. Rivera's application. Further, if said terms and conditions have not been fulfilled completely upon Ms. Rivera applying for a new license, permit, or certificate the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education to evaluate any new application in accordance with its orders and ensure all outstanding terms and conditions are addressed; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Rivera of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Flory and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 33) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Antoinette Miranda Eric Poklar Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Kara Morgan James Sheppard Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lisa Woods

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 34):

# 34. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE THREE-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF GARY L. STANFORTH

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Gary L. Stanforth holds a three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS on June 12, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Gary L. Stanforth of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b). The notice was based upon Mr. Stanforth's 2018 conviction in the Clinton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of menacing, 2005 conviction in the Clermont County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of drug paraphernalia and one minor misdemeanor count of possession of marijuana, 1998 conviction in the Clermont County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of underage consumption, and failure to fully disclose his criminal convictions on his 2017 application to the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Mr. Stanforth that if he fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017; and

WHEREAS Gary L. Stanforth did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Clinton County Municipal Court and Clermont County Municipal Court, and certified police records from the Blanchester Police Department; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b), hereby **REVOKES** Gary L. Stanforth's three-year pupil activity permit issued in 2017 based upon Mr. Stanforth's 2018 conviction in the Clinton County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of menacing, 2005 conviction in the Clermont County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of drug paraphernalia and one minor misdemeanor count of possession of marijuana, 1998 conviction in the Clermont County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of underage consumption, and failure to fully disclose his criminal convictions on his 2017 application to the Ohio Department of Education. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Gary L. Stanforth be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Stanforth of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Ms. Bruns that the above recommendation (Item 34) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister Mervl Johnson Laura Kohler Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan Eric Poklar James Sheppard Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 35):

35. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE PERMANENT NON-TAX TEACHING CERTIFICATE OF SUSAN E. THOBURN

I RECOMMEND that the State Board of Education ADOPT the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Susan E. Thoburn holds a permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2011; and

WHEREAS on July 24, 2017, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Susan E. Thoburn of its intent to

determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2011 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Thoburn engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession between 2008 and 2014 when she engaged in inappropriate sexual conduct with a minor; and

WHEREAS Ms. Thoburn did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on May 9, 2018; and

WHEREAS Ms. Thoburn was not present at the hearing or represented by counsel, but she did submit her contentions in writing; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Thoburn's license be permanently revoked. Further, it is recommended that Ms. Thoburn be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Thoburn engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession by having an inappropriate sexual relationship with a minor child; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Susan E. Thoburn's permanent non-tax teaching certificate issued in 2011 based upon Ms. Thoburn engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession between 2008 and 2014 when she engaged in inappropriate sexual conduct with a minor. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Susan E. Thoburn be permanently ineligible to apply for any license issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Thoburn of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Ms. Johnson that the above recommendation (Item 35) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda Kara Morgan

Eric Poklar	James Sheppard
Lisa Woods	Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 36):

36. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND TO APPROVE THE INDIAN HILL EXEMPTED VILLAGE SCHOOL DISTRICT'S DETERMINATION OF IMPRACTICAL TRANSPORTATION AND PAYMENT IN LIEU OF TRANSPORTATION OF A STUDENT ATTENDING ST. MARY'S SCHOOL, HAMILTON COUNTY

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following preambles and resolutions:

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code ("ORC") 3327.01 and 3327.02, Indian Hill Exempted Village School District determined that it is impractical to transport a student from Indian Hill Exempted Village School District to St. Mary's School, Hamilton County;

The parents requested a hearing, and the hearing was held on June 21, 2018, before a duly appointed hearing officer;

In her report, dated August 23, 2018, hearing officer Lisa Slotnick, recommends that the State Board of Education approve Indian Hill Exempted Village School District's determination and payment in lieu of transporting certain students attending St. Mary's School; and

Based on the evidence presented and the factors set forth in ORC 3327.02, the hearing officer found that based upon the reliable, probative, and substantial evidence presented in this matter, Indian Hill Exempted Village School District performed a thorough analysis and followed the requirements of the Ohio Revised Code in this matter in determining that transporting the student to St. Mary's School was impractical.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that upon consideration of the hearing officer's report and recommendation and the relevant law, the State Board of Education hereby adopts the recommendation of the hearing officer and approves Indian Hill Exempted Village School District's determination of impractical transportation and payment in lieu of transportation of a certain student attending St. Mary's School for all the reasons set forth in the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to serve a true copy of this resolution on the parents, Indian Hill Exempted Village School District, and counsel of record, if applicable.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Dodd that the above recommendation (Item 36) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Cathye Flory
Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock
Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire

Kara Morgan Eric Poklar Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

NO VOTES

Stephanie Dodd Meryl Johnson

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 37):

37. RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND THE ADOPTION OF THE ASSESSMENT AND QUALIFYING SCORE FOR THE INTERVENTION SPECIALIST GIFTED LICENSE AND GIFTED INTERVENTION SPECIALIST ENDORSEMENT (OAE 053) LICENSURE EXAM

The State Board of Education ("Board") hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolution:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.07 requires the State Board of Education (Board) to formulate and prescribe minimum standards related to licensing educators;

ORC 3319.22 further requires the Board to adopt rules establishing the standards and requirements for obtaining the educator licenses that the Board issues;

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-24-18 requires the prospective resident educator to pass an examination prescribed by the Board in the subject area to be taught before the license is issued;

ORC 3319.26 requires the prospective alternative educator to similarly pass an examination prescribed by the Board in the subject area to be taught before a license is issued;

The Ohio Department of Education's testing vendor Evaluation Systems group of Pearson (vendor) presented its Standard Setting data to the Educator Standards Board at its June 2018 meeting regarding the Gifted Education (053) licensure exam;

The Educator Standards Board in the same June 2018 meeting recommended that the Board adopt a qualifying score at the panel recommended value for the Exam of 67.

The Educators and Student Options Committee recommended at its June 11, 2018 meeting that the Board approve the adoption of the new Gifted Education Exam (053) for both prospective resident and alternative resident educator licensees for the Intervention Specialist Gifted License and the Gifted Intervention Specialist Endorsement, and that the raw qualifying score for the exam be set at the panel recommended value 67; and that the effective date is January 1, 2019, for which this new Gifted Exam (053) will be required for licensure.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board approves the adoption of the new Gifted Education Exam (053) for both prospective resident and alternative resident educator licensees for the Intervention Specialist Gifted License and the Gifted Intervention Specialist Endorsement, and that the raw qualifying score for the exam be set at the panel recommended value 67; and that the effective date is January 1, 2019, for which this new Gifted Exam (053) will be required for licensure.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 37) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Cathye Flory Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock Nancy Hollister
Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire
Kara Morgan Eric Poklar
Lisa Woods Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 38):

# 38. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE ASSESSMENT AND QUALIFYING SCORE FOR THE MULTI-AGE AMERICAN SIGN LANGUAGE SUBTESTS (OAE 050/051) LICENSURE EXAM

The State Board of Education ("Board") hereby **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolution:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.07 requires the State Board of Education (Board) to formulate and prescribe minimum standards related to licensing educators;

ORC 3319.22 further requires the Board to adopt rules establishing the standards and requirements for obtaining the educator licenses that the Board issues;

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-24-18 requires the prospective resident educator to pass an examination prescribed by the Board in the subject area to be taught before the license is issued;

ORC 3319.26 requires the prospective alternative educator to similarly pass an examination prescribed by the Board in the subject area to be taught before a license is issued;

The Ohio Department of Education's testing vendor Evaluation Systems group of Pearson (vendor) presented its Standard Setting data to the Educator Standards Board at its June 2018 meeting regarding the Multi-Age American Sign Language Subtests (050/051) licensure exam;

The Educator Standards Board (ESB) in the same June 2018 meeting recommended that the Board adopt qualifying scores at the panel recommended value for Subtest 1 (050) at a value of 27. For Subtest II (051), the ESB recommended that the Board adopt the vendor and ODE recommended qualifying participation requirements as follows:

- 1. Candidates answer correctly, at a minimum, 33% of the scorable multiple-choice items; and
- 2. Candidates' responses to each of the four expressive production assignments are judged scoreable because the response is:
- primarily in American Sign Language,
- related to the assignment, and
- sufficient in length to score.

The Educators and Student Options Committee hereby recommended at its June 11, 2018 meeting that the Board approve the adoption of the new American Sign Language Exam (050/051 Subtests I and II) for both prospective resident and alternative resident educator licensees for Multi-Age American Sign Language and that the qualifying score for Subtest 1 be set at the recommended panel-based passing score of 27 and to adopt the recommended qualifying participation requirements for Subtest II as follows:

- 1. Candidates answer correctly at a minimum, 33% of the scorable multiple choice items: and
- 2. Candidates' responses to each of the four expressive production assignments are judged scoreable because the response is:
- primarily in American Sign Language,
- related to the assignment, and
- sufficient in length to score;

and that the effective date is January 1, 2019 for which this new ASL Exam (050/051 Subtests I and II) will be required for licensure.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board approves the adoption of the new American Sign Language Exam (050/051 Subtests I and II) for both prospective resident and alternative resident educator licensees for Multi-Age American Sign Language and that the qualifying score for Subtest 1 be set at the recommended panel-based passing score of 27 and to adopt the recommended qualifying participation requirements for Subtest II as follows:

- 1. Candidates answer correctly at a minimum, 33% of the scorable multiple choice items: and
- 2. Candidates' responses to each of the four expressive production assignments are judged scoreable because the response is:
- primarily in American Sign Language,
- related to the assignment, and
- sufficient in length to score;

and that the effective date is January 1, 2019 for which this new ASL Exam (050/051 Subtests I and II) will be required for licensure.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 38) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Martha Manchester
Kara Morgan
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd Sarah Fowler Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire

Eric Poklar Tess Elshoff

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 39):

# 39. RESOLUTION APPOINTING MEMBER TO THE EDUCATOR STANDARDS BOARD

The State Board of Education ADOPTS the following Preambles and Resolution:

Ohio Revised Code Section 3319.60 provides for the creation of an Educator Standards Board charged with bringing to the State Board of Education recommendations on standards for teachers and principals, professional development and other educator-related items;

Ohio Revised Code Section 3319.60 directs the State Board of Education to appoint to the Educator Standards Board ten public school teachers, one non-public school teacher, five administrators, one school board member and one parent representative;

Ohio Revised Code Section 3319.60 provides that vacancies on the board shall be filled in the same prescribed manner as appointments under that section;

The position on the Education Standards Board for a Middle School Principal is now vacant;

The designated stakeholder group has nominated two individuals for the open seat on the Educator Standards Board;

The State Board reviewed the nominations for the Educator Standards Board for the position noted below;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education hereby appoints the following individual to the Educator Standards Board to fill the vacant position noted below for the remaining term expiring on June 30, 2019:

President Elshoff opened the floor for nominations.

Mrs. Dodd Moved the nomination for William Joseph Friess. Mrs. Flory Moved the nomination for Robert Knisely. Mrs. Dodd and Mrs. Flory spoke in favor of the candidates they nominated. Ms. Fowler spoke in favor of Mr. Friess and acknowledged the excellent group of candidates submitted to the Board.

President Elshoff stated nominations would be closed barring any objections. There were no objections.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote for Board members to say the name of the candidate they were voting for.

William Joseph Friess

Pat Bruns Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester Charlotte McGuire

Kara Morgan Eric Poklar

Lisa Woods

Robert Knisely

Cathye Flory Nancy Hollister

Tess Elshoff

William Joseph Friess received 11 votes and the appointment to the Educator Standards Board.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 40):

# 40. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE OHIO LEARNING STANDARDS - EXTENDED

The Achievement and Graduation Requirements Committee **RECOMMENDS** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the Ohio Learning Standards-Extended, in accordance with the following preamble and resolution:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.079 requires the State Board of Education to adopt statewide academic standards for each of grades kindergarten through twelve that emphasize coherence, focus, and rigor. Every Student Succeeds Act (20 U.S.C. 6301) requires states have an alternate assessment for students with the most significant cognitive disabilities, which must be aligned with alternate academic achievement standards for students with the most significant cognitive disabilities.

The Department reviewed Ohio's Learning Standards-Extended. As part of the comprehensive review process, the Department sought input from Ohio stakeholders which valued teachers' work with the standards, sought to improve the standards, and created a process for future improvements;

As part of this input, a public comment survey was conducted during November 2017-December 2017 for English Language Arts and Mathematics and February 2018-March 2018 for Science and Social Studies. This resulted in 694 responses from stakeholders to recommend revisions; and

The Department also convened advisory committees of Ohio educational organizations and working groups by grade band of Ohio educators to make recommended revisions and address issues of clarity, grade level appropriateness, content, and consider the comments raised through the public comment surveys;

The Achievement and Graduation Requirements Committee reviewed the revised Ohio Learning Standards-Extended in July 2018 and adopted a resolution that recommended approval of these standards.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education hereby approves the revised Ohio Learning Standards-Extended in the form presented to the Board for the September 2018 Board meeting;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education authorizes the Superintendent of Public Instruction to publish these standards electronically or through other media as Ohio's Learning Standards-Extended and their accompanying forms and to make such revisions to form and style as may be determined necessary of a non-substantive nature, including grammatical and other technical matters;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that State Board of Education approves these standards becoming operational to inform district curriculum in the school year 2018-2019; and be used for the Alternate Assessment for Students with Significant Cognitive Disabilities (AASCD) during the 2019-2020 school year;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction makes periodic reports on the implementation of Ohio's Learning Standards-Extended to the State Board of Education in order to inform its understanding of the transition to full operation of the Learning Extended-Standards; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education authorizes the Superintendent of Public Instruction to inform all school districts, community

schools, nonpublic schools, and STEM schools of the adoption of these standards to provide such technical assistance and professional development possible to assist in the transition of Ohio's Learning Standards-Extended in all content areas.

It was Moved by Mrs. Kohler that the above recommendation (Item 40) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Eric Poklar Tess Elshoff Stephanie Dodd Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Kara Morgan Lisa Woods

#### NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler

Motion carried.

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 41):

# 41. RESOLUTION TO RECOMMEND ADOPTION OF THE STATE SUPERINTENDENT GOALS

The Executive Committee hereby **RECOMMENDS** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following:

Pursuant to Article V, Section D. of the State Board of Education's Policies and Procedures Manual, as revised in May 2017, the State Board annually evaluates the Superintendent of Public Instruction (Superintendent) by measuring the Ohio Department of Education's performance, to the degree it reflects and incorporates State Board policies, and including the State Board members' feedback regarding the Superintendent's strengths and opportunities for improvement and indicators of success relative to leadership, communication and policy making, and the State Board members' ratings on the Superintendent's performance of his goals;

Since the Superintendent's 2017-2018 evaluation, the State Superintendent submitted proposed goals to the State Board of Education for their review and consideration;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, after review and consideration of these goals, the Executive Committee recommends that the State Board of Education adopt those goals in the form attached hereto.

It was Moved by Mrs. Elshoff that the above recommendation (Item 41) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Pat Bruns
Cathye Flory
Nancy Hollister
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire

Eric Poklar Tess Elshoff

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler

Motion carried.

Stephanie Dodd Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Kara Morgan Lisa Woods

President Elshoff presented the following recommendation (Item 42):

# 42. RESOLUTION ON THE ANNUAL EVALUATION AND COMPENSATION FOR THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

The Executive Committee hereby **RECOMMENDS** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following:

Pursuant to Article V, Section D of the State Board of Education's Policies and Procedures Manual, as revised in May 2017, the State Board annually evaluates the Superintendent of Public Instruction (the Superintendent) by measuring the Department's performance to the degree it reflects and incorporates State Board policies and including the State Board members' feedback regarding the Superintendent's strengths and opportunities for improvement and indicators of success relative to leadership, communication and policy making and the State Board members' ratings on the Superintendent's performance of his goals.

Based on the State Board Members' ratings of the Superintendent's performance, Paolo DeMaria has been effective in working on the education system policy and system performance, relationship with the State Board of Education, relationship with education stakeholders, communications, operations of the Ohio Department of Education and the 2017-2018 priority projects.

The State Board appreciates the leadership and performance of Paolo DeMaria and expresses continued confidence in him as the Superintendent.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Executive Committee recommends that the State Board of Education approve a two and three-quarter percent (2.75%) salary increase for the Superintendent of Public Instruction, so that his compensation will be increased to One Hundred Eighty-Nine Thousand

Five Hundred Seventy-One Dollars and 20/100 (\$189,571.20) effective June 24, 2018, and a bonus paid in the amount of Twenty Thousand Dollars (\$20,000.00).

It was Moved by Mrs. Elshoff that the above recommendation (Item 42) be approved.

President Elshoff called for a roll call vote.

#### YES VOTES

Pat Bruns Cathye Flory Nancy Hollister Laura Kohler Charlotte McGuire Eric Poklar Tess Elshoff Stephanie Dodd Linda Haycock Meryl Johnson Martha Manchester Kara Morgan Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Sarah Fowler

Motion carried.

#### PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NONACTION ITEMS

- 1) Dr. K. McMahon-Klosterman, Oxford Citizens for Peace and Justice. Dr. McMahon-Klosterman spoke to the Board regarding Native American mascots in schools.
- 2) Philip J. Yenyo, Executive Director, American Indian Movement of Ohio (AIM). Mr. Yenyo spoke to the Board regarding Native American mascots in schools.
- 3) Mary Pember, Cincinnati. Ms. Pember spoke to the Board regarding Native American mascots in schools.
- 4) Ms. Louise Lawarre, Greater Anderson Promotes Peace. Ms. Lawarre spoke to the Board regarding Native American mascots in schools.
- 5) Ms. Janis Dutton, Oxford Citizens for Peace and Justice. Ms. Dutton spoke to the Board regarding Native American mascots in schools.
- 6) Ms. Elizabeth Hixon. Ms. Hixon spoke to the Board regarding Native American mascots in schools.

This concludes Public Participation on Nonaction Items.

Non-Resolutions
Old Business

There was no Old Business.

New Business	
There was no New Business.	

#### **Once Around**

Board members were encouraged to share with the rest of the Board, something positive occurring in their districts.

Ms. Johnson Moved to adjourn the meeting. Mrs. Flory Seconded the motion.

The President requested a voice vote.

Motion carried.

President Elshoff adjourned the meeting at 2:20 p.m. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Education is October 15-16, 2018.

ATTEST:

Tess Elshoff
President

State Board of Education

Tess Elshoy

Paolo DeMaria

Superintendent of Public Instruction

**Please note:** Copies of the attachments referenced in the Minutes may be obtained by contacting the Office of Board Relations at the Ohio Department of Education at (614) 728-2754.