

**STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION OF OHIO
MINUTES**

December 2019
Ohio Department of Education
25 South Front Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215

MEMBERS OF THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION

Cindy Collins	Stephen Dackin
Stephanie Dodd	Sarah Fowler
John Hagan	Linda Haycock
Kirsten Hill	Meryl Johnson
Jenny Kilgore	Laura Kohler
Mark Lamoncha	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Eric Poklar
Mike Toal	Reginald Wilkinson
Lisa Woods	

EX OFFICIO MEMBERS

Senator Peggy Lehner	Representative Don Jones
----------------------	--------------------------

SECRETARY

Paolo DeMaria
Superintendent of Public Instruction

Mr. Lamoncha and Mr. Poklar were absent from the meeting.

The State Board convened on Monday, December 9, at the Ohio Department of Education in Columbus.

Chapter 119 Hearing

December 9, 2019
8:30 a.m.

Hearing Regarding the Amending, Rescinding and Adoption of Rules

President Kohler stated the Board would proceed with the public hearing on the following rule actions:

- The amendment of 3301-13-09 Provisions for an excuse from taking any assessment required for graduation of for an adult with disabilities, or for providing accommodations on any assessment required for graduation for an adult.
- The amendment of 3301-16-08 State Seal of Biliteracy.

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

- The amendment of 3301-24-05 Licensure.
- The amendment of 3301-102-09 Approving applications for new internet-or computer-based community schools.

President Kohler called on Mia Yaniko, from the Office of the Attorney General, Chief, Education section. Ms. Yaniko called on Immy Singh, Chief Legal Counsel for the Ohio Department of Education.

Ms. Singh presented the following Board Exhibits:

- Board Exhibit 1 is the public notice that appears in the Register of Ohio and references the proposed rule actions subject to this hearing;
- Board Exhibits 2 through 5 would be true and accurate copies of the resolutions adopted by the State Board of Education regarding these rules;
- Board Exhibits 6 through 9 would be true and accurate copies of the rules as filed with the Joint Committee on Agency Rule Review (JCARR), Legislative Service Commission (LSC) and the Secretary of State;
- Board Exhibit 10 would be a true and accurate copy of public comment received regarding administrative rule 3301-24-05.

Ms. Singh explained the rules had been made available to all persons affected by the rules.

President Kohler stated that testimony would be received, either orally or in writing, for or against, the amendment of the rules that are under consideration. Anyone who wished to testify must complete the registration sheet. All testimony would be limited to no more than five minutes. If additional time is needed, consideration would be given to a reasonable extension. Any written testimony would be marked as Group Exhibit 11.

President Kohler announced that the Board would now receive testimony on the proposed actions before the Board.

PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON THE PROPOSED RULE ACTIONS

There were no requests.

President Kohler called on Ms. Yaniko, who submitted into evidence State Board Exhibits 1 through 10.

President Kohler stated that the exhibits were so received. As there was no more testimony, she declared the public hearing closed at 8:38 a.m.

STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

President Kohler convened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, December 9, at 8:39 a.m.

President Kohler asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephen Dackin
Stephanie Dodd	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Mike Toal
Reginald Wilkinson	Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

President Kohler called on Vice President McGuire, who Moved that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the appointment, employment, dismissal, discipline, promotion, demotion or compensation of a public employee or official; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(1) to consider the investigation of charges or complaints against a public employee, official, licensee, or regulated individual; that the State Board of Education go into Executive Session pursuant to Ohio Revised Code Section 121.22(G)(3) for the purpose of conferring with legal counsel about matters that are the subject of pending or imminent court action.

Mrs. Hill Seconded the motion.

The President called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephen Dackin
Stephanie Dodd	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Meryl Johnson	Jenny Kilgore
Laura Kohler	Martha Manchester
Charlotte McGuire	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Mike Toal
Reginald Wilkinson	Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

The Board went into Executive Session at 8:39 a.m.

The Board recessed from Executive Session at 9:55 a.m.

Following the recess of the State Board Business meeting, the Board held a Quasi-Judicial discussion, including those functions outlined in the State Board of Education's Policies and Procedures Manual.

Following Executive Session, The Board's Teaching, Leading and Learning and Continuous Improvement Committees met beginning at 9:55 a.m.

The State Board recessed for lunch.

RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Kohler reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Monday, December 9, at 12:40 p.m.

President Kohler welcomed Board members and guests and led the Board in the Pledge of Allegiance.

Review of Written Reports and Items for Vote

REPORT OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

Discussion of High School Graduation Requirements and Diploma Seal Guidelines:

Ohio's High School Graduation Requirements:

- Course Requirements
- Determination of Competency
- Determination of Readiness

Demonstration of Competency:

Criteria for the demonstration of competency is under development. Students will meet competency requirements in one of four ways.

- Competency on Ohio's State Tests
- Military Enlistment
- College Credit Plus
- Career Readiness

Career Readiness:

Students must meet two criteria – of which one must be foundational

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

- Foundational Demonstration:
 - Proficiency on WebXams
 - Earning an approved industry-recognized credential
 - Pre-apprenticeship or apprenticeship program
- Supporting Demonstration:
 - 250-hour Work-based learning experience
 - WorkKeys
 - OhioMeansJobs Readiness Seal

Demonstration of Readiness:

- Recent changes to Ohio's graduation requirements require students to earn 2 diploma seals to qualify for a high school diploma
- State law created 12 diploma seals and established the criteria for each seal
- State defined seals and locally defined seals

Legislative Requirement:

State law directs the Board to establish the system of state diploma seals.

Sec. 3313.6114. (A) The state board of education shall establish a system of state diploma seals for the purposes of allowing a student to qualify for graduation under section 3313.618 of the Revised Code. State diploma seals may be attached or affixed to the high school diploma of a student enrolled in a public or chartered nonpublic school.

Demonstration of Readiness:

Guidelines for earning these seals required Department development.

- Military Enlistment Seal
- Technology Seal
- Industry-Recognized Credential Seal

Military Enlistment Seal:

Requirements:

- Provide evidence of enlistment in an armed services branch of the military; OR
- Participating in an approved Junior Reserve Officer Training (JROTC) program

Proposed Guidelines:

Evidence of Enlistment

- Completion of the ASVAB
- Oath of Enlistment into a Delayed Entry Program (DEP)
- Signed enlistment contract

JROTC Participation

- Two school years (or equivalent)

Technology Seal:

Requirements

- Advanced Placement or International Baccalaureate; or
- Earning a "B" or higher in an approved College Credit Plus course; or
- Completing a course that meets guidelines set by the Ohio Department of Education

Proposed Guidelines

- Identification of Advanced Placement and International Baccalaureate courses and tests
- Definition of appropriate College Credit Plus Technology course
- Guidelines for local technology course

Industry-Recognized Credential Seal: Proposed Guidelines Under Development

Requirements:

Earn an industry-recognized credential that is aligned to a job that is determined to be “in-demand” in this state and its regions.

Demonstration of Readiness:

Criteria for earning these Seals is set by existing Ohio law, code or board policy.

- Citizenship Seal
- OhioMeansJobs Readiness Seal
- Seal of Biliteracy
- College Ready Seal
- Science Seal
- Honors Diploma Seal

Citizenship Seal:

- Proficient on the American History and American Government test
- Advanced Placement score of “2” or better
- International Baccalaureate score of “2” or better
- Earning a “B” or higher on approved CCP courses

OhioMeansJobs Readiness Seal

- Demonstration of professional skills and competencies
- Students must have 3 mentors to validate the 15 professional skills needed to earn the Seal

Seal of Biliteracy:

- Student must demonstrate proficiency in English and high levels of proficiency in at least one other world language
- Students can demonstrate proficiency in English and at least one other world language through a series of test-based options.

College Ready Seal:

- Earn remediation-free scores on the ACT or SAT

Science Seal:

- Proficient on the Biology test
- Advanced Placement score of “2” or better
- International Baccalaureate score of “2” or better
- Earning a “B” or higher on an approved CCP course

Honors Diploma Seal

- Meeting the criteria for one of six honors diplomas:
 - Honors Diploma
 - Career-Tech Honors Diploma
 - IB Honors Diploma
 - STEM Honors Diploma
 - Civics and Social Sciences
 - Fine Arts Honors Diploma

Demonstration of Readiness:

State law directs the guidelines for these seals be set by districts and schools.

- Community Service Seal
- Student Engagement Seal

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

- Fine and Performing Arts Seal

Community Service Seal:

- Completion of a community service project that is aligned with the guidelines adopted by the student's district board or school governing authority.

Student Engagement Seal:

- Participation in extracurricular activities such as athletics, clubs, or student government to a meaningful extent, as determined by local guidelines.

Fine and Performing Arts Seal:

- Demonstration of skill in the fine or performing arts according to an evaluation that is aligned with the guidelines adopted by the student's district board or school governing authority.

Determination of "Competency" Score:

- A "Competency" score will be determined for Algebra I and ELA II tests
- Determination made by the Department of Education in consultation with Department of Higher Education and Office of Workforce Transformation
- Stakeholder engagement to inform the process

Determination of Competency Score – Background

Ohio law specifies that each state assessment have at least five performance levels.

- Current: Five performance levels:
 - Limited
 - Basic
 - Proficient
 - Accelerated
 - Advanced
- Current: Four cut scores:
- Five performance levels require the identification of four cut scores, one each at the beginning of the Basic, Proficient, Accelerated and Advanced ranges.
- Performance level descriptors drive cut score setting:
 - Statements of expectations for what students at each of the five levels should know and be able to do.
 - Developed by teams of Ohio teachers and college faculty and reflect the state's adopted learning standards in the relevant content area.
- Test questions are arrayed and "bookmarked" to establish cut scores.

Determination of Competency Score – Considerations:

- Urgency
- Current performance percentages
- No bright line
- Students must earn competency score on both tests

STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION RECOGNITION CEREMONY

President Kohler provided Board members with an update regarding State Board recognitions:

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Each year the State Board of Education has the opportunity to recognize schools across the State that are doing great work in Education. There are three awards the Board will recognize;

The All A Award and it is presented by the State Board of Education and recognizes schools that earned straight A's on all of their applicable report card measures.

The Momentum Award and is presented by the State Board of Education and recognizes schools for exceeding expectations in student growth for the year. Schools must earn straight A's on all Value-Added measures on the report card. The school or district must have at least two Value-Added subgroups of students, which includes gifted, lowest 20% in achievement, and students with disabilities.

The Overall A Award and is presented by the State Board of Education and recognizes districts and schools that earned an Overall A.

There will be a follow up email to each Board member in early January that will show which schools in each district that received awards and how best to coordinate with the districts regarding award ceremonies.

President Kohler recessed the Board meeting at 2:15 p.m.

President Kohler reconvened the meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, December 10, at 8:30 a.m.

The Board's Integrated Student Supports and Assessment & Accountability Committees met beginning at 8:30 a.m.

RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Kohler reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, December 10, at 10:50 a.m.

President Kohler asked the Recording Secretary to call the roll.

MEMBERS PRESENT

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Meryl Johnson
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda

Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

President Kohler called for the approval of the Minutes of the November 2019 meeting. She asked if there were any corrections to the Minutes.

There were no corrections.

It was Moved by Dr. Wilkinson and Seconded by Mrs. Manchester that the Minutes be approved as presented. The President called for a voice vote.

Motion carried unanimously.

LEGISLATIVE REPORT

Superintendent DeMaria and key staff provided Board members with updates on the following topics:

Proposed Short-Term Changes to Ohio Law EdChoice Voucher Program; Policy & School Building Eligibility

Presenters: Barbara Shaner, Ohio Association of School Business Officials (OASBO). Will Schwartz, Ohio School Boards Association (OSBA)

Short-Term Relief:

For the reasons discussed below, districts are experiencing extreme increases in the number of vouchers being deducted from state payments. At the same time, foundation funding for education has been frozen at FY19 levels, so no additional state funds have been made available to cover the state share of the cost of vouchers.

While districts have received Student Wellness and Success Funds (SWSFs) for this biennium, these funds are purposed for removing "non-educational barriers to student success." They cannot be used to pay for EdChoice vouchers. Also, while districts can supplant funds already being spent on qualifying expenditures with SWSFs, this does not account for normal increases in educational costs, nor does it offset the extreme increases in deductions for EdChoice vouchers.

Solution: The state should directly fund new vouchers by providing a state appropriation to cover the full cost of any new vouchers awarded during the current biennium.

"And" versus "Or"

The criteria for school building eligibility for the EdChoice Voucher program was changed in law making it much easier for school buildings to become EdChoice eligible. Beginning with school year 2012-2013, buildings with a D or F grade for BOTH the Value-Added component AND the Performance Index component were EdChoice eligible.

Since that time, the criteria changed causing a building to become EdChoice eligible if it met one of those triggers, rather than both. Now, a building is eligible if it received:

- Overall building grades of D or F, OR
- Value Added grade of F; OR
- Performance index ranking in the bottom 10% of all buildings ranked; OR
- Four-year graduation rate grade of D or F; OR
- K-3 Literacy grade of D or F; OR
- Building is in a district subject to an academic distress commission.

Ohio went from having 120 EdChoice eligible buildings in the last school year to an expected 1200+ buildings in 2020-2021. 582 of those buildings received overall grades of either "A," "B," "C" on the 2018-2019 report card.

Solution: Buildings must have two or more of the above components with D or F grades before qualifying as EdChoice eligible.

Default EdChoice Program:

Ohio law currently requires that if a student qualifies for an EdChoice voucher both through the income-based Ed Choice criteria and the report card performance of their building, the default is the Ed Choice voucher based on building eligibility. This means that even though the student would qualify for a state-paid voucher, the payment for the voucher must come from the school district.

Since the original premise for offering vouchers to students was the notion that some students' families may not have the wherewithal to access a different education "choice" because of the cost of tuition, the income-based EdChoice voucher program ought to be the default for students who qualify for both programs.

Solution: Replace the current default mechanism in Ohio law to make the income-based voucher the default when a student qualifies for both programs.

Safe Harbor:

Ohio appropriately put in place a "safe harbor" provision for the school years 2014-2015, 2015-2016 and 2016-2017, to allow time for school districts to adjust to new testing requirements, the phase-in of the new report card and other accountability changes. By law, the "safe harbor" meant that performance during those three school years could not be counted toward sanctions such as eligibility for the EdChoice voucher program.

However, once the "safe harbor" period ended, Ohio law was not amended to remove the restriction against using those years for determining EdChoice eligibility. That means, if a building's performance improved over the "safe harbor" period, the improvement could not be used to keep the building from becoming EdChoice eligible.

Instead, the requirement that report card data from "two of the most recent three years" be used for this determination meant that data from school years 2012-2013 and 2013-2014 (along with 2017-2018) were used for the current year's eligibility. For example, the performance of students who graduated in the class of 2016 is being used to determine EdChoice eligibility.

Solution: If building performance improved during the "safe harbor" years, ODE should be directed to utilize that data when determining EdChoice eligibility.

K-3 literacy

Buildings are considered Ed Choice eligible if they have a D or F grade for K-3 Literacy. Currently, almost half the elementary school buildings in the state receive a D or F in K-3 Literacy. This is largely due to the fact that the K-3 Literacy component is flawed and does not accurately reflect the overall K-3 Literacy performance. It simply measures how successful districts and buildings are at

moving students from "off track" to "on track" in order to be proficient under Ohio's Third Grade Reading Guarantee. This means a building may become Ed Choice eligible because of the performance of a small percentage of its students were not moved to "on track."

Solution: Remove the K-3 Literacy measure from the criteria that makes a building EdChoice eligible. Long term, the K-3 Literacy measure on the report card needs to be changed to accurately reflect the building's performance.

Two of the Most Recent Three Years:

Currently, Ed Choice eligibility is based on data from two of the most recent three years (except the safe harbor years - see above). This criterion may be punishing buildings that have made improvement or have one year when performance slipped somewhat, but overall performance continues to improve.

Solution: Require that performance be measured by "three consecutive years".

Value Added:

Some improvements were made in HB 166, the biennial budget bill, to better reflect district performance on the value-added progress dimension of the report card. The first improvement was the rescaling of grades based on standard error. The legislation also changed the "demotion" component of value-added. Previously, a district could not be assigned an "A" if any subgroup scored below a "B." New legislation changes the subgroup performance to a "C" or higher. These changes ensure that a school's or district's progress is evaluated more accurately.

However, the criteria for EdChoice eligibility continues to allow years when this change was not in effect to determine a building's fate.

Solution: Require ODE to recompute the overall building grades for the school years that will affect EdChoice eligibility to match the legislature's own conclusion that the old law was unfair as evidenced in HB 166.

Overall Building Grades:

Ohio currently has buildings that are considered high performing (overall grade of A, B or C) on the list of buildings whose students qualify for Ed Choice vouchers due to the problems and inconsistencies already listed. While the suggested changes may alleviate some of the Ed Choice building designations, it is inconceivable that a building be EdChoice eligible when it has an overall passing grade.

Solution: Any building receiving an overall grade of A, B or C should not be subject to EdChoice eligibility and should be removed from eligibility list. Overall building grade is already being used to exempt high performing buildings from some EdChoice eligibility triggers.

High School Students Already Attending Private Schools:

The EdChoice Voucher program has long required students (except for kindergarten) to attend a public school prior to applying for a voucher. This practice serves to ensure the state's investment in private school tuition is aimed at students who otherwise would not be able to exercise an educational "choice." The payment of private school tuition would not be directed toward students whose parents were already paying tuition and would not have otherwise attended an EdChoice eligible building. Furthermore, the district of residence would receive state funding through the formula for the student as the student would be counted in the district's enrollment.

However, changes in HB 166 now allow students who have never attended a public school to qualify for a voucher to attend a private high school, if the public high school of residence is a designated as

an EdChoice-eligible building. School districts have not received any state funding for these students due to HB 166 providing funding at FY 19 levels which did not include these students in the district's enrollment count, yet the full voucher amount will be deducted from the district's payments. Once a student receives the voucher, they are eligible to receive it for the rest of their K-12 educational career.

Solution: Reverse the change in HB 166 and require high school students to attend a public school in the year prior to applying for an EdChoice voucher.

The State Board recessed for lunch.

RECONVENE STATE BOARD BUSINESS MEETING

President Kohler reconvened the Business meeting of the State Board of Education on Tuesday, December 10, at 1:17 p.m.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON VOTING AGENDA ITEMS

There was no Public Participation on Voting Agenda Items.

PUBLIC PARTICIPATION ON NON-VOTING AGENDA ITEMS

- 1) Dr. Katie Hendrickson, Director, State Government Affairs, Code.org. Dr. Hendrickson and student provided testimony to the Board regarding computer science.
- 2) Dr. Sharon Watkins, Mazie Hawkinberry, Soloman Bangora, Northwoods Career-Prep High School. Dr. Watkins and students provided testimony to the Board regarding career education.
- 3) Mrs. Melanie Elsey. Mrs. Elsey provided testimony to the Board regarding Health Education Standards.
- 4) Mr. Jarod Hartzler, Mr. Mike Collins, Ohio Alliance of Arts Educators. Mr. Hartzler and Mr. Collins provided testimony to the Board regarding licensure in the area of arts education.
- 5) Mr. Tony Fairhead, Childhood Food Solutions. Mr. Fairhead provided testimony to the Board regarding childhood food insecurity.
- 6) Mr. Charlie Keenan, Superintendent, Maple Heights City Schools. Mr. Keenan provided written testimony to the Board regarding support for proposed rule changes to OAC 3301-35-02 and -05.

DISCUSSION OF THE STATE SUPERINTENDENT'S GOALS

President Kohler provided Board members with an update regarding the development of the Superintendent's goals for the next year. The group affirmed the Board's goals should drive the Superintendent's goals. Goal areas of discussion are Achievement & Growth, Stewardship, Communication & Partnerships and Safety.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE TEACHING, LEADING AND LEARNING COMMITTEE

Chair: Sarah Fowler, Vice Chair: Mike Toal

Ms. Fowler gave a report from the Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Members Present: Fowler (Chair), Owens (Vice-Chair) Dackin, Haycock, Hill, Johnson, Manchester, Wilkinson.

OAC 3301-20-03 Employment of non-licensed individuals with certain criminal convictions (*Strategy 7*)

- Department staff provided Members with a summary of revised *OAC 3301-20-03 Employment of non-licensed individuals with certain criminal convictions*, currently up for five-year review.
- Committee members discussed the proposed revised rule, which aligns with OAC 3301-20-01 regarding employment of licensed educators. Following discussion, Members voted unanimously to recommend adoption of the revised rule, as presented.
- A resolution to adopt the revised rule will appear on the State Board's January 2020 voting agenda.

OAC 3301-69-01 Stipends for National Board Certified Teachers (*Strategy 1 & 2*)

- Department staff provided Members with an overview of a revised *OAC 3301-69-01 Stipends for National Board Certified Teachers*, currently up for five-year review.
- Committee members discussed the proposed revisions, which primarily remove redundant language from the Ohio Revised Code. Following discussion, Members voted unanimously to recommend adoption of the revised rule, as presented.
- A resolution to adopt the revised rule will appear on the State Board's January 2020 voting agenda.

Ohio Teacher Evaluation System Framework Revision (*Strategies 1 & 2*)

- Department staff provided Members with an overview of the Educator Standards Board's proposed revised Ohio Teacher Evaluation System (OTES) Framework and High-Quality Student Data (HQSD) definition. The revisions are recommended due to legislative changes contained in Senate Bill 216 of the 132nd General Assembly (SB 216). State Board adoption of a revised framework is required by May 1, 2020.
- These items were on the December agenda for discussion only and will return to the Committee's agenda in the coming months for a possible vote to recommend adoption by the State Board.

Ohio Learning Standards Revision: World Languages and Cultures (*Strategies 4*)

- Department staff provided Members with an overview of the proposed revised Learning Standards for World Languages and Cultures. The revisions were made as part of the periodic review of all Ohio Learning Standards.
- The revised standards were on the December agenda for discussion only and will return to the Committee's agenda in the coming months for a possible vote to recommend adoption by the State Board.

Overview: 22+ Adult High School Diploma Program (*Strategies 10*)

- Department staff provided Members with an overview of Ohio's 22+ Adult High School Diploma Program in preparation for the Committee's upcoming review of revised Ohio Administrative Code rules *3301-45 Adult High School Diplomas* (22+).
- Proposed revised OAC 3301-45 rules are currently scheduled to appear on the Committee's January 2020 agenda for initial discussion.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT COMMITTEE

Chair: Antoinette Miranda, Vice Chair: Mike Toal

Dr. Miranda gave a report from the Continuous Improvement Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Members Present: Antoinette Miranda (Chair), Mike Toal (Vice Chair), Stephanie Dodd (member), John Hagan (member), and Jenny Kilgore

Absent: Mark Lamoncha (member) and Eric Poklar (Member)

Purpose(s) and/or Goal(s) of Meeting:

- Discuss and review the Department's proposed changes to the Operating Standards for Kindergarten through Twelfth Grade which are being amended pursuant to the five-year rule review. The committee planned to review rules 3301-35-08, 09 and 10.

Operating Standards – OAC 3301-35-01, 08, 09 and 10:

- Department staff reviewed the timeline for the review process for the Operating Standards and shared actions the Department took to garner feedback from the field.
- The committee and Department staff reviewed and discussed proposed changes to 3301-35-08 non-chartered, non-tax supported school, 3301-35-09 Chartered nonpublic schools, and 3301-35-10 Procedures for beginning a new school and for changing the location or ownership of a school.
- The committee reviewed the Department's responses to questions raised during the November meeting. Committee members further reviewed rules discussed during the November meeting and provided recommendations for revisions on the rules to the Department.
- The Department will share final proposed changes to rules 2 – 10 with stakeholders prior to a committee vote. This has changed the timeline of a committee vote on all rules in January 2020 to a committee vote on all rules in February 2020. The full board is now expected to vote on rules 1 – 10 during the March 2020 meeting.

- Next month, the committee will discuss and review changes to 3301-35-01 Purpose and definitions and review the Department's responses to questions raised during yesterday's meeting.

Unit of Field Relations Overview:

- Due to the time spent discussing proposed changes to the Operating Standards, committee members did not review this agenda item; the committee will plan to discuss this in the coming month as time allows.

Items Voted on and Outcome of Vote:

No items were voted on during this committee meeting.

Will there be a Vote or Information in Front of the Full Board at Next or Upcoming Meeting?

The full board is expected to vote on OAC 3301-35-01 through OAC 3301-35-10 during the March 2020 State Board meeting.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE INTEGRATED STUDENT SUPPORTS COMMITTEE

Chair: Charlotte McGuire, Vice Chair: Martha Manchester

Mrs. McGuire gave a report from the Integrated Student Supports Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Members Present: Charlotte McGuire, Committee Chair, Martha Manchester, Committee Vice Chair, Cindy Collins, Kirsten Hill, Meryl Johnson, Mark Lamoncha, Antoinette Miranda and Reginald Wilkinson.

School-Based Health Care:

- Staff presented on School-Based Health Care. The presentation included a basic overview of School-Based Health Care services, updates on the School-Based Health Care Network and an overview of Ohio's School-Based Health Care Support Toolkit.
- Committee members discussed the importance of having data to show positive outcomes from school-based health care efforts and parental consent and privacy.
- Committee members requested that future presentations to the committee include information on the various funding sources available to districts to support school-based health care, including an overview of Student Wellness and Success Funds. The committee members also requested information on the national health outcomes for youth at-risk including a comparison of Ohio and surrounding states in the Midwest.
- The agenda item was discussion only, therefore, there was no action by the committee and the item is not scheduled for full board.

Interventions and Supports in the Early Grades:

- Staff presented on interventions and supports for students in the early grades. The presentation included highlights of the work occurring in the Office of Early Learning and School Readiness, as well as the Office of Approaches to Teaching and Professional Learning, to prevent learning challenges and provide interventions in the early grades. The presentation included a success story from

Riverside School District who has improved their results on the third grade English language arts assessments.

- Committee members discussed the positive outcomes of the focus on evidence-based literacy intervention and supports, retention in the early grades including in the third-grade reading guarantee, and the importance of exposing students to broad set of experiences outside of the classroom including field trips.
- Committee members requested information on Riverside School District's curriculum and the definition of each of the developmental groups on the literacy continuum.
- The agenda item was discussion only, therefore, there was no action by the committee and the item is not scheduled for full board.

Culturally Responsive Practices Program:

- Staff presented on the Culturally Responsive Practices program developed by the Center for the Teaching Profession. The course is available to educators in the state of Ohio along with higher education faculty and students in education preparation programs. The program consists of four courses: Introduction, Culturally Responsive Practices, Socio-Political Engagement and Academic Achievement.
- Committee members discussed the importance of all educators having access to this training, the connection of this training to Each Child, Our Future, and how the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards align with Ohio's educator standards and the program vision.
- Committee members requested that staff provide the committee with future facilitator training dates when they are scheduled.
- The agenda item was discussion only, therefore, there was no action by the committee and the item is not scheduled for full board.

Strategy Updates:

- Staff presented updates on the Plan to Improve Results and Educational Experiences for Students with Disabilities. The plan is currently being drafted and the advisory committee has provided initial feedback. A full board presentation on the plan will occur before the plan is finalized in the spring.
- Staff also presented updates on Strategy 7 Meeting the Needs of the Whole Child. The Whole Child Advisory Group met on Dec. 5th and discussed the development of Ohio's whole child framework. Staff will present on this work at future meetings.
- The agenda item was discussion only, therefore, there was no action by the committee and the item is not scheduled for full board.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE ASSESSMENTS & ACCOUNTABILITY COMMITTEE

Chair: John Hagan, Vice Chair: Lisa Woods

Mr. Hagan gave a report from the Assessments & Accountability Committee meeting focusing on the following issues:

Members Present: John Hagan (Chair), Lisa Woods (Vice Chair), Jenny Kilgore, Linda Haycock, Mike Toal, Stephen Dackin, Stephanie Dodd

Geometry/Algebra 1 Assessments:

- The committee discussed the recent change in state law surrounding the elimination of the Geometry end-of-course exam as a graduation requirement. The elimination of the exam may create federal level consequences for Ohio’s assessment and accountability system and the committee discussed these dynamics.
- The committee members discussed the memo previously shared by Superintendent DeMaria and the three possible options outlined in that document.
- Department staff will collate the feedback that has been received by education stakeholders on the possible options and share with the committee members.

Competency Scores: Algebra 1 and English Language Arts:

- The committee also discussed the memo previously shared by Superintendent DeMaria on the requirement of setting competency scores related to the new graduation requirements.
- The committee will continue this discussion in January and has requested to review more in-depth the performance level descriptors used on Ohio’s state tests.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE DROP OUT PREVENTION AND RECOVERY WORKGROUP

Chair: John Hagan, Vice Chair: Lisa Woods

The Board’s Dropout Prevention and Recovery Workgroup presented its Report and Recommendations to the full Board for consideration and to be voted on at the January meeting of the Board.

BOARD PRESENTATIONS AND DISCUSSION FROM THE GRADUATION REQUIREMENTS AND HIGH SCHOOL REDESIGN TASK FORCE

Task Force Members:

Martha Manchester, Co-Chair
Rachel Dobney
Tanya Ficklin
Michelle Grimm
Julie Holderbaum
Michael King
Senator Peggy Lehner
Robert Mehno
Heather Powell
Debbie Tidwell
Bill Wise

Shelly Vaughn, Co-Chair
Emily Fabiano
Joe Glavan
Susan Gunnell
Keith Horner
Mark Lamoncha
Matt McCorkle
Antoinette Miranda
Michelle Snow
Dana Weber

November 25, 2019

Recently Adopted Graduation Requirements:

- Members received an update on the recently adopted graduation requirements.

- Specifically, staff and members discussed the proposed guidelines for work-based learning and the process for the determination of the competency score for the English 2 and Algebra I state assessments.

High School Redesign Scope of Work and Discussion:

- Members reviewed the proposed scope of work as it relates to high school redesign.
- Staff facilitated discussions related to the development of principles and themes that foster and promote high school redesign.
- The next Task Force meeting will be held on January 27th.

VOTING ON THE REPORT & RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUPERINTENDENT OF PUBLIC INSTRUCTION

President Kohler called on Superintendent DeMaria for his report and recommendations.

Mrs. Dodd requested Item 9 be pulled from the Consent Agenda and be voted on separately.

President Kohler presented the following recommendations (Items 1-8) on the Consent Agenda:

1. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY CHRISTOPHER D. BECK AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Christopher D. Beck has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 21, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Christopher D. Beck that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Beck's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Christopher D. Beck is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Christopher D. Beck has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Christopher D. Beck's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Beck's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Christopher D. Beck be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Beck of this action.

2. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY RENEE BECK AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Renee Beck has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 6, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Renee Beck that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Beck's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Renee Beck is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Renee Beck has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Renee Beck's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Beck's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Renee Beck be permanently ineligible to apply for any

license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Beck of this action.

3. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY FRED M. DOUGHMAN AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Fred M. Doughman has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 18, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Fred M. Doughman that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Doughman's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Fred M. Doughman is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Fred M. Doughman has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Fred M. Doughman's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Doughman's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Fred M. Doughman be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Doughman of this action.

4. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY MARY F. FULLER AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Mary F. Fuller has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 14, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Mary F. Fuller that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Fuller's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Mary F. Fuller is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Mary F. Fuller has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Mary F. Fuller's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Fuller's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Mary F. Fuller be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Fuller of this action.

5. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY STEPHANIE A. HILBUN AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Stephanie A. Hilbun has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 5, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Stephanie A. Hilbun that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Hilbun's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Stephanie A. Hilbun is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Stephanie A. Hilbun has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Stephanie A. Hilbun's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Hilbun's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Stephanie A. Hilbun be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Hilbun of this action.

6. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY KATIE L. SCHWENDEMAN AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HER CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HER PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Katie L. Schwendeman has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 7, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Katie L. Schwendeman that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of her current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Schwendeman's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Katie L. Schwendeman is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Katie L. Schwendeman has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, her right to a hearing and her right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Katie L. Schwendeman's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that she has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Ms. Schwendeman's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Katie L. Schwendeman be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Schwendeman of this action.

7. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY JOSHUA K. SKEANS AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Joshua K. Skeans has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 19, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Joshua K. Skeans that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Skeans' decision not

to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Joshua K. Skeans is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Joshua K. Skeans has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Joshua K. Skeans' current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Skeans' decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Joshua K. Skeans be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Skeans of this action.

8. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY JAMES D. WARD AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS James D. Ward has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 21, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from James D. Ward that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Ward's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that James D. Ward is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS James D. Ward has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his

right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** James D. Ward's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Ward's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders James D. Ward be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Ward of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Dodd that the Consent Agenda (Items 1-8) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Motion carried.

President Kohler presented the following recommendation (Item 9):

- 9. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE PERMANENT VOLUNTARY SURRENDER AND DENIAL OF LICENSES FORM SIGNED BY NATHANIEL J. WYCINSKI AND TO ENTER AN ORDER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY ALL OF HIS CURRENT AND PREVIOUSLY HELD LICENSES, PERMITS, AND CERTIFICATES AND TO DENY PERMANENTLY ANY OF HIS PENDING APPLICATIONS FOR A LICENSE, PERMIT, OR CERTIFICATE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Nathaniel J. Wycinski has applied for and/or has been issued a license, permit, or certificate by the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS on November 1, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a permanent voluntary surrender and denial of licenses form from Nathaniel J. Wycinski that authorizes the State Board of Education to enter an order permanently revoking all of his current and previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and permanently denying any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Wycinski's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311; and

WHEREAS the form specifies that Nathaniel J. Wycinski is ineligible for and may not reapply for certification or licensure in the state of Ohio; and

WHEREAS Nathaniel J. Wycinski has expressly and forever waived all rights as set forth in Chapter 119 of the Ohio Revised Code, including but not limited to, his right to a hearing and his right to appeal the Resolution of the State Board of Education: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and Ohio Revised Code 3319.311(F), hereby **REVOKES** Nathaniel J. Wycinski's current and any previously held licenses, permits, and certificates and **DENIES** any pending applications that he has submitted for a license, permit, or certificate based upon Mr. Wycinski's decision not to participate in any further proceedings pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.311. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b) and (A)(3)(b), orders Nathaniel J. Wycinski be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Wycinski of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Dr. Kilgore that the above recommendation (Item 9) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Stephanie Dodd

Motion carried.

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 10):

10. RESOLUTION TO RESCIND OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE RULE 3301-20-02 / CIRCUMSTANCES UPON WHICH INDIVIDUALS WITH CERTAIN CONVICTIONS MAY PARTICIPATE IN THE OHIOREADS PROGRAM

The State Board of Education (“Board”) hereby **RESCINDS** Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-20-02 as follows:

OAC 3301-20-02 amplified Ohio Revised Code (ORC) 3301.88 and set restrictions on who may participate in the OhioReads program;

ORC 3301.88 was repealed under House Bill 477 of the 132nd General Assembly;

With the repeal of ORC 3301.88, OAC 3301-20-02 is obsolete and unnecessary;

The Teaching, Learning and Learning Committee recommended rescission of the rule at its November 2019 meeting.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board rescinds OAC 3301-20-02 / Circumstances Upon Which Individuals with Certain Convictions may Participate in the OhioReads program;

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction or his designee be, and hereby is, directed to file the rule with the proper agencies, and the same be made available upon request, without charge, to all persons affected by said rule; and

FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and hereby is, directed to give proper notice under the provisions of Chapter 119 of the Revised Code of the holding of a hearing on said rule; that public notice be given in the Register of Ohio, and that said notice contain a general statement of the subject matter to which the rule relates.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 10) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Motion carried.

Mr. Hagan presented the following recommendation (Item 11):

11. RESOLUTION TO APPROVE PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO SECTIONS 3301-28-01 AND 3301-28-03 THROUGH 3301-28-07 OF THE OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

The State Board of Education (the “Board”) is required under Ohio Revised Code section 3302.03 to establish performance criteria for each letter grade on Ohio’s School Report Cards and to prescribe a method by which the Department of Education (the “Department”) assigns each letter grade;

The Board is further required under Ohio Revised Code section 3302.03 to designate performance measures that are applicable to the building and that must be calculated separately and used to calculate the building’s overall grade;

The Board’s administrative rules regarding the performance criteria for Ohio Report Cards are set forth in Chapter 3301-28 of the Ohio Administrative Code;

As part of a five-year rule review, the Assessment and Accountability Committee reviewed the following six rules within Chapter 3301-28 of the Ohio Administrative Code: sections 3301-28-01 and 3301-28-03 through 3301-28-07;

The Department posted the rules for public comment, which began October 18, 2019, and ended on November 6, 2019;

In light of on-going external work-group reviews of the Ohio Report Cards, the Assessment and Accountability Committee recommended that the Board not make any amendments to the six rules, with the exception of amendments that are required by the 133rd General Assembly’s enactment of House Bill 166; and

The rules may be reviewed again in the near future based on recommendations from the work-group or revisions to Ohio law regarding Ohio Report Cards.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that State Board of Education adopts the proposed amendments to section 3301-28-06 of the Ohio Administrative Code in the form attached hereto.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that State Board of Education approves no changes to sections 3301-28-01, 3301-28-03 through 3301-28-05, and 3301-28-07 of the Ohio Administrative Code in the form attached hereto.

It was Moved by Mr. Hagan that the above recommendation (Item 11) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 12):

12. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE ADOLESCENCE TO YOUNG ADULT TEACHING LICENSE APPLICATIONS OF DALE A. HARDEN

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Dale A. Harden has applied for two one-year substitute adolescence to young adult teaching licenses; and

WHEREAS on November 28, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Dale A. Harden of its intent to deny or permanently deny both of his applications for a one-year substitute adolescence to young adult teaching license pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Harden engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about January 6, 2016, when he twice showed a YouTube video titled *King Tut's Rap* to sixth grade students that contained references to hoes, fellatio, and smoking a blunt, in addition to containing suggestive sexual images; and

WHEREAS Mr. Harden did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on June 18, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Harden was not present at the hearing or represented by counsel, but he did submit his contentions in writing; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Harden's applications be denied. Further it is recommended that Mr. Harden be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Harden's conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession and the negative impact his licensure will have on the welfare of the school community; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Dale A. Harden's applications for one-year substitute adolescence to young adult teaching license based upon Mr. Harden engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about January 6, 2016, when he twice showed a YouTube video titled *King Tut's Rap* to sixth grade students that contained references to hoes, fellatio, and smoking a blunt, in addition to containing suggestive sexual images. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(b), orders Dale A. Harden be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Harden of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. Manchester and Seconded by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 12) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 13):

13. RESOLUTION TO REVOKE THE ONE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE GENERAL EDUCATION TEACHING LICENSE OF MARY P. HARRISON

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Mary P. Harrison held a one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2018; and

WHEREAS on September 13, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Mary P. Harrison of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2018 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Harrison's 2018 conviction in the Franklin County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after leaving two children alone in a car for approximately twenty-five minutes; and

WHEREAS the notice informed Ms. Harrison that if she fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code, the State Board of Education will proceed to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2018; and

WHEREAS Mary P. Harrison did not request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has reviewed the affidavit of the director of the Office of Professional Conduct, Notice of the State Board of Education's Intended Action and Opportunity for a Hearing, certified court records from the Franklin County Municipal Court, and police records from the Columbus Division of Police; and

WHEREAS Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-05 authorizes the State Board of Education to impose disciplinary action against any licenses held or applied for without holding an administrative hearing if the applicant and/or license holder fails within thirty days to request a hearing in accordance with Section 119.07 of the Revised Code; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Mary P. Harrison's one-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2018 based upon Ms. Harrison's 2018 conviction in the Franklin County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of disorderly conduct after leaving two children alone in a car for approximately twenty-five minutes. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a), orders that Mary P. Harrison be ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after December 9, 2022, provided she submits to the Ohio Department of Education that she has completed, at her own expense, a parenting class which is approved in advance by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Harrison of this action.

It was Moved by Mr. Owens and Seconded by Mrs. Collins that the above recommendation (Item 13) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Charlotte McGuire

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 14):

14. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE THE FOUR-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF TIMOTHY J. HUDSON

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Timothy J. Hudson holds a four-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS on June 15, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Timothy J. Hudson of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his four-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Hudson engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about September 2, 2016 when, during a teacher in-service, he sent inappropriate electronic messages to a female colleague which included a text message indicating that another female colleague was physically attractive, an image of a woman stretching, and a GIF (moving image) of a man simulating masturbation; and

WHEREAS Mr. Hudson did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on October 24, 2018; and

WHEREAS Mr. Hudson was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Hudson's four-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016 be revoked and that he not be permitted to reapply for any license for a period of one year and upon reapplication, he must submit written proof that he has completed, at his own cost, eight hours of boundary training and eight hours of sexual harassment training with the trainings to be approved by the Ohio Department of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Hudson's conduct being unbecoming and his behavior reflecting negatively on the teaching profession and casting him in a light of a poor role model; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Timothy J. Hudson's four-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016 based upon Mr. Hudson engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about September 2, 2016 when, during a teacher in-service, he sent inappropriate electronic messages to a female colleague which included a text message indicating that another female colleague was physically attractive, an image of a woman stretching, and a GIF (moving image) of a man simulating masturbation. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(a), orders that Timothy J. Hudson be ineligible to reapply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after December 9, 2020, and upon reapplication, Mr. Hudson must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has successfully completed, at his own expense, eight hours of boundary training and eight hours of sexual harassment training, with the training to be approved in advance by the Ohio Department of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Hudson of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mr. Toal that the above recommendation (Item 14) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler

Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Reginald Wilkinson

Charlotte McGuire
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 15):

15. **RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT OF THE HEARING OFFICER, TO AMEND AND RECONCILE THE RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER, AND TO SUSPEND THE FIVE-YEAR SCHOOL TREASURER LICENSE AND FIVE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE GENERAL EDUCATION TEACHING LICENSE OF ROBERT W. KUEHNLE**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Robert W. Kuehnle holds a five-year school treasurer license issued in 2015 with an effective year of 2016 and five-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2015 with an effective year of 2016; and

WHEREAS on April 19, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Robert W. Kuehnle of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year school treasurer license issued in 2015 with an effective year of 2016 and five-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2015 with an effective year of 2016 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Kuehnle, on or about the 2012-2013, 2013-2014, and 2014-2015 school years during and around the time of his employment as treasurer with the Benjamin-Local Local School District, engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to his position as a treasurer when he failed to maintain professional relationships with several students on the following occasions: on or about December 4, 2012 at 2:11 a.m., Mr. Kuehnle tweeted a high school student for a non-educational purpose; he paid \$800 for the same student to attend a trip to Boston and proceeded to have lunch with the student at a restaurant with no other adult present; on or about January 24, 2013, he tweeted another high school student, implying that the student was tall, blonde, and beautiful; and the Benjamin-Local Local School District completed an investigation and issued a written reprimand to Mr. Kuehnle on or about December 15, 2014 for the actions described above, along with other allegations of misconduct. Further, the notice included as an aggravating factor that on or about September 27, 2004, while serving as a duly elected member of the Madison-Plains Local School District Board of Education, the Madison County Common Pleas Court ordered him removed from office for committing numerous violations of law and judgment that warranted the sanction of removal; and

WHEREAS Mr. Kuehnle requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on June 18-19, 2019 and July 15, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Kuehnle was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Kuehnle's licenses be suspended for a period of two years from the date of the final order issued by the State Board of Education with the entire suspension period stayed provided he does not engage in any further conduct unbecoming an educator's position during the stay and that he complete eight hours of boundary training within one hundred and twenty days of the effective date of the final order issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Kuehnle engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession during the 2012-2013 school year by communicating with several students through social media and other direct interactions that violated a school district policy prohibiting such communication unless for an educational purpose or part of his duties as treasurer; and

WHEREAS Mr. Kuehnle's five-year school treasurer license issued in 2015 with an effective year of 2016 and five-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2015 with an effective year of 2016 will expire on June 30, 2021; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education must reconcile the hearing officer's recommendation to suspend Mr. Kuehnle's licenses for a total period of two years with the 2021 expiration of his licenses; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **SUSPENDS** Robert W. Kuehnle's five-year school treasurer license issued in 2015 with an effective year of 2016 and five-year substitute general education teaching license issued in 2015 with an effective year of 2016 from June 30, 2019 through June 30, 2021, their expiration date. Further, the State Board of Education hereby **STAYS** the suspension provided Mr. Kuehnle refrains from engaging in any further conduct unbecoming an educator's position during the stayed suspension period and provides written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has completed, at his own expense, eight hours of boundary training by April 7, 2020, with the training to be approved in advance by the Ohio Department of Education. The suspension period is based upon Mr. Kuehnle, on or about the 2012-2013, 2013-2014, and 2014-2015 school years during and around the time of his employment as treasurer with the Benjamin-Local Local School District, engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to his position as a treasurer when he failed to maintain professional relationships with several students on the following occasions: on or about December 4, 2012 at 2:11 a.m., Mr. Kuehnle tweeted a high school student for a non-educational purpose; he paid \$800 for the same student to attend a trip to Boston and proceeded to have lunch with the student at a restaurant with no

other adult present; and on or about January 24, 2013, he tweeted another high school student, implying that the student was tall, blonde, and beautiful. Pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-21(B), the State Board of Education further considers in aggravation that on or about September 27, 2004, while serving as a duly elected member of the Madison-Plains Local School District

Board of Education, the Madison County Common Pleas Court ordered him removed from office for committing numerous violations of law and judgment that warranted the sanction of removal; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education, on its behalf, to implement the aforementioned terms and conditions regarding Mr. Kuehnle's licenses. Further, if said terms and conditions have not been fulfilled completely upon Mr. Kuehnle applying for a new license, permit, or certificate, the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education to evaluate any new application in accordance with its orders and ensure all outstanding terms and conditions are addressed; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Kuehnle of this action.

It was Moved by Dr. Kilgore and Seconded by Ms. Woods that the above recommendation (Item 15) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 16):

- 16. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL ELEMENTARY TEACHING LICENSE OF JARROD R. MAYBURY**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Jarrod R. Maybury holds a five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on August 31, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Jarrod R. Maybury of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Maybury engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about March 15, 2017, he was convicted in the Licking County Municipal Court of one misdemeanor count of violating a protection order; on or about November 2016, he accessed sexually inappropriate websites, including pornography, on his school district issued device; and on or about October 2016, he used an electronic cigarette on school grounds and during school hours. Further, the notice included the following aggravating factors: on or about October 25, 2016, Mr. Maybury was issued a written reprimand for, amongst other conduct, entering classrooms other than his own after school hours and removing items from said classrooms without permission and this was a repeated offense; on or about April 21, 2016, he was issued an oral reprimand for leaving students unsupervised during gym class, during which time an altercation occurred between two students; and on or about February 3, 2016, he was issued an oral reprimand for removing computers that were not issued to him from school rooms without permission and this occurred after he borrowed a computer in July 2015 without asking permission or notifying the teacher; and

WHEREAS Mr. Maybury requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on July 23, 2019 and August 6, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Maybury was not present at the hearing, but he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Maybury's license be revoked and that he be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Maybury engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession as a result of his 2017 conviction for violation of a protection order, using an electronic cigarette on school grounds during school hours in violation of school district policy, and using his school district issued computer to search for and access nearly two hundred sexually inappropriate websites, including pornography, in violation of school district policy, and further, Mr. Maybury's continued licensure will negatively impact the health, safety, or welfare of students and the school community; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Jarrod R. Maybury's five-year professional elementary teaching license issued in 2015 based upon Mr. Maybury engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about March 15, 2017, he was convicted in the Licking County Municipal Court of one misdemeanor count of violating a protection order; on or about November 2016, he accessed sexually inappropriate websites, including pornography, on his school district issued device; and on or about October 2016, he used an electronic cigarette on school grounds and during school hours. Pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-21(B), the State Board of Education further considers in aggravation that on or about October 25, 2016, Mr. Maybury was issued a written reprimand for, amongst other conduct, entering classrooms other than his own after school hours and removing items from said classrooms without permission and this was a repeated offense; on or about April 21, 2016, he was issued an oral reprimand for leaving students unsupervised during gym class, during which time an altercation occurred between two students; and on or about February 3, 2016, he was issued an oral reprimand for removing computers that were not issued to him from school rooms without permission and this occurred after he borrowed a computer in July 2015 without asking permission or notifying the teacher. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Jarrod R. Maybury be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Maybury of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Woods and Seconded by Dr. Wilkinson that the above recommendation (Item 16) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 17):

17. RESOLUTION TO RESCIND THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION'S RESOLUTION, DATED OCTOBER 15, 2019, REGARDING ASHELY MILLER AND TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL MIDDLE CHILDHOOD TEACHING LICENSE OF ASHLEY L. MILLER

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Ashley L. Miller holds a five-year professional middle childhood teaching license issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on October 4, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Ashley L. Miller of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her five-year professional middle childhood teaching license issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Miller engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about the 2014-2015 school year, she failed to maintain appropriate student-teacher boundaries with a student and her conduct included exchanging nude photos and other communication with the student via text and/or Snapchat, giving the student rides home and kissing the student, with the inappropriate relationship culminating in a physical relationship that occurred between the student's graduation and the middle of June 2015; and on or about June 2016 through April 2016, she failed to follow Westerville City School District Board policies and mishandled \$375.00 of school funds from a fundraiser that took place in June 2015 and she did not return the funds to the school until approximately April 15, 2016, after several months of communication from the school district; and

WHEREAS Ms. Miller did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on April 22, 2019; and

WHEREAS Ms. Miller was not present at the hearing, nor was she represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Miller's teaching license be revoked and that she be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Miller engaging in conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession as a result of her failure to recognize and adhere to appropriate student-teacher boundaries when she had an inappropriate relationship with a student and her actions in retaining student fundraising monies over an extended period of time until pressed for their return; and

WHEREAS on October 15, 2019, the State Board of Education revoked permanently Ashley L. Miller's five-year professional middle childhood teaching license issued in 2015. The State Board's October 15, 2019 resolution accepted the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS on August 29, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education, in accordance with Ohio Revised Code 119.07, mailed the hearing officer's report and

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

recommendation with a certificate of mailing via U.S. First Class Mail to Ms. Miller's last known address after a prior attempt to serve Ms. Miller on June 26, 2019 with the report and recommendation via certified mail was returned as unclaimed; and

WHEREAS Ms. Miller did not file objections within ten days after the report and recommendation was mailed with a certificate of mailing and as of October 15, 2019, the report and recommendation had not been returned to the Ohio Department of Education; and

WHEREAS the State Board proceeded to review the matter and issued its October 15, 2019 resolution revoking permanently Ms. Miller's teaching license; and

WHEREAS after the State Board's review on October 15, 2019, the report and recommendation that was mailed to Ms. Miller was returned by the U.S. Postal Service to the Ohio Department of Education on October 16, 2019 marked as "Refused--No Longer at This Address"; and

WHEREAS on or about October 16, 2019, the State Superintendent, on behalf of the State Board of Education, re-sent the report and recommendation to a new address for Ms. Miller via certified mail. On October 22, 2019, the Ohio Department of Education received a signed certified mail receipt verifying service of the report and recommendation was complete; and

WHEREAS the report and recommendation that was sent to Ms. Miller advised her that she had ten days from receiving the report and recommendation to file objections in this matter; and

WHEREAS ten days have elapsed since Ms. Miller received the report and recommendation on October 18, 2019, and Ms. Miller has not filed objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education hereby **RESCINDS** its resolution dated October 15, 2019 that revoked permanently Ashley L. Miller's five-year professional middle childhood teaching license issued in 2015; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Ashley L. Miller's five-year professional middle childhood teaching license issued in 2015 based upon Ms. Miller engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about the 2014-2015 school year, she failed to maintain appropriate student-teacher boundaries with a student and her conduct included exchanging nude photos and other communication with the student via text and/or Snapchat, giving the student rides home and kissing the student, with the inappropriate relationship culminating in a physical relationship that occurred between the student's

graduation and the middle of June 2015; and on or about June 2016 through April 2016, she failed to follow Westerville City School District Board policies and mishandled \$375.00 of school funds from a fundraiser that took place in June 2015 and she did not return the funds to the school until approximately April 15, 2016, after several months of communication from the school district. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Ashley L. Miller be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Miller of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Manchester that the above recommendation (Item 17) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 18):

18. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO ADMONISH KRISTINA L. PERALTA AND TO ISSUE HER ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT AND TO ADD AN ESEA QUALIFIED ENDORSEMENT TO HER ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Kristina L. Peralta held a one-year educational aide permit issued in 2018, has applied for a one-year educational aide permit, and has applied to add an ESEA qualified endorsement to her pending application for a one-year educational aide permit; and

WHEREAS on January 4, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Kristina L. Peralta of its intent

to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her one-year educational aide permit issued in 2018 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b). The notice was based upon Ms. Peralta's 2018 conviction in the Miami County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of menacing; and

WHEREAS Ms. Peralta requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS the administrative record reflects that after she requested a hearing, Ms. Peralta applied for a one-year educational aide permit and to add an ESEA qualified endorsement to her pending application for a one-year educational aide permit; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on September 6, 2019; and

WHEREAS Ms. Peralta was present at the hearing, but she was not represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Peralta be admonished by the State Board of Education and that her applications be issued. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Peralta engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession as a result of her 2018 conviction, but finding in mitigation that Ms. Peralta has no previous criminal history, she is currently employed in a program that serves students with significant emotional and cognitive disabilities, she submitted letters of support that praise her job performance, she provided evidence of rehabilitation from her licensed professional clinical counselor that speaks to her involvement in and progress with counseling sessions, and she has no prior disciplinary action on her record; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1) and (B)(2)(b), hereby **ADMONISHES** Kristina L. Peralta based upon Ms. Peralta's 2018 conviction in the Miami County Municipal Court for one misdemeanor count of menacing; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby directs the Ohio Department of Education to **ISSUE** Kristina L. Peralta's one-year educational aide permit and to add an ESEA qualified endorsement to her a one-year educational aide permit; and Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Peralta of this action.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire and Seconded by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 18) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Stephanie Dodd
Sarah Fowler	John Hagan
Linda Haycock	Kirsten Hill
Jenny Kilgore	Laura Kohler
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Antoinette Miranda	Mike Toal
Reginald Wilkinson	Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 19):

19. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FOUR-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF VERA M. PERTUSET

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Vera M. Pertuset holds a four-year educational aide permit issued in 2016; and

WHEREAS on March 13, 2019, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Vera M. Pertuset of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke her four-year educational aide permit issued in 2016 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Ms. Pertuset engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about March 27, 2017 through March 31, 2017, when she engaged in physical altercations with a student. Specifically, she swatted/slapped the student's hand on at least two occasions; and

WHEREAS Ms. Pertuset did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on September 26, 2019; and

WHEREAS Ms. Pertuset was not present at the hearing, nor was she represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Ms. Pertuset's permit be revoked and that she be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Ms. Pertuset engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when she engaged in physical altercations with a high needs child by swatting/slapping the student's hand on more than one occasion and her continued licensure would negatively impact the health, safety, and welfare of the school community because she failed to comply with the requirements of her position as an educator to the detriment of a student; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Vera M. Pertuset's four-year educational aide permit issued in 2016 based upon Ms. Pertuset engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession on or about March 27, 2017 through March 31, 2017, when she engaged in physical altercations with a student. Specifically, she swatted/slapped the student's hand on at least two occasions. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Vera M. Pertuset be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Ms. Pertuset of this action.

It was Moved by Dr. Miranda and Seconded by Dr. Wilkinson that the above recommendation (Item 19) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 20):

20. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER AND TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE FIVE-YEAR SUBSTITUTE HIGH SCHOOL TEACHING LICENSE OF CALVIN ROBINSON

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Calvin Robinson held a five-year substitute high school teaching license issued in 2011; and

WHEREAS on March 26, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Calvin Robinson of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his five-year substitute high school teaching license issued in 2011 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon *[redacted in accordance with Ohio law]*. Further, the notice included as an aggravating factor that on July 26, 2011, Mr. Robinson was issued a Letter of Admonishment after the Ohio Department of Education determined that he was convicted of one misdemeanor count of attempted assault in 2007; and

WHEREAS Mr. Robinson did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on April 11, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Robinson was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that *[sealed by the hearing officer]*. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon *[sealed by the hearing officer]*; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Calvin Robinson's five-year substitute high school teaching license issued in 2011 based upon *[redacted in accordance with Ohio law]*. Pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-21(B), the State Board of Education further considers in aggravation that on July 26, 2011, Mr. Robinson was issued a Letter of Admonishment after the Ohio Department of Education determined that he was convicted of one misdemeanor count of attempted assault in 2007. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Calvin Robinson be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Robinson of this action.

It was Moved by Mr. Hagan and Seconded by Mrs. Hill that the above recommendation (Item 20) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

ABSTAIN

Nick Owens

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 21):

21. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF ALEX J. SKOWRONSKI

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Alex J. Skowronski held a one-year educational aide permit issued in 2015; and

WHEREAS on October 17, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Alex J. Skowronski of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his one-year educational aide permit issued in 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Skowronski engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about February 16, 2016, he said to students in his care, "Settle down or I am going to break your legs."; and on or about December 3, 2015, he picked up a student by the student's upper arms, shook the student, and yelled at the student; and

WHEREAS Mr. Skowronski did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on August 6, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Skowronski was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Skowronski's permit be revoked and that he be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Skowronski taking out his anger on five-year old students with special needs, him failing to take any responsibility for his actions, and him victimizing the youngest and most vulnerable of school children which simply cannot be tolerated; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Alex J. Skowronski's one-year educational aide permit issued in 2015 based upon Mr. Skowronski engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about February 16, 2016, he said to students in his care, "Settle down or I am going to break your legs."; and on or about December 3, 2015, he picked up a student by the student's upper arms, shook the student, and yelled at the student. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Alex J. Skowronski be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Skowronski of this action.

It was Moved by Dr. Wilkinson and Seconded by Mrs. Collins that the above recommendation (Item 21) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 22):

22. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO REVOKE PERMANENTLY THE ONE-YEAR EDUCATIONAL AIDE PERMIT OF BENJAMIN A. WHITENACK

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Benjamin A. Whitenack held a one-year educational aide permit issued in 2014; and

WHEREAS on October 22, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Benjamin A. Whitenack of its intent to determine whether to limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his one-year educational aide permit issued in 2014 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Whitenack engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about May 14, 2015, he brought alcohol to school while working with students; on or about May 15, 2015, he consumed alcohol at school while working with students; on or about November 16, 2012, he entered into a consent agreement with the Ohio Board of Nursing in which he agreed that his Ohio practical nursing license would be suspended indefinitely and the suspension would be stayed subject to probationary conditions; and on or about

March 13, 2015, the Ohio Board of Nursing indefinitely suspended his Ohio practical nursing license; and

WHEREAS Mr. Whitenack did not request a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on June 4, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Whitenack was not present at the hearing, nor was he represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Whitenack's permit be revoked and that he be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Whitenack working individually with a disabled child while under the influence of alcohol, and without evidence that he has obtained treatment for his alcoholism, his continued employment in the teaching profession could jeopardize the health, safety, or welfare of the school community and/or the statewide education community; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **REVOKES** Benjamin A. Whitenack's one-year educational aide permit issued in 2014 based upon Mr. Whitenack engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about May 14, 2015, he brought alcohol to school while working with students; on or about May 15, 2015, he consumed alcohol at school while working with students; on or about November 16, 2012, he entered into a consent agreement with the Ohio Board of Nursing in which he agreed that his Ohio practical nursing license would be suspended indefinitely and the suspension would be stayed subject to probationary conditions; and on or about March 13, 2015, the Ohio Board of Nursing indefinitely suspended his Ohio practical nursing license. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(2)(b), orders Benjamin A. Whitenack be permanently ineligible to apply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Whitenack of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Ms. Woods that the above recommendation (Item 22) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Motion carried.

Lori Kelly, Director, Office of Professional Conduct, presented the following recommendation (Item 23):

- 23. RESOLUTION TO ACCEPT THE REPORT AND RECOMMENDATION OF THE HEARING OFFICER TO DENY THE FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL INTERVENTION SPECIALIST TEACHING LICENSE AND FIVE-YEAR PROFESSIONAL PRINCIPAL LICENSE APPLICATIONS AND TO REVOKE THE FOUR-YEAR PUPIL ACTIVITY PERMIT OF COREY A. YOAKAM**

I **RECOMMEND** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the following Resolution:

WHEREAS Corey A. Yoakam has applied for a five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license and five-year professional principal license, and held a four-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016 with an effective year of 2015; and

WHEREAS on October 17, 2018, the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, on behalf of the State Board of Education, notified Corey A. Yoakam of its intent to deny or permanently deny his applications for a five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license and five-year professional principal license, and/or limit, suspend, revoke, or permanently revoke his four-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016 with an effective year of 2015 pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1). The notice was based upon Mr. Yoakam engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about the 2015-2016 school year, he made two students run, stand for extended periods of time, run up and down stairs, and jump on a trampoline as a punishment; on or about April 2016, Mr. Yoakam squeezed the neck and shoulder area of a student, causing the student to fall to the ground, in a move described by students as a "Vulcan Death Grip"; on or about the 2015-2016 school year, Mr. Yoakam, on multiple occasions, poured water on a student when the student was sleeping in Mr. Yoakam's class; and on or about the 2015-2016 school year, Mr. Yoakam made offensive, racial, and sexually charged comments to staff and student helpers in his class. Specifically, Mr. Yoakam referred to a student helper as "Slumdog Millionaire", referred to a student helper as "Chong" and asked the student helper a question to the effect of, "Did you eat fried rice today?", told a student helper that she was going to be a pole dancer, asked a fellow teacher to tell a female student not to wear a particular shirt because it was distracting as the shirt had a cat on it and the cat's eyes were positioned on the student's chest, and referred to a former student as "the Hunchback of Notre Dame" and as "the mongoloid looking one". Further, the notice was based upon Mr. Yoakam engaging in conduct that is unbecoming the teaching profession on or about May 2016 when he sent a text message to a co-worker in an attempt to improperly influence the co-worker's interview with children services; and

WHEREAS Mr. Yoakam requested a hearing regarding the State Board of Education's intent; and

WHEREAS a hearing was held on June 27-28, 2019; and

WHEREAS Mr. Yoakam was present at the hearing, and he was represented by counsel; and

WHEREAS the hearing officer recommends that Mr. Yoakam's four-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016 with an effective year of 2015 be revoked and his applications for a five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license and five-year professional principal license be denied and that he not be permitted to reapply for any license for a period of six months and upon reapplication, he must submit written proof that he has completed, at his own cost, eight hours of ethics training, eight hours of sexual harassment training, and eight hours of Crisis Prevention Intervention training by entities approved by the Ohio Department of Education. Further, the hearing officer recommends that should Mr. Yoakam

obtain a license, permit, or certificate from the State Board of Education, that he be subject to administrative reporting for a period of three years indicating

whether he has engaged in any conduct unbecoming or any other conduct giving rise to discipline, at scheduled intervals to be determined by the Ohio Department of Education. The hearing officer's recommendation is based upon Mr. Yoakam engaging in conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession when he became overzealous in his attempts to use exercise and deep pressure techniques to control student behaviors, when he poured water on a student to wake him up, when he made racial and offensive remarks to and about students, and when he sent a text message to his classroom aide to instruct her what to say in an upcoming interview with children services about allegations against him; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education considered the objections to the hearing officer's report and recommendation which Mr. Yoakam timely filed; and

WHEREAS the State Board of Education has considered the factors listed in Rule 3301-73-21 of the Ohio Administrative Code and has considered the *Licensure Code of Professional Conduct for Ohio Educators*, which contains standards for the teaching profession and provides guidelines for conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: Therefore, Be It

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education, pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 3319.31(B)(1), hereby **DENIES** Corey A. Yoakam's applications for a five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license and five-year professional principal license and **REVOKES** Corey A. Yoakam's four-year pupil activity permit issued in 2016 with an effective year of 2015 based upon Mr. Yoakam engaging in the following conduct that is unbecoming to the teaching profession: on or about the 2015-2016 school year, he made two students run, stand for extended periods of time, run up and down stairs, and jump on a trampoline; on or about April 2016, Mr. Yoakam squeezed the neck and shoulder area of a student, causing the student to fall to the ground, in a move described by students as a "Vulcan Death Grip"; on or about the 2015-2016 school year, Mr. Yoakam, on multiple occasions, poured water on a student when the student was sleeping in Mr. Yoakam's class; and on or about the 2015-2016 school year, Mr. Yoakam made offensive and racial comments to staff and student helpers in his class. Specifically, Mr. Yoakam referred to a student helper as "Slumdog Millionaire", referred to a student helper as "Chong" and asked the student helper a question to the effect of, "Did you eat fried rice today?", brought up pole dancing in reference to a student, asked a fellow teacher to tell a female student not to wear a particular shirt because it was distracting as the shirt had a cat on it and the cat's eyes were positioned on the student's chest, and referred to a former student as "the Hunchback of Notre Dame" and as "the mongoloid looking one". Further, the State Board's disciplinary action is based upon Mr. Yoakam engaging in conduct that is unbecoming the teaching profession on or about May 2016 when he sent a text message to a co-worker telling her what to say during her interview with children services regarding the allegations against him. Further, the State Board of Education, in accordance with Ohio Administrative Code Rule 3301-73-22(A)(3)(a), orders that Corey A. Yoakam be ineligible to reapply for any license, permit, or certificate issued by the State Board of Education until on or after June 9, 2020, and upon reapplication, Mr. Yoakam must provide written verification to the Ohio Department of Education that he has successfully completed, at his own expense, eight hours of ethics training, eight hours of sexual harassment training, and eight hours of Crisis Prevention Intervention training, with the training to be approved in advance by the Ohio Department of Education. Further, should the State Board of Education issue a license, permit, or certificate to Mr. Yoakam, he

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

must the complete a three-year period of administrative reporting with the administrative reports to be due quarterly to the Ohio Department of Education indicating whether he has engaged in any conduct unbecoming to the teaching profession or any other conduct giving rise to discipline; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education, on its behalf, to implement the aforementioned terms and conditions regarding Mr. Yoakam's applications and permit. Further, if said terms and conditions have not been fulfilled completely upon Mr. Yoakam applying for a new license, permit, or certificate, the State Board of Education directs the Ohio Department of Education to evaluate any new application in accordance with its orders and ensure all outstanding terms and conditions are addressed; and, Be It Further

RESOLVED, That the State Superintendent of Public Instruction be, and he hereby is, directed to notify Mr. Yoakam of this action.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler and Seconded by Mrs. Dodd that the above recommendation (Item 23) be approved.

Mr. Toal moved to amend the resolution by substitution. He proposed to admonish Mr. Yoakam and direct the Ohio Department of Education to issue Mr. Yoakam's applications for a five-year professional intervention specialist teaching license and five-year professional principal license. Mr. Hagan seconded the motion. Mr. Toal stated a denial of Mr. Yoakam's pending applications and a revocation of his permit is not warranted in this case based on mitigating factors.

After discussion, Mrs. McGuire made a friendly amendment to add eight hours of ethics training to be completed within 90 days. Mr. Toal accepted the proposed friendly amendment.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

YES VOTES

Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Charlotte McGuire

John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Mike Toal

NO VOTES

Cindy Collins
Jenny Kilgore
Antoinette Miranda
Reginald Wilkinson
Laura Kohler

Stephanie Dodd
Martha Manchester
Nick Owens
Lisa Woods

Motion denied.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the original resolution.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Mike Toal

Motion carried.

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 24):

24. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE ASSESSMENT AND QUALIFYING SCORE FOR THE COMPUTER SCIENCE PROFESSIONAL MULTI-AGE LICENSE AND ENDORSEMENT

The State Board of Education (“Board”) hereby **ADOPTS** the following:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.07 requires the Board to formulate and prescribe minimum standards related to licensing educators;

ORC 3319.22 allows the Board to adopt, amend, or rescind rules for educator licenses;

Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 3301-24-05 requires an applicant for a professional educator license to pass an examination prescribed by the Board in the subject area to be taught;

At the Educator Standards Board’s October 2019 meeting, the Ohio Department of Education’s testing vendor, Evaluation Systems group of Pearson, presented an overview of the process of developing a new assessment and creating a panel to provide a recommended qualifying score of the assessment;

Evaluation Systems group of Pearson presented a panel-recommended qualifying score for the new Computer Science Exam (054) of 74 and variations of that score based on +1, +2, -1, and -2 standard errors of a measurement;

The Educator Standards Board recommended at its October 2019 meeting the adoption of the new Computer Science Exam (054) and a qualifying score of 69, which is -1 standard error of measurement of the panel-recommended score;

The Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee recommended the adoption of the panel-recommended qualifying score of 74.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board adopts the new Computer Science Exam (054) as the requisite subject area assessment for a

Computer Science Professional Multi-Age License and the Computer Science Endorsement and that the qualifying score for passing the assessment is set at 74.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the new Computer Science Exam (054) with a qualifying score of 74 is effective December 16, 2019.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 24) be approved with the technical amendment that would state an effective date of December 16,2019. There were no objections to the addition of the technical amendment.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Laura Kohler
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Motion carried.

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 25):

25. RESOLUTION ADOPTING CHANGES TO THE CREDENTIAL REVIEW BOARD FRAMEWORK

The State Board of Education (“State Board”) hereby **ADOPTS** changes to Credential Review Board framework as follows:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3319.65 requires the State Board to establish a Credential Review Board to carry out any functions assigned to it by the State Board with respect to assessing individuals pursuing alternative routes to educator licensure and out-of-state educators seeking licensure in Ohio;

The Credential Review Board may also carry out any other duties the State Board considers appropriate;

The State Board adopted a framework under which the Credential Review Board operates in 2005, and that framework has not been updated since that time;

Updating the Credential Review Board framework will improve the structure and practices of the Credential Review Board and rephrase the framework in terms that read contemporaneously rather than prospectively;

The Credential Review Board reviewed the framework and provided valuable input during the revision process;

The Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee recommended adoption of the revised framework in the form attached hereto at its November 2019 meeting.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee recommends the State Board adopt changes to the Credential Review Board framework in the form attached hereto.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 25) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 26):

26. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT THE MODEL CURRICULUM FOR FINANCIAL LITERACY

The State Board of Education (“Board”) hereby **ADOPTS** the model curriculum for financial literacy as follows:

Ohio Revised Code (ORC) Section 3301.079 states the Board shall adopt a model curriculum for instruction in each subject area for which updated academic standards are required and for each of grades kindergarten through twelve that is sufficient to meet the needs of students in every community;

The revisions to academic standards for financial literacy were adopted by the Board in February of 2018;

Revisions to academic standards for financial literacy included the addition of K-3 and 4-6 grade band financial literacy standards that provide a foundation for middle grades and high school financial literacy and updates to 7-8 grade band to reflect student understanding as well as added clarity to content statements;

The Department convened a model curriculum writing team for financial literacy consisting of 37 Ohio educators. The writing team worked on revising the model curriculum for financial literacy over the course of nine meetings;

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

The Department engaged with the public through a survey, and the Department received 691 responses pertaining to the proposed model curriculum. Revisions were made to the model curriculum based on the survey responses;

The Department convened a model curriculum for financial literacy workgroup in August 2019 and made revisions to the model curriculum based on feedback received from the workgroup;

The Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee reviewed the model curriculum, made revisions, and recommended adoption of the model curriculum in the form attached hereto at its November 2019 meeting;

The model curriculum for financial literacy provides content elaborations and expectations for learning.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board adopts the model curriculum for financial literacy in the form attached hereto;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent of Public Instruction is hereby authorized to publish the model curriculum electronically or through other media as Ohio's model curriculum for financial literacy and its accompanying forms and to make such revisions to form and style as may be determined necessary of a non-substantive nature, including grammatical and other technical matters; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that this model curriculum shall become operational to support district curriculum immediately upon approval.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 26) be approved.

Mrs. Hill clarified that she would not be submitting a proposed amendment regarding this item due to the legal office reviewing and accepting the changes as grammatical only and an amendment would not be required.

Mrs. Dodd stated the proposed change that referenced retirement accounts to retirement account was not a grammatical change. Mrs. Dodd further stated she took issue with changes being made to an item that was voted on from the committee and not going through a formal process to address further additional proposed changes that were more than just grammatical changes.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Ms. Fowler presented the following recommendation (Item 27):

27. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT A PERFORMANCE-BASED ASSESSMENT AS AN ALTERNATIVE TO A WRITTEN EXAMINATION TO MEASURE KNOWLEDGE OF THE TEACHING PROFESSION FOR LICENSURE

The State Board of Education (“Board”) hereby **ADOPTS** the following:

The Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) Section 3301-26-01 allows the superintendent of public instruction to continuously monitor the procedures to be used in application of said rule;

OAC 3301-26-01 requires that examinations for licensure as a classroom teacher shall measure knowledge of professional education and content knowledge of the subject area or area of specialization;

Many of Ohio’s educator preparation programs administered by institutions of higher education use performance-based assessments to measure knowledge of professional education;

Vendors for nationally recognized performance-based assessments work with panels of experts to set the qualifying score needed to demonstrate knowledge of professional education for each assessment;

Allowing educators to obtain licensure through a performance-based assessment would provide an alternative means of testing knowledge of professional education and reduce the cost and burden for educators who currently take a performance-based assessment for their educator preparation program but then must take an additional written examination to get an educator license;

The Educator Standards Board recommended that the Board accept nationally recognized and scored performance-based assessments, as determined by the Department of Higher Education, to measure knowledge of professional education as an alternative to the written examination prescribed by the Board and that the qualifying score needed to demonstrate the requisite knowledge be set at the vendor-recommended cut score for each performance-based assessment at their May 2019 meeting;

The Teaching, Leading and Learning Committee recommended that the Board accept nationally recognized and scored performance-based assessments, as determined by the Department of Higher Education, to measure knowledge of professional education as an alternative to the written examination prescribed by the Board and that the qualifying score needed to demonstrate the requisite knowledge be set at the vendor-recommended cut score for each performance-based assessment at their May 2019 meeting;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board accepts nationally recognized and scored performance-based assessments, as determined by the

Department of Higher Education, to measure knowledge of professional education as an alternative to the written examination that is currently administered;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the qualifying score needed to demonstrate knowledge of professional education on a performance-based assessment be set at the vendor-recommended cut score for each recognized performance-based assessment.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the effective date for the Board to accept nationally recognized and scored performance-based assessments as an alternative to a written examination to measure knowledge of the teaching profession for licensure is July 1, 2020.

It was Moved by Ms. Fowler that the above recommendation (Item 27) be approved with the technical amendment that would state an effective date of July 1, 2020. There were no objections to the addition of the technical amendment.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Mrs. Manchester presented the following recommendation (Item 28):

28. RESOLUTION TO ADOPT A SYSTEM OF STATE DIPLOMA SEALS

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolutions:

In House Bill 166, the 133rd Ohio General Assembly enacted Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6114, which requires the State Board of Education (the “Board”) to establish a system of state diploma seals for the purposes of allowing a student to qualify for graduation under Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.618;

Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6114(A) provides that the state diploma seals may be attached or affixed to the high school diploma of a student enrolled in a public or chartered nonpublic school;

Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6114(A) provides further that the system of state diploma seals consists of: the state seal of biliteracy; the OhioMeansJobs-readiness seal; and the state diploma seals established by the Board;

Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6114(C) requires that the Board establish the following state diploma seals: (1) an industry-recognized credential seal; (2) a college-ready seal; (3) a military enlistment seal; (4) a citizenship seal; (5) a science seal; (6) an honors diploma seal; (7) a technology seal; (8) a community service seal; (9) a fine and performing arts seal; and (10) a student engagement seal;

The requirements for each of these seals are set forth in Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6114(C); and

In its November meeting, the Integrated Student Supports Committee recommended that the Board adopt the system of state diploma seals in accordance with Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6114.

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education adopts, for the purposes of allowing a student to qualify for graduation under Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.618, the following state diploma seals: (1) the industry-recognized credential seal; (2) the college-ready seal; (3) the military enlistment seal; (4) the citizenship seal; (5) the science seal; (6) the honors diploma seal; (7) the technology seal; (8) the community service seal; (9) the fine and performing arts seal; and (10) the student engagement seal. To qualify for a state diploma seal, a student must meet the requirements, which are established under Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6114(C) and summarized in the attached “Summary of Requirements for the State Diploma Seals in Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6114(C),” for the particular diploma seal.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the State Board of Education approves the establishment of a system of state diploma seals that include the following seals: (1) the state seal of biliteracy established under Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6111; (2) the OhioMeansJobs-readiness seal established under Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6112; and (3) the state diploma seals established in this resolution and prescribed under Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6114(C).

**Summary of Requirements for the State Diploma Seals
in Ohio Revised Code Section 3313.6114(C)**

Seal	Requirements
Industry-recognized credential	Earn an industry-recognized credential approved under R.C. 3313.6113 that is aligned to a job that is determined to be in demand in Ohio and its regions under R.C. 6301.11.
College-ready	Attain a score that is remediation-free, in accordance with standards adopted under R.C. 3345.061(F), on a nationally-standardized assessment prescribed under R.C. 3301.0712(B)(1).

<p>Military enlistment</p>	<p>(1) Provide evidence that the student has enlisted in a branch of the armed services of the United States as defined in R.C. 5910.01; or</p> <p>(2) Participate in a junior reserve officer training program approved by the United States Congress under title 10 of the United States Code.</p>
<p>Citizenship</p>	<p>(1) Demonstrate at least a proficient level of skill on both the American history and American government end-of-course examinations prescribed under R.C. 3301.0712(B)(2);</p> <p>(2) Attain a score that is the equivalent of proficient level of skill in appropriate advanced placement or international baccalaureate examinations in lieu of the American history and American government end-of-course examinations; or</p> <p>(3) Attain a final course grade that is the equivalent of a “B” or higher in appropriate courses taken through the college credit plus program in lieu of the American history and American government end-of-course examinations.</p>
<p>Science</p>	<p>(1) Demonstrate at least a proficient level of skill on the science end-of-course examination prescribed under R.C. 3301.0712(B)(2);</p> <p>(2) Attain a score that is the equivalent of proficient level of skill in appropriate advanced placement or international baccalaureate examinations in lieu of the science end-of-course examination; or</p> <p>(3) Attain a final course grade that is the equivalent of a “B” or higher in appropriate courses taken through the college credit plus program in lieu of the science end-of-course examinations.</p>
<p>Honors diploma</p>	<p>Meet the additional criteria for an honors diploma under R.C. 3313.61(B).</p>

Technology	<p>(1) Attain a score level that is at least the equivalent of a proficient level of skill in an appropriate advanced placement or international baccalaureate examination;¹</p> <p>(2) Attain a final course grade that is the equivalent of a “B” or higher in an appropriate course taken through the college credit plus program; or</p> <p>(3) Complete a course offered through the student’s district or school that meets guidelines developed by the Department of Education.²</p>
Community service	Complete a community project that is aligned with guidelines adopted by the student’s district board or school governing authority.
Fine and performing arts	Demonstrate skill in the fine or performing arts according to an evaluation that is aligned with guidelines adopted by the student’s district board or school governing authority.
Student engagement	Participate in extracurricular activities such as athletics, clubs, or student government to a meaningful extent, as determined by guidelines adopted by the student’s district board or school governing authority.

It was Moved by Mrs. Manchester that the above recommendation (Item 28) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

- | | |
|--------------------|--------------------|
| Cindy Collins | Stephanie Dodd |
| Sarah Fowler | John Hagan |
| Linda Haycock | Kirsten Hill |
| Jenny Kilgore | Martha Manchester |
| Charlotte McGuire | Antoinette Miranda |
| Nick Owens | Mike Toal |
| Reginald Wilkinson | Lisa Woods |

Motion carried.

¹ Subject to R.C. 3301.0712(B)(5)(d).

² A district or school is not required to offer a course that meets guidelines developed by the Department. R.C. 3313.6114(C)(7)(c).

Vice President McGuire presented the following recommendation (Item 29):

29. MOTION TO ACCEPT RECOMMENDED CHANGE TO THE STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION POLICIES AND PROCEDURES MANUAL REGARDING PUBLIC RECORDS TRAINING

The Executive Committee **RECOMMENDS** that the State Board of Education **ADOPT** the above motion.

It was Moved by Mrs. McGuire that the above recommendation (Item 29) be approved.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Motion carried.

Vice President McGuire presented the following recommendation (Item 30):

30. RESOLUTION APPOINTING MEMBERS TO THE DROPOUT PREVENTION AND RECOVERY PROGRAM STUDY COMMITTEE

The State Board of Education **ADOPTS** the following Preambles and Resolution:

Ohio Revised Code Section 3314.017 provides for the creation of a committee (the “Study Committee”) for the purpose of conducting a study regarding the classification, authorization, and report card ratings of community schools that primarily serve students enrolled in dropout prevention and recovery programs as described in division (A)(4)(a) of section 3314.35 of the Revised Code;

The State Board of Education (the “State Board”) is responsible for coordinating the Study Committee;

Ohio Revised Code Section 3314.017 further directs the State Board to appoint one school district superintendent, and one chief administrator of a community school to the Study Committee;

The State Board, on behalf of the Study Committee, shall submit the Study Committee's recommendations to the General Assembly not later than six months after October 17, 2019;

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

The State Board has nominated two individuals for each open seat on the Study Committee;

The State Board has reviewed the nominations for the Study Committee for the positions noted below;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board hereby appoints the following individuals to the Study Committee:

Edward P. Kurt - School District Superintendent

Peter Bartkowiak - Community School Chief Administrator

Vice President McGuire opened the floor for nominations for the Community School Chief Administrator appointment.

Ms. Woods moved the nomination for Peter Bartkowiak. Mrs. Dodd moved the nomination for Todd Whiteman. Mrs. McGuire moved the nomination for Anthony Fisher.

Mrs. Woods, Mr. Hagan and Mr. Toal spoke in favor of Mr. Bartkowiak. Mrs. Dodd spoke in favor of Mr. Whiteman. Mrs. McGuire spoke in favor of Mr. Fisher.

Vice President McGuire called for a roll call vote for Board members to say the name of the candidate they were voting for.

PETER BARTKOWIAK

John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

TODD WHITEMAN

Cindy Collins
Martha Manchester

Stephanie Dodd

ANTHONY FISHER

Charlotte McGuire

ABSTAIN

Sarah Fowler

Peter Bartkowiak received 9 votes and the appointment to the Dropout Prevention and Recovery Program Study Committee.

Vice President McGuire opened the floor for nominations for the School District Superintendent appointment.

Mr. Hagan moved the nomination for Edward P. Kurt. Mr. Hagan spoke in favor of Mr. Kurt.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote for Board members to say the name of the candidate they were voting for.

Mr. Hagan moved to close nominations. Dr. Wilkinson seconded the motion. Nominations were closed.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote for Board members to say the name of the candidate they were voting for.

EDWARD P. KURT

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Edward P. Kurt received 14 votes and the appointment to the Dropout Prevention and Recovery Program Study Committee.

Vice President McGuire presented the following recommendation (Item 31):

31. RESOLUTION TO APPOINT MEMBERS TO THE STATE LIBRARY BOARD

The State Board hereby **ADOPTS** the following:

Ohio Revised Code Section 3375.01 charges the State Board of Education with appointing members of the State Library Board;

Member Melissa Hendon Deters resigned from the State Library Board for her five-year term ending December 31, 2019.

The State Board of Education has reviewed the qualifications of the candidates and recommends that the following individual be appointed to the State Library Board;

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the State Board of Education appoints Janet M. Carleton to the State Library Board for a five-year term beginning on December 10, 2019.

Vice President McGuire opened the floor for nominations for appointment to the State Library Board.

Ms. Fowler moved the nomination for Janet M. Carleton.

Mrs. Hill moved to close nominations. Mrs. Collins seconded the motion. Nominations were closed.

Vice President McGuire called for a roll call vote for Board members to say the name of the candidate they were voting for.

JANET M. CARLETON

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Janet M. Carelton received 14 votes and the appointment to the State Library Board.

Non-Resolutions

New Business

Mr. Owens presented the following recommendation: He requested and was granted emergency consideration by Vice President McGuire.

32. RESOLUTION APPROVING RECOMMENDATION TO THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY REGARDING THE EDUCATIONAL CHOICE SCHOLARSHIP PROGRAM

The State Board of Education (“State Board”) hereby **APPROVES** the recommendation for a legislative change as follows:

WHEREAS, Ohio Revised Code section 3310.02 establishes the Educational Choice Scholarship program (“Traditional Ed Choice”);

WHEREAS, Ohio Revised Code section 3310.03 sets forth the criteria that qualify schools to be placed on the designated list for Traditional Ed Choice;

WHEREAS, 3310.03 further sets forth the criteria that determines student eligibility for participation in Traditional Ed Choice;

WHEREAS, Application of criteria for the designated list for Traditional Ed Choice as established in Ohio Revised Code section 3310.03 has resulted in a significant increase in the number of schools included on the designated list for the 2020-2021 school year;

WHEREAS, Traditional Ed Choice scholarships are funded through deductions from the school district to which the participating student is assigned;

WHEREAS, Ohio school districts have expressed concerns to the State Board for deductions for students participating in Traditional Ed Choice who have never been enrolled in the school district;

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

WHEREAS, Ohio school districts have further expressed concerns to the State Board about the number of schools included on the designated list for Traditional Ed Choice; and

WHEREAS, the Ohio Association of School Business Officials, Buckeye Association of School Administrators and the Ohio School Boards Association represent important stakeholders in the education community and have adopted a series of legislative recommendations to address concerns surrounding the Ed Choice program,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board endorses the legislative recommendations proposed by the Ohio Association of School Business Officials, Buckeye Association of School Administrators and the Ohio School Boards Association as they pertain to the Ed Choice Scholarship Program;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Board hereby directs the Superintendent of Public Instruction to prepare a letter, subject to the approval of the President of the Board, to the Primary and Secondary Education Committee of the House of Representative s and the Education Committee of the Ohio Senate indicating the Board's endorsement of these recommendations;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent submit the letter to the aforementioned committees of the General Assembly and take any appropriate action to advocate for the adoption of the legislative recommendations included therein.

It was Moved by Mr. Toal and Seconded by Dr. Miranda that the above recommendation (Item 32) be approved. Mr. Owens stated the resolution incorporated the recommendations of the groups that had testified to the State Board.

Mrs. Dodd called the question. Mr. Owens Seconded the motion.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote to call the question.

YES VOTES

Stephanie Dodd
Jenny Kilgore
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens

Linda Haycock
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Reginald Wilkinson

NO VOTES

Cindy Collins
John Hagan
Mike Toal

Sarah Fowler
Kirsten Hill
Lisa Woods

Motion denied.

Ms. Fowler asked if the following clause of the resolution meant that all recommendations provided in a handout received earlier in the day are what is being referenced in the resolution. Mr. Owens responded it would be all of the recommendations presented in the handout:

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board endorses the legislative recommendations proposed by the Ohio Association of School Business Officials, Buckeye Association of School Administrators and the Ohio School Boards Association as they pertain to the Ed Choice Scholarship Program;

Mr. Toal moved to amend the resolution by substitution. He proposed to include only Short-Term Relie and High School Students Already Attending Private Schools from the list of recommendations. Mr. Hagan seconded the motion. Mr. Toal stated these items were the only recommendations that were impacted by HB 166 and the rest of the recommendations had the potential to alter the original intent of the Ed Choice Program. He also felt the need to hear opposing views on the proposals.

Mr. Owens stated he did not agree with the proposed amendment and believed all recommendations that were presented should be approved.

Ms. Fowler stated she believed more information should be gathered on the other recommendations before being included in any proposal.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the proposed amendment.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins	Sarah Fowler
John Hagan	Kirsten Hill
Martha Manchester	Charlotte McGuire
Mike Toal	Lisa Woods

NO VOTES

Stephanie Dodd	Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore	Antoinette Miranda
Nick Owens	Reginald Wilkinson

Motion carried.

Resolution as amended:

32. RESOLUTION APPROVING SELECTED RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE GENERAL ASSEMBLY REGARDING THE EDUCATIONAL CHOICE SCHOLARSHIP PROGRAM

The State Board of Education (“State Board”) hereby **APPROVES** the recommendation for a legislative change as follows:

WHEREAS, Ohio Revised Code section 3310.02 establishes the Educational Choice Scholarship program (“Traditional Ed Choice”);

WHEREAS, Ohio Revised Code section 3310.03 sets forth the criteria that qualify schools to be placed on the designated list for Traditional Ed Choice;

WHEREAS, 3310.03 further sets forth the criteria that determines student eligibility for participation in Traditional Ed Choice;

WHEREAS, Application of criteria for the designated list for Traditional Ed Choice as established in Ohio Revised Code section 3310.03 has resulted in a significant increase in the number of schools included on the designated list for the 2020-2021 school year;

WHEREAS, Traditional Ed Choice scholarships are funded through deductions from the school district to which the participating student is assigned;

WHEREAS, Ohio school districts have expressed concerns to the State Board for deductions for students participating in Traditional Ed Choice who have never been enrolled in the school district;

WHEREAS, Ohio school districts have further expressed concerns to the State Board about the number of schools included on the designated list for Traditional Ed Choice; and

WHEREAS, the Ohio Association of School Business Officials, Buckeye Association of School Administrators and the Ohio School Boards Association represent important stakeholders in the education community and have adopted a series of legislative recommendations attached hereto to address concerns surrounding the Ed Choice program,

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Board endorses the legislative recommendations in part, titled “Short-Term Relief” and “High School Students Already Attending Private Schools,” proposed by the Ohio Association of School Business Officials, Buckeye Association of School Administrators and the Ohio School Boards Association as they pertain to the Ed Choice Scholarship Program and having been presented by these organizations as specific remedies to certain Ed Choice provisions in House Bill166 of the 133rd General Assembly.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Board hereby directs the Superintendent of Public Instruction to prepare a letter, subject to the approval of the President of the Board, to the Primary and Secondary Education Committee of the House of Representative s and the Education Committee of the Ohio Senate indicating the Board’s endorsement of these recommendations;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Superintendent submit the letter to the aforementioned committees of the General Assembly and take any appropriate action to advocate for the adoption of the legislative recommendations included therein.

President Kohler called for a roll call vote on the resolution as amended.

YES VOTES

Cindy Collins
Sarah Fowler
Linda Haycock
Jenny Kilgore
Charlotte McGuire
Nick Owens
Reginald Wilkinson

Stephanie Dodd
John Hagan
Kirsten Hill
Martha Manchester
Antoinette Miranda
Mike Toal
Lisa Woods

Minutes of the December 2019 Meeting of the State Board of Education of Ohio

Motion carried.

Mr. Hagan Moved to adjourn the meeting. Dr. Kilgore Seconded the motion.

The President requested a voice vote.

Motion carried.

President Kohler adjourned the meeting at 5:15 p.m. The next regularly scheduled meeting of the State Board of Education is January 13-14, 2020.

ATTEST:



Laura Kohler
President
State Board of Education



Paolo DeMaria
Superintendent of Public Instruction

Please note: Copies of the attachments referenced in the Minutes may be obtained by contacting the Office of Board Relations at the Ohio Department of Education at (614) 728-2754.