Revised Editions Review Rubric for Kindergarten-Grade 5 English Language Arts Core Curriculum and Instructional Materials

The Revised Editions Review Rubric for Kindergarten-Grade 5 English Language Arts Core Curriculum and Instructional Materials has been created by the Department to review revised editions of already approved core curriculum and instructional materials in ELA on the Department's approved list. Revised editions will undergo a limited review process as the originally submitted edition has already been reviewed and approved. Revised editions will be reviewed for alignment with the science of reading and strategies for effective literacy instruction, as well as alignment to Ohio's Learning Standards for English Language Arts adopted in 2017 (referenced as "standards" in the indicators).

Intended Use of the Rubric
Criterion
Criterion is a combination of all indicators within a single focus area in ELA and Literacy, which identify markers of high-quality instructional materials. The nine criterion areas, found across Parts 1-6 of this rubric, provide a brief description at the top of each section and each Criterion is scored based on the Indicators totals.
Indicators
Indicators are in the left-hand column and grouped by Criterion. Reviewers use Guiding Questions and evidence to score Indicators within each Criterion.
Scoring
The middle column indicates possible scores for a given indicator.
Comments
The right-hand column provides explanatory notes to describe the score given based on evidence provided for a given indicator.

Key Shifts in the Ohio Learning Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy
The Ohio Learning Standards for English Language Arts and Literacy reflect the skills and knowledge students will need to succeed in college, career, and life. Using the standards and understanding the necessary shifts they call for are essential for high-quality instruction. The following are the key shifts:
Shift 1: Complexity
The Ohio Learning Standards call for regular practice with complex text and its academic language. This includes scaffolding of text complexity over the course of the year, a focus on appropriately rigorous text in relation to quantitative analysis, qualitative analysis, and task measures.
Shift 2: Evidence
The Ohio Learning standards ground reading, writing, and speaking in evidence from text, both literary and informational. Rather than asking students questions they can answer solely from their prior knowledge or experience, students should be able to answer a range of text-dependent questions.
Shift 3: Knowledge
Building knowledge through content-rich nonfiction plays an essential role in the standards. This requires a balance between reading informational and literacy texts, and that students build coherent general knowledge both within each year and across years, with opportunities for students to engage, interact, and have a conversation with the text.

Review Use
Materials submitted for review will be evaluated on parts of the rubric, dependent on the review category/grade band identified. The rubric will be used to evaluate all grade levels within the grade band for the program as a whole.
Grades K-2 Core Comprehensive English Language Arts
Materials provide comprehensive instruction in K-2 English language arts, aligned with standards, grade-level content and strategies for effective literacy instruction. **Review on all rubric parts except Part 3: Foundational Skills 3-5.**
Grades K-2 Core No Foundational Skills
Materials provide instruction in K-2 English language arts, that do not include foundational skills, aligned with standards and strategies for effective literacy instruction. Programs must be paired with a foundational skills program. **Review on all rubric parts except Part 2: Foundational Skills K-2 and Part 3: Foundational Skills 3-5.**
Grades K-2 Core Foundational Skills
Programs provide comprehensive foundational skills instruction, aligned to K-2 English language arts standards and research-based practices, including phonological awareness, phonics, fluency and spelling. Programs must be paired with a core comprehensive program or a core no foundational skills program. **Review on all rubric parts except Part 3: Foundational Skills 3-5, Part 4: Text Complexity & Vocabulary, and Part 5: Knowledge Building & Writing.**
Grades 3-5 Core Comprehensive English Language Arts
Programs in this category provide comprehensive instruction in grades 3-5 English language arts, aligned with standards, grade-level content and strategies for effective literacy instruction. **Review on all rubric parts except Part 2: Foundational Skills K-2.**
Grades K-5 Core Comprehensive English Language Arts
Programs in this category provide comprehensive instruction in K-5 English language arts, aligned with standards, grade-level content, and strategies for effective literacy instruction. **Review on all rubric parts.**

Notation Key
Some indicators throughout part 2 have notations directly related to the grade-level appropriate content or skill, which is marked with the corresponding K, 1 or 2 within a set of parentheses.

Non-Negotiable Requirement

Non-Negotiable Requirement			
Category	**Criteria**	**Met/Not Met**	**Evidence**
Three-Cueing Approach	Materials do not include the three-cueing approach or model of teaching students to read based on meaning, structure and syntax, and visual cues.		
The non-negotiable requirement will be evaluated as Met or Not Met. If any portion of submitted materials includes instructional methods or practices that rely on the three-cueing approach as a model of teaching students to read based on meaning, structure and syntax, and visual cues, applications will not be considered to meet criteria for this non-negotiable requirement. All evidence of not meeting this non-negotiable requirement, if applicable, will be documented by reviewers.			

SB 19 Language		
Category	**Criteria**	**Evaluated Yes/No**
Skill Building and Advancement	Materials facilitate a student's skill building and sequential advancement through mastery.	
Language being added to ORC 3313.6028(B) as amended by SB 19 to evaluate "whether or the extent to which core curricula in English language arts facilitates a student's skill building and sequential advancement through mastery." In the Revised Editions Rubric, this is evaluated through **Indicators 1.3a and 1.3b.**		

Rating Definitions for Core Curriculum and Instructional Materials

Ratings
CRITERIA NOT MET/0 POINTS
The evidence provided does not meet the criteria indicated.
CRITERIA PARTIALLY MET/1 POINT
The evidence provided partially meets the criteria indicated, but additional information, detail, or examples are needed to fully meet the criteria.
CRITERIA FULLY MET/2 POINTS
The evidence provided fully meets or exceeds the criteria indicated, demonstrating thorough implementation or alignment of the indicator to expectations.

PART 1: INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN

Materials include an intentional design for instruction, aligned with science of reading research and the principles of effective literacy instruction.

Criterion 1: Instructional Design		
Materials reflect current and converging research in reading and related fields, including the use of explicit, sequential, and systematic and cumulative instruction.		
Indicators	**Score**	**Comments**
1.1.a. The program includes evidence of being both aligned to the science of reading and based on conceptual research and theoretical models, citing relevant research articles and websites.		
1.1.b. The program demonstrates the understanding that reading is a language-based skill and learning to read depends on mapping sounds to print, rather than emphasizing visual memory, guessing, the shape of the word, or the use of context clues to decode words.		
1.1.c. Lessons use instructional routines and scripts that provide suggested teacher language, include a step-by-step sequence, procedures, and consistent academic language and vocabulary linked to grade-level outcomes and content standards in Ohio's learning standards for English language arts.		
1.1.d. The scope and sequence for each skill **within** a grade shows a clear progression from basic to advanced (i.e., easier to harder), and is appropriate for the grade for which the program is designed.		
1.1.e. Critical grade-level content and high-priority skills are cumulatively reviewed to support mastery and the integration of knowledge, strategy, and skills.		
1.1.f. The same routines, terminology, and procedures are used within lesson plan formats across skill areas and throughout the academic year, including across the grade level and program.		
TOTAL SECTION SCORE	0	

PART 2: FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS DEVELOPMENT K-2

Materials are aligned to research-based practices and the Ohio Learning Standards in English Language Arts for foundational skills instruction.

Criterion 1: Foundational Skills (K-2)

Materials and instruction provide research-based systematic and explicit instruction and practices of print concepts and letter recognition, phonemic awareness, phonics and word study, and fluency.

Indicators	Score	Comments
2.1.a. Materials provide explicit instruction and student practice opportunities in alphabet knowledge (K-1) to include: • Letter names and their corresponding sounds; • Letter identification and letter formation.		
2.1.b. Materials include phonological awareness instruction on a research-based continuum with an emphasis on: • Recognizing and producing phonemes (K). • Blending and segmenting syllables (K-1). • Blending and segementing phonemes (K-1).		
2.1.c. Using a logical scope and sequence, materials include systematic and explicit instruction in phonics, including syllable types, from simple to complex.		
2.1.d. Step by step demonstration in materials are provided that contain: • Clear and concise language. • Range of examples and non-examples. • Guided and supported practice. • Opportunities for frequent student responses. • Corrective feedback routines. • Opportunities for cumulative review.		
2.1.e. Letter-sounds are taught in isolation and then connected to reading words, sentences, and decodable text aligned to the phonics patterns.		
2.1.f. Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to practice and gain decoding automaticity and sight-based recognition of high-frequency words.		

2.1.g. Materials include consistent blending routines for reading words using teacher modeling, student-guided practice and independent practice applying the sound-spelling pattern(s) in an instructional sequence.		
2.1.h. Materials support word study in connection to the meaning of the words decoded.		
2.1.i. Materials include spelling instruction aligned to the phonics scope and sequence.		
2.1.j. Materials include examples of explicit instructional routines or scripts within lessons that demonstrate frequent opportunities for connected text fluency.		
TOTAL SECTION SCORE	0	

PART 3: FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS DEVELOPMENT 3-5

Materials are aligned to research-based practices and the Ohio Learning Standards in English Language Arts for foundational skills instruction.

Criterion 1: Foundational Skills 3-5		
Materials and instruction provide research-based systematic and explicit instruction and practices of phonics and oral reading fluency.		
Indicators	**Score**	Comments
3.1.a. Materials include systematic and explicit instruction in advanced word study.		
3.1.b. Materials provide frequent opportunities for practice in advanced word study skills.		
3.1.c. Materials include spelling instruction aligned to the scope and sequence.		
3.1.d. Materials provide frequent opportunities for teacher modeling, student oral reading and immediate feedback to emphasize reading accuracy and automaticity.		
TOTAL SECTION SCORE	0	

PART 4: TEXT COMPLEXITY AND VOCABULARY

High-quality texts, at the appropriate grade-level text complexity, are the central focus of lessons, supported by tasks and questions grounded in evidence and explicit instruction in vocabulary aligned to the Ohio Learning Standards in English Language Arts.

Criterion 1: Text Complexity		
Texts are worthy of students' time and attention: texts are of quality and are rigorous, meeting the text complexity criteria for each grade. Materials support students' advancing toward independent reading.		
Indicators	**Score**	Comments
4.1.a. Materials reflect the distribution of text types and genres required by the state standards at each grade level. **This does not include decodables. Those are identified in Section 2: Foundational Skills.*		
4.1.b. Materials provide specific guidance for teachers on how to provide scaffolds and materials for differentiation as texts become more complex.		
4.1.c. Materials are included for teachers to read aloud to students, exposing students to text more complex than students could read independently. This is for the purpose of building vocabulary and background knowledge, as well as modeling fluency for students.		
4.1.d. Materials provide varied approaches to learning tasks over time of how students are expected to demonstrate their learning with opportunities for students to monitor their learning while providing supporting text evidence (e.g. share thinking, ask questions, research & investigate, problem solve, present, write, discuss, self-reflect, evaluate other's ideas, monitor own progress, implement feedback, etc.).		
TOTAL SECTION SCORE	0	

Criterion 2: Vocabulary		
Key academic vocabulary instruction is cohesively taught in and across texts.		
Indicators	Score	Comments
4.2.a. Vocabulary instruction prioritizes teaching high-utility words that frequently occur in conversations, as well as words, including content-area words, that must be learned in order to fully comprehend a text and across contexts. Vocabulary instruction includes guidance for students on how to revisit and apply learned words, including content-area words and high-utility words.		
4.2.b. Materials guide teachers to explicitly model using student-friendly definitions, provide multiple examples and non-examples, and engage students in multiple opportunities to learn, practice, and apply learned vocabulary with immediate corrective feedback.		

4.2.c. Materials support explicit and systematic instruction in morphemic analysis to bolster the development of word meaning through knowledge of root words, prefixes, and suffixes.		
TOTAL SECTION SCORE	0	

PART 5: KNOWLEDGE BUILDING AND WRITING

Materials build knowledge and understanding through integrated reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language, aligned to the Ohio Learning Standards for English Language Arts.

Criterion 1: Knowledge Building & Writing		
Materials build knowledge and understanding through integrated reading, writing, speaking, listening, and language. Writing is cohesively and intentionally taught across the year.		
Indicators	**Score**	**Comments**
5.1.a. Texts are organized around a cohesive topic(s) to build students' ability to read and comprehend complex texts independently and proficiently in order to build knowledge.		
5.1.b. Materials require students to analyze the key ideas, details, craft, and structure within individual texts as well as across multiple texts using coherently sequenced, high-quality questions and tasks.		
5.1.c. Materials include a cohesive, year-long plan for students to achieve grade-level writing proficiency by the end of the school year.		
5.1.d. Materials include systematic and explicit writing instruction following a logical progression of transcription skills, progressing from simple to complex, as appropriate for the grade, including the following skills: • Handwriting • Punctuation • Capitalization		
5.1.e. Materials include systematic and explicit writing instruction following a logical progression of text generation skills, progressing from simple to complex, as appropriate for the grade, including the following skills: •Grammar •Sentence-level composition •Paragraph-level composition •Multi-paragraph composition		

5.1.f. Materials provide sufficient time for modeling, planning, drafting, revising, and editing through the use of the gradual release of responsibility model (i.e., I do, we do, you do).		
5.1.g. Materials provide opportunities for students to learn, practice, and apply different text genres, modes, or types of writing that reflect the distribution required by the standards, and to demonstrate knowledge of content.		
TOTAL SECTION SCORE	0	

PART 6: USABILITY

Materials support teachers to fully utilize the curriculum, understand the skills and learning of their students, and support a range of learners.

Criterion 1: Implementation Supports		
The program includes opportunities for teachers to effectively plan and utilize materials with integrity and to further develop their own understanding of the content.		
Indicators	**Score**	**Comments**
6.1.a. Materials regularly and systematically balance time and resources required for following the suggested implementation, as well as include guidance for alternative implementations that maintain alignment and intent of the standards.		
6.1.b. Materials provide teacher guidance with annotations and suggestions for how to implement the student materials and ancillary materials to support students' literacy development.		
6.1.c. Materials contain teacher-specific explanations, examples and resources on concepts within and beyond the grade-level concepts to help teachers improve their knowledge and better their practice.		
6.1.d. Materials provide strategies for increasing engagement of a student's parent, guardian, custodian, caregiver, or other household member around the program and suggestions for how they can help support student progress and achievement.		
TOTAL SECTION SCORE	0	

Criterion 2: Assessment System		
The program includes a system of assessments identifying how materials provide tools, guidance, and support for teachers to collect, interpret, and act on data about student progress toward the standards.		
Indicators	**Score**	**Comments**
6.2.a. Assessment information is included in the materials to indicate which standards are assessed.		

6.2.b. Materials offer a system of various assessments, including formative and summative assessments, that do all of the following: (a) evaluate student progress and mastery of grade-level content standards, as defined in Ohio's Learning Standards for English Language Arts; (b) throughout the duration of the course, program, or grade level, consistently evaluate student performance and mastery to determine students' learning; (c) provide guidance for teachers on interpreting student performance that includes suggestions for follow-up [e.g., supports and services for each student based on the assessment results].		
6.2.c. Assessments make available testing accommodations that allow students to demonstrate their knowledge and skills without changing the type of knowledge or skill that the assessment is intended to measure.		
TOTAL SECTION SCORE	0	

Criterion 3: Student Supports		
The program includes materials designed for each student's regular and active participation in program content.		
Indicators	**Score**	**Comments**
6.3.a. Materials provide strategies and supports for students who read, write, speak, and/or listen below grade level to work with grade-level content and to meet or exceed grade-level standards that will support their regular and active participation in learning English language arts and literacy.		
6.3.b. Materials regularly provide extensions to engage with literacy content and concepts at greater depth for students who read, write, speak, and/or listen above grade level.		
6.3.c. Materials provide strategies and supports for students who read, write, speak and/or listen in a language other than English to meet or exceed grade-level standards and to regularly participate in learning English language arts and literacy.		
6.3.d. Materials provide opportunities for teachers to use a variety of grouping strategies.		
TOTAL SECTION SCORE	0	

CORE PROGRAM SUMMARY

Programs must receive a rating of **Meets Expectations** within each of the criteria required for the category of review to receive an overall rating of Meets Expectations.

PART 1: INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN

CRITERIA		TOTAL POINTS	SCORING
1. Instructional Design		0	Meets: 10-12 Does Not Meet: 0-9
	OVERALL POINTS	0	Meets: 10-12 Does Not Meet: 0-9
	DECISION	Does Not Meet	

PART 2: FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS K-2

CRITERIA		TOTAL POINTS	SCORING
1. Foundational Skills K-2		0	Meets: 16-20 Does Not Meet: 0-15
	OVERALL POINTS	0	Meets: 16-20 Does Not Meet: 0-15
	DECISION	Does Not Meet	

PART 3: FOUNDATIONAL SKILLS 3-5

CRITERIA		TOTAL POINTS	SCORING
1. Foundational Skills 3-5		0	Meets: 7-8 Does Not Meet: 0-6
	OVERALL POINTS	0	Meets: 7-8 Does Not Meet: 0-6
	DECISION	Does Not Meet	

PART 4: TEXT COMPLEXITY AND VOCABULARY

CRITERIA		TOTAL POINTS	SCORING REQUIREMENT
1. Text Complexity		0	Meets: 7-8 Does Not Meet: 0-6
2. Vocabulary		0	Meets: 5-6 Does Not Meet: 0-4
	OVERALL POINTS	0	Meets: 12-14 Does Not Meet: 0-11
	DECISION	Does Not Meet	

PART 5: KNOWLEDGE BUILDING AND WRITING

CRITERIA		TOTAL POINTS	SCORING REQUIREMENT
1. Knowledge Building & Writing		0	Meets: 12-14 Does Not Meet: 0-11
	OVERALL POINTS	0	Meets: 12-14 Does Not Meet: 0-11
	DECISION	Does Not Meet	

PART 6: USABILITY

CRITERIA		TOTAL POINTS	SCORING REQUIREMENT
1. Implementation Supports		0	Meets: 7-8 Does Not Meet: 0-6
2. Assessment System		0	Meets: 5-6 Does Not Meet: 0-4
3. Student Supports		0	Meets: 7-8 Does Not Meet: 0-6
	OVERALL POINTS	0	Meets: 18-22 Does Not Meet: 0-17
	DECISION	Does Not Meet	