# Accelerating Learning Through High-Quality Tutoring Programs

## REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS

## Project Background

Data from the 2021-2022 school year show the major impact that the pandemic had on student learning in Ohio. State assessment results indicate that historically underserved students experienced the greatest decreases in learning as a result of the pandemic. Student performance was significantly impacted, as in other states. Data on the 2022-2023 Ohio School Report Cards illustrate consistent growth while highlighting areas of continued focus. Student proficiency is rising but still not up to pre-pandemic levels. Ohio is committed to providing intensive supports to accelerate learning for students who have been impacted by the events of the past few years and has invested federal funds in three priorities as part of Future Forward Ohio: addressing obstacles to learning, accelerating learning and preparing students for future success.

High-dosage tutoring is an effective tool to accelerate learning. According to the Annenberg Institute at Brown University, high-dosage tutoring is defined as "more than three days per week or at a rate of at least 50 hours over 36 weeks." That research shows high-dosage tutoring can produce "large learning gains for a wide range of students, including those who have fallen behind academically." High-dosage tutoring increased achievement "by roughly an additional three to 15 months of learning across grade levels."

Ohio has invested in high-dosage tutoring through the Statewide Mathematics and Literacy Grant and the State-Funded High-Dosage Tutoring Program. In addition, Ohio districts received more than $6.8 billion in federal COVID relief funds that can be utilized through Sept. 30, 2024 on tutoring and other programs to help students recover from the impact of the pandemic.

Ohio House Bill 583 (134th GA) requires the development of a list of tutoring programs that the Department considers to be of *high quality* and have the potential to accelerate learning for students in the areas of English language arts, mathematics, science and social studies, which is the purpose of this Request for Qualifications (RFQ). Respondents to this RFQ must provide a comprehensive tutoring program that includes the six Key Components of High-Quality Tutoring (see p. 2), including high-quality instructional materials aligned to Ohio's learning standards and quality tutors.

Ohio Department of Education & Workforce

While the list of high-quality programs is intended to be a helpful resource, schools and districts are best equipped to know the specific needs of students and select appropriate tutoring programs and may select any tutoring provider of their choice, including providers not on the list.

**No school district or school shall be *required* to use a tutoring program on the list unless participating in a grant program or funding opportunity for which it is required.**

## Project Justification

This RFQ is responsive to the requirements of House Bill 583 for the development of a list of tutoring programs that the Ohio Department of Education and Workforce (the Department) considers to be of high quality and have the potential to accelerate learning for students in the areas of English language arts, mathematics, science and/or social studies.

To meet this requirement, the Department requests the qualifications of public and private entities that provide tutoring programs for students. The Department will utilize a rubric to evaluate the programs and determine a minimum score for a tutoring program to be included on the Department's list. In compiling the list, the Department may designate individual tutoring programs as more appropriate for certain grade levels, populations of students, or subject areas.

As part of this RFQ, the Department will also include an opportunity to be listed as a high-quality tutoring provider as part of the Expanding Opportunities for Each Child grant. This grant is meant to expand access to and enrollment in school improvement activities for low-achieving students and students from low-income families through four grant focus areas:

- Advanced coursework;
- Career pathways;
- Personalized learning; and
- Credit recovery and academic acceleration services.

Part of the personalized learning focus area includes high-quality academic tutoring. A variety of providers of high-dosage tutoring may be selected and approved by the State and appear on the State's list of high-quality tutors. To determine an organization's eligibility, please reference the Expanding Opportunities for Each Child guidance document.

**KEY COMPONENTS OF HIGH-QUALITY TUTORING PROGRAMS:**
Public and private entities that submit an application should meet the following requirements[1]:

- High-quality instructional materials aligned to Ohio's Academic Learning Standards.
  - For literacy, tutoring programs should also be aligned to Ohio's literacy priorities, including grade specific English language arts content standards, Ohio's Plan to Raise Literacy Achievement and the Science of Reading.
  - For mathematics, tutoring programs should also be aligned to Ohio's Learning Standards for Mathematics and Ohio's Mathematical Practices.

- Instruction aligned with research on effective teaching and learning
  - Explicit and systematic instruction aligned to students' core instruction

- Alignment to high-dosage tutoring practices:
  - One-on-one or small group (3-4) instruction
  - At least three sessions a week, 20-40 minutes each session or 50 hours over 36 weeks
  - Embedded in the school day or immediately before/after
  - Coordination with classroom teachers

- Data-driven instructional practices
  - Sessions individualized based on students' needs in support of grade-level core-instruction
  - Data for teachers and district personnel

- Quality tutors
  - Background checks and screening procedures
  - Onboarding
  - Content and pedagogy training
  - Ongoing supports
  - Quality control measures during tutoring sessions

- Demonstrated effectiveness
  - History of performance
  - Data and research to support program effectiveness

---

[1] Adapted from: https://annenberg.brown.edu/sites/default/files/EdResearch_for_Recovery_Design_Principles_1.pdf

Ohio **Department of Education & Workforce**

## ELIGIBLE APPLICANTS

Public and private entities that provide high-quality tutoring programs for students are eligible to apply. Tutoring programs should be of high quality (please see Key Components of High-Quality Tutoring Programs, p.2) and have the potential to accelerate learning for students in the areas of English language arts, mathematics, science and/or social studies.

At this time, the Department does not have additional funding to support tutoring programs approved under this RFQ. Each approved tutoring program will be responsible for all contracts with individual districts and schools.

Public or chartered nonpublic schools are not prohibited from contracting or partnering with another entity not on the high-quality tutoring programs list to provide tutoring services to the school's students.

The programs on the resulting list will have been determined by the Ohio Department of Education and Workforce to be of high-quality and with the potential to accelerate learning for students in the areas of English language arts, mathematics, science and/or social studies.

Parental Complaints: Because the Department does not have jurisdiction over determining what type of tutoring programs are used in the classroom or what fees are assessed by districts, parents should contact their local boards of education to raise any concerns they may have regarding the use of tutoring programs. Districts should work with parents in addressing their concerns and take such concerns into consideration.

# Application Procedures

## APPLICATION TIMELINE

The Department posted an initial list of tutoring programs on the Department's website on Oct. 1, 2022.  The application period will be open on an annual basis with anticipation that an updated list will be published once a year.

- **RFQ High-quality tutoring program application available:** Wednesday, Jan. 3, 2024
- **Application deadline:** Wednesday, Jan. 31, 2024
- **High-quality tutoring program list published:** Early March 2024

To be considered for the initial list, the application and appendices must be submitted by 11:59 p.m. EST on Wednesday, Jan. 31, 2024 to tutoring@education.ohio.gov. The electronic version must include all required components. Incomplete or late applications will not be considered.

Department of Education & Workforce

## APPLICATION SUBMISSION METHOD

Applicants are required to submit a completed application and required supporting documents to the tutoring inbox at tutoring@education.ohio.gov answering all questions included in the application portion of this RFQ.

The Department has provided an application template to assist in the organization of the information required in the application. Use of the template is required.

## EVALUATION PROCESS

The Department shall utilize a rubric to evaluate the applications. All complete and timely submissions will be evaluated by at least three qualified reviewers selected by the Department. Each of the quality elements will be scored by the team of reviewers. Quality review components will be rated using a score of "0" to "4". Applications that are missing one or more required narratives and/or appendices will not be scored. Applications missing one or more technical or quality review elements will not be scored. Applications must receive a minimum of 75% of the total possible points to advance to the High-Quality Tutoring Programs list. Applications scoring less than 75% shall not be included on the list, although applicants may apply again in subsequent application windows. In compiling the list, the Department may designate individual tutoring programs as more appropriate for certain grade levels, populations of students, or subject areas.  Applicants will be notified via email if the application scored 75% or above to be listed on the High-Quality Tutoring Programs list.

Ohio Department of Education & Workforce

# Application Template

Eligible applicants must complete fully the following technical and quality elements to be considered. These components can be completed using the application template found on the RFQ webpage. The application should include the following sections:

# Part 1: Technical Review

Applications must first pass a technical review to ensure they are complete and include all required information. Applications that pass the technical review will then undergo a review for quality criteria. The technical review includes: (1) Verification that applicants have completed Sections A and B on the application, and (2) Verification that applicants have submitted Appendix A.

## SECTION A: VENDOR INFORMATION

| Technical Element | Answer |
|---|---|
| Name of Organization | |
| Address | |
| City, State and Zip Code | |
| Phone | |
| Email | |
| Name and Title of Authorized Contact | |
| Address (if different from above) | |
| City, State and Zip Code | |
| Phone | |
| Email | |
| Name and Title of Secondary Contact | |
| Address (if different from above) | |
| City, State and Zip Code | |
| Phone | |
| Email | |
| Tax I.D. Number and / or Ohio Secretary of State Business Registration Entity Number | |

Ohio Department of Education & Workforce

| Technical Element | Answer |
|---|---|
| Number of years as a provider of tutoring programs | |
| Number of LEAs the tutoring program can support during a school year | |

## ORGANIZATION TYPE (CHECK APPROPRIATE BOXES)

| For-Profit Corporation | ☐ | ☐ Ohio Corp. or | ☐ Foreign Corp. |
|---|---|---|---|
| Nonprofit Corporation | ☐ | ☐ Ohio Corp. or | ☐ Foreign Corp. |
| Other | ☐ | Please specify: | |

## SERVICE DELIVERY MODEL (CHECK APPROPRIATE BOXES)

| On Campus Tutoring | ☐ |
|---|---|
| Virtual Tutoring | ☐ |
| Blended Model | ☐ |

## AREAS OF TUTORING COVERAGE (CHECK APPROPRIATE BOXES)

| Content | Grades | Can provide tutoring service in this grade band and content area | Can support students participating in special education and related services |
|---|---|---|---|
| English Language Arts | K-5 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | 6-8 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | 9-12 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | Other (Please explain) | | |
| Mathematics | K-5 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | 6-8 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | 9-12 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | Other (Please explain) | | |

Department of Education & Workforce

| Content | Grades | Can provide tutoring service in this grade band and content area | Can support students participating in special education and related services |
|---|---|---|---|
| Science | K-5 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | 6-8 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | 9-12 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | Other (Please explain) | | |
| Social Studies | K-5 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | 6-8 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | 9-12 | ☐ | ☐ |
| | Other (Please explain) | | |

## BACKGROUND CHECKS

Are background checks and other screening procedures are performed for tutors?

Yes ☐

No ☐

If yes, explain the process and how it aligns to Ohio's background requirements for vendors as outlined here.

## REFERENCES

As part of the technical review, a minimum of three (3) relevant client references should be included within the application (Appendix A). Include client names, addresses, contact names with emails and phone numbers, dates of service and type(s) of service(s) provided. Client references should include state or local education agencies that you have partnered with in the past five years to provide similar services. If any of those state or local education agencies terminated their contracts with your organization early, please explain.

# Part 2: Quality Elements Review

Each component of high-quality tutoring will be scored according to the following categories:

**Not Addressed/0 Points:** The response is not provided.

**Poorly Developed/1 Point:** The response is significantly incomplete, missing required appendices or otherwise raises substantial concerns about the viability of the plan or the applicant's capacity to execute it.

**Partially Developed/2 Points:** The response meets less than half of the established criteria and contains substantial gaps in other areas.

**Adequately Developed/3 Points:** The response meets the established criteria.

**Fully Developed/4 Points:** The response demonstrates the applicant's thorough understanding of key issues via specific and accurate information. The response presents a clear, realistic picture of how the applicant expects to operate and inspires confidence in the applicant's capacity to execute the plan effectively.

## SECTION B: KEY COMPONENTS

### HIGH-QUALITY INSTRUCTIONAL MATERIALS ALIGNED TO OHIO'S ACADEMIC LEARNING STANDARDS

Please describe how the tutoring program will align to Ohio's Academic Learning Standards for English language arts, mathematics, science and/or social studies.  For literacy, be sure to clearly articulate how the tutoring program is also aligned to the Science of Reading and Ohio's Plan to Raise Literacy Achievement. For mathematics, clearly articulate how the tutoring program is aligned to Mathematical Practices.

Please provide, as an appendix (Appendix B), adequate documentation and/or evidence to support your description (above) for each grade band and content area you intend to serve. This may include curriculum guides, sample lesson plans, scope and sequence, tutorials, promotional materials, etc.

### APPROACH ALIGNED WITH RESEARCH ON EFFECTIVE TEACHING AND LEARNING

Please provide an overview and explanation of how the tutoring program is aligned with research on effective teaching and learning; specifically, how the program leverages explicit and systematic instruction.

Department of Education & Workforce

## HIGH-DOSAGE TUTORING PRACTICES

Please outline and describe how the tutoring program is aligned with the qualities of high-dosage tutoring. Specifically, be sure to address how the program incorporates the following features:

- One-on-one or small group (3-4) instruction
- At least three sessions a week or 50 hours over 36 weeks
- Embedded in the school day or immediately before/after
- Implementation supports/coaching
- Coordination with classroom teachers and/or district personnel

## DATA-DRIVEN INSTRUCTION

Explain how the tutoring program provides and uses data to drive instruction. Specifically, be sure to address the following:

- Sessions individualized based on students' needs
- Data informed instruction in coordination with teachers and district personnel

## QUALITY TUTORS

Describe the background checks and screening procedures utilized. Describe your process for recruiting tutors and the necessary qualifications for hire. Describe the content-specific and pedagogical training provided to tutors for each content area. Please include sample training materials, guides, etc.as supporting evidence. Describe the quality control measures in place to monitor tutoring sessions, including professionalism of tutors, quality of tutoring sessions, and methods for providing feedback to tutors.

## DEMONSTRATED EFFECTIVENESS

Describe the vendor's experience as a provider of a tutoring program. Please describe evidence of your organization's prior successes in tutor recruitment, training, and/or instructional materials for tutoring. Describe and provide any program evaluations that demonstrate a positive impact on student achievement. Concrete, specific, and quantitative metrics are strongly preferred over qualitative descriptions. Independent research studies demonstrating effectiveness are particularly valuable.

Please provide a statement of how many districts or schools your organization can responsibly support and how they would be served by your proposed team.

Department of Education & Workforce

# Part 3: Appendices

## APPENDIX A: REFERENCES

As part of the technical review, a minimum of three (3) relevant client references should be included within the application. Include client names, addresses, contact names with emails and phone numbers, dates of service and type(s) of service(s) provided. Client references should include state or local education agencies that you have partnered with in the past five years to provide similar services. If any of those state or local education agencies terminated their contracts with your organization early, please explain.

**Please attach three references as part of Appendix A.**

## APPENDIX B: SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION

Please provide adequate documentation and/or evidence to support your description (above) for each grade band and content area you intend to serve. This may include curriculum guides, sample lesson plans, scope and sequence, tutorials, promotional materials, etc.

## APPENDIX C: OPTIONAL QUALIFICATIONS

To also be an eligible provider for Expanding Opportunities for Each Child grant funding, entities must assure the following by checking the appropriate box for each item below. To review full eligibility requirements, please reference the Expanding Opportunities for Each Child guidance document.

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Proposed tutoring program has a demonstrated record of success in increasing students' academic achievement. | Yes ☐ | No ☐ |
| Proposed tutoring program complies with all applicable Federal, State, and local health, safety and civil rights laws. | Yes ☐ | No ☐ |
| Proposed tutoring program provides instruction and content that is secular, neutral and non-ideological. | Yes ☐ | No ☐ |

Ohio Department of Education & Workforce