High-Quality Instructional Materials Rubric

K-12 Social Studies

April 2025

Ohio Department of Education & Workforce

Table of Contents

High-Quality Instructional Materials Rubric

K-12 SOCIAL STUDIES

TITLE: _____ **REVIEWER NAME:** _____ **DATE:** _____

Social Studies Rubric Overview

Instructional materials selection is an important district decision, and conducting a thorough review of instructional materials at the local level is essential in meeting the needs of students within a school or district. This evaluation rubric is designed to offer an evaluation that districts can utilize to determine how well instructional materials align with Ohio's Learning Standards for Social Studies and other local criteria. Pursuant to ORC 3301.079 (B) (3) and 3313.60, it is the responsibility of Ohio's local boards of education to vet and approve curriculum and educational materials for use in the public schools within their district. Districts and schools should use their professional expertise to determine the suitability of any particular resources for use in their districts, schools or classrooms.

The evaluation rubric includes key considerations for high-quality instructional materials and outlines two Gateways for consideration when evaluating materials. Within each Gateway, Criterion and related Indicators are provided along with Guiding Questions and Look-Fors. Each indicator is evaluated as Does Not Meet Expectations, Partially Meets Expectations, or Meets Expectations using a 0-1-2 scale score.

Ohio's rubric is composed of 5 criteria: Alignment to Learning Standards, Social Studies Practices and Disciplinary Literacy, Assessment, Student Supports, and Teacher Supports. These criteria feature review indicators, each with guiding questions and evidence guidance to help focus the review process.

- *Criterion:* Criterion refers to a compilation of indicators within a specific focus area in social studies that discern markers of high-quality instructional materials. Each criterion area offers a concise description at the beginning of its section, and the scoring of each criterion is determined by the total indicators.
- *Indicators:* Indicators denote the high-quality components of instructional materials that align with the Ohio Learning Standards for Social Studies.
- *Guiding Questions:* Guiding Questions accompany each indicator and are intended to assist reviewers in understanding the evidence required for each indicator.
- *Look For Evidence of How the Materials:* The Look-Fors offer suggestions and considerations for what reviewers may observe in the instructional materials to support the evaluation of that indicator. These suggestions are not exhaustive, as demonstrations for any indicator can vary between materials.
- *Scoring*: Scores are given to most indicators within each criterion to determine how well materials meet the expectations. Each scored indicator is evaluated as Not Meeting Expectations, Partially Meeting Expectations, or Meeting Expectations using a 0-1-2 scale score. Some indicators are marked as "Narrative Evidence" and will not receive a numeric score.

The rubric is designed to allow reviewers to determine a threshold for quality for each Gateway. If instructional materials do not meet the thresholds for Meets Expectations or Partially Meets Expectations for a Gateway, reviewers are prompted to not move forward with reviewing the other Gateways.

- Gateway 1: Alignment (advance to Gateway 2 only if the instructional materials Meet or Partially Meet Expectations for Gateway 1)
- Gateway 2: Instructional Support

Review Summary	Criteria	Score	Rating
Alignment Criteria	1.1 Alignment to Learning Standards	/4	
	1.2 Social Studies Practices and Disciplinary Literacy	/6	
	Gateway 1 Sub-Total	**/10**	
Instructional Supports Criteria	2.1 Assessment	/6	
	2.2 Student Supports	/10	
	2.3 Teacher Supports	/12	
	Gateway 2 Sub-Total	**/28**	
Overall Rating		**Total Score**	**Final Rating**
Meets Expectations *Materials meet expectations for all criteria.* **Partially Meets Expectations** *Materials meet or partially meet expectations for all criteria.* **Does Not Meet Expectations** *Any gateway that does not meet the criteria.*		**/38**	

Ohio **Department of Education & Workforce**

Gateway 1: Alignment

Gateway 1 looks at alignment with the Ohio Learning Standards and additional subject-specific indicators of quality.

CRITERION 1.1: ALIGNMENT TO LEARNING STANDARDS			
Materials align to the Ohio Learning Standards for Social Studies at the grade or course-level.			
Indicators	**Guiding Questions**	**Look for Evidence of How the Materials:**	**Evidence**
1.1a. Materials support engaging students in the Ohio Social Studies learning standards and model curriculum for that grade or course. **Scoring** | 0 | 1 | 2 |	• Are all grade or course-level learning standards present? If not, which ones are absent in the materials? ○ Have all aspects or parts of the learning standards been addressed? • Does the level of rigor meet or exceed the skills or knowledge defined in Ohio's social studies learning standards and expectations for learning? • Do the materials present content in a way that is accurate and evidence-based for the specific social studies discipline? • Do materials promote students building knowledge and skills in a coherent and logical sequence?	• Explicitly identify and align unit or lesson objectives to Ohio's learning standards and model curriculum's content statements, content elaborations, and expectations for learning. • Directly contribute to students' engagement in content or skills to meet or exceed the Expectations of Learning described in Ohio's Social Studies Model Curriculum. • Reflect accurate information, current scholarship and research, or evidence-based best practices in social studies appropriate to the social studies discipline, course, or grade-level content. • Multiple perspectives are presented that expand the dominant historical narrative.	

Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 1.1: ALIGNMENT TO LEARNING STANDARDS
Materials align to the Ohio Learning Standards for Social Studies at the grade or course-level.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
1.1b. Materials include primary and secondary sources with a variety of mediums and text complexity that are appropriate for the grade or course-level. **Scoring** 0 1 2	• Are included primary and secondary documents accurately cited and contextualized where appropriate? • Are the primary and secondary sources relevant and authentic to the social studies discipline, course, or grade-level content? • Do the materials include a variety of mediums (text, video, maps, audio, charts, graphs) appropriate for the social studies discipline, course, or grade? • Are written texts appropriately complex for the course or grade level?	• Contain discipline-appropriate sources (i.e., informational texts, literary excerpts or works, maps, charts, graphs, diagrams, artworks, illustrations, historical documents, artifacts, and sources). • Presents primary and secondary sources in a variety of different formats, mediums, and types (texts, videos, audio, images, etc.). • Utilizes secondary sources to provide students with the necessary background knowledge to access and analyze primary sources. • Contain texts that support students reading at grade level or higher. • Contain strategies (i.e., annotation, organization, building academic vocabulary) that promote student comprehension of a variety of text types and sources to support comprehension. • Provide appropriate context to primary and secondary sources by accurately informing students and teachers about the source's author, date of creation, location, and the source for any quotes or excerpts.	
Criterion 1.2 Summary		**Criterion Score**	**Criterion Rating**
Meets Expectations (3-4 pts) Partially Meets Expectations (2 pts) Does Not Meet Expectations (< 2 pts)			

Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 1.2: SOCIAL STUDIES PRACTICES AND DISCIPLINARY LITERACY

Materials promote students engaging in grade level or course investigation of social studies content and questions while applying social studies disciplinary tools and concepts through the evaluation of sources, use of evidence, and communication of conclusions.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
1.2a. Materials promote student inquiry and frame instruction that leads students to course-level, grade-level appropriate explorations of social studies content. **Scoring** 0　　1　　2	• Do materials use evidence-based instructional methods such as inquiry? 　○ Do the materials promote the use of compelling and supporting questions? • Do materials promote student interest in grade or course-level appropriate exploration of the content? • Do the materials organize social studies content as a set of interlocking and mutually supportive ideas that frame the ways students comprehend social studies content?	• Use supporting questions to connect lesson objectives to larger themes, ideas, or compelling questions. • Prompts students to generate and reflect upon their own investigations and questions throughout a lesson or unit. • Support students at appropriate levels of inquiry (structured, guided, or open).	

Ohio Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 1.2: SOCIAL STUDIES PRACTICES AND DISCIPLINARY LITERACY

Materials promote students engaging in grade level or course investigation of social studies content and questions while applying social studies disciplinary tools and concepts through the evaluation of sources, use of evidence, and communication of conclusions.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
1.2b. Materials are designed for students to build knowledge and disciplinary literacy within the social studies disciplines of civics, economics, history, and geography. **Scoring** 0 1 2	• Do the materials support building student content knowledge? • Do the materials support building student academic and discipline-specific vocabulary? • Do the materials engage students' reading, writing, thinking, and communicating in the discipline? • Do the materials promote the development of discipline-specific skills, knowledge, and thinking (i.e., thinking like a historian) through the investigation and use of evidence to support claims from primary and secondary sources?	• Include text or source-dependent and text or source-specific questions and instructional strategies that engage students in reading, writing, thinking, and communicating with evidence. • Provide opportunities for student use of primary and secondary sources in writing, thinking, and communicating. • Provide opportunities for student application and synthesis of knowledge within and across social studies disciplines. • Provide students opportunities and protocols for students to learn, practice, and develop discrete disciplinary skills appropriate for the grade or course. • Engage students in learning experiences that develop their ability to think like social scientists (historians, economists, geographers, political scientists, etc.) • Provide opportunities for student analysis and evaluation of sources and arguments (claim, evidence, and reasoning) across social studies disciplines. • Supports the language and literacy goals defined in Science of Reading.	

CRITERION 1.2: SOCIAL STUDIES PRACTICES AND DISCIPLINARY LITERACY

Materials promote students engaging in grade level or course investigation of social studies content and questions while applying social studies disciplinary tools and concepts through the evaluation of sources, use of evidence, and communication of conclusions.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence

1.2c. Materials promote students engaging in discourse of multiple perspectives and narratives and student examination of the credibility of sources.
 	
Scoring
 	
0   1   2
	• Do the materials provide frequent opportunities for student discourse and meaningful classroom discussions using evidence from primary and secondary sources?
	• Do the materials promote the use of effective strategies for developmentally appropriate student discourse and academic conversations in social studies (i.e., Socratic seminar, Anchor charts, small group strategies)?
	• Do the materials promote students exploring and considering a variety of perspectives on complex issues, where appropriate to the grade-level or course-level content?
		• Provide strategies that promote students to engage in discourse on social studies topics.
		• Provide instructors tools to customize learning experiences in connection with students' homes and communities.
		• Integrate student questions and background knowledge into the unit or lesson.
		• Engage students with different perspectives on the same event or experience.
		• Engage students in examining primary and secondary sources' credibility by checking the:
		  o Perspective of the author.
		  o Agreement with other credible sources.
		  o Qualifications and reputation of the author.
		  o Bias of the author (including use of stereotypes.)
		  o Circumstances in which the author prepared the source.
		  o Accuracy and consistency of arguments made in the source.	

Criterion 1.2 Summary		**Criterion Score**	**Criterion Rating**
Meets Expectations (5-6 pts) Partially Meets Expectations (4 pts) Does Not Meet Expectations (< 4 pts)			

Ohio **Department of Education & Workforce**

Gateway 1 Summary	Points Scored
Criterion 1.1: Alignment to Learning Standards	**/4**
Criterion 1.2: Social Studies Practices and Disciplinary Literacy	**/6**
Gateway 1 Rating Levels	**Gateway 1 Total Points**
Meets Expectations (9-10 pts) Partially Meets Expectations (7-8 pts) Does Not Meet Expectations (< 7 pts)	**/10**
Gateway 1 Comments:	

Ohio **Department of Education & Workforce**

Gateway 2: Instructional Support

Gateway 2 examines additional indicators of quality that demonstrate the usability of the materials to support implementation. This includes assessment, student supports and teacher supports. **Materials must Meet or Partially Meet Expectations for Gateway 1 to be reviewed for Gateway 2.**

CRITERION 2.1: ASSESSMENT			
The program includes a system of assessments identifying how materials provide tools, guidance, and support for Ohio teachers to collect, interpret and act on data about student progress toward the standards.			
Indicators	**Guiding Questions**	**Look for Evidence of How the Materials:**	**Evidence**
2.1a. Materials offer a diverse system of assessment with multiple opportunities throughout the grade, course, or series to determine students' learning and sufficient guidance to teachers for interpreting student performance and suggestions for follow-up. **Scoring** 0 1 2	• Does the assessment system provide multiple opportunities throughout the grade, course, or series to determine students' learning and sufficient guidance to teachers for interpreting student performance and suggestions for follow-up? • Is guidance consistently provided to teachers on how to interpret student understandings?	• Provide resources (e.g., sample student responses, rubrics, scoring guidelines, and open-ended feedback) for scoring purposes. • Provide guidance to teachers to interpret student understanding. • Provide teachers guidance to respond to student needs elicited by the assessment. • Provide opportunities for students to show learning through annotated drawings, classroom observations, oral responses, presentations, use of glossaries and home language, performance assessments, and portfolios.	

CRITERION 2.1: ASSESSMENT

The program includes a system of assessments identifying how materials provide tools, guidance, and support for Ohio teachers to collect, interpret, and act on data about student progress toward the standards.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.1b. Assessments include opportunities for students to demonstrate the full intent of grade-level or course-level standards across the series. **Scoring** 0 1 2	• Do the assessments include opportunities for students to demonstrate the full intent of grade-level or course-level standards and practices across the series? • Do the assessments include a variety of modalities (e.g., writing, illustrating, demonstrating, modeling, oral presentations, and performance tasks) and suggestions for how they can be used? • Is there a good balance of complexity in assessment tasks?	• Provide opportunities for different types of modalities (e.g., writing, illustrating, demonstrating, modeling, oral presentations, and performance tasks). • Provide opportunities for different types of items used for student assessments and how they are used to measure student performance (e.g., performance tasks, discussion questions, constructed response questions, project- or problem-based tasks, portfolios, justified multiple-choice).	
2.1c. Assessments offer accommodations that allow students to demonstrate their knowledge and skills without changing the content of the assessment. **Scoring** 0 1 2	• Do materials incorporate accommodations in assessments that maintain the assessment's content while enabling students to demonstrate their knowledge and skills effectively? • Is guidance provided for teachers to use the accommodations?	• Describe where and how accommodations are offered that ensure all students can access the assessment, (e.g., text-to-speech, increased font size, etc.) without changing the content of the assessment. • Provide guidance for teachers to accommodate students, including those in special populations, without altering grade-level or course expectations or the content of the assessment.	
Criterion 2.1 Summary	**Criterion Score**		**Criterion Rating**
Meets Expectations (5-6 pts) Partially Meets Expectations (4 pts) Does Not Meet Expectations (< 4 pts)			

Ohio Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 2.2: STUDENT SUPPORTS

The program includes materials designed for each student's regular and active participation in Ohio's grade level, grade band, and course content.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.2a. Materials provide strategies and support to help students consistently and actively engage in learning at course level or grade level. **Scoring** 0 | 1 | 2	• Do materials provide differentiation supports to sufficiently engage students in grade-level or course-level content? • Do the materials provide comprehensive guidance on strategies and accommodations for diverse students needs?	• Provide specific strategies and supports for differentiating instruction. • Provide a comprehensive strategic support system for students to maintain consistent and active involvement in their learning.	
2.2b. Materials provide both extensions and opportunities for students to engage with grade-level or course-level content at higher levels of complexity. **Scoring** 0 | 1 | 2	• Do materials present opportunities for students to engage in grade or course-level content at a higher level of complexity?	• Suggest strategies and supports for students' exploration of grade-level or course content at a higher level of complexity, not students completing additional tasks, but as an extension of their learning. • Provide opportunities for students to develop and apply higher-level thinking.	

Ohio Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 2.2: STUDENT SUPPORTS

The program includes materials designed for each student's regular and active participation in Ohio's grade level, grade band, and course content.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.2c. Materials provide varied approaches to learning tasks over time and variety in how students are expected to demonstrate their learning with opportunities for students to monitor their learning. **Scoring** 0 1 2	• Do the materials provide multi-modal opportunities for students to question, investigate, sense-make, and problem-solve using a variety of formats and methods, while providing a variety of approaches for students to demonstrate and monitor their learning?	• Provide opportunities for students to share their thinking, to demonstrate changes in their thinking over time, and to apply their understanding in new contexts. • Leverage the use of a variety of formats and methods over time to deepen student understanding and ability to explain and apply ideas. • Provide opportunities for students to monitor and deepen their own learning, using ongoing review, either oral or written feedback, practice, and self-reflection.	
2.2d. Materials provide opportunities for teachers to use a variety of grouping strategies. **Scoring** 0 1 2	• Do the materials provide opportunities for teachers to use a variety of grouping strategies? • Do the materials provide guidance for the teacher on how and when to use specific grouping strategies?	• Provide for meaningful interaction among students, such as in large or small groups, pairs, etc.	

Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 2.2: STUDENT SUPPORTS
The program includes materials designed for each student's regular and active participation in Ohio's grade level, grade band, and course content.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.2e. Materials provide strategies and supports for students who read, write, and/or speak in a language other than English to regularly participate in grade-level learning. **Scoring** 0 1 2	• Do materials provide appropriate support and accommodations for English Learner (EL) students to actively participate in learning grade-level content? • Do the materials teachers provide guidance for instructional practices that foster and empower English Learners (ELs) to develop and exercise agency and autonomy in their learning?	• Provide strategies and opportunities for speaking, listening, reading, and writing to develop practices and knowledge of the subject matter, including scaffolding up to and within grade-level or course-level work. • Provide teacher guidance to support EL students. • Provide guidance that helps teachers identify and follow up on whether the student has challenges in content vs. language acquisition, as well as identify when students may have misconceptions with content vs. language demand, to ensure the two are not conflated.	
2.2f. Materials provide a balance of images or information about people, representing various demographic and physical characteristics to positively portray individuals from all communities and enable students to see themselves in materials. **Scoring** Narrative Evidence	• Do the materials provide a balance of images and/or information about all people? • Do the materials provide representations that show students that they can succeed in the subject?	• Provide positive and balanced depictions of all individuals.	

Ohio **Department of Education & Workforce**

CRITERION 2.2: STUDENT SUPPORTS
The program includes materials designed for each student's regular and active participation in Ohio's grade level, grade band, and course content.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.2g. Materials provide teachers with guidance and strategies that embrace and integrate students' home languages, as well as their cultural and social backgrounds, to facilitate meaningful learning. **Scoring** Narrative Evidence	• Do the materials provide strategies for utilizing students' home language in context with the materials? • Do the materials provide guidance for teachers to effectively incorporate and utilize students' cultural and social backgrounds in the classroom and learning process?	• Provide suggestions and strategies for how to allow the use of the home language to support students in learning. • Present multilingualism as an asset in reading and learning. • Make connections to students' linguistic and cultural backgrounds to facilitate learning. • Provide opportunities for students to feel acknowledged, e.g., asked to create personal problems based on customs of their own home culture.	
2.2h. Materials provide support for different reading levels to ensure accessibility for students. **Scoring** Narrative Evidence	• Do the materials include specific supports or strategies to support students who read at or below grade level to engage with grade or course-level content? • Do the materials scaffold vocabulary or concepts to support readers at or below grade or course level? • Do the materials use a variety of representations to engage students with grade or course-level content?	• Provide tasks with multiple entry points. • Use a variety of representations to engage students with grade-level or course-level content. • Include pre-reading activities that utilize visuals to establish necessary background knowledge on new or unfamiliar themes or topics in an appropriate manner.	

Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 2.2: STUDENT SUPPORTS

The program includes materials designed for each student's regular and active participation in Ohio's grade level, grade band, and course content.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.2i. The visual design (whether in print or digital) supports students in engaging thoughtfully with the subject and is neither distracting nor chaotic. **Scoring** Narrative Evidence	• Do the materials present visual design elements, whether in print or digital format, that facilitate thoughtful student engagement with the subject matter by avoiding distractions or chaotic layouts?	• Provide images, graphics, and models that support student learning and engagement. • Provide images, graphics, and models that clearly communicate information or support student understanding of topics, texts, or concepts. • Provide organizational features (e.g., Table of Contents, glossary, index, internal references, table headers, captions, etc.) clearly and accurately.	
2.2j. Materials integrate digital technology such as interactive tools, virtual manipulatives, objects, and/or dynamic software in ways that engage students in the grade or course-level, when applicable. **Scoring** Narrative Evidence	• Do the materials integrate interactive tools along with dynamic software in ways that support student engagement in the content? • Do the included digital tools support student engagement in the content? • Are digital materials compatible with the Learning Management System (LMS) currently in use?	• Include digital technology and interactive resources, such as data collection tools, simulations, and modeling tools, made available to students. • Include digital technology and interactive tools that support student engagement in the content and how these digital materials can be customized for local use. • Provide accessibility that is compatible with district digital systems for lesson delivery, assessment, and communication from within the district LMS and meet all district privacy-data security requirements. • Include videos, virtual manipulatives, glossaries, English captioning, illustrations, graphic tools, speech recognition, interactive tools, materials in the home language, games, and accessible format.	

Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 2.2: STUDENT SUPPORTS
The program includes materials designed for each student's regular and active participation in Ohio's grade level, grade band, and course content.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.2k. Materials include or reference digital technology that provides opportunities for teachers and/or students to collaborate with each other, when applicable.	• Do the materials provide and leverage digital tools in ways that actively promote and facilitate collaborative interactions among teachers and/or students, where appropriate?	• Support collaboration between teacher to teacher, teacher to student, or student to student.	
Scoring			
Narrative Evidence			

Criterion 2.2 Summary	Criterion Score	Criterion Rating
Meets Expectations (9-10 pts) Partially Meets Expectations (7-8 pts) Does Not Meet Expectations (< 7 pts)		

Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 2.3: TEACHER SUPPORTS

The program includes educative materials that provide teachers with guidance, recommendations, or annotations for how to facilitate the effective use of instructional materials.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.3a. Materials provide teacher guidance with useful annotations and suggestions for how to enact the student and ancillary materials, with specific attention to engaging students to guide their development. **Scoring** 0 | 1 | 2	• Do the materials offer comprehensive guidance, including detailed annotations and actionable suggestions, to assist teachers in implementing both student and ancillary materials, specifically focusing on engaging students to facilitate their developmental progress?	• Provide overview sections, annotations, narrative information, or other documents that will assist the teacher in planning instruction, including strategies and guidance for presenting the content. • Include guidance on identifying and addressing student errors and misconceptions in the planning phase.	
2.3b. Materials contain adult-level explanations and examples of the more complex grade-level or course-level concepts and concepts beyond the current course so that teachers can improve their own knowledge of the subject. **Scoring** 0 | 1 | 2	• Do the materials provide comprehensive resources that support teachers in deepening their understanding of complex grade-level or course-level concepts, extending beyond the current curriculum, through adult-level explanations and examples?	• Provide complete adult-level explanations and examples that support the teacher in developing their own understanding of the content and expected student practices. • Provide supports for teachers to develop their own understanding of more advanced applications of grade-level or course-level concepts. • Provide supports for teachers to develop their own understanding of concepts beyond the current course.	

Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 2.3: TEACHER SUPPORTS
The program includes educative materials that provide teachers with guidance, recommendations, or annotations for how to facilitate the effective use of instructional materials.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.3c. Materials provide recommendations for curriculum-based professional learning that is immersive and allows teachers to experience the materials as a student. **Scoring** 0 1 2	• Do the materials recommend curriculum-based professional learning to enhance both teacher content knowledge and pedagogy? • Do the materials provide best practices to support teachers' planning for instruction? • Do the materials recommend professional learning strategies that promote teachers reflecting on and considering the student experience with the instructional materials? • Do the materials provide recommendations for both initial professional learning and sustained teacher support for student success with the program?	• Provide guidance on curriculum-based professional learning to support classroom facilitation, including understanding the program's instructional design, philosophy, and approaches in units and lessons. • Provide guidance and strategies for professional learning that provide teachers opportunities and time to plan instruction and collaborate with colleagues (i.e., professional learning communities, study groups, coaching, feedback, and reflective practices). • Includes initial and ongoing curriculum-based professional learning to support the program's sustainability.	
2.3d. Materials provide strategies for informing all stakeholders, including students, parents, or caregivers about the program and suggestions for how they can help support student progress and achievement. **Scoring** Narrative Evidence	• Do the materials provide comprehensive strategies that enable students, parents, and caregivers with an understanding of the program, accompanied by actionable guidance to actively support and enhance student progress and achievement?	• Contain strategies for informing students, parents, and/or caregivers about the content their student is learning. • Provide forms of communication with parents and caregivers, including for families that may speak and read in a language other than English. • Contain suggestions for how parents or caregivers can support student progress and achievement.	

Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 2.3: TEACHER SUPPORTS

The program includes educative materials that provide teachers with guidance, recommendations, or annotations for how to facilitate the effective use of instructional materials.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.3e. Materials provide explanations of the instructional approaches of the program and identification of the research-based and evidence-based strategies. **Scoring** 0 | 1 | 2	• Do the materials present the program's teaching methodologies and research-based and evidence-based strategies that aid educators' understanding and implementation?	• Explain the instructional approaches of the program. • Identify and reference research-based and evidence-based strategies that are used in the design.	
2.3f. Materials provide a comprehensive list of all supplies needed to support instructional activities. **Scoring** Narrative Evidence	• Do the materials offer a detailed and comprehensive inventory of all necessary supplies required to facilitate instructional activities effectively?	• Provide a comprehensive list of required materials.	

Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 2.3: TEACHER SUPPORTS

The program includes educative materials that provide teachers with guidance, recommendations, or annotations for how to facilitate the effective use of instructional materials.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.3g. Materials regularly and systematically balance time and resources required for following the suggested implementation, as well as information for alternative implementations.	• Do the materials explore multiple implementation pathways and their resource implications? • Do materials address trade-offs between implementations, incorporating considerations of time and effectiveness? • Do materials prioritize adaptability, promoting flexibility in response to available resources or evolving circumstances?	• Provide a detailed breakdown of the resources needed for each implementation pathway, including time, personnel, materials, and any other required resources. • Provide a clear and structured comparison that highlights the trade-offs with different implementation methods and discusses how each option affects time and effectiveness. • Provide guidance or suggestions on how to adapt or modify the implementation strategy based on the availability of resources or changing circumstances, demonstrating a proactive approach to flexibility.	

Scoring

0	1	2

Department of Education & Workforce

CRITERION 2.3: TEACHER SUPPORTS

The program includes educative materials that provide teachers with guidance, recommendations, or annotations for how to facilitate the effective use of instructional materials.

Indicators	Guiding Questions	Look for Evidence of How the Materials:	Evidence
2.3h. Materials provide teacher guidance for the use of embedded technology to support and enhance student learning, when applicable. **Scoring** 0 1 2	• Do the materials provide specific guidance, examples, or instructions for teachers to effectively utilize embedded technology, where suitable, to enhance and strengthen student learning experiences?	• Provide teacher guidance on how to use embedded technology in supporting and enhancing student learning. • Provide step-by-step explanations on integrating digital tools, recommendations for suitable technological resources, or scenarios showcasing technology-enhanced learning activities aligned with the curriculum. • Provide troubleshooting tips or strategies for adapting the use of technology to different learning environments or student needs.	

Criterion 2.3 Summary	Criterion Score	Criterion Rating
Meets Expectations (10-12 pts) Partially Meets Expectations (8-9 pts) Does Not Meet Expectations (< 8 pts)		

Ohio Department of Education & Workforce

Gateway 2 Summary	Points Scored
Criterion 2.1: Assessment	/6
Criterion 2.2: Student Supports	/10
Criterion 2.3: Teacher Supports	/12
Gateway 2 Rating Levels	**Gateway 2 Total Points**
Meets Expectations (23-28 pts) Partially Meets Expectations (17-22 pts) Does Not Meet Expectations (< 17 pts)	/28
Gateway 2 Comments:	

Ohio Department of Education & Workforce